

Published on Al-Islam.org (https://www.al-islam.org)

<u>Home</u> > <u>Tragedy of al-Zahra': Doubts and Responses</u> > <u>Texts And Legacies</u> > <u>Al-Muhsin In Texts And Legacies</u> > Is This Historical "Confusion"?

## **Al-Muhsin In Texts And Legacies**

### Did al-Muhsin Die Young?!

It is obvious that the subject of killing al-Muhsin embarrasses the scholars and dignitaries of a huge proportion of the Muslims who hold allegiance to those who played a part in what al-Zahra' (sa) had to go through. Yes, it will embarrass them as well as those who follow or support them. And it will embarrass them in the fields of debates and deduction with others.

For this reason, they felt that they had to find a solution for this problem which they faced. Some of them tried to deny the existence of al-Muhsin altogether. "Umar Abu al-Nasr has said, "Historians have disputed among themselves about his existence, as we have already stated, although al-Ya'qubi and al-Mas'udi as well as others stress his existence."1

He goes on to add, "Some historians deny the existence of al-Muhsin, but others, such as al-Mas'udi and Abul Fida', emphasize it."2

You may find few and rare allusions like this which we would not like to trace. Since this denial is considered as a serious risk, and there is no sufficient justification to insist on it, there is also no room to deny that an attack was launched on the house of al–Zahra' (sa) then the Commander of the Faithful Ali (as) was taken out by force from that house, the eyes were directed to other attempts of a different nature aiming at distancing the ghost and means of violence from reaching the mentality of ordinary people.

One of the manifestations of such a trend is that a group of people has preferred to remain silent with regard to mentioning the name of al-Muhsin with the ability to seek an excuse for such silence by saying that it touches on discussing who from among Fatima's offspring lived and who did not. But all of this was never sufficient to reap the anticipated results.

The existence of al-Muhsin among the offspring of al-Zahra' (sa) is like a fire lit in a lighthouse or the sun at midday. It is not easy to ignore or deny it. Some people resorted to distancing the allegations from

those who caused the killing of this oppressed fetus and dared to insult the Head of the Women of Mankind. They did so in a clever way which implies a denial and invalidates the story that a miscarriage took place by denying the subject altogether.

So, they claimed that Muhsin was born during the lifetime of the Prophet (S); therefore, the Prophet (S) named him "Muhsin." And they mention a way to support their claim which does not attach any insult to Ali (as). Their narrative demonstrates the insistence of Ali (as) three times on naming the newborn "Harb," but the Prophet (S) insisted otherwise. This gives the impression that Ali (as) used to live the mentality of a warrior who thought of nothing other than war...! The apparent unintentional result is that Ali (as) used to kill people during the wars and he had such an urge to kill them.

The issue, then, was not the issue of a sacrifice, of a scapegoat, of the desire to serve the creed as prompted by the divine obligation, so people's hatred towards Ali (as) would become quite justified.

No matter what, Ibn Shahr Ashub al-Mazandarani regarded the claim that al-Muhsin was born during the lifetime of the Prophet (S) as a lowly claim put forth by bad people prompted by stubbornness. Says he, "A group of bad people wa carried away by stubbornness to the extent that it said that Abu Bakr was more courageous than Ali (as), that Marhab was killed by Muhammed ibn Maslamah, that Thu al-Thudayya was killed in Egypt, and that during the mission to convey Surat Bara'a, Abu Bakr was in charge over Ali (as). Some may even say that it was Anas ibn Malik who conveyed it, that Muhsin was born by Fatima (sa) during the lifetime of the Prophet (S) in a miscarriage, and that the Prophet (S)..., etc. Anyone who makes falsehood his conveyance will let his foot slip from the Straight Path: "And Satan made their deeds fair-seeming to them, so he kept them back from the Path, though they were endowed with intelligence and skill" (Qur'an, 29:38). Some openly expressed their enmity to Ali (as).3

Thus, it becomes quite obvious that these folks who attempted to coordinate the miscarriage of al–Muhsin with the others (who are responsible for it) being above doubt, being too pious and too great to commit such a crime. They, therefore, decided that there was, undoubtedly, a miscarriage, but it took place during the lifetime of the Prophet (S).

Then comes the narrative, which they label as authentic, to underscore such a conclusion by saying,

"Imam Ahmed has said the following in his *Musnad* which is also narrated by others through authentic *isnad*: We have been told by Yahya ibn Adam who has said that we have been informed by Isra'il from Abu Ishaq from Hani ibn Hani from Ali (as) saying, "When al–Hassan (as) was born, I named him Harb. The Messenger of Allah S came and said, 'Show me my son! What have you named him?!' I said to him that I named him Harb. He said, 'No. His name is Hassan (as).' When my son al–Husayn (as) was born, I named him Harb. The Messenger of Allah S came and said, 'Show me my son! What have you named him?!' I said to him that I named him Harb. He said, 'No. His name is Husayn (as).' When the third son was born, the Messenger of Allah S came and said, 'Show me my son! What have you named him?!' I said to him that I named him Harb. He said, 'No. His name is Muhsin.' Then he said, 'I have named

#### What the Foremost Tabi'in Have Said

Others admitted the implication of this narrative, taking it for granted in their books and works. Here, we would like to cite what we can of their statements which all admit the existence of al–Muhsin but claim that he "died young". We would like to point out that the claim that he "died yung" does not necessarily obligate them to admit that he died during the lifetime of the Prophet (S). Rather, it contradicts what others have said, i.e. that he died as a result of a miscarriage.

#### Such texts are the following:

- 1. Al-Tabari and Ibn al-Athir have said, "... It has been mentioned that she conceived by him another son called Muhsin and that he died young."5
- 2. Yunus has said that he heard Ibn Ishaq saying, "Fatima (sa) gave birth by Ali (as) to Hassan, Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*."6
- 3. Ibn Ishaq has said, "Fatima (sa) gave birth by Ali to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin who died *young*."7
- 4. Husam ad–Din Hamad ibn Ahmed al–Mahalli has said, "Al–Hassan and al–Husayn, peace and blessings of Allah with them8, and al–Muhsin who died *young*."9
- 5. Al-Qastalani has said, "She gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*." 10
- 6. Ibn Hazm, of Andalusia, has said, "Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) married Fatima (sa), so she gave birth to al–Hassan and al–Husayn (as) and al–Muhsin. Al–Muhsin died *young*." 11 He also said, "These all, with the exception of al–Muhsin, left offspring. Al–Muhsin left no offspring. Al–Muhsin died *very young* at the time of his birth." 12
- 7. Al-Badkhashani al-Harithi has said, "As regarding her sons, she gave birth to three males: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin. As regarding al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), their discussion will follow. As regarding al-Muhsin, he died as a *suckling infant*." 13
- 8. Al-Muhibb al-Tabari has said, "Al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) we have dealt with in detail in *Manaqib Thawi al-Qurba*, and they left behind offspring. As for Muhsin, he died young. Their mother is Fatima."14
- 9. Al-Muhibb al-Tabari has also said, "Others (other than al-Layth ibn Sa'd) have said that she gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*. She also gave birth to Umm Kulthum." 15

- 10. Ibn al-Murtada has said the following about Fatima (sa): "She gave birth to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin who died *young*." 16 He also said, "His sons by Fatima (sa) are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin, then Muhammed ibn al-Hanafiyya." 17
- 11. Al-Manawi has said, "Al-Layth has said that she gave birth by him to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin, who died *young*, and Umm Kulthum." 18

It seems that the phrase "died young" is added by al-Manawi since others have quoted what al-Layth has said without mentioning this phrase.

