

Published on Al-Islam.org (https://www.al-islam.org)

Home > Tagleed & Ijtihad > Commentary by Imam Hasan al-Askari (as)

Commentary by Imam Hasan al-Askari (as)

Whether it is a treasure of Commentaries or a collection of Traditions; whether it is organized by the earlier intellectuals or collected by later authors; all such researches cannot be declared totally clean. So even in those books of Islamic Knowledge that are generally depended on by all Muslims some people are able to find faults, such as, "this anecdote looks similar to Israeli stories; the narrators of this tradition do not come up to the mark; that tradition does not have solid proofs; there is some doubt in this tradition; and so on".

However, in spite of all such faults no presentation has totally been discarded because if people start rejecting books for minor defects, there will be no such thing left as a book. This is why the scholars do not outrightly throw away someone's hard work when they find some deficiency, rather they try to explain it.

What is surprising is that some people show such disdain towards the Commentary associated with Imam Hasan Askari (as) as if they will lose Islam by just looking at it or they will be left faith–less; even though what is mentioned in this book is also there in other collections.

There can only be one explanation – people belonging to a certain group have been clamoring for a long time that taqleed is not mentioned in the literature related to Shia belief system, whereas the Commentary under discussion clearly and emphatically recounts the issue of taqleed and ljtihad in the sacred words of the virtuous Imam. With this background in mind, it will not be unreasonable to say that the taqleed–denying folks intentionally or un–intentionally have not done justice to the under–discussion commentary.

At this point we have 42 critiques of this book. Twelve of them have negative opinion on it and thirty favor it. The books with negative opinion are the following:

- 1. Kitabuz Zuafa by Ibnul Ghazairi
- 2. Khulasatul Aqwal by Allama Hilli
- 3. Nagdur Rijal by Al-Tafrashi

- 4. Shara Un-Nijat by Researcher Damad
- 5. Minhaj Ul-Miqal by Speaker Ustarabadi
- 6. Jama Ur-Riwat by Urdbaili
- 7. Majma Ur-Rijal by Qahbani
- 8. Aala Ur-Rahman by Muhammad Jawad Balaghi
- 9. Kitabul Akhbar by Researcher Tastari
- 10. Hashia Majma Ul-Bayan by Mirza Abul Hasan Sha'rani
- 11. Majam Rijal Ul-Hadith by Ayatullah Sayed Abul Qasim Khooi
- 12. Fighatur Ridha' by Sayed Muhammad Hashim Khwansari

The list of scholarly works with positive attitude is as follows:

- 1. Man La Yahzaratul Faqiah by Sheikh Saduk Muhammad Ibn Babuya Qumi
- 2. At-Tawhid by same author
- 3. Al-Uyun by same author
- 4. Al-Kamal by same author
- 5. Al-Aamali by same author
- 6. Al-Alal by same author
- 7. Maanil Akhbar by same author
- 8. Al-Ihtijaj by Abu Mansu Tibrisi
- 9. Al-Kharaij by Qutub Ravandi
- 10. Maalim Ul-Ulama by Ibn Shehr Ashob
- 11. Maniatul Murid by Shaheed Sani
- 12. Rauzatul Muttaqeen by Majlisi First Muhammad Taqi
- 13. Bihar Ul-Anwar, vol 1 by Majlisi Second Muhammad Baqir
- 14. Wasayl ush-Shia by Sheikh Hurr al-Amili

- 15. Isbat UI-Hidat by same author
- 16. Tafsir Safi by Faiz Kashani
- 17. Tafsir Burhan by Sayed Hashim Bohrani
- 18. Tafseer Noor Us-Saqalain by Sheikh Abd Ali Havezi
- 19. Aklail Ur-Rijal by Muhammad Ja'far Khurasani
- 20. Al-Fawahidul Najafia by Sheikh Sulaiman Bohrani
- 21. Muntahil Miqal by Abu Ali
- 22. Al Taaliqatu Ali Minhajul Miqal by Wahid Bahihani
- 23. Tafsir Miraatul Anwar by Sheikh Abul Hasan Al Sharif
- 24. Itganul Migal by Sheikh Muhammad Taha
- 25. Tasliatul Fawad by Sayed Abdullah Shabbar
- 26. Nakhbitul Miqal by Sayed Hussain Barojardi
- 27. Sahifatul Abrar by Hujjat Ul Islam Tabrezi
- 28. Awalimul Ulum by Sheikh Abdullah Bohrani
- 29. Faraidul Usul by Sheikh Ansari
- 30. Tanqihul Miqal by Sheikh Abdullah Mamiqani
- 31. Jami Ahadith Ush-Shia by Ayatullah Barojardi
- 32. Alzaria vol 4 p 283 by Allama Tehrani

The well–known authors of the books in this list have written at length about this commentary. They have scrutinized it from every angle and have praised it a great deal. As an example, Majlisi First Muhammad Taqi (RA) has written in the Farsi commentary of Rauzatul Muttageen and Faqih:

"The truth of the matter is that this commentary is one of the treasures of Allah (SWT)." 1

And Majlisi Second Muhammad Baqir writes on p 28, vol 1 of Bihar UI-Anwar, "This commentary referenced to Imam Hasan al-Askari (as) is a well-known book and the well-known personality, Sheikh Saduq, has expressed confidence in it."

In addition, the author of Wasayl ush-Shia, Sheikh Hurr al-Amili has counted it as a source for his creation, Fiqhi Dairatul Maarif Wasail. Similarly, the famous researcher, Sayed Abdullah Shabbar, also labels this commentary as the foundation for his own scholarly works. And Ayatullah Burujardi says, "I am one of the beneficiaries of this commentary by Imam al-Askari (as)."

1. Commentary on Faqih, vol 5, p 142 – 213

Source URL:

https://www.al-islam.org/taqleed-ijtihad-allama-syed-ibn-hasan-najafi/commentary-imam-hasan-al-a skari#comment-0