

Published on Al-Islam.org (https://www.al-islam.org)

Home > Ali: The Best of the Sahabah > 1. Hadith Al-Qadha, Investigating Its Authenticity

1. Hadith Al-Qadha, Investigating Its Authenticity

Shaykh Ibn Taymiyyah (d. 728 H) states:

و إما قوله قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم لاقضاكم علي والقضاء يستلزم العلم و الدين فهذا الحديث لم يثبت و لا و ليس له إسناد تقوم به الحجة ... لم يروه أحد في السنن المشهورة و لا المساند المعروفة لا بإسناد صحيح و لا ضعيف و إنما يروى من طريق من هو معروف بالكذب

As for his statement, "The Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him, said: 'The best judge among you is 'Ali", and justice dispensation requires knowledge and religious devotion. But, this *hadith* is not authentic, and it has no chain of transmission which makes it a valid proof ... It is not recorded by anyone in the famous *Sunan* books, and not (by anyone) in the well–known *Musnad* books – not with a *sahih* chain, nor with a *dha'if* chain. It is only narrated through the route of notorious liars. 1

Meanwhile, Imam Ibn Majah (d. 273 H) records in his Sunan:

حدثنا محمد بن المثنى ثنا عبد الوهاب بن عبد المجيد ثنا خالد الحذاء، عن أبي قلابة، عن أنس بن مالك، أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال :أرحم أمتي بأمتي أبو بكر وأشدهم في دين الله عمر وأصدقهم حياء عثمان وأقضاهم الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال :أرحم أمتي بأمتي أبي طالب .

Muhammad b. al-Muthanna – 'Abd al-Wahhab b. 'Abd al-Majid – Khalid al-Haza – Abi Qilabah – Anas b. Malik:

The Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him, said, "The most merciful of my *Ummah* to my *Ummah* is Abu Bakr. The most severe of them in the religion of Allah is 'Umar. The most shy of them is 'Uthman. And the best judge among them is 'Ali b. Abi Talib."2

This report cancels out the first leg of our Shaykh's claims: that the hadith is not documented in any of

the authoritative Sunan and Musnad books - whether with a sahih chain or even a dha'if one!

So, the next question is: has the *hadith* truly been narrated by a liar or liars?

The first narrator, Muhammad b. al-Muthanna is *thiqah* (trustworthy) without absolutely any doubt. Al-Hafiz (d. 852 H) for instance says about him:

Muhammad b. al-Muthanna b. 'Ubayd al-'Unaza, Abu Musa al-Basri.... *Thiqah* (trustworthy), *thabt* (accurate).3

Elsewhere, he adds about him:

Al-Bukhari narrated 103 *ahadith* from him (in his *Sahih*), and Muslim also narrated 772 *ahadith* (from him in his *Sahih*).4

Apparently, he was a super-weight in Sunni ahadith.

Al-Hafiz also says about the second narrator:

'Abd al-Wahhab b. 'Abd al-Majid b. al-Salt al-Thaqafi, Abu Muhammad al-Basri: *Thiqah* (trustworthy). He changed (i.e. his memory weakened) 3 years before his death.5

In his Lisan, he gives further, crucial information about him:

But, his change (in memory) does not harm his *ahadith*, for he never narrated a single *hadith* during the period of the change.6

So, what about the remaining narrators? Shaykh al-Arnau® saves us a lot of time with this tahqiq:

حدثنا عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا عفان ثنا وهيب ثنا خالد الحذاء عن أبي قلابة عن أنس بن مالك عن النبي صلى الله عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا عفان ثنا وهيب ثنا خالد الحذاء عن أبي قلابة عن أنس بن مالك عن النبي صلى الله عبد ا

'Abd Allah (b. Ahmad) – my father (Ahmad b. Hanbal) – 'Affan – Wuhayb – **Khalid al-Haza** – **Abu Qilabah** – **Anas b. Malik** – the Prophet, peace be upon him **Its chain is** *sahih* **UPON THE STANDARD OF THE TWO SHAYKHS**.7

We understand from this that both Khalid al-Haza and Abu Qilabah are *thiqah* (trustworthy) narrators of both *Sahih al-Bukhari* and *Sahih Muslim*, like Muhammad b. al-Muthanna.