- 12. Ibn Findaq, while listing the children of the Commander of the Faithfuly by Fatima (as), has said: "Al–Hassan son of Ali and al–Husayn son of Ali (as), and al–Muhsin son of Ali, who died *young*." 19
- 13. Al-Barri al-Talmasani has said, "Fatima (sa) gave birth by Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin *who died young*."20
- 14. Ibn al-Athir has counted him among the *sahaba*! Said he, "Muhsin son of Ali son of Abu Talib son of 'Abd al-Muttalib (as) al-Qarashi al- Hashimi. His mother is Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S." Then he mentions how the Messenger of Allah S chose a name for him, adding, "Al-Muhsin died young. This is transmitted by Abu Musa."21
- 15. Al-'Asqalani has said the following about al-Muhsin: "Ibn Fathan corrected what Ibn 'Abd al-Birr has said about him, saying, 'I think he died young." 22 We do not know why he did not say that he thought he died in a miscarriage.
- 16. Ibn Qudamah al-Maqdisi has said, "Muhsin ibn Ali ibn Abu Talib (as): We do not know *anything* about him except in a tradition narrated by Hani ibn Hani from Ali (as)." Then he mentions the story of how al-Muhsin was originally named Harb then the Prophet (S) changed his name adding, "It seems that he died as a *young child*."23

He also said, "She gave birth by Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Umm Kulthum and Zainab. It is said that she gave birth to a third son whom the Messenger of Allah S named Muhsin saying, 'I named them after the sons of Aaron: Shaba, Shubayr and Mushabbar." 24

- 17. "She gave birth by Ali, may Allah be pleased with both of them, to our masters al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), our Lady Zainab and our master Muhsin who died *young*."25
- 18. Ibn al-Jawzi has said, "... Ibn Ishaq added the name of Muhsin to the list of the children of Fatima (sa) by Ali (as) saying that (Muhsin) died *young*."26
- 19. Al-Sakhawi has said, "For the fourth (daughter of the Prophet S), namely al-Zahra' (sa), by Ali (as), and who did not marry anyone else, are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Umm Kulthum and Zainab; Muhsin died *young*."27

- 20. Al-'Amiri has said, "A Chapter dealing with her children and the date of their birth; they are: Hassan and Husayn (as), Muhsin, Umm Kulthum and Zainab," till he comes to say, "He S named the sons of Fatima (sa), i.e. Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin, after the sons of Aaron son of 'Imran (Amram). Muhsin died *young*."28
- 21. Al-Shiblinji has said, "As regarding her sons, may Allah be pleased with her, they are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin who died *young*." 29
- 22. "Others (other than al-Layth ibn Sa'd) have said that she gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*."30
- 23. Ibn Kathir has said, "The first wife whom Ali, may Allah be pleased with him, married was Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S. He married her after the Battle of Badr, so she gave birth by him to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and, it is said, also Muhsin who died *young*."31
- 24. 'Imad ad-Din Isma'il Abul-Fida' has said, "Born to him by her are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and Muhsin, who died *young*, and Zainab..., etc."32
- 25. Al-Dalabi has quoted Ahmed ibn 'Abd al-Jabbar quoting Yunus ibn Bakir saying, "I have heard Ibn Ishaq saying that Fatima (sa), daughter of the Messenger of Allah S, gave birth by Ali to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*. She also gave birth to Umm Kulthum and Zainab."33
- 26. Ibn Qutaybah has said, "She gave birth by Ali (as) to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin and Umm Kulthum,"34 adding, "As for Muhsin son of Ali (as), he died *young*."35
- 27. Al-Nuwayri has said, "It has been said that she gave birth to a son named Muhsin who died young."36

In another place, he said, "She, may Allah be pleased with her, gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*." He also said, "All the male children of Ali, may Allah be pleased with him, were five: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and Muhsin about whom there is a controversy... [and the girls Zainab and Umm Kulthum.]"37

- 28. Sibt ibn al-Jawzi has said, "Ibn Ishaq has added the name of Muhsin, who died *young*, to the list of Fatima's children by Ali."38
- 29. Al-Qastalani has said, "She gave birth by Ali to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin who [the latter] died *young*."39
- 30. Sibt ibn al-Jawzi has said, "This testifies to what al-Zubayr ibn Bakar has said, that is, that Fatima (sa) conceived by Ali (as) with another son whose name is Muhsin and who died *young*."40
- 31. Al-Qanduzi has said, "She gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died

- 32. Ibn Sayyid an-Nas has said, "So she gave birth by him to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin, who died *young*, Umm Kulthum and Zainab, etc."42
- 33. Khawand Ameer has said, "Ibn Ishaq and al-Layth ibn Sa'd, may Allah be pleased with them, have both narrated saying that Fatima (sa) had two other children. Their names are: Muhsin and Ruqayya. They both died *young*."43
- 34. Al-Ya'qubi has said, "He (Ali (as)) had four children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, who died *young*..."44
- 35. Al-Maqdisi has said, "As regarding Muhsin son of Ali (as), he died young." 45
- 36. Ibn KhayrAllah al-"Omari al-Musilli (the public speaker) has said, "... And it is stated in *Al-Tabyeen* that she gave birth to a third son besides al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), so the Prophet (S) named him Muhsin."46

## Mentioning al-Muhsin Without Mentioning the Reason for His Death

It is quite obvious that many scholars have included the name of al-Muhsin among the offspring of Ali (as) and Fatima (sa) without pointing out to his fate. This does not negate the fact that he was miscarried. As regarding those who did not count him among Ali's sons, their doing so does not mean that they denied his existence because they intended to discuss only those who lived from among the offspring, peace with both of them.

We would like to list some of them here:

- 1. Al-Fayrooz-Abadi has said, "The name Shabbar is like Baqqam; Shubayr is like Qomayr, and Mushabbir is like Muhaddith: sons of Aaron, peace with him. It is said that the Prophet (S) coined after them the names of al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and al-Muhsin."47
- 2. Al-Zubaidi has said, "It is said that the Prophet (S) coined the names of his sons al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and al-Muhsin, after theirs (the sons of Aaron). Thus is written in some narratives."

Ibn Barri has said, "I have found Ibn Khalawayh explaining these names. He says that Shabar and Shubayr and Mushabbar are the sons of Aaron, peace with him. In Arabic, they mean Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin respectively."

3. He went on to say, "According to them did Ali, may Allah be pleased with him, name his sons: Shabar, Shubayr and Mushabbar, meaning Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin."48

