

Incident In The Wording Of Traditionists And Historians

[Ziyarat of al-Zahra' \(sa\), the Truthful Lady](#)

1. Shaikh al-Mufid has recorded one *ziyara* for Fatima (sa) saying, “Peace with you, O Messenger of Allah S! Peace with your daughter, the truthful, the purified one! Peace with you, O Fatima daughter of the Messenger of Allah S! O Head of the Women of the World! O *batul* البتول, martyr, purified one..., etc.”^{[1](#)}

2. Another text reads: “Peace with you, O martyred *batul*, daughter of the Prophet of Mercy!”^{[2](#)}

There is another text that says, “Peace with you, O truthful martyr!”^{[3](#)}

3. Another text says: “Peace with you, O martyred truthful one whose inheritance was confiscated, whose rib was broken, whose husband was oppressed and whose son was killed!”^{[4](#)}

Shaikh al-Saduq, may Allah have mercy on him, has said, “I have not found any specific *ziyara* for the Truthful Lady, so I have commended what I have stated in this book to my reader what I commend for my own self.”^{[5](#)} He said so commenting on the afore-mentioned *ziyara* which contains this statement: “Peace with you, O Truthful Lady, O Martyr!”^{[6](#)}

4. Citing her *ziyara*, Shaikh al-Tusi, may Allah have mercy on him, addresses her thus: “O one who was tried, tried by Allah...” I found this narrative about Fatima (sa). As regarding what I found our own folks saying when reciting her *ziyara*, you must stand at one of the two locations which we mentioned^{[7](#)} and say: “Peace with you, O daughter of the Messenger of Allah S... Peace with you, O truthful lady, martyr..., etc.”^{[8](#)}

5. Another text reads: “O Lord! Bless the bereaved lady, the honorable and the praised one, the lofty martyr.”^{[9](#)}

6. Al-Kaf'ami has said that Fatima's children were five and that the cause of her death was beating and miscarriage."

As regarding the details of the oppression to which she was exposed, some such details have been cited above as well as what the historians and authors have written in their books. We started by what Sulaym ibn Qays has narrated in his valuable book which is one of the reliable references which contain details of what actually took place.

7. Islam's mentor, *'allama* Shaikh al-Majlisi, has narrated reliable transmissions by Sulaym ibn Qays al-Hilali and others from both Salman and al-'Abbas saying (the following text is from Sulaym's book):

Sulaym ibn Qays said, "When Ali (as) saw how people betrayed him and were reluctant to support him, agreeing with Abu Bakr, paying homage to him and respecting him, he remained at home. "Umar said to Abu Bakr, 'What stops you from calling on him to swear the oath of allegiance to you since nobody else remains to do so except him and these four men?' Abu Bakr was more soft-hearted than "Umar and more intelligent, as well as more far-sighted, whereas the other ("Umar) was the most rough, rude and crude. Abu Bakr said, 'Who should we send to him?' "Umar said, 'Let us send Qunfath to him, for he is a rough and tough man and a *taleeq*, one of the Banu 'Adiyy ibn Ka'b.' He sent him together with helpers to Ali (as). He sought Ali's permission to enter, but Ali (as) refused to let him in. Those in Qunfath's company returned to Abu Bakr and "Umar, who were sitting at the Mosque surrounded by people, and told them that they were not granted permission to enter. "Umar said, 'Go back. If he permits you, enter, but if he does not, enter without his permission!'"

They returned and again sought permission to enter. Fatima (sa) said to them, "I shall expose you to embarrassment if you enter my house without permission." They returned whereas the accursed Qunfath remained. They narrated what Fatima (sa) had told them, adding, "We felt too embarrassed to enter without permission."

"Umar then was angry and said, "Why should we pay attention to women?!" Then he ordered some men to carry firewood, and "Umar, too, carried firewood with them, placing it around the house where Ali and Fatima (as) and both their sons (as) lived. Then "Umar called out so Ali (as) and Fatima (sa) could hear him saying: "By Allah! You shall have to come out, O Ali, and you shall have to swear the oath of allegiance to the successor of the Messenger of Allah S or else I shall set your house ablaze!"

Fatima (sa) said, "O "Umar! What feud is there between us and you?" He said, "Open the door or else I shall burn your house!" She said, "O "Umar! Do you not fear Allah so you want to enter my house by force?" He refused to leave.

"Umar now ordered fire to be lit at the door. Then he pushed the door and forced himself inside. He found himself face-to-face with Fatima (sa) who called out: "O father! O Messenger of Allah S!" "Umar raised his sword which was still inside its scabbard, hitting her side with it. She screamed: "O father!" "Umar raised his whip and hit her arm. She called out: "O Messenger of Allah S! How badly have Abu

Bakr and "Umar succeeded you!"

Ali (as) leaped and pulled "Umar's clothes, then he pulled him and wrestled him to the ground, fracturing his nose and neck and was about to kill him. Then he remembered what the Messenger of Allah S had told him and how he admonished him to deal with those folks. Ali (as), therefore, said to "Umar, "I swear by the One Who honored Muhammed S with the Prophetic Mission, O son of Sakh¹⁰, that had it not been for a Book from Allah and a covenant entrusted to me by the Messenger of Allah S, you would have come to know that you are not such who would enter my house!"

"Umar cried out for help. People came and entered the house. Ali (as) took to his sword, so Qunfath returned to Abu Bakr fearing that Ali (as) would kill him, knowing his might and prowess.

Abu Bakr said to Qunfath, "Go back. If he comes out, that is alright; otherwise, enter his house by force. If he refuses to come out, set their house to fire." The accursed Qunfath set out. He and those in his company entered Ali's house by force and without permission.

Fatima (sa) intercepted them at the door. The cursed Qunfath hit her with the sword. When she died, her wrist had a mark looking like a bracelet because of being whipped by that damned slave.

Ali (as) was taken by force and brought to Abu Bakr. "Umar was standing next to Abu Bakr with his sword unsheathed. Khalid ibn al-Walid, Abu 'Ubaydah ibn al-Jarrah, Salim (slave of Abu Huthayfah), Mu'ath ibn Jabal, al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah, Aseed ibn Hassin, Bashir ibn Sa'd and other people were all sitting around Abu Bakr, all armed.

I said to Salman, "Did they really enter the house of Fatima (sa) without permission?!" He said, "Yes, by Allah, and she did not have a veil, so she cried out, 'O Father! O Messenger of Allah! O how badly you have been succeeded by Abu Bakr and "Umar while your eyes can still see though you are in your grave!' She called that out as loudly as she could. I saw Abu Bakr and those around him weeping (as they heard her say those words). They all wept except "Umar, Khalid ibn al-Walid and al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah. "Umar kept saying, 'We have nothing to do with what women say.' They took Ali (as) to Abu Bakr as he was saying, 'O by Allah! Had I had my sword in my hand, you would surely know that you would not be able to do what you are doing at all. By Allah! I do not blame myself if I fight you.

Had I only had forty supporters, I would have been able to disperse all the people you have rallied behind you. But the curse of Allah be on people who swore the oath of allegiance to me then betrayed me.' When Abu Bakr saw Ali (as), he shouted, 'set him free!' Ali (as) said, 'O Abu Bakr! How swiftly you have transgressed against the Messenger of Allah S! What gives you the right or which status permits you to invite the people to swear the oath of allegiance to you? Did you not yourself swear the oath of allegiance to me a few days¹¹ ago as ordered by Allah and as enjoined by the Messenger of Allah (S)?"

