

[Home](#) > [Fabricated Traditions](#) > [As Prophet \(S\) falls ill he wants to meet someone](#) > Evaluation of tradition

---

## As Prophet (S) falls ill he wants to meet someone

The fourth fabricated tradition is about the excellence of Uthman. This tradition is mentioned by Ibn Majah in his *Sunan*. He narrates from Muhammad bin Abdullah bin Namir and Ali bin Muhammad from Waki'a from Ismael bin Abu Khalid from Qays bin Abu Hazim who quotes Aisha as saying:

As the Holy Prophet (S) fell ill he said: I would like to have one my companions with me.

We said: O Messengers of Allah! Should we bring you Abu Bakr?

The Holy Prophet (S) was silent saying nothing.

We said: Should we bring you Umar?

The Holy Prophet (S) was silent saying nothing.

We said: Should we bring you Uthman?

The Holy Prophet (S) said: Yes

We told Uthman to come and he came and met the Messenger of Allah. As the Holy Prophet was talking to him, Uthman's face was turning pale.

Qays quotes Abu Sahla, Uthman's slave as saying that Uthman bin Affan on Yawm al-Dar said: The Messenger of Allah made a covenant with me and I am going to fulfill it.

Ali bin Muhammad has narrated this tradition in a slightly different manner. According to his version, Uthman says: I will continue to keep that covenant.

Qays says: It was believed that the covenant was the day when Uthman was killed. [1](#)

Hakim has narrated this tradition on his own documentation from Ismael bin Abu Khalid, from Qays bin Abu Hazim from Abu Sahla (Uthman's slave), from Aisha. He adds that the chain of its transmitters is authentic, though Muslim and Bukhari have not reported it.[2](#)

## Evaluation of tradition

One of the narrators this chain includes is Qays bin Abu Hazim about whom scholars of tradition have said different things.

Zahabi and Ibn Hajar narrated something from Ya'aqub bin Shaiba concerning him. In his *Mizan al-Itidal*, Ibn Hajar says: Companions have talked about Qays. Some have regarded him as great and honorable considering his traditions as the most authentic ones whereas others have criticized him saying that he reported unknown traditions. Those who have praised him have not regarded these traditions as unknown. They have put them in the rank of strange traditions. Others have criticized him saying that he used to criticize Ali (a.s).

It is however clear that he used to prefer Uthman to Ali (a.s) and that is the reason why most Kufis have not reported any tradition from him.[3](#)

In his *Tadrib al-Rawi*, commenting on him, Suyuti says: Here I want to mention names that were accused of innovation, but Bukhari and Muslim or one of them have however, reported from them. He considers Qays as one of those who were accused of showing hostility towards Ali (a.s).[4](#)

[1.](#) – Sunan Ibn Majah, vol. 1, p. 139 and 130, tradition, no, 113.

[2.](#) – Al-Mustadrak als al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p. 106, tradition, no, 4543.

[3.](#) – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 5, p. 476 and Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 8, p. 336.

[4.](#) – Tadrib al-Rawi, vol. 1, pp. 278 and 279.