- 4. Abu 'Abdullah Muhammed Ibn Ishaq ibn Mandah al-Isbahani, may Allah have mercy on him, has said the following in *Kitab al-Ma'rifa*: "Ali (as) married Fatima (sa) in Medina one year after the Hijra. About a year thereafter, she gave birth by him to al-Hassan then al-Husayn (as), then al-Muhsin, then Zainab al-Kurbra, then Umm Kulthum al-Kubra."49
- 5. Ibn al-Athir, quoting Ibn 'Abbas, has said in one of his discussions, "Fatima (sa) was the wife of Ali (as). She gave birth by him to Hassan and Husayn (as), Muhsin and Zainab."50
- 6. Al-Layth ibn Sa'd is quoted as having said, "Ali (as) married Fatima (sa) who gave birth by him to Hassan and Husayn (as), Muhsin, Zainab and Umm Kulthum."51
- 7. Al-Dhahbi has said, "Ibn 'Abd al-Birr has said that he (Ali (as)) married her (Fatima (sa)) after the Battle of Uhud. She gave birth by him to al-Hassan and al-Husayn, Muhsin, Umm Kulthum and Zainab."52
- 8. Al-'Asqalani has listed him among the *sahab* saying, "Al-Muhsin son of Ali (as) ibn Abu Talib ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib, of Banu Hashim, a grandson of the Prophet." 53 then he cited what Ibn Fathan has written about him.
- 9. Shams ad-Din, namely Muhammed S ibn Tolon, has said, "Ali (as) had the following children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Umm Kulthum..., etc."54
- 10. Al-Nawawi has said, "Ali, may Allah be pleased with him, had the following children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Umm Kulthum al-Kubra and Zainab al-Kubra. All of them were by Fatima (sa)."55
- 11. Al-Diyar Bakri has said, "Al-Layth ibn Sa'd is quoted as saying that Ali (as) married Fatima (sa), so she gave birth by him to Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Zainab..., etc." 56
- 12. Ibn Kathir has said, "... 'So she gave birth by him to Hassan (as), so he is called 'Abul–Hassan,' and al–Husayn (as), who was martyred in Iraq.' I said: 'And Muhsin...,' etc."57
- 13. Ibn Hassan has said, "Ali (as) ibn Abu Talib had twenty-five children. Among his sons are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin. He also had Umm Kulthum..., etc."58
- 14. "Ali's children by Fatima (sa) were three males: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin, and two daughters: Zainab and Umm Kulthum. All of them left offspring with the exception of Muhsin."59
- 15. "He had fourteen males; among them were: al-Hassan, al-Husayn and Muhsin, all by Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S)."60
- 16. Al-Layth ibn Sa'd is quoted as having said, "Ali (as) married Fatima (sa), so she gave birth by him to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Zainab, Umm Kulthum and Ruqayya."61

- 17. In the book titled *Bughyat al–Talib*, it is stated that his children, may Allah be pleased with them, were fourteen sons and eighteen daughters according to the cholars' consensus. There is a difference of opinion regarding the males whom some count as twenty and regarding the females whom some count as twenty–two. As regarding the males, they are: al–Hassan and al–Husayn and Muhsin..."62
- 18. Muhammed ibn al-Shahnah has said, "It was born for Ali (as) of the males fourteen and of the females many. By Fatima, may Allah be pleased with her, he had al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin and Zainab."63
- 19. Al-Khawarizmi has said, "For Ali (as), she gave birth to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), al-Muhsin, Umm Kulthum al-Kubra..., etc."64
- 20. 'Umar Abu al-Nasr has said, "Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S was blessed by her husband, Imam Ali ibn Abu Talib (as), with five children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) al-Muhsin, Zainab al-Kubra (the elder) and Umm Kulthum al-Kubra."65
- 21. Al-Mazandarani has said, "He [Ali (as)] gave her [Fatima (sa)] these *kunyats*: mother of al-Hassan and of al-Husayn (as), mother of al-Muhsin, mother of the Imams, and mother of her father..., etc. "66"
- 22. Shaikh 'Abbas al-Qummi has said, "... Al-Mas'udi states in *Muruj al-Dhahab*, Ibn Qutaybah in *Al-Ma'arif*, and Nur ad-Din al-'Abbas al-Musawi al-Shami in *Azhar Bustan al-Nazirah* have all said that Muhsin is counted among the offspring of the Commander of the Faithful, peace with him."67
- 23. In a tradition about Imam al-Sadiq (as) wherein he mentions the call from the depths of the 'Arsh, he says, "... And how good your grandsons, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), are, and how good your fetus, al-Muhsin...!"68
- 24. In a text citing the Torah, it is stated: "Eliya (Ali (as)), father of the grandsons (of the Prophet S), al–Hassan and al–Husayn (as), and of Muhsin, one of his offspring. And I made for your brother Aaron Shubar, Shubayr and Mushabbir."69

#### **Deleting Muhsin's Name without Saying Why**

- 1. The author of *Al–Kafi*, *Al–'Idda*, citing Ahmed ibn Muhammed from al–Qasim from his grandfather from Abu Busayr from Abu Abdullah (as) from his forefathers (as), has said, "The Commander of the Faithful (as) has said, 'On the Day of Judgment, if you chose no name for your children born during miscarriages, when the latter meet you, each will ask his father, 'Why did you not choose a name for me?' The Messenger of Allah (S) chose a name for Muhsin even before his birth."70
- 2. "Some people say that the Commander of the Faithful (as) had the following children by Fatima (sa): al-Hassan and al-Husayn, al-Muhsin, a stillborn, and Umm Kulthum..., etc." 71

- 3. Kamal ad-Din ibn Talhah, the Shafi'i scholar, may Allah have mercy on him, has said,
- "Chapter 11: His Offspring: Be informed, may Allah support you with a Spirit from Him, that people have varied in their views regarding the number of his offspring, males and females. Some of them list a large number, including the miscarriage without excluding lineage, and others discounted that, seeing no need to count him, so each statement came according to what he took into consideration."72
- 4. Al-Sabban has said, "Fatima (sa) gave birth by Ali (as) to six children, three males and three females. The males are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn and al-Muhassin [thus differing from others' spelling of al-Muhsin]. The females were: Zainab..., etc. As for al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), they both left offspring, numerous and good, and they will both be discussed later. As for al-Muhassan, he died in a miscarriage."73
- 5. Ibn Abul-Thalj has said, "The following children were born for the Commander of the Faithful (as) by Fatima (sa): al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin who died in a miscarriage." 74
- 6. "And some other people have added to the above al-Muhsin as a brother of al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and who died in a miscarriage."75
- 7. Al-Tibrisi, listing the offspring of the Commander of the Faithful (as), has said, "Al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and al-Muhsin who died in a miscarriage." 76
- 8. Al-Mamqani has said, "... She gave birth by him to Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Zainab and Umm Kulthum. She miscarried Muhsin."
- 9. Al-Tibrisi has said, "Fatima (sa) had five children, males and females: al-Hassan and al-Husayn, peace with them both, Zainab al-Kubra (senior), and Zainab al-Sughra (junior) who is nicknamed Umm Kulthum, may Allah be pleased with her. Also she gave birth after the demise of the Prophet, greeting and salutation on him, to another son in a miscarriage whom the Messenger of Allah S had already named, even as he was in his mother's womb, as Muhsin."78
- 10. Ibn al-Sabbagh, the Malikite scholars, has said, "They have stated that among them is Muhsin, a brother of al-Hassan and al-Husayn, peace with them both, whom the Shi'as mention, and that he died in a miscarriage."79
- 11. Al-Safari, the Shafi'i scholar, has said, "Al-Hassan (as) is the first of Fatima's five children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), al-Muhsin, who died in a miscarriage, Zainab al-Kubra and Zainab al-Sughra."80
- 12. Shaikh al-Mufid has said, "... Among the Shi'as are those who state that Fatima (peace and blessings of Allah be on her), had a miscarriage after the demise of the Prophet (S) of a boy whom the Messenger of Allah (S) had named, even as he was in his mother's womb, Muhsin."81

- 13. Close to this text is what is mentioned by al-Fadl ibn al-Hassan al-Tibrisi.82
- 14. This is also mentioned by 'allama al-Hilli in his own summary of Al-Irshad.83
- 15. Also close to this text is stated by Ibn al-Batriq84; so, you may refer to it.
- 16. Jamal ad-Din, the Harawi traditionist, having listed Muhsin among the children of Ali (as), says, "As regarding Muhsin, he died young, in fact, he died in a miscarriage."85
- 17. Ibn Talhah has said, "Anyone who lists more (of the offspring of Imam Ali (as)) includes her miscarriage of al-Muhsin."86
- 18. Ibrahim al-Tarabulsi al-Hanafi says the following in the family tree which he prepared for (caliph) al-Nasar and a copy of which was made for the library of Salah ad-Din (Saladin) al-Ayyubi: "Muhsin son of Fatima (sa) was miscarried. It is also said that he died young, but the truth is that Fatima (sa) did miscarry a fetus."87
- 19. Al-Hamzawi, the Malikite scholar, has said, "As regarding al-Muhsin, he died in a miscarriage."88
- 20. Sayyid Mahdi al-Suweej has quoted that particular text from many references including *Manaqib al-Hassan and al-Husayn* (as) by al-Jawhari, from the author of *Jawharat al-Kalam* and from *Al-Anwar* by Abul-Qasim.