Qunfath, the curse of Allah on him, hit Fatima (sa) with the whip when she threw herself between him and her husband. "Umar had instructed him thus: "If Fatima (sa) intercepts you from reaching him

(reaching Ali (as)), you should whip her.” Qunfath, the curse of Allah on him, cornered her at the knob of her house’s door, pushed her and broke one of her ribs, so she miscarried a fetus. She remained in bed since then till she died as a martyr in the aftermath.

When Ali (as) was brought to Abu Bakr, “Umar rebuked him and rudely said to him: “Swear the oath of allegiance (and leave such falsehood of yours aside).” He (as) said to “Umar, “And if I do not, what are you all going to do?” They said, “We shall kill you in the most humiliating and contemptible way.” He (as) said, “You will then kill a servant of Allah and a Brother of His Messenger.” Abu Bakr said, “As regarding you being a servant of Allah, yes, I agree with that.

But as regarding you being the Brother of the Messenger of Allah S, we do not recognize you as such.” Ali (as) said, “Do you deny that the Messenger of Allah (S) had established Brotherhood between himself and myself [when he established brotherhood between the Ansar and the Muhajirun in Medina in the first Hijri year]?” Abu Bakr said, “Yes.” Ali (as) repeated his question to them three times! Then Ali (as) said, “O Muslims! O Muhajirun and Ansar! I ask you in the Name of Allah, have you heard the Messenger of Allah S on the Day of Ghadir Khumm say such-and-such?! And have you heard him in the Invasion of Tabuk say such-and-such?!” Ali (as) continued reminding them of what the Messenger of Allah (S) had said about him. They said, “Lord! We testify that he (as) said it.”

When Abu Bakr was afraid of a change of public opinion in favor of Ali (as) and that they would now oppose him, he said to Ali (as), “Any word of truth you have said we have heard it with our ears and recognized it, and our hearts have understood it. But we have also heard the Messenger of Allah (S) say, ‘We are members of a House whom Allah chose and honored, choosing for us the Hereafter over the temporal life. Allah decreed not to grant us both Prophetic Mission and Caliphate’.” Ali (as) asked Abu Bakr, “Has any of the *sahaba* of the Messenger of Allah S ever heard the Prophet S saying so besides yourself?” “Umar immediately said, “The successor of the Messenger of Allah S has said the truth, and I have heard it just as he stated it.” Abu ‘Ubaydah, Salim (slave of Abu Huthayfah) and Mu’ath ibn Jabal said, “He said the truth; we, too, heard the Messenger of Allah S say it.” Ali (as) said to all of them, “You have all fulfilled the promise which you had vowed as recorded in your (damned) *sahifa* to whose contents you swore at the Ka’ba saying, ‘If Allah causes Muhammed S to be killed, or if he dies, we shall shift this matter (caliphate) from Ahl al-Bayt.’”

Abu Bakr asked Ali (as), “How do you know about it and we never acquainted you with what is in it?!” Ali (as) said, “You, Zubayr, and you, Salman, and you, Abu Dharr, and you, Miqdad! I ask you in the Name of Allah and in the name of Islam, did you hear the Messenger of Allah (S) say as you heard: ‘So-and-so, till he counted the names of these five individuals, wrote a covenant and made a pledge and an agreement to which they all swore to do such-and-such if I am killed or if I die’?” They all said, “We invoke Allah to witness that yes, we have heard the Messenger of Allah S say so to you, that they made an agreement and a covenant to do what they have already done, writing a document to this effect that if the Prophet S was killed or if he died, they would oppose you and shift this (caliphate) from you, O Ali!”

You yourself said, “May my parents be sacrificed for your sake, O Messenger of Allah S! What do you order me to do if this comes to pass?” He said to you, “If you find supporters, you should oppose and fight them. But if you do not find enough supporters, you should swear fealty and safeguard your own blood.”

Ali (as) then said, “By Allah! Had those forty men who swore allegiance to me fulfilled their promise, I would have fought you. But, by Allah, none of your offspring shall ever achieve it till the Day of Judgment. What proves that you have told a lie about the Messenger of Allah S is the verse of the most Exalted One wherein He says, ‘Or do they envy the people for what Allah has bestowed on them of His grace? But indeed We have given Abraham’s children the Book and the wisdom, and We have given them a grand kingdom’ (Qur’an, 5:54), for the Book, the Prophetic Mission, the wisdom, the Sunnah, the kingdom and the caliphate are all ours, for we are from the family of Abraham.”

Al-Miqdad stood up and said, “O Ali (as)! What do you order me to do? By Allah! If you order me to strike anyone with my sword, I will do it. And if you do not, I shall refrain.” Ali (as) said, “Stop it, Miqdad, and remember the covenant with the Messenger of Allah (S) and what he ordered you to do.”

I stood up and said, “By the One in Whose hand my life is, had I known that I keep away oppression and thus strengthen the creed of Allah, I would have taken out my sword and stricken with it one after another. Do you really all leap like that on the Brother of the Messenger of Allah S and his successor over his nation and the father of his offspring?! Then receive the good news of tribulation and lose hope of prosperity!”

Abu Dharr stood up and said, “O nation confused after its Prophet S, betrayed because of its mutiny, Allah says,

‘Surely Allah chose Adam and Noah and the descendants of Abraham and the descendants of Imran (Amram) above all nations: offspring, one of the other, and Allah is Hearing, Knowing.’ (Qur’an, 3:33–34).

The Progeny of Muhammed S are the descendants of Noah, the family of Abraham are he descendants of Abraham, and the elite from among the lineage of Ishmael, the family of Prophet Muhammed S!

They are the household of the Prophetic Mission and the place of the Message. Angels visit them, and they are like the raised heavens, the fixed mountains, the veiled Ka’ba, the pure spring, the guiding stars, the blessed tree which emits light and whose decoration is blessed! Muhammed S of the Prophetic Mission is the seal of all the prophets, the master of the offspring of Adam, while Ali (as) is the *wasi* of all *wasis*, the Imam of the righteous, the leader of the good ones, the greatest Siddiq, the greatest Faruq, the *wasi* of Muhammed (S) of the Prophetic Mission, the heir of his knowledge and the one who has more authority over the believers than the believers have over their own selves just as the Almighty says,

'The Prophet has a greater claim on the Faithful (as) than they have on their own selves, and his wives are their mothers; and those of kinship have better claim in the ordinance of Allah of Prophetic Mission to inheritance, one with respect to the other, than (other) believers, and (than) those who have fled (their homes), except that you do some good to your friends; this is written in the Book' (Qur'an, 33:6).

So now you should prefer those whom Allah has preferred, and let others behind you, those whom Allah left behind, and make the authority and inheritance to those for whom Allah assigned them.”

“Umar stood up and said to Abu Bakr as the latter was sitting on the pulpit, “What keeps you sitting on this pulpit since this man is fighting you and is not swearing the oath of allegiance to you? Do you issue an order to kill him so we may strike his neck with the sword?” Al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) were both present... When they heard what Umar said, they wept. Ali (as) hugged them and said, “Do not weep, for by Allah, they both (Umar and Abu Bakr) shall never be able to kill your father.”

Umm Ayman, who nursed the Messenger of Allah S in his childhood, came in and said, “O Abu Bakr! How swiftly you have revealed your envy and hypocrisy!” Abu Bakr ordered her to be kicked out of the Mosque saying [repeating the words of his friend, Umar], “Why should we bother about women?”