Interestingly, Imam al-Hakim (d. 403 H), Imam al-Dhahabi (d. 748 H) and 'Allamah al-Albani (d. 1420 H) also confirm that the second narrator is like the others too in this regard. The 'Allamah writes:

أخرجه الترمذي (2 / 309) وابن ماجه (154) وابن حبان (2218) و (2219) والحاكم (3 / 422) من طريق عبد الوهاب بن عبد المجيد الثقفي حدثنا خالد الحذاء عن أبي قلابة عن أنس قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: فذكره، وقال الترمذي: "حديث حسن صحيح ". وقال الحاكم: " هذا إسناد صحيح على شرط الشيخين ". ووافقه .الذهبي وهو كما قالا

Al-Tirmidhi (2/309), Ibn Majah (154), Ibn Hibban (2218) and al-Hakim (3/422) narrated it through the route of 'ABD AL-WAHHAB B. 'ABD AL-MAJID AL-THAQAFI – Khalid al-Haza – Abu Qilabah – Anas – the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him. Al-Tirmidhi said: "The hadith is hasan sahih". Al-Hakim (also) said, "This chain is sahih UPON THE STANDARD OF THE TWO SHAYKHS". Al-Dhahabi concurred with him, and it is (indeed) as they both have stated.8

In a simple summary, *Hadith al–Qadha* – as documented by Imam Ibn Majah – has a chain of transmission that is *sahih* upon the standard of al–Bukhari (d. 256 H) and Muslim (d. 261 H). All its narrators are relied upon in both *Sahih al–Bukhari* and *Sahih Muslim*, and there is no disconnection anywhere in the chain. Apparently, Shaykh Ibn Taymiyyah's weird, unfounded claim that the *hadith* is narrated only by notorious liars is itself a sickening rape of the truth!

There is equally a *mutaba'ah* for Muhammad b. al-Muthanna copied by Imam al-Haythami (d. 807 H):

أخبرنا أحمد بن مكرم بن خالد البرتي، حدثنا علي بن المديني، حدثنا عبد الوهاب الثقفي، حدثنا خالد الحذاء، عن أبي قلابة عن أنس بن مالك قال: قال رسول الله _ صلى الله عليه وسلم :ارحم أمتي بأمتي أبو بكر، وأشدهم في أمر الله عمر، وأصدقهم حياء عثمان، وأقضاهم على

Ahmad b. Makram b. Khalid al-Birti – 'Ali b. al-Madini – 'Abd al-Wahhab al-Thaqafi – Khalid al-Haza – Abu Qilabah – Anas b. Malik:

The Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him, said: "The most merciful of my *Ummah* to my *Ummah* is Abu Bakr. The most severe of them concerning the Command of Allah is 'Umar. The most shy of them is 'Uthman. And the best judge among them is 'Ali.9

We already know that the last four narrators – including Anas – are *thiqah* narrators of both *Sahih al–Bukhari* and *Sahih Muslim*. So, we only have to find out the status of the first two narrators. Once again, Shaykh al–Arnau® saves us time. Imam Ibn Hibban (d. 354 H) records this chain in his *Sahih*:

Ahmad b. Makram b. Khalid al-Birti -'Ali b. al-Madini - Ma'n b. 'Isa - Malik b. Anas - Safwan b. Sulaym - 'A⊡a b. Yasar - Abu Sa'id al-Khudri10

Al-Arnau® says:

Its chain is *sahih* upon the standard of al-Bukhari. Its narrators are *thiqah* (trustworthy), narrators of the *Sahih*, except 'Ali b. al-Madini because he is from the narrators of (*Sahih*) al-Bukhari (only).11

So, both al-Birti and 'Ali b. al-Madini are *thiqah* (trustworthy) narrators of *Sahih al-Bukhari* too. As such, the *mutaba'ah* of 'Ali b. al-Madini to Muhammad b. al-Muthanna in *Hadith al-Qadha* is *sahih* as well, upon the standard of *Sahih al-Bukhari*!

The *hadith* has equally been transmitted from other Sahabah, apart from Anas. Imam al-Haythami for instance records:

Narrated Jabir b. 'Abd Allah al-Ansari:

The Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him, said: "The most merciful of my *Ummah* to my *Ummah* is Abu Bakr. The kindest of my *Ummah* to my *Ummah* is 'Umar. The most shy of my *Ummah* is 'Uthman. The best judge of my *Ummah* is 'Ali b. Abi Talib". 12

He comments:

Al-Tabarani narrated it in *al-Awsa*, and its chain is *hasan*. 13

In modern prints of *Mu'jam al–Awsa* of Imam al–Tabarani (d. 360 H), this *hadith*, unfortunately, is no longer present! The previous existence of this report in *al–Awsat* is further confirmed by Imam al–Haytami (d. 974 H):

In the report of al-Tabarani in *al-Awsat*, it is recorded: "The most merciful of my *Ummah* to my *Ummah* is Abu Bakr. The kindest of my *Ummah* to my *Ummah* is 'Umar. The most shy of my *Ummah* is 'Uthman. The best judge of my *Ummah* is 'Ali b. Abi Talib" 14

It has gone missing in the same *al–Awsat* after the time of al–Haytami.