Referring to the Miscarriage and why

- 1. It has already been stated that al-Maqdisi attributes the miscarriage of al-Muhsin to the Shi'as who state that it was because 'Umar beat al-Zahra' (sa).
- 2. He has said, "And among them is what is narrated by al-Balathiri, whose statement is famous among the Shi'a, saying that "Umar squeezed Fatima (sa) behind the door till she miscarried Muhsin despite everyone's knowledge of her father's statement: 'She is part of me; whoever hurts her hurts me." 89
- 3. 'Imad ad-Din al-Tabari (one of the 7th century scholars) has said the following: "And they have said that Fatima (sa) miscarried Muhsin because 'Umar beat her on her stomach."90
- 4. Sayyid Taj ad-Din Ali ibn Ahmed al-Husayni (one of the four scholars of the 11th Hijri century) has said, "The reason for her death is the beating which she received in the aftermath of which she miscarried the fetus."91

Listing the sons of Ali (as), he said, "... And the miscarried son whom the Prophet (S) named 'Muhsin' in his own lifetime even prior to birth."92

5. Ali ibn Muhammed al-"Omari, the genealogist, has said, "And they did not count Muhsin because he was born dead. Shi'as have reported the incident of al-Muhsin and of how his mother was kicked. I have

found some genealogy books referring to al-Muhsin by name without saying anything about such kicking from a venue on which I rely."93

6. According to some folks, "And her sons are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn, and al-Muhsin who was miscarried. According to *Al-Ma'arif* of Ibn Qutaybah, al-Muhsin was damaged because of the pressure of Qunfath al-'Adawi."94

In another place, he said, "So Fatima (sa) gave birth to al-Hassan, al-Husayn and al-Muhsin whom she miscarried."95

- 7. Ali (as) is also quoted as having said, "... And Muhsin will come [on the Judgment Day], drenched in his blood, carried by Khadija daughter of Khuwaylid and Fatima (sa) daughter of Assad... and Gabriel will announce the name of Muhsin who will say, 'I am wronged, so redress!' The Messenger of Allah S will take Muhsin in his hands and raise him to the heavens as he says..., etc."96
- 8. He (as) is also quoted in a tradition as saying, "... And the killer of Fatima (sa), and the killer of al-Muhsin..., etc."97
- 9. He (as) is also quoted as having said, "... So he kicked her with his foot, and she was pregnant by a son named al-Muhsin, causing her to miscarry al-Muhsin."98
- 10. He (as) is also quoted as having said, "And the reason for her death is that Qunfath, slave of the man (Abu Bakr) pinched her with his sword's scabbard according to his master's orders, causing her to miscarry Muhsin."99
- 11. In a supplication by Imam al–Rida (as) during the thanks–giving prostration (*sajdat al–shukr*), he says, "... And they both [Abu Bakr and 'Umar] killed the son of your Prophet."100
- 12. Ibn Sa'd al-Jaza'iri has said, "... And they beat Fatima (sa), so she miscarried a fetus." 101
- 13. Al-Fattani al-'Amili has said, "... According to narratives told by Ahl al-Bayt (as), ''Umar pushed the door in order to enter by force, and Fatima (sa) was behind it. The door hit her stomach, so she miscarried her fetus named al-Muhsin." 102
- 14. Al-Khawajoo'i al-Mazandarani has said, "... And they hit Fatima (sa), so she miscarried her fetus." 103
- 15. He also said, "What was the shortcoming of Fatima (sa), the Purified one, and for what did she deserve to be beaten till she miscarried her fetus?" 104
- 16. He also said, "... And they broke her rib and caused her to miscarry her son." 105
- 17. Shaikh Yousuf al-Bahrani has said, "... and their beating al-Zahra' (sa) till she miscarried her fetus." 106

- 18. Sayyid Muhammed Qulli al-Musawi has detailed this incident, so refer to him. 107
- 19. The great religious authority, Sayyid Muhammed Mahdi al-Qazwini 108, has said, "... And when she opened the door, they pushed it on her, breaking her rib and causing her to miscarry her fetus, al-Muhsin." 109
- 20. Sayyid al-Khunsari, discussing al-Zahra' (sa), has said, "... And who caused her to miscarry her fetus, and who made her loudly wail..., etc.?"110
- 21. Shaikh al-Tusi has said, "What is well known and regarding which there is no contention among the Shi'as is that "Umar hit Fatima (sa) on her stomach till she miscarried Muhsin, and the incident in this regard is quite famous among them." 111
- 22. 'Abd al-Jalal al-Qazwini has said, ""Umar beat the stomach of Fatima (sa), killing her fetus whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin."112
- 23. Al-Fadil al-Miqdad has said, "'He dispatched ''Umar to her who beat her on the stomach, causing her to miscarry Muhsin."113
- 24. Al-Bayadi has said, "It is well known among the Shi'as that he (''Umar) squeezed Fatima (sa) with the door, causing her to miscarry Muhsin." 114
- 25. Ibn Abu Jumhur has said, "... and how she was squeezed by the door till she miscarried her fetus." He also said, "As regarding the incident of the burning, the beating, and the miscarriage of the fetus, some of it is quoted from you..., etc."115
- 26. Al-Karki, the researcher, has said the following protesting against them, "... And how he gathered firewood at the door, and how he caused Fatima (sa) to miscarry Muhsin..."116
- 27. Al-Tasatturi, the judge, has stated some proofs about the miscarriage, so refer to what he has said. 117
- 28. Al-Husayni has said, "... So they rushed towards the door, pushing it in her direction, and she was pregnant, causing her to miscarry a son whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin."118
- 29. Al-Mas'udi has said, "... And they pressed the door against the Head of the Women of the World till she miscarried Muhsin."119
- 30. Al-Nizam is quoted as having said, ""Umar hit the stomach of Fatima (sa) on the day of the swearing of allegiance [to Abu Bakr] till she miscarried the fetus, al-Muhsin, in her womb." 120
- 31. Ibn Abul-Hadid, the Mu'tazilite scholar, has transmitted the Shi'as saying that "Umar pressured her between the door and the wall, so Fatima (sa) called out, "O Father! O Messenger of Allah S!," causing her to miscarry." 121

32. Al-Nu'man, the judge, has said, "... So they beat her, hence her miscarriage." 122

33. Mughamis al-Hilli has said:

Having miscarried because of a blow she received,

She passed away as her property remained seized. 123

34. Shaikh al-Hurr al-'Amili has composed the following lines:

Five are her sons: Husayn, Hassan, Zainab and Umm Kulthum

And Muhsin, miscarried when "Umar opened the door as known.

He goes on to say the following about the cause of her death:

She soon miscarried her fetus and remained

Till death mourning him, moaning, she stayed 124

35. Al-Isfahani, the researcher, has said:

In the fetus of glory there is something that

Causes the insides to bleed;

Can they really hide what is already known?