Buraydah al-Aslami stood up and said, “O Umar! Do you really leap against the Brother of the Messenger of Allah S and the father of his offspring while you are one whom we, Quraishites, know very well who he is?! Are you both not the ones to whom the Messenger of Allah S said, ‘Go, both of you, to Ali (as) and address him as the Commander of the Faithful (as)’ and you both asked him, ‘Is this an order from Allah and His Messenger?’ and he said to you, ‘Yes,?’” Abu Bakr said, “This did, indeed, take place, but the Messenger of Allah S said after that, ‘My Ahl al-Bayt (as) shall not have both Prophetic Mission and caliphate’.” He said, “By Allah do I swear that the Messenger of Allah S *never* said so! By Allah do I swear that I shall never live in a town where you sit in charge.” Umar ordered him to be beaten and expelled! Then Umar said, “Stand up, O son of Abu Talib, and swear the oath of allegiance.” Ali (as) said, “And what if I do not?” Umar said, “Then by Allah we shall kill you.” Ali (as) argued with them in vain three times after which he stretched his hand without opening it. Abu Bakr slapped on it and accepted it as a token of his allegiance. But before doing so, Ali (as), while the rope was still around his neck, loudly recited this verse:

“O son of my mother! Surely the people deemed me weak and almost killed me” (Qur'an, 7: 150).

Al-Zubayr was told to swear the oath of allegiance, but he refused, whereon Umar, Khalid ibn al-Walid, al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah and other people leaped at him and took his sword away from him, hitting it on the ground and breaking it. Al-Zubayr, while Umar was on his chest, said to the latter, “O son of a sahk صهك! By Allah! Had my sword been in my hands, you would not have had the courage to stand in my way.” Then he was forced to swear it.

Salman said, “Then they took me and crushed my neck till they left it like a goiter. Then they took my

hand and twisted it, so I swore the oath of allegiance even against my wish.”

Then Abu Dharr and al-Miqdad swore it against their will. Only Ali (as) and these four men were forced to swear the oath of allegiance against their will. Al-Zubayr was the toughest in his speech. Having sworn it, he (addressing “Umar ibn al-Khattab) said, “O son of A sahk! By Allah! Had it not been for the tyrants who supported you, you would never have had the courage to face me while my sword is with me due to your well known cowardice and meanness. But you found oppressors whereby you deem yourself strong, so you now use them as your weapon.” “Umar was angry and asked him, “Do you mention the name of *Sahk* (at this place)?” “And what stops me from mentioning her?!” answered al-Zubayr, “and she was a prostitute.

Do you deny it?! Was she not a slave woman from Ethiopia and the property of my grandfather ‘Abd al-Muttalib?! Your grandfather, Nufayl, committed adultery with her, so she gave birth to your father al-Khattab. ‘Abd al-Muttalib then gave her away to your grandfather after the latter had committed adultery with her, so she gave birth to him [to al-Khattab]. Is he not a slave of my grandfather and the son of a prostitute?!” Abu Bakr interceded between both men, pushing each one of them aside from the other.

Sulaym ibn Qays said, “I asked Salman [al-Farisi], ‘Did you really swear the oath of allegiance, O Salman, to Abu Bakr without saying anything at all about that?’ He said, ‘Having sworn it, I said, ‘Woe unto you for eternity! Do you not know what you have committed against your own souls? You hit the mark while missing it! You followed the way of the people before you, the people of dissension and disunity, and you missed the Sunnah of your Prophet S, so much so that you took this Sunnah out of its substance and out of the hands of its people.’” “Umar said, “O Salman! Since your friend has sworn it, and since you yourself have done likewise, you may say whatever you wish to say, and you may do whatever you please, and let your friend, too, say whatever he likes.” Salman said, “I heard the Messenger of Allah S saying that on you (O “Umar!) and on your fellows shall fall the like of the sins of all his [Prophet’s] nation till the Day of Judgment and the like of all their torment.” He (“Umar) said, “Say whatever you wish to say.

Have you not sworn the oath of allegiance and Allah did not cool your eyes by seeing your friend [Ali (as)] taking charge of it?!” Salman said, “I testify that I have read in some of the Books revealed by Allah about the people of this Household that you, in your name and in your lineage and characteristics, are one of the Gates of Hell.” “Umar said to Salman, “Say whatever you wish to say.

Has Allah not removed it [caliphate] from the people of this House which you chose as lords besides Allah?” Salman said, “I testify that I heard the Messenger of Allah S saying that you yourself are implied in the following verse about which I asked him: ‘On that Day, no one shall chastise with (anything like) His chastisement, and no one shall bind with (anything like) His binding’ (Qur’an, 89:25–26).” “Umar said, “Shut your mouth, may Allah shut it forever, you slave and son of the stinking woman!” Ali (as) said to Salman, “O Salman! I ask you in the Name of Allah to remain silent.”[12](#)

8. In another text by Sulaym ibn Qays, the following is stated:

Ali (as), Banu Hashim, Abu Dharr, al-Miqdad, Salman and a few others did not swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr. "Umar said to Abu Bakr, "Look, you, all people have sworn the oath of allegiance to you except this man and his family members as well as these individuals; so, send someone to fetch him." Abu Bakr sent a cousin of "Umar named Qunfath to fetch Ali (as). He said to him, "Qunfath! Set out to Ali (as) and say to him, 'Answer the call of the successor of the Messenger of Allah S.'" Qunfath set out and conveyed the message. Ali (as) said, "How swiftly you all are in telling lies about the Messenger of Allah S! You have reneged from your oath [to the Messenger of Allah S] and you have betrayed [the one whom he S had assigned as his successor, namely Ali (as)]! By Allah! The Messenger of Allah S did not leave a successor to him besides myself. So, Qunfath! Go back, for you are only a bearer of a message, and tell him that by Allah, the Messenger of Allah S never assigned you as his successor, and you know exactly who the successor of the Messenger of Allah *really* is."

Qunfath went to Abu Bakr and conveyed the message. Abu Bakr said, "Ali (as) has said the truth! The Messenger of Allah S did NOT assign me as his successor!" "Umar became angry and leaped from his place, but Abu Bakr told him to sit. Then Abu Bakr said to Qunfath, "Go back and say to him, 'Answer the call of the commander of the Faithful Abu Bakr.'"

Qunfath returned, entered Ali's house and conveyed the message. Ali (as) said, "By Allah do I swear that he (Abu Bakr) has lied! Set out to him and say to him, 'By Allah! You have assumed a title which is not yours, and you know very well that the commander of the faithful is someone else other than yourself!'"

Qunfath returned and did so. "Umar, now became even angrier, leaped again and said, "By Allah! I know how silly he is and how weak his view is, and we shall never be able to take full control unless we kill him, so let me bring his head to you!" Abu Bakr said, "Sit down," but "Umar refused to sit. Then Abu Bakr pleaded to "Umar in the Name of Allah to sit, so he sat... Abu Bakr then said, "Qunfath! Set out to him and say, 'O Ali! Answer the call of Abu Bakr.'"

Ali (as) said to Qunfath, "I am too busy to be concerned about them, and I am not going to abandon the will of my friend and Brother S. Go back to Abu Bakr and to whatever oppression you all have set your minds on."

