

Published on Al-Islam.org (https://www.al-islam.org)

Home > Kamaaluddin wa Tamaamun Ni'ma Vol. 2 > Chapter 40: After Hasan and Husain (a.s.) no two brothers can be Imams

Chapter 40: After Hasan and Husain (a.s.) no two brothers can be Imams

1 – Narrated to us my father and Muhammad bin Hasan – May Allah be pleased with them – they said: Narrated to us Saad bin Abdullah and Abdullah bin Ja'far Himyari, all of them from Muhammad bin Isa bin Ubaid from Yunus bin Abdur Rahman from Husain bin Thuwair bin Abi Fakhta from Abi Abdullah (a.s.) that he said:

"The Imamate will never be diverted between two brothers after al-Hasan and Husain; it proceeds from Ali Ibn Husain, as Allah, the Blessed, the Sublime, said:

Some of those who are bound by blood are closer (to each other) than others in the Book of Allah. 1

There was no one after Ali Ibn Husain (a.s..), except it went to the next descendant or the next descendant of the next descendant."

2 – Narrated to us Muhammad bin Hasan bin Ahmad bin Walid (r.a.): Muhammad bin Hasan al-Saffar from Yaqoob bin Yazid from Muhammad bin Isa bin Ubaid from Husain bin Hasan Farisi from Sulaiman bin Ja'far Ja'fari from Hammad bin Isa from Abi Abdullah (a.s.) that he said:

"The Imamate will never come together in two brothers after Hasan and Husain (a.s.). It will continue in his (Husain's) progeny one generation after another."

3 –Narrated to us Muhammad bin Musa bin Mutawakkil (r.a.): Narrated to us Ali bin Husain Saadabadi from Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Khalid from his father from Muhammad bin Sinan from Yunus bin Yagoob from Abi Abdullah (a.s.) that he said:

"Allah does not accept to appoint to it (the Imamate) two brothers after al-Hasan and Husain (a.s.)."

4 – Narrated to us Muhammad bin Hasan bin Ahmad bin Walid (r.a.): Narrated to us Husain bin Hasan bin Aban from Husain bin Saeed from Muhammad bin Sinan from Abi Salam from Surah bin Kulaib from Abi Baseer from Abi Ja'far (a.s.) regarding the words of Allah, the Mighty and Sublime:

And he made it a word to continue in his posterity.2

That it is regarding Imam Husain (a.s.). It (Imamate) will be transferred from one to another in his progeny generation after generation and it will not return to the brother or uncle."

5 – Narrated to us my father: Narrated to us Saad bin Abdullah and Abdullah bin Ja'far Himyari, all of them from Ibrahim bin Hashim from Abi Ja'far Muhammad bin Ja'far [from his father] from Abdul Hameed bin Nasr from Abi Ismail from Abi Abdullah (a.s.) that he said:

"Imamate will never come together in two brothers after Hasan and Husain (a.s.). It will continue in his (Husain's) progeny one generation after another."

6 –Narrated to us Muhammad bin Musa bin Mutawakkil (r.a.): Narrated to us Ali bin Husain Sadabadi from Ahmad bin Abi Abdullah Barqi from his father from Muhammad bin Abi Umair from more than persons, from Abi Baseer from Abi Abdullah (a.s.) that he said:

"When Fatima (s.a.) gave birth to Imam Husain (a.s.) her father told her the Ummah will slay him after he (Prophet) has passed away. She said: I don't need (deserve) this. The Prophet said: Indeed Allah, the Mighty and Sublime informed me that He has appointed Imams from his progeny. She said: Now I am satisfied, O Messenger of Allah (S)."

7 – Narrated to us my father: Narrated to us Saad bin Abdullah and Abdullah bin Ja'far Himyari, all of them from Muhammad bin Husain bin Abil Khattab and Muhammad bin Isa bin Ubaid, all of them from Abdur Rahman bin Abi Najran from Isa bin Abdullah Alawi Umari that he asked Abi Abdullah (a.s.) Ja'far bin Muhammad as–Sadiq (a.s.):

"May I be sacrificed on you, may Allah not show me the day when you are not alive. If this happens whom should we refer to? The Imam pointed to Imam Musa Kazim (a.s.). And if Imam Musa Kazim (a.s.) passes away? He said: His son. And if his son passes away leaving a brother who is grown up and son who is young? Which of them should we follow? The Imam said: His son, it will be like this forever. I said: What should we do if we don't know who and where he is? He replied: Say: O Allah I have attached myself to Your remaining Divine Proof from the sons of the previous Imam. That would be sufficient."

8 - Narrated to us Muhammad bin Musa bin Mutawakkil (r.a.): Narrated to us Abdullah bin Ja'far

Himyari: Narrated to us Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Isa: Narrated to us Hasan bin Mahboob from Ali Ibne Riyab that he said: Abi Abdullah (a.s.) said:

"When Fatima (s.a.) was expectant with Imam Husain (a.s.) the Messenger of Allah (S) told her: Allah, the Mighty and Sublime has gifted you a male child whose name is Husain. My Ummah would slay him. Fatima said: I don't need (deserve) this. The Prophet said: Indeed Allah, the Mighty and Sublime has promised me about him. She asked: And what is that promise? He replied: He promised me that He will appoint Imamate in his progeny after him. She said: Now I am satisfied."

9 – Narrated to us Muhammad bin Ibrahim bin Ishaq (r.a.): Informed us Ahmad bin Muhammad Hamadani: Narrated to us Ali bin Hasan bin Ali bin Faddal from his father from Hisham bin Saalim that: I asked As–Sadiq Ja'far bin Muhammad (a.s.):

"Who is superior, Hasan or Husain? He replied: Hasan is superior to Husain. I said: Then how come the Imamate has come in the generations of Husain after him? And not in the generations of Hasan? The Imam said: Allah, the Mighty and Sublime wanted to effect the Sunnah of Musa and Harun in Hasan and Husain (a.s.).

Have you not seen that they shared prophethood like Hasan and Husain shared Imamate and Allah, the Mighty and Sublime placed prophethood in the progeny of Harun and not in the progeny of Musa, even though Musa was superior to Harun (a.s.)? I said: Would there be two Imams at the same time? He replied: No, except that one of them may be silent and under the command of the other. And the other will be the speaking Imam for his counterpart.

But as to whether there can be two speaking Imams at the same time? No. I said: Would Imamate be inherited between two brothers after Hasan and Husain (a.s.)? He said: No, it will continue in the progeny of Husain (a.s.) like Allah, the Mighty and Sublime has said:

And he made it a word to continue in his posterity. 3

Thus Imamate will continue in his progeny generation after generation till the Judgment Day."

10 – Narrated to us Muhammad bin Musa bin Mutawakkil (r.a.): Narrated to us Muhammad bin Yahya al-Attar from Muhammad bin Husain bin Abil Khattab from Ali bin Asbat from Ali bin Abi Hamza from Abi Baseer from Abi Abdullah (a.s.) that he said regarding the words of Allah, the Mighty and Sublime:

And (how many a) deserted well and palace raised high.4

The 'deserted well' is the silent (inactive) Imam and 'and palace raised high' denotes the speaking (active) Imam."

- 1. Surah Anfaal 8:75
- 2. Surah Zukhruf 43:28
- 3. Surah Zukhruf 43:28
- 4. Surah Hajj 22:45

Source URL:

https://www.al-islam.org/kamaaluddin-wa-tamaamun-nima-vol-2-shaykh-saduq/chapter-40-after-has an-and-husain-no-two-brothers#comment-0