The door, the wall and the blood testify

As witnesses from which nothing can hide:

The oppressor committed against her fetus a crime

So the mountains, from her anxiety, are undermined. 125

- 36. In a narrative transmitted about the Prophet (S), it is recorded that "Her rib was broken, and she miscarried her fetus," till he comes to say, "Lodged forever in Your Fire the one who hit her side till she miscarried her son." 126
- 37. In her ziyrat, it is stated: "... the one whose son was killed." 127
- 38. Al-Kaf'ami has said that the cause of her death was her being beaten and subsequent miscarriage. 128
- 39. Sulaym ibn Qays has said, "... He shoved her, breaking her rib, so she miscarried her fetus." 129

- 40. Al-Kanji has added the following to what Shaikh al-Mufid has stated: "He added to what the majority have reported saying that Fatima (sa) miscarried a male after the demise of the Prophet (S) whom the Messenger of Allah (S) had named Muhsin." 130
- 41. Al-Maqdisi al-Ardabili has said, "... 'Umar in person hit her on her stomach, and his slave whipped her on her shoulder. That was the reason for her miscarriage." 131
- 42. In a letter from "Umar to Mu'awiyah, the first admits the following: "And her pain of childbirth intensified. I entered the house, so she miscarried a son whom Ali called Muhsin." 132
- 43. Al-Saduq has transmitted from some mentors the following explanation of the Prophet's statement to Ali (as): "There is a treasure for you in Paradise": "This treasure is his son al-Muhsin, the one whom Fatima (sa) miscarried when she was squeezed between both doors." 133
- 44. In a narrative from Imam al-Sadiq (as), he said, "... And she was beaten even while being pregnant..., and she miscarried because of such beating... The first in whose regard a judgment will be issued shall be Muhsin son of Ali (as) against his killer, *then* against Qunfath." 134
- 45. In another narrative from Imam al–Sadiq (as), he says, "He kicked her in the stomach, hence the miscarriage of Muhsin." The same narrative also says, "And he kicked the door with his foot till he hit her stomach, and she was six months pregnant with al–Muhsin, causing her to miscarry." It also states: "... And she was beaten, and her fetus was killed inside her womb... Due to the kick, she suffered from childbirth, and when he slammed the door, she miscarried Muhsin... And Muhsin shall come [on the Day of Judgment] carried by [his grandmothers] Khadija daughter of Khuwaylid and Fatima daughter of Assad... The one unjustly killed (referred to in 81:8 of the Holy Qur'an) is, by Allah, Muhsin..."135
- 46. In another tradition from Imam al-Sadiq (as), he says, "And the killing of Muhsin with that kick is surely a greater [sin] and more bitter." 136
- 47. Abul-Sa'adat, namely As'ad ibn Abd al-Qahir, has said, "... And they both squeezed Fatima (sa) behind her door till she miscarried al-Muhsin." 137
- 48. Imam Ali (as) used to supplicate in his *qunut* saying, "... and a fetus which they caused to miscarry, and a rib which they crushed, and a property title which they tore to pieces..." 138
- 49. In a narrative transmitted by al-Daylami about al-Zahra' (sa), she is quoted as having said, "... And he kicked the door with his foot, slamming it on me, and I was pregnant, so I fell on my face... And childbirth overcame me, so I miscarried Muhsin who was killed without having committed any crime." 139
- 50. Addressing al-Mughirah, Imam al-Hassan (as) has said to the latter, "You are the one who hit Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S till you caused her to bleed and to miscarry what she had in her womb, thus humiliating the Messenger of Allah S..., etc."140

- 51. Imam al-Baqir (as) has said, "And she was big with Muhsin. When the Messenger of Allah S passed away, and when the folks forced their way into her house, taking her cousin, the Commander of the Faithful (as), out by force, and when she was harmed by that man ("Umar ibn al-Khattab), she miscarried a boy..., etc."141
- 52. Al-Majlisi I has said, "Due to the beating [of Fatima (sa)], a son named Muhsin was miscarried." 142
- 53. Al-Majlisi II has said, "They squeezed her behind the door, so she miscarried one whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin." 143

He also said, "So, she miscarried a fetus whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin." 144

He also said, "Our narratives have over-flown, so have their narratives as well, with the incident of how Fatima (sa) was scared till she miscarried what she had in her womb." 145

He has also said, "And they both squeezed Fatima (sa) behind her door till she miscarried Muhsin." 146

- 54. Al-Kashani has said, "That beating was the most serious cause of her miscarriage of a son whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin." 147
- 55. Al-Turayhi has said, "When Khalid ibn al-Walid squeezed her, she miscarried Muhsin." 148
- 56. The author of the book *Conference of the Scholars of Baghdad* has said, "'Umar squeezed Fatima (sa) between the wall and the door very hard and with cruelty till she miscarried her fetus." has said, "'Umar squeezed Fatima (sa) between the wall and the door very hard and with cruelty till she miscarried her fetus."

### Al-Maqdisi and the Miscarriage of al-Muhsin

Al-Maqdisi has said, "The grandsons of the Messenger of Allah S are: 'Abdullah ibn 'Othman, Ali ibn Abul-'As, Umama daughter of Abul-'As, al-Hassan and al-Husayn, Muhsin, Umm Kulthum and Zainab, eight all in all." 149

He also said, "He has eighteen children, eleven males and seven females. Among them from Fatima (sa) are five: al-Hassan and al-Husayn, Muhsin, Umm Kulthum al-Kubra and Zainab al-Kubra..., etc." 150

He has been already quoted as having said, "... As for Muhsin son of Ali (as), he perished young." 151

57. He has also said, "She gave birth to Muhsin; he is the one the Shi'as claim was miscarried because "Umar hit her. Many historians are not familiar with Muhsin." 152

It appears from his statements that:

- 1) Shi'as, generally speaking, say that "Umar hit Fatima (sa), so she miscarried Muhsin.
- 2) He himself counts Muhsin as one of the grandsons of the Prophet (S) and one of the sons of Fatima (sa), saying that he died young as his statements above indicate.
- 3. His statement that many historians are not familiar with Muhsin, as we indicated, is not quite accurate because these historians pay attention to those who lived rather than to whoever died by miscarriage.

# Muhsin was miscarried because of Grief for the Demise of the Prophet (S)

58. "Umar Abu al-Nasr has said, "The author of the book titled *Al-Isnad fi Ma'rifat Hujaj-Allah 'alal 'Ibad* says that Fatima, may Allah be pleased with her, miscarried al-Muhsin after the demise of the Messenger of Allah S. She may have miscarried him due to her intense grief and anxiety." 153

I think that the last sentence belongs to "Umar Abu al-Nasr, not to the author of the book titled *Al-Isnad fi Ma'rifat Hujaj-Allah*. (Obviously, the correct titled is *Al-Irshad fi Ma'rifat Hujaj-Allah 'ala al-'Ibad*, one of the books written by al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy on him).