Qunfath set out and conveyed the above to Abu Bakr, whereon "Umar, outraged, leaped out of his place, called on Khalid ibn al-Walid and Qunfath and ordered them to carry firewood and a torch of fire. He went to Ali's house door while Fatima (sa) was behind it, her head bandaged and body extremely thin due to the effects of the demise of the Messenger of Allah S. "Umar came and knocked at the door then shouted out, "O son of Abu Talib! Open the door!" Fatima (sa) said to him, "O "Umar! What feud is there between us and yourself? Why don't you leave us in our pain?" He said to her, "Open the door or else I shall burn you all!" She said, "O "Umar! Don't you have any fear of Allah, the most Exalted and

the most Great, at all? Do you want to enter my house (by force) and assault my family?” But he refused to leave. Then “Umar ordered the door to be set to fire, burning it. “Umar pushed the door. Fatima (sa) met him face-to-face and screamed, “O Father! O Messenger of Allah!” He lifted his sword as it was still in its scabbard and hit her side with it, so she screamed. He raised the whip and hit her on her arm, causing her to scream, “O Father!”

Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) then leaped and pulled “Umar by his clothes, shaking him and throwing him on the ground. He smashed his nose and neck and was about to kill him. But he remembered what the Messenger of Allah S had told him and how he enjoined him to be patient, so he said to ‘Umar, “I swear by the One Who honored Muhammed S with the Prophetic Mission, O son of Sakh, that had it not been for a Book from Allah which He already revealed, you should know that you would not be able to enter my house!”

“Umar sent for help. People came and entered the house. Khalid ibn al-Walid pulled his sword out of its scabbard in order to hit Fatima (sa)! Ali (as) attacked Khalid with his own sword, but “Umar pleaded to Ali (as) in the Name of Allah not to kill Khalid, so he refrained.

Al-Miqdad, Salman, Abu Dharr, ‘Ammar and Buraydah al-Aslami came and entered the house to support Ali (as). A great sedition was about to befall the Islamic nation. Ali (as) was taken out, followed by people and by Salman, Abu Dharr, al-Miqdad, ‘Ammar and Buraydah al-Aslami (may Allah have mercy on them all) as they were saying to ‘Umar, “How swiftly you have betrayed the Messenger of Allah, you and Khalid, letting grudge come out of your chests!”

Buraydah ibn al-Khasab al-Aslami said, “O “Umar! Do you, Khalid, really leap on the Brother of the Messenger of Allah and his *wasi* and on his daughter, so you hit her, and you are the one whom we, Quraishites, all know who he is?!” Khalid ibn al-Walid raised his sword, which was still in its scabbard, to hit Buraydah, but “Umar held him back and forbade him.

Finally, they brought Ali (as) to Abu Bakr handcuffed. Once Abu Bakr laid his eyes on him, he shouted at the men to release him. Ali (as) said to Abu Bakr, “How swiftly you all have attacked the Ahl al-Bayt (as) of your Prophet S! O Abu Bakr! By what right or by what will, or by what merit of your own, do you urge people to swear the oath of allegiance to you?! Did you not yourself swear the oath of allegiance days ago as ordered by the Messenger of Allah S?!” “Umar interrupted saying, “Leave such talk aside, Ali, for by Allah, if you do not swear the oath of allegiance, we shall kill you.”

“Umar again said, “Stand up and swear fealty.” Ali (as) asked him, “And what if I do not?” “Umar said, “Then we, by Allah, shall kill you.” Ali (as) said, “You, by Allah, have lied, O son of a *sahk*! You cannot do that! You are too mean and too weak to do it!” Khalid ibn al-Walid jumped and unsheathed his sword as he said, “By Allah! If you do not do it, I shall kill you!” Ali (as) stood up and pulled Khalid by his clothes then shoved him, throwing him on the ground on his back. The sword fell from Khalid’s hand. “Umar said, “Stand up, Ali, and swear the oath of allegiance.” Ali (as) said to him, “And what if I do

not?!” “Umar said, “We by Allah will then kill you.”

Three times did Ali (as) argue with them, but it was in vain. Then he stretched his hand *without opening* it. Abu Bakr slapped on it, accepting this as a token of his fealty. Then Ali (as) went back home followed by people. [13](#)

9. Sulaym ibn Qays has also recorded the following:

“Ibn ‘Abbas said, ‘... Then they cooked a plot and rehearsed their roles. They said, ‘We shall never be in full charge as long as this man (Ali (as)) is alive!’

“Abu Bakr asked, ‘Who can kill him for us?’ ‘Umar said, ‘Khalid ibn al-Walid!’ So they summoned him. Both men (‘Umar and Abu Bakr) said to Khalid, ‘O Khalid! What would you say if we ask you to undertake a very serious errand?!’ He said, ‘Order me to do anything at all as you please, even if you order me to kill Ali ibn Abu Talib (as), and I shall do it.’ They said to him, ‘We do not want you to do anything other than that!’ He said, ‘I am the man for it!’ Abu Bakr said, ‘Once we have performed the *fajr* prayers, stand beside him, and let your sword be with you. Once I offer the *tasleem*, you should kill him.’ Khalid agreed.

“They dispersed following their agreement. Abu Bakr contemplated a great deal on his plot to get Ali (as) killed. He realized that if he did so, a devastating war and a great calamity would take place, so he regretted ordering Khalid to do it. He could not sleep that night till dawn. At dawn, he went to the Mosque after the call for the prayers had already been made. He advanced and led the prayers, contemplating, not knowing what to say.

“Khalid came, carrying his sword, and stood beside Ali (as). Ali (as) was able to guess some of the plot against him. Once Abu Bakr finished the *tashahhud*, he called out, before the *tasleem*, ‘O Khalid! Do not do what I ordered you to do, for if you do it, I shall kill you!’ Then he made the *tasleem*, turning his face right and left.

“Ali (as) leaped and pulled Khalid by his clothes, pulling the sword from his hand then subdued him on the ground and sat on his chest. He pulled his sword to kill him. Those attending the prayer service gathered around Ali (as) trying to save Khalid from his grip but they could not. Al-‘Abbas says, ‘They pleaded to him in the sanctity of the grave of the Messenger of Allah (S) to let Khalid alone, so he did. He stood up and went to his house.’

“Al-Zubayr, al-‘Abbas, Abu Dharr, al-Miqdad and many people from among the Banu Hashim, with swords unsheathed, said, ‘By Allah! You shall not leave till we see what he wants to say and do!’ People disputed with each other, and there was a great deal of commotion.

“The women of Banu Hashim went out screaming and saying, ‘O enemies of Allah! As long as you seek this from the Messenger of Allah S, you shall never be able to achieve it. In the near past you killed his

daughter (Fatima (sa)) and now you want to kill his Brother, cousin, *wasi* and the father of his offspring! You have lied, by the Lord of the Ka'ba! You shall never be able to kill him!' People were apprehensive of a very serious sedition.”[14](#)

What al-Mufid Records in Al-Amali

10. Abu ‘Abdullah, al-Mufid, has said,

Abu Bakr, namely Muhammed ibn ‘Umar al-Ji’abi, has said that Abu Bakr, Ahmed ibn Mansur al-Ramadi, has said that Sa’d ibn ‘Afar saying that Ibn Lahi’ah quotes Khalid ibn Yazid, from Abu Hilal from Marwan ibn ‘Othman, as saying that when people swore the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, Ali (as), al-Zubayr and al-Miqdad entered the house of Fatima (sa) and refused to go out (to swear it). ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab said, “Set the house on fire!” Al-Zubayr went out with his sword. Abu Bakr said, “Take care of the dog!” So they went in his direction. His foot slipped, and he fell on the ground, and the sword fell from his hand. Abu Bakr said, “Hit it [his sword] on the rock!” His sword was hit on a rock till it was broken.

Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) went out to a cliff. He was met by Thabit ibn Qays ibn Shammas who asked him, “O father of al-Hassan! What are you doing here?” He said, “They wanted to burn my house as Abu Bakr was sitting on the pulpit receiving the people’s oath of allegiance without defending or even denouncing such an act.” Thabit said to him, “My hand shall not part with yours till I am killed defending you.” They both set out and entered Medina. Fatima (sa) was standing at her door. Her house was empty. She was saying, “I dissociate myself from people worse than whose presence there is nothing at all! You left the coffin of the Messenger of Allah S lying before us [as you went to the *saqifa* to “elect” Abu Bakr, not bothering about burying your Prophet S]; you violated your oath to be obedient to us, and you did not let us take charge of you. You have done what you have done to us without being mindful of our status.”[15](#)

11. Shaikh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy on him, has also said,

When people from Banu Hashim and others assembled at the house of Fatima (sa) in order to demonstrate their opposition to Abu Bakr and to show that they differed in their views from him, ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab dispatched Qunfath, saying to him, “Get them out of the house. If they get out (to swear fealty), it is alright; otherwise, collect firewood at his (Ali’s) house door and tell them that if they did not come out to swear fealty, you would burn their house.”

Then ‘Umar led in person a group of people, including al-Mughirah ibn Shu’bah al-Thaqafi and Salim slave of Abu Huthayfah, till they arrived at the door of Ali’s house. ‘Umar shouted, “O Fatima daughter of the Messenger of Allah! Get those who have sought shelter at your house out or else I shall burn you all!” All this is very well known.[16](#)

12. Al-Kanji has attributed to al-Mufid and to Ibn Qutaybah their statement relevant to the miscarriage of Muhsin, the fetus. Al-Kanji has cited Shaikh al-Mufid as saying, "... And he added to what the masses have said that Fatima (sa) had miscarried after the demise of the Prophet S a male child whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin... This is something which only Ibn Qutaybah from among the transmitter has stated." [17](#)

But what we have stated in these chapters proves the inaccuracy and imprecision of his last statement. Such a fact exists in scores of references.

13. Shaikh al-Mufid has said,

Not many people attended the burial of the Messenger of Allah S because of the bickering which took place between the Muhajirun and the Ansar about the caliphate issue. Most of them missed the opportunity to perform the funeral prayers for him as well. Fatima (sa) kept lamenting that day's morning, whereon the second caliph said to her, "Your morning is surely evil." [18](#)

14. Al-Mufid has said that Abu Ja'far, namely Muhammed ibn Ali ibn al-Husayn, has said that his father narrates saying that Ahmed ibn Idris says that Muhammed ibn 'Abd al-Jabbar quotes al-Qasim ibn Muhammed al-Razi quoting Ali ibn al-HirMizan quoting Ali ibn al-Husayn ibn Ali (as) quoting his father, al-Husayn (as), as saying,

"When Fatima (sa) daughter of the Prophet S fell sick, she told Ali (as) by way of will to keep what was happening to her as a secret, not to tell anyone about her and not to announce her sickness, which he did. He used to look after her in person assisted by Asma' daughter of 'Umays, may Allah have mercy on her, on the condition that she, too, had to keep it a secret. When death approached her, she told the Commander of the Faithful (as) by way of will to take care of her burial and to obliterate all signs of the location of her grave. The Commander of the Faithful (as) did so, burying her and hiding the location of her grave." [19](#)

15. Al-Mufid and al-'Ayyashi have quoted 'Amr ibn Abu al-Miqdam quoting his father quoting his grandfather as saying,

Two occasions were the very hardest on Ali (as). The first of those occasions was when the Messenger of Allah S passed away. The second occasion was, by Allah, when I sat at the *saqifa* of Banu Sa'idah on the right side of Abu Bakr as people were swearing the oath of allegiance to him [to the latter]. "Umar said "You [Abu Bakr] have not done anything [worth doing] unless Ali (as) swears the oath of allegiance to you, so send for him so that he may come to you and swear fealty to you." Abu Bakr dispatched Qunfath after instructing him thus: "Say to him: 'Answer the call of the successor of the Messenger of Allah S'." Abu Bakr, "Umar, 'Othman, Khalid ibn al-Walid, al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah, Abu 'Ubaydah ibn al-Jarrah and Salim slave of Abu Huthayfah stood up, and I stood up and went with them. Fatima (sa) thought that nobody would enter her house without her permission, so she closed her house door and locked it. When they arrived at the door, "Umar kicked it with his foot and broke it, and it was made of

palm branches. They forcefully entered Ali's house and arrested him.[20](#)

16. Muhammed ibn Jarir ibn Rustam al-Tabari has quoted al-Waqidi as saying that the son of Abu Hanifah has quoted Dawud ibn al-Hassan as saying that some men from among the Muhajirun and Ansar were very angry when Abu Bakr received the oath of allegiance. They said that he had done so without consulting them and without their consent. Ali (as) and al-Zubayr were both angry, too. They took to Fatima's house and did not swear it. "Umar, accompanied by a group of men which included Assad ibn Hassan and Salamah ibn Aslam ibn Jarish al-Ashhali. "Umar shouted, "Come out or else we shall burn you all!" They refused to come out. Fatima (sa) called on those men and pleaded to them in the Name of Allah to leave. "Umar ordered Salamah ibn Aslam to enter by force. "Umar took the sword of one of them [al-Zubayr] and kept hitting it on the wall till he broke it. Then he led them after having arrested them till they were forced to swear the oath of allegiance (to Abu Bakr).

17. He has also said that he was told by Ishaq ibn Ibrahim that the latter was told by Salamah ibn al-Fadl who cited 'Abdullah ibn A'yan quoting Harb ibn Abul-Aswad al-Du'ali as saying,

"My father sent me to Jundab ibn 'Abdullah al-Bijli to ask him about what went on between Abu Bakr and 'Umar on one hand and Ali (as) on the other when they invited the latter to swear the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr]. He said, 'They took it [by force] from Ali (as).' So he wrote him asking him to state, in writing, his view of what he had seen in person. He wrote him saying the following: 'They both [Abu Bakr and 'Umar] sent for Ali (as) who was brought to them tied. Once in their presence, they required him to swear the oath of allegiance. 'What if I do not?' Ali (as) inquired. They both told him that they would kill him. He said, 'Then you will be killing a servant of Allah and a Brother of the Messenger of Allah S.' They said, 'As being a servant of Allah, yes, you are a very good one, indeed. But as for being the Brother of the Messenger of Allah S, No.' Then they repeated their demand, and he repeated his question, whereupon they said, 'Then you shall be humiliated and killed.' He repeated his response, returning that day without swearing it..., etc."[21](#)

18. 'Imad ad-Din, namely al-Tabari, one of the seventh century [Hijri] scholars, has said the following (which is a translation from the original Persian text):

... Meanwhile, "Umar, accompanied by the folks of stubbornness and hypocrisy, arrived. He said, "O son of Abu Talib! Open the door or else I shall burn your house!" Fatima (sa) said, "O 'Umar! Fear Allah with regard to the sanctity of the Messenger of Allah S! Do not enter, for you are prohibited." "Umar insisted, forcing his way and the way of his hypocritical companions in. Fatima (sa) called out, "O Father! Witness what we have suffered at the hands of Abu Bakr and 'Umar after you!" "Umar took his sword, which was still in its scabbard, and hit Fatima (sa) with it on the side. Qunfath hit her with the sword on her shoulder. Fatima (sa) screamed, "O Father! Witness what your Ahl al-Bayt (as) have suffered at the hands of Abu Bakr and 'Umar after you!"[22](#)