Finally, 'Allamah al-Albani has copied Hadith al-Qadha from yet another Sahabi, namely Ibn 'Umar:

The most compassionate of my *Ummah* to my *Ummah* is Abu Bakr, and the most severe of them in the religion of Allah is 'Umar. The most shy of them is 'Uthman **and the best judge among them is 'Ali**. 15

The 'Allamah says:

Sahih ... (Narrated) by Ibn 'Umar16

- 1. Abu al-'Abbas Ahmad b. 'Abd al-Halim b. Taymiyyah al-Harrani, Minhaj al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah (Muasassat Qurtubah; 1st edition, 1406 H) [annotator: Dr. Muhammad Rashad Salim], vol. 7, pp. 512-513
- 2. Ibn Majah Abu 'Abd Allah Muhammad b. Yazid al-Qazwini, Sunan (Dar al-Fikr) [annotator: Muhammad Fuad 'Abd al-Baqi], vol. 1, p. 55, # 154
- 3. Ahmad b. 'Ali b. Hajar al-'Asqalani, Taqrib al-Tahdhib (Beirut: Dar al-Maktabah al-'Ilmiyyah; 2nd edition, 1415 H) [annotator: Mustafa 'Abd al-Qadir 'Ata], vol. 2, p. 129, # 6283
- 4. Shihab al-Din Ahmad b. 'Ali b. Hajar al-'Asqalani, Tahdhib al-Tahdhib (Dar al-Fikr; 1st edition, 1404 H), vol. 9, p. 378, # 698
- 5. Ahmad b. 'Ali b. Hajar al-'Asqalani, Taqrib al-Tahdhib (Beirut: Dar al-Maktabah al-'Ilmiyyah; 2nd edition, 1415 H) [annotator: Mustafa 'Abd al-Qadir 'Ata], vol. 1, p. 626, # 4275
- 6. Shihab al-Din Abu al-Fadhl Ahmad b. 'Ali b. Hajar al-'Asqalani, Lisan al-Mizan (Beirut: Manshurat Muasassat al-A'lami li al-Matbu'at; 2nd edition, 1390 H), vol. 4, p. 88, # 168
- 7. Abu 'Abd Allah Ahmad b. Hanbal al-Shaybani, Musnad (Cairo: Muasassat Qurtubah) [annotator: Shu'ayb al-Arnaut], vol. 3, p. 281, # 14022
- 8. Abu 'Abd al-Rahman Muhammad Nasir al-Din b. al-Hajj Nuh b. Tajati b. dam al-Ashqudri al-Albani, Silsilah al-Ahadith al-Bahihah wa Shayhun min Fiqhihah wa Fawaidihah (Riyadh: Maktabah al-Ma'arif li al-Nashr wa al-Tawzi'; 1st edition, 1415 H), vol. 3, p. 223, # 1224

- 9. Nur al-Din 'Ali b. Abi Bakr al-Haythami, Mawarid al-Zaman ila Zawaid Ibn Hibban (Damascus: Dar al-Thaqafah al-'Arabiyyah; 1st edition, 1412 H) [annotators: Husayn Salim Asad al-Darani and 'Abd 'Ali al-Kushk], vol. 7, pp. 161–162, #
- 10. Abu Hatim Muhammad b. Hibban b. Ahmad b. Hibban b. Mu'adh b. Ma'bad al-Tamimi al-Darimi al-Busti, ⊡ahih Ibn Hibban bi Tartib Ibn Balban (Beirut: Muasassat al-Risalah; 2nd edition, 1414 H) [annotators: Muhammad Nasir al-Din al-Albani and Shu'ayb al-Arnaut], vol. 16, p. 404, # 7393
- **11.** Ibid
- 12. Nur al-Din 'Ali b. Abi Bakr al-Haythami, Majma' al-Zawaid (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr; 1412 H), vol. 9, p. 235, # 14918
- **13**. Ibic
- 14. Abu al-ʿAbbas Ahmad b. Muhammad b. ʿAli b. Hajar al-Haytami, al-Ṭawaiq al-Muhriqah ʿala Ahl al-Rafdh wa al-Ṭalal wa al-Ṭindiqah (Beirut: Muasassat al-Risalah; 1st edition, 1997 CE) [annotators: ʿAbd al-Rahman b. ʿAbd Allah al-Turki and Kamil Muhammad Khurat], vol. 1, p. 226
- 15. Abu 'Abd al-Rahman Muhammad Nasir al-Din b. al-Hajj Nuh b. Tajati b. ⊡dam al-Ashqudri al-Albani, ⊡ahih al-Jami' al-⊡aghir wa Ziyadatuhu (Al-Maktab al-Islami), vol. 1, p. 211, # 868
- 16. Ibid

Source URL:

https://www.al-islam.org/ali-best-sahabah-toyib-olawuyi/1-hadith-al-qadha-investigating-its-authentic ity#comment-0