Nevertheless, it is quite obvious that this is a blatant insult to al–Zahra' (sa) by saying that she lost patience while facing the destiny of Allah, Glory to Him, to such an extent although she is much more pious and righteous to attribute such impatience to her which reached the extent of jeopardizing the health of her fetus and killing him. She is the patient and persevering woman who said once to the ladies of Banu Hashim, when they gathered to mourn the Prophet S, "Do not wail; take to supplication." 154

The Messenger of Allah S had admonished Fatima (sa) saying, "If I die, do not scratch your face, nor should you let your hair loose, nor should you wail nor lament." 155

Regarding the same occasion, he admonished her thus: "Rely on Allah, and persevere just as your forefathers from among the prophets persevered." 156

Al–Zahra' (sa) was not to go against the command of her father, peace and blessings of Allah with him and his purified progeny, nor can we imagine her going against the Commandments of Allah in obedience to her emotions. But those who harbor mischief, and the vicious ones, tried to depict Fatima (sa) as the woman who lost her patience and was wailing and lamenting and whose impatience reached the extent of killing her fetus and miscarrying him, so much so that someone reported that "She remained, following the death of her father, tying her head with a scarf, very thin, fatigued, weeping, depressed, falling into swoons from time to time and saying to both her sons..., etc." 157

Someone else added in another text to the previous statements saying, "And whenever she sniffed his shirt, she would lose consciousness." 158 This depicts her as violating her father's instruction not to wail, calling out thus: "O Father! The Garden of Eternity is his reward! O Father! Near the One of the Throne

is his abode! O Father! Gabriel used to visit him! O Father! After this day, I shall never see him!"159

Add to the above the narrative which they transmit from her maid, Fidda, and other such stuff.

We may interpret this as a justification for getting her out of her house and near her father's grave. It is to justify prohibiting her from showing her grief which exposes the oppression to which she was exposed and how the Commander of the Faithful (as) was forced to build her "bayt al-ahzan" at al-Baqee' so that this name may remain forever a document indicting the new oppression and harsh persecution to which she was exposed.

#### Is This Historical "Confusion"?

59. Al-Malti, the Shafi'i scholar who died in 377 A.H./987 A.D., may Allah have mercy on him, listing statements by Hisham ibn al-Hakam, has said, "... Abu Bakr passed by Fatima (sa), so he kicked her in the stomach. She miscarried, and that was the cause of her sickness and subsequent death." 160

What is well known is that the one who kicked al–Zahra' (sa) in the stomach was 'Umar, not Abu Bakr. Perhaps the confusion originated from those who cited Hisham or from al–Malti himself.

- 1. ''Umar Abul-Nasr, Fatima bint Rasul Allah Muhammed (S), p. 94 (Beirut edition).
- 2. Ibid., footnote of p. 93.
- 3. Managib al Abu Talib, Vol. 1, p. 16.
- 4. Ahmed, Musnad, Vol. 1, pp. 98, 118. Tarikh Dimashq (in the biography of Imam al-Husayn 🗈 edited by al-Mahmudi), p. 18. Al-Sunan al-Kubra, Vol. 6, p. 166 and Vol. 7, p. 63. Tahthib Tarikh Dimashq, Vol. 4, p. 204 from Ahmed, al-Tabrani, Ibn Abu Shaybah, Ibn Jarir, Ibn Haban, al-Hakim and al-Dulabi. Al-Adab al-Mufrad, p. 121. Usd al-Ghaba, Vol. 2, p. 18 and Vol. 4, p. 308. Al-Isaba, Vol. 3, p. 471. Al-Tabrani, Vol. 3, pp. 28, 96, 97. Al-Thurriyya al-Tahira, p. 97. Al-Isti`ab (referenced in a footnote in Al-Isaba), Vol. 1, p. 369. Nihayat al-'Arab, Vol. 18, p. 213. Al-Riyad al-Mustataba, p. 293. Tarikh al-Khamis, Vol. 1, p. 418. Muntakhab Kanz al-`Ummal (referenced in a footnote in Ahmed's Musnad), Vol. 5, p. 108. Mukhtasar Tarikh Dimashq, Vol. 7, pp. 7, 117. Al-Hakim, Mustadrak, Vol. 3, pp. 165-66. Mujma` al-Zawa'id, Vol. 8, p. 52 from al-Bazzar and al-Tabrani in Al-Kabir. The author says, "Ahmed's sources as well as those of al-Bazzar are the same sources cited in the Sihah book in addition to Hani ibn Hani who is a trusted authority." al-Dhahbi, Talkhis al-Mustadrak (references in a footnote in Al-Mustadrak) and is referred to as authentic. Thakha'ir al-`Uqba, p. 119 from Ahmed and Abu Hatim. Ansab al-Ashraf (edited by al-Mahmadi), Vol. 3, p. 144; refer to its footnotes. Al-Tabyeen fi Ansab al-Qarashiyyin, pp. 133, 192. Kifayat al-Talib, p. 208. Tathkirat al-Khawass, p. 193. Al-Zarqani, Vol. 4, p. 339. Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya, Vol. 7, p. 332. Taj al-`Arus, Vol. 3, p. 389. Kanz al-`Ummal, Vol. 6, p. 221. Refer also to the biography of Imam al-Hassan 🗈 from the section which was not printed of Al-Tabagat al-Kubra of Ibn Sa'd, p. 34. Al-Ihsan fi Tagrib Sihah Ibn Haban, Vol. 15, p. 410. Kashf al-Astar, quoting al-Bazzar's Musnad, Vol. 2, p. 216. Mawarid al-Zam'an, p. 551 citing Al-Sira al-Halabiyya, Vol. 3, p. 292.
- 5. Al-Kamil, Ibn al-Athir, Vol. 3, p. 397. Al-Tabari, Tarikh Umam wal Muluk, Vol. 5, p. 153.
- 6. Al-Bayhaqi, Dala'il al-Nubuwwa, Vol. 3, p. 161.
- 7. Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya, Vol. 3, p. 346.
- 8. Al-Hada'iq al-Wardiyya, Vol. 1, p. 52.
- 9. Al-Mawahib al-Laduniyya, Vol. 1, p. 198.
- 10. Jamharat Ansab al-`Arab, p. 16. Refer also to p. 37.
- 11. Ibid., p. 37.
- 12. Nuzul al-Abrar, p. 134.