19. The same author, discussing how Fatima (sa) was buried without the knowledge of the caliph and

how "Umar became angry and almost hit al-Miqdad who told him the news, cites al-Miqdad as saying the following to "Umar: "Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S left this life while blood was coming out of her back and side because of you hitting her with the sword and with the whip." The author goes on to state the following:

They went to Ali (as) and found him sitting at his house door surrounded by his companions. "Umar said to him, "O son of Abu Talib! You never abandon your ancient envy! Yesterday, you washed the corpse of the Messenger of Allah (S) without our knowledge, and today you perform the funeral prayers for Fatima (sa) also without us." 'Aqil, may Allah have mercy on him, said to him, "And you, I swear by Allah, are the most of all people in your envy and more ancient in animosity towards the Messenger of Allah S and his Ahl al-Bayt. You hit her in the past, and she left this world and blood was on her back, and she was not pleased with you both ["Umar and Abu Bakr] at all."[23](#)

20. Discussing "Umar [ibn al-Khattab], al-Maqdisi al-Ardabili (d. 993 A.H./1585 A.D.) has stated the following (a translation from the Persian text):

According to his order, they carried firework to the house of al-Zahra' (sa) in order to burn it, seeing and knowing that Fatima (sa) was sitting behind the door. "Umar ordered her beaten and he, "Umar, himself beat her on her stomach, and his slave beat her with the whip on her shoulder. This was the cause of her miscarriage. The marks of the beating remained on her body. She fell sick because of that and died. All of this happened because of their ["Umar and Abu Bakr's] orders. Sunnis do not deny any of these incidents, but some of them, such as al-Qawshaji[24](#), have tried to rebut it, but the rebuttals have come very cold and weak.[25](#)

21. Al-Khawajoo'i al-Mazandarani[26](#) has quoted a narrative transmitted by al-Kalbi from Ibn 'Abbas as follows:

Al-Zuhri has quoted Abu Ishaq, namely Ibrahim al-Thaqafi, citing Za'idah ibn Qudamah as saying that he went out with "Umar accompanied by about sixty men. "Umar sought permission to enter their house, but he was not granted permission, so he made a lot of fuss and commotion.

Al-Zubayr went out to him, unsheathing his sword. The second [caliph, i.e. "Umar] fled away before them as was his habit. Al-Zubayr chased him, but he stumbled on a rock in his way, so he fell headlong. "Umar shouted, "Take care of the dog!" Al-Zubayr was surrounded. Salamah ibn Aslam took al-Zubayr's sword and kept hitting it on a rock till it broke. Al-Zubayr was roughly led to Abu Bakr. "Umar returned to the door and again asked permission to enter. Fatima (sa) said to him, "I plead to you in the Name of Allah, if you are a believer, not to enter my house, for I am without a veil." "Umar did not pay her any attention and attacked the house. Fatima (sa) called out, "O Father! Witness what we have suffered from Abu Bakr and "Umar after you!"

His supporters followed him inside. He demanded the Commander of the Faithful (sa) should come out. Ali (as) did not resist because of the instructions which he had been given by the Messenger of Allah S

by way of will, thus avoiding a serious sedition among the Muslims.

“Umar went out with them, and the Pure Lady went out behind him and kept saying to him, “O son of the black woman [*sahk* صهك, prostitute]! How swiftly you permitted humiliation to enter the house of the Messenger of Allah S!” All the women belonging to Banu Hashim went out with her. When Abu Bakr saw Fatima (sa) coming to meet him, he stood up and said, “What caused you to come out like that, O daughter of the Messenger of Allah S?!” She said, “You and the son of the black woman caused me to come out.” Abu Bakr said, “O Daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S)! Do not talk like that, for he used to love your father.” Fatima (sa) said, “Had he loved him, he would not have caused humiliation to enter his house.”[27](#)

22. Al-Khawajoo'i al-Mazandarani has also said, “They have narrated that Fatima (sa) had a house, and she had a door overlooking the Mosque. Abu Bakr said, ‘I have heard the Messenger of Allah S say that the door should not lead to the Mosque.’ He, therefore, ordered the door of her house to be removed or sealed. Then he regretted having left her house thus exposed and said, ‘How I wish I left Fatima’s house alone and did not expose it!’”[28](#)

We say that the regret referred to above by Abu Bakr was not because he left Fatima’s house exposed, but it was on account of assaulting her house on the day of his inauguration in office. What points out to this fact is his own statement at the end of his speech wherein he said: “... although it was shut down by force.”

23. Al-Tibrisi has narrated the incident of the assault. In a detailed narrative, he has said the following:

‘Othman and ‘Abd al-Rahman ibn ‘Awf and those in their company stood up and swore the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr]. Ali (as) and Banu Hashim went to Ali’s house, and al-Zubayr was with them.

“Umar went to them in a group of those who swore fealty, including Assad ibn al-Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam, and found them assembled. He said to them, “Swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, for the people have already done so.” Al-Zubayr was swift to take to his sword, so “Umar said to them, “Go take care of the dog and spare us his evil!” Salamah ibn Aslam took the sword out of al-Zubayr’s hand. “Umar took the sword and kept hitting it on the ground till he broke it.

They surrounded all those of Banu Hashim who assembled there and led them to Abu Bakr. When they were present there, they were told to swear fealty to Abu Bakr since other people had already done so.[29](#)

24. In another text stated by al-Tibrisi, the author says the following as he discusses “Umar:

He [“Umar] came to know that some people remained at home [rather than swear fealty to his friend, Abu Bakr], so he used to go to them accompanied by a large number of his fellows and bring them to the Mosque to swear fealty. After a few days, he went with a large number of people to the house of Ali

ibn Abu Talib (as) and demanded that he should come out, but Ali (as) refused. "Umar ordered firewood and a torch to be brought and said, "I swear by the One Who holds "Umar's life in His hand that he either comes out or I burn his house and everyone in it!" He was told that Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S was there, and so were al-Hassan and al-Husayn, grandsons of the Messenger of Allah S and his offspring, and people found the statement which he made ["So what?!] very contemptible.

When he knew that they resented his statement, "Umar said, "What is wrong with you?! Do you see that I have done anything like that?! I only want to scare them." Ali (as) sent them the following message; "I have no intention to leave the house because I am very busy compiling the text of the Holy Qur'an which you have left behind your backs, and your love for the life of this world has diverted your attention from it. I have sworn neither to come out of my house nor to put my outer garment on till I compile its entire text."

Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S went out to reason with them. She stood behind the door and said, "I do not know any day of my life worse than the one when I face you like that. You left the corpse of the Messenger of Allah S to us as you decided your affair among yourselves and did not let us take charge of you, nor did you uphold our rights, as if you did not understand what the Prophet S had said to you on the Ghadir Khumm day, by Allah...!"³⁰

25. Al-Majlisi, may Allah have mercy on him, detailed a letter sent by the second caliph to Mu'awiyah narrating what al-Zahra' (sa) had to go through at his own hand. Among its contents are the following details:

I went to his [Ali's] house bent on getting him out of it. I said to the maid, Fidda, "Tell Ali to come out to swear fealty to Abu Bakr since all the Muslims have already done so." She said, "The Commander of the Faithful is busy." I said to her, "Leave such talk aside and tell him to come out or else we shall enter and get him out by force."