- 13. Al-Riyad al-Nadira, Vol. 4, p. 239. Thakha'ir al-'Ugba, pp. 116-17.
- 14. Thakha'ir al-`Uqba, p. 55. Irshad al-Sari, Vol. 6, p. 141.
- 15. Al-Bahr al-Zakhkhar, Vol. 1, p. 221.
- 16. 1bid., Vol. 1, p. 221.
- 17. Ithaf al-Sa'il, p. 33.
- 18. Lubab al-Ansab wal Alqab wal A'qab, Vol. 1, p. 337.
- 19. Al-Jawhara fi Ansab al-Imam Ali wa Alih, p. 19.
- 20. Usd al-Ghaba, Vol. 4, p. 308.
- 21. Al-Isaba, Vol. 4, p. 471.
- 22. Al-Tabyeen fi Ansab al-Qarashiyyin, p. 133.
- 23. Ibid., pp. 91-92.
- 24. Tarikh al-Hijra al-Nabawiyya, p. 58.
- 25. Sifat al-Safwa, Vol. 2, p. 9.
- 26. Al-Tuhfa al-Latifa fi Tarikh al-Medina al-Sharifa, Vol. 1, p. 19.
- 27. Refer to Al-Riyad al-Mustataba by al-`Amiri al-Yamani, pp. 292-93.
- 28. Nur al-Absar, p. 147.
- 29. Tarikh al-Khamis, Vol. 1, p. 279.
- 30. Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya, Vol. 7, p. 332.
- 31. Al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar, Vol. 1, p. 181.
- 32. Al-Thurriyya al-Tahira, pp. 90, 155.
- 33. Al-Ma`arif, pp. 143, 210.
- 34. Ibid., p. 211.
- 35. Nihayat al-`Arab, Vol. 20, p. 221.
- 36. Ibid., Vol. 18, p. 213.
- 37. Ibid., Vol. 20, p. 223.
- 38. Tathkirat al-Khawass, p. 322.
- 39. Refer to Sharh al-Mawahib by al-Zarqani, Vol. 4, p. 339.
- 40. Tathkirat al-Khawass, p. 193.
- 41. Yanabi` al-Mawadda, p. 201. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 539.
- 42. `Uyun al-Athar, Vol. 2, p. 290.
- 43. Habib al-Siyar, Vol. 1, p. 436.
- 44. Al-Ya'qubi, Tarikh, Vol. 2, p. 213.
- 45. Al-Bid' wal Tarikh, Vol. 5, p. 75.
- 46. Al-Rawda al-Fayha' fi Tawarikh al-Nisa', p. 252.
- 47. Al-Qamus al-Muhit, Vol. 2, p. 55. The same is cited on p. 238, Vol. 43, of Bihar al-Anwar.
- 48. Taj al-`Arus, Vol. 3, p. 389. Ibn Manzur, Lisan al-`Arab, Vol. 4, p. 393.
- 49. Al-Bayhaqi, Dala'il al-Nubuwwa, Vol. 3, p. 162. Refer to p. 213, Vol. 43 of Bihar al-Anwar and to p. 480, Vol. 11, of `Awalim al-`Ulum.
- 50. Jami` al-Usul, Vol. 12, pp. 9-10. The author says that this statement is transmitted by Razan and by the author of Diya' al-`Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 4, p. 2.
- 51. Thakha'ir al-`Uqba, p. 55. Irshad al-Sari, Vol. 6, p. 141. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 539.
- 52. Siyar A`lam al-Nubala', Vol. 2, p. 119.
- 53. Al-Isaba, Vol. 3, p. 471.
- 54. Al-A'imma al Ithna-`Ashar, p. 58.
- 55. Tahthib al-Asma', Vol. 1, p. 349.
- 56. Tarikh al-Khamis, Vol. 1, pp. 278-79.
- 57. Ibn Kathir, Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya, Vol. 5, p. 293.
- 58. Al-Thiqat, Vol. 2, p. 304.

- 59. Al-Ashkhar al-Yamani, Sharh Bahjat al-Mahafil, Vol. 2, p. 138.
- 60. Ma'athir al-Inafa, Vol. 1, p. 100.
- 61. Thakha'ir al-'Uqba. 'Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 539.
- 62. Nur al-Absar, p. 103.
- 63. Rawdat al-Munazir, Vol. 7, p. 195 (cited in a footnote of Al-Kamil fil Tarikh).
- 64. Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 1, p. 272, citing al-Khawarizmi's book Maqtal al-Husayn 団, p. 83.
- 65. "Umar Abul-Nasr, Fatima (sa) bint Rasul Allah Muhammed (S), p. 93.
- 66. Manaqib al Abu Talib, Vol. 3, p. 132. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, pp. 16-17. Al-Hidaya al-Kubra, p. 176. Diya'
- al-'Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, p. 11 from Al-Manaqib and 'Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 69.
- 67. Muntaha al-Amal, Vol. 1, p. 263.
- 68. Al-Qummi, Tafsir, Vol. 1, p. 128. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 7, pp. 328-39 and Vol. 23, pp. 130-31 and Vol. 12, pp.
- 6, 7. Tafsir Nar al-Thaqalayn, Vol. 1, p. 348 and Tafsir Al-Burhan, Vol. 1, pp. 328-39.
- 69. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 38, p. 145, citing Al-Manaqib.
- 70. Al-Kafi, Vol. 6, p. 18. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 411. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, pp. 195 and Vol. 10, p. 112 and Vol. 101, p. 118. Refer to Al-Khisal, Vol. 2, p. 634, `Ilal al-Sha'i`, Vol. 2, p. 464 and Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, p. 222.
- 71. Tarikh Ahl al-Bayt, quoting statements from Imams al-Baqir T, al-Sadiq T, al-Rida T, and al-`Askari T, p. 93.
- 72. Al-Irbili, Kashf al-Ghumma, Vol. 2, p. 67, citing al-Shafi'i.
- 73. Is af al-Raghibin (included in a footnote in Nur al-Absar), p. 86.
- 74. Tarikh al-A'imma (included among precious essays and published by Intisharat Basirati, Qum, Iran), p. 16.
- 75. Al-Irbili, Kashf al-Ghumma, Vol. 2, p. 67 from Kamal ad-Din ibn Talhah, may Allah have mercy on him.
- 76. Taj al-Mawalid, p. 18.
- 77. Tanqih al-Maqal, Vol. 3, p. 82.
- 78. Taj al-Mawalid, pp. 23-24 (published among precious essays by Intisharat Basirati, Qum, Iran).
- 79. Al-Fusul al-Muhimma, p. 126. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 32, p. 90.
- 80. Nuzhat al-Majalis, Vol. 2, pp. 184, 194.
- 81. Shaikh al-Mufid, Al-Irshad, Vol. 1, p. 355. Al-Irbali, Kashf al-Ghumma, Vol. 2, p. 67. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol.
- 42, p. 90.
- 82. I`lam al-Wara, p. 203.
- 83. Al-Mustajad min Kitab al-Irshad, p. 140 (published among precious essays by the Basirati Library, Qum, Iran).
- 84. Al-`Umda, p. 30.
- 85. Kitab al-Arba`in, pp. 67-68.
- 86. Matalib al-Su'l, p. 45.
- 87. Sayyid Mahdi al-Suweej, Awlad al-Imam Ali E, p. 46, quoting p. 6 of the said family tree.
- 88. Refer to the previous reference as cited by Mashariq al-Anwar by al-Hamzawi, p. 132.
- 89. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, p. 370. Al-Bayadi (may Allah have mercy on him), Al-Sirat al-Mustaqim, Vol. 3, p. 12.
- 90. Kamil Baha'i (in Persian), p. 309.
- 91. Al-Tatimma fi Tawarikh al-A'imma, p. 28 (1412 A.H. edition), p. 28 (distributed by Dar al-Kitab al-Islami, Beirut, Lebanon).
- 92. Ibid., p. 39.
- 93. Al-Mujdi fi Ansab al-Talibiyyin, p. 12.
- 94. Ibn Shahr Ashub, Al-Manaqib, Vol. 3, p. 407 (published by Dar al-Adwa'). Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, pp. 237, 233. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 539.
- 95. Ibn Shahr Ashub, Manaqib al Abu Talib. Refer also to p. 91, Vol. 42 of Bihar al-Anwar.
- 96. Fatima al-Zahra': Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa, Vol. 2, p. 532. Nawa'ib al-Duhur, p. 192.
- 97. Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 343-44. Kamil al-Ziyarat, pp. 326-27. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 25, p. 373. Basa'ir al-Darajat.
- 98. Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 184-85. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 29, p. 192. Al-Muqarram, Wafat al-Siddiqa al-Zahra' (sa), p. 78.
- 99. Dala'il al-Imama, p. 45. Bihar al-Anwar, vo. 43, p. 170. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, pp. 411, 504.
- 100. Muhaj al-Da`awat, pp. 257-58. Al-Kaf`ami, Misbah, pp. 553-54. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 3, p. 393 and Vol. 83, p. 223.