Fatima (sa) came out and stood behind the door. She said, "O you folks of misguidance and falsehood, what are you saying, and what do you want?!" I said, "O Fatima!" Fatima (sa) said, "What do you want, "Umar?!" I said, "What is wrong with your cousin? Why did he send you to answer the door as he sat behind the curtain?" She said, "It is your own oppression, you wretch, that has forced me to come out thus and has tied you to the evidence as a misguided deviator." I said, "Leave such falsehood and women's fables aside and tell Ali to come out." She said, "Neither love is there for you from us nor respect; are you scaring me with the Party of Satan, O "Umar?! Surely the Party of Satan is weak." I decided that if he refused to come out, I would bring plenty of firewood and burn everyone in his house unless Ali is led to swear the oath of allegiance. I took the whip of Qunfath and hit her with it, then I said to Khalid ibn al-Walid, "Go, you and our men, and gather firewood, for I shall set it ablaze myself." She said, "O enemy of Allah, of His Messenger and of the Commander of the Faithful!" I hit Fatima (sa) on the hand because she was holding the door, thus stopping me from entering. I tried to open it but I could

not, so I hit her hands with the whip, and it hurt her. I heard her exhaling and crying, and I almost felt that my heart was becoming soft, then I remembered Ali's grudges and how much blood he had spilled of the *heroes of the Arabs*. I kicked the door. Fatima had supported the door with her body, and I heard her let out a scream whereby I thought she turned Medina upside down. She said, "O Father! O Messenger of Allah! Should this be done to the one you loved, to your daughter?! O Fidda! Take me, for by Allah what I have in my womb has been killed." I heard her birth-pangs as she supported herself with the wall. I pushed the door and entered. She faced me with a face that caused my vision to be blurred, so I slapped her on her cheeks from outside the veil. Her ear-ring was crushed into bits and pieces that scattered on the ground. Ali came out. When I sensed his presence, I hurried to get out of the house and said to Khalid, Qunfath and those in their company, "I have been saved from something tremendous!" According to another narrative, he said, "I have committed a great crime from which I do not feel safe for my life at all, and here is Ali (as) coming out of the house. Neither I nor all of you combined can overpower him. Ali (as) came out. She hit with her hands her forehead to expose it and to complain to Allah, the Great, because of what had befallen her. Ali threw her outer mantle on her saying, "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah! Allah sent your father as mercy to the worlds... so, O Head of the Women of the World, you, too, should be mercy to these afflicted folks, and do not be a torment." The pain of child-birth intensified. She entered the room and miscarried a child whom Ali had named Muhsin. I gathered many people, not to overpower Ali but so that I would feel safer. I approached him as he was besieged and took him out of his house... Abu Bakr said to me, "Woe unto you, O 'Umar! What have you done to Fatima?!"³¹

26. Al-Ishnani quotes his grandfather quoting Muhammed ibn 'Ammar quoting Musa ibn Isma'il quoting Hammad ibn Salamah quoting Abu al-Tufayl quoting Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) as saying that the Messenger of Allah S said to him, "O Ali (as)! There is a treasure for you in Paradise, and you are Thul-Qarnain (Double-Horns) of this nation, so do not follow your eyes while performing the prayers." Al-Saduq has said, "I have heard some mentors saying that this treasure is his son al-Muhsin, the one whom Fatima (sa) miscarried when she was squeezed between both doors." He cites evidence from a narration saying that Muhsin will be at the gate of Paradise. He will be told to enter, but he will refuse saying, "No! I shall not enter till both my parents enter first."³²

27. Ibn Tawus has said the following in his will to his son: "I have mentioned to you in some of the most interesting incidents how they wanted to burn the house of Fatima (sa) and everyone inside it. Al-'Abbas, your grandfather Ali (as), al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and other good people were at the time inside it."³³

We have already quoted Ibn Tawus in a previous chapter.

28. On reaching the topic of how Fatima (sa) was martyred, in his commentary on the book titled *Man La Yahduruhu al-Faqih*, al-Majlisi I states the following:

She, peace and blessings of Allah with her, was martyred because of the beating which she had

received at the hands of ‘Umar [ibn al-Khattab]... He hit her stomach with the door when he wanted the Commander of the Faithful (sa) to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr. Qunfath, slave of ‘Umar, hit her with a whip as ‘Umar had ordered him to do. The incident is very well known by both Sunnis and Shi’as and it is detailed in the book of Sulaym ibn Qays al-Hilali. Due to the beating, a male child named Muhsin was miscarried. This is also mentioned in the book titled *Al-Irshad* by al-Mufid (may Allah be pleased with him.).”[34](#)

29. Al-Majlisi II has said,

According to another narrative, ‘Umar hit her with a whip, so she died while her wrist still showed a mark that looked like a bracelet because of his whipping... She did not let them take Ali (as) away before they had squeezed her behind the door, causing her to miscarry a child whom the Messenger of Allah (S) had named Muhsin. She died in the aftermath.

In another narrative, al-Mughirah ibn Shu’bah, acting on orders which he had received from ‘Umar, pushed the door on her stomach, causing her to miscarry Muhsin. He took Ali (as) to the Mosque by force.[35](#)

30. Al-Majlisi II, commenting on an authentic tradition narrated from the father of al-Hassan (as), says that Fatima (sa) is a truthful martyr, adding,

This incident proves that Fatima, peace and blessings of Allah with her, was a martyr, and this is a consecutively reported fact. The reason is that when they confiscated the caliphate, and when most people swore the oath of allegiance to them, they sent for the Commander of the Faithful (as) to participate, but he refused. ‘Umar brought fire to burn the house and everyone inside it, and they wanted to enter his house by force. Fatima (sa) prohibited them at the door, so Qunfath, slave of ‘Umar, pushed the door on Fatima’s stomach, breaking her rib and causing her to miscarry a fetus whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin. She fell sick as a result, and she died, peace and blessings of Allah with her. Both al-Tabari and al-Waqidi have stated in their respective *Tarikh* books that ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab went to Ali (as) in a group of men which included Assad ibn Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam and said, “Get out or I shall burn you all.” This is narrated by Hazanah, too.[36](#)

31. Al-Majlisi has said the following about ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab: “Our [Shi’a] narratives, and also theirs [Sunnis’] as well, are quite clear in reporting how he terrified Fatima (sa) till she miscarried.

Consecutively reported narratives have stated that when both men [referring to Abu Bakr and ‘Umar] harmed her, peace and blessings of Allah with her, they actually harmed the Messenger of Allah S and Ali (as). Both parties [Shi’as and Sunnis] quote the Prophet S as saying, ‘Whoever harms Ali (as) harms me.’ Allah, the most Exalted and Sublime, has said, ‘Surely those who harm Allah and the Messenger of Allah S [with their evil deeds or words] are cursed by Allah in the life of this world and in the hereafter, and He has prepared for them a humiliating chastisement’ (Qur’an, 33:58).”[37](#)

32. Al-Majlisi, may Allah have mercy on him, said the following as he was explaining some

supplications:

Referring to the harm done by the first [caliph] as well as the second to Ali (as) and Fatima (sa), and how they wanted to burn Ali's house, how they led him by force like a fleeing camel, how they squeezed Fatima (sa) with her door till she miscarried Muhsin, so much so that she ordered to be buried at night so that neither the first nor the second ["caliph"] would attend her funeral..., etc."[38](#)

33. Some ancient traditionists and historians from among our fellows have included "the martyr" among her titles. Why was she a martyr? "She was a martyr because they beat her at her house's door on her stomach till her fetus, whom the Messenger of Allah S had named al-Muhsin, died."[39](#)