- Al-`Ataridi, Musnad al-Imam al-Rida 1, Vol. 2, p. 65.
- 101. Al-Imama (manuscript), p. 81
- 102. Diya' al-'Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, pp. 62-64.
- 103. Al-Khawajoo'i, Al-Rasa'il al-I'tiqadiyya, p. 444.
- 104. Ibid., p. 446.
- 105. Al-Khawajoo'i, Taraq al-Rashid (included among Al-Rasa'il al-l'tiqadiyya), p. 301.
- 106. Al-Hada'iq al-Nadira, Vol. 5, p. 180.
- 107. Sayyid Muhammed Qulli Al-Musawi, Tashyeed al-Mata`in, Vol. 1 where he has written scores of pages detailing this incident.
- 108. Al-Sawarim al-Madiya (manuscript), p. 56.
- 109. Rawdat al-Jinan, Vol. 1, p. 358.
- 110. Talkhis al-Shafi, Vol. 3, pp. 156-57.
- 111. Al-Naqd, p. 298.
- 112. Al-Lawami` al-Ilahiyya fi al-Mabahith al-Kalamiyya, p. 302.
- 113. Al-Sirat al-Mustaqim, Vol. 3, p. 12.
- 114. A Debate Between al-Gharawi and al-Harawi (published in 1397 A.H.), pp. 47-48
- 115. Nafahat al-Lahut, p. 130.
- 116. Al-Tasatturi, Ihqaq al-Haqq, Vol. 2, p. 374.
- 117. Sirat al-'A'imma al-Ithnai 'Ashar, Vol. 2, p. 374.
- 118. Ithbat al-Wasiyya, p. 143. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 308-309.
- 119. Al-Shahristani, Al-Milal wal Nihal, Vol. 1, p. 57. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 416. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 271, 281. Bahj al-Sibagha, Vol. 5, p. 15. Al-Wafi bil Wafiyyat, Vol. 6, p. 17. Bayt al-Ahzan, p. 124.
- 120. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 2, p. 60.
- 121. Al-Urjuza al-Mukhtara, pp. 88-93.
- 122. Al-Turayhi, Al-Muntakhab, p. 293.
- 123. Urjuza fi Tawarikh al-Nabiy wa al-'A'imma (as) (manuscript), pp. 13, 14. A photocopy of this book is available at the Library of the Center for Islamic Studies in Beirut, Lebanon. Refer to A'lam al-Nisa', Vol. 2, pp. 316, 317.
- 124. Al-Anwar al-Qudsiyya, pp. 42-44.
- 125. Fara'id al-Simtayn, Vol. 2, pp. 34, 35. Shaikh al-Saduq, Al-Amali, pp. 99–101. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 1, pp. 280–81. Al-Daylami, Irshad al-Qulub, p. 295. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 37–39 and Vol. 43, pp. 172–73. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 391–92. Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, pp. 186–88. Bisharat al-Mustafa, pp. 197–200. Ibn Shathan, Al-Fada'il, pp. 8–11 edited by al-Armawi. Ghayat al-Maram, p. 48. Al-Muhtadir, pp. 199–200.
- 126. lqbal al-A`mal, p. 625. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, pp. 199-200.
- 127. Al-Kaf`ami, Misbah, p. 522.
- 128. Sulaym ibn Qays's book, pp. 590–97. Al-Tibrisi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, pp. 210–16. Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1. Refer also to Mir'at al-`Uqul, Vol. 5, pp. 319–20, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 268, 270 and Vol. 43, pp. 197–200, Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 400, 404 and Diya' al-`Alamin, Vol. 2, pp. 63, 64.
- 129. Kifayat al-Talib, p. 413.
- 130. Hadaqat al-Shi`a, pp. 265-66.
- 131. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, pp. 294-95.
- 132. Ma`ani al-Akhbar, pp. 205-07. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 39, pp. 41-42.
- 133. Kamil al-Ziyarat, pp. 332-35. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 62-64. Refer also to Vol. 53, p. 23. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 398. Al-Majlisi, Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, pp. 184-86.
- <u>134.</u> Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 53, pp. 14-23. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 441-443. Al-Hidaya al-Kubra, p. 392. Hilyat al-Abrar, Vol. 2, p. 652.
- 135. Fatima al-Zahra': Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa, Vol. 2, p. 532, citing Nawa'ib al-Duhur, p. 194. Al-Hidaya al-Kubra, p. 417.
- 136. Refer to the footnote on p. 553 of Shaikh al-Kaf`ami's book Al-Misbah. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 82, p. 261.
- 137. Al-Kaf`ami, Al-Misbah, p. 553. Al-Balad al-Amin, pp. 551-52. `Ilm al-Yaqin, p. 701. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 2, p. 261.

- 138. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, pp. 348-50, citing al-Daylami's Irshad al-Qulub.
- 139. Al-Tibrisi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, p. 414. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, p. 197. Mir'at al-`Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 321. Diya' al-`Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, p. 321.
- 140. Dala'il al-Imama, pp. 26-27. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 504.
- 141. Rawdat al-Muttaqin, Vol. 5, p. 342.
- 142. Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, p. 193.
- 143. Mir'at al-`Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 318. Refer to the biographies in A`lam al-Nisa', Vol. 2, p. 321.
- 144. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 209-10.
- 145. Ibid., Vol. 82, p. 264.
- 146. Nawadir al-Akhbar, p. 183. `Ilm al-Yaqin, pp. 686, 688. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 414.
- 147. Al-Turayhi, Al-Muntakhab, p. 136.
- 148. Conference of Baghdad's Scholars, pp. 135–37.
- 149. Al-Bid' wal Tarikh, Vol. 5, pp. 20-21.
- 150. Ibid., Vol. 5, p. 73.
- 151. Ibid., Vol. 5, p. 75.
- 152. Ibid., Vol. 5, p. 20.
- 153. ''Umar Abu al-Nasr, Fatima (sa) Bint Rasul Allah Muhammed (S), p. 94 (published by the office of ''Umar Abu al-Nasr for authorship, translation and journalism, Beirut, Lebanon).
- 154. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, p. 522, quoting Al-Kafi and p. 294, Vol. 1, of Manaqib Al Abu Talib by Ibn Shahr Ashub.
- 155. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, p. 496 in a footnote from p. 66, Vol. 2, of Al-Kafi.
- 156. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, p. 502 in a footnote citing pp. 32-33 of Al-Amali by the mentor al-Tusi.
- 157. Ahmed Fahmi, Al-Batul al-Tahira, p. 128 from Al-Manaqib by Ibn Shahr Ashub.
- 158. Refer to the book titled Fatima al-Zahra' (sa) in al-Ahadith al-Nabawiyya, pp. 183-84 and p. 87 of Al-Nafahat al-Qudsiyya from Rawdat al-Wa`izin.
- 159. Consult the following references: p. 126 of Al-Batul al-Tahira by Shaikh Ahmed Fahmi Muhammed from al-Suddi, p. 43, Vol. 13 of Sharh Nahjul-Balagha by the Mu`tazilite scholar [Ibn Abul-Hadid], pp. 527–28, Vol. 22, of Bihar al-Anwar by al-Majlisi, p. 294, Vol. 1 of Manaqib Al Abu Talib, p. 85 of Al-Nafahat al-Qudsiyya by `Abd al-Razzaq Kammuna (published in 1390 A.H./1970 A.D. by Dar al-Sadiq in Beirut, Lebanon) from p. 312, Vol. 1 of al-Nisa'i's Sunan and other references. 160. Al-Tanbih wal Radd `ala Ahl al-Ahwa' wal Bida`, pp. 25–26, edited by Muhammed Zahid al-Kawthari.

#### Source URL:

https://www.al-islam.org/tragedy-al-zahra-doubts-and-responses-jafar-murtadha-al-amili/al-muhsin-texts-and-legacies#comment-0