34. Others have said that when Ali (as) was brought to the Mosque, he made a statement wherein he said, "You folks of betrayal and abomination, prepare your answers, for you shall be questioned tomorrow. You will be asked why you oppressed us, we Ahl al-Bayt! Why should al-Zahra' be beaten in daylight, and why should you confiscate our right by force?... It is very hard for Ali son of Abu Talib to see how the wrist of Fatima is turned black while everyone knows his status and observed his valor."[40](#)

35. Al-Kashani says,

... Then "Umar gathered a bunch of *taleeqs* and hypocrites and brought them to the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as). They found his door locked, so they shouted, "Come out, O Ali, for the successor of the Messenger of Allah calls you to his presence!" He did not open the door to them. They brought firewood and put it at the door. Then they brought a torch in order to set it ablaze. "Umar shouted, "By Allah! If you do not open the door, we shall surely burn it!" When Fatima (sa) realized that they were going to burn her house, she stood up and opened the door for them. Those folks pushed her before she could return. Fatima (sa) hid behind the door. Then they leaped on the Commander of the Faithful (as) as he was sitting on his bed, surrounded him and dragged him from his house tied by his own garment, dragging him to the Mosque. Fatima (sa) tried to intercept between them and her husband and said, "By Allah! I shall not let you drag my cousin unjustly like that! Woe unto you! How swiftly you are to betray Allah and His Messenger S in our regard?! The Messenger of Allah S told you to follow us, to love us, and to uphold us, for Allah Almighty has said, 'Say: I do not ask you for any reward for it [for the Prophetic Message] except love for my near relatives' (Qur'an, 42:23)." Most people deserted him ["Umar] on account of her statement, so "Umar ordered Qunfath, the curse of Allah on him, to hit her with his whip. Qunfath whipped her on her back and side till he worn her out, leaving marks on her sacred body. That beating was the main reason why she miscarried a boy whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin.[41](#)

36. Muhammed ibn Ahmed ibn al-Hassan al-Daylami has said, "... till he broke the sword of al-Zubayr. He ["Umar] insulted Salman, hit 'Ammar, harmed Ali (as) and assaulted the house of Fatima (sa)."[42](#)

37. He also said, "Some people have said that a rope was brought and placed around the neck of Ali (as) who was told to swear fealty [to Abu Bakr] or be killed."[43](#)

38. He has also said, "It has been reported that Ali (as) did not leave his house till his door was burnt, and he was dragged to swear fealty against his wish."[44](#)

39. He narrated that "Umar said to Ali (as), "Swear the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr]." Ali (as) said, "What if I do not?" "Umar said, "Then we shall kill you." Such is accepted neither by the Islamic Legislative System (Shari'a) nor by reason.[45](#)

40. The author of the book titled *Al-Dawlatayn* has stated that "Umar took a torch of fire and went to the house of Fatima (sa). Fatima (sa) came out. He said to her, "Tell Ali and al-'Abbas to come out or else I shall burn the house." There is no doubt that if he was forced to do what he did not want, he would be excused for having done it.[46](#)

41. Sayyid Taj ad-Din ibn Ali ibn Ahmed al-Husayni al-'Amili[47](#) has written the following:

When he, peace with him, saw how few his supporters were and how those who swore the oath of allegiance to him [at Ghadir Khumm] betrayed him, he remained at home. "Umar ibn al-Khattab gathered a group of people and brought them to the house of Ali (as). They found its door locked. Nobody permitted them to enter. "Umar called for firewood to be brought and said, "By Allah! If you do not open it, we shall burn it!" When Fatima (sa) heard that, she went out and opened the door. "Umar pushed the door as she was behind it, squeezing her and causing her to miscarry then subsequently to die as is transmitted. They entered and leaped on the Commander of the Faithful (sa) whom they took out by force. Fatima (sa) tried to intercept them and said, "I plead to you in the Name of Allah not to take my cousin out unjustly! Woe unto you! How swift you are in betraying Allah and His Messenger in our regard!" "Umar ordered Qunfath to whip her. The marks of whipping remained on her body [till her death].[48](#)

42. Fakhr ad-Din al-Turayhi (d. 1085 A.H./1674), who was a contemporary of al-Majlisi, may Allah have mercy on him, has recorded the following:

"... So, my Brethren, if we reconsider, abandoning the worship of our ego and shunning those who strayed and followed their own inclinations, do you think that Fatima (sa) was pleased when Khalid ibn al-Walid squeezed her, so she miscarried Muhsin, and Qunfath, slave of Abu Bakr, whipped her, leaving marks on her body, or when her husband, cousin and father of the Prophet 's grandsons, was cheated out of the caliphate...?!"[49](#)

43. The following is recorded in the book titled *Conference of Baghdad's Scholars*:

Having taken the oath of allegiance to himself from the people through coercion, force, threats and intimidation, Abu Bakr sent "Umar and Qunfath with Khalid ibn al-Walid, Abu 'Ubaydah ibn al-Jarrah and a group of hypocrites to the house of Ali and Fatima (as). "Umar gathered firewood at the door of Fatima's house. That was the same door where the Messenger of Allah S many times stood and said: "*Assalamo Alaikom*, O Household of the Prophetic Mission!" and he never entered it without permission.

“Umar burnt the door of that house.

When Fatima (sa) went behind that door to send “Umar and his party away, “Umar squeezed her between the wall and the door very hard, causing her to miscarry her fetus, and one nail planted itself in her chest. Fatima (sa) screamed, “O Father! O Messenger of Allah! See what we have suffered after you at the hands of the son of al-Khattab and the son of Abu Quhafah!” “Umar turned to those in his company and said, “Hit Fatima!” The one who was very much loved by the Messenger of Allah S and who was part of him was whipped, so much so that they caused her body to bleed. Marks of the hard squeeze and the bitter shock took their toll on Fatima’s body, so she fell sick and depressed, remaining so till she died only a few days later. So, the house of Fatima (sa) is the house of the Prophetic Mission. Fatima (sa) was killed because of “Umar ibn al-Khattab.[50](#)

44. Al-Hassani has said, “According to another narrative, when they wanted to enter her house and take Ali (as) out, she wanted to stop them. Qunfath hit her on her face, hurting her eyes.”[51](#)

45. Al-Hassani has also said, “According to a third narrative, she stood behind the door to stop them from entering. They thrust themselves on the door, pushing it against her, and she was pregnant, so she miscarried a son whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin.”[52](#) It is as if the author wants to exonerate the assailants from the consequences of killing al-Muhsin, as the reader understands, by saying that he was killed because of the folks’ stampede. This is rebutted by consecutively reported narratives proving that someone [“Umar] intentionally killed him by squeezing his mother between the door and the wall as has already been explained.

46. Ibn Hamzah al-Zaidi, relying on the authority of Muhammed Ibn Ishaq ibn ‘Abd al-Rahman ibn al-Harith who cites Muhammed ibn Rakanah as saying,

“Umar ibn al-Khattab, Khalid ibn al-Walid, ‘Ayyash ibn Rabi’ah went to the door of Fatima’s house. They said, “By Allah! You have to come out for the swearing of fealty!” “Umar said, “By Allah! We shall burn your house and everyone inside it!” Fatima (sa) called out, “O Messenger of Allah! What have we suffered after you?!” Al-Zubayr came out to meet them with his sword unsheathed. He attacked them. When ‘Ayyash saw him, he said to “Umar, “Beware of the dog!” ‘Ayyash threw a garment on al-Zubayr, caught him with both his arms and pulled the sword from his hand. He kept hitting it on a rock till it broke.[53](#)

47. He also narrated through *isnad* to ‘Abdullah ibn “Umar al-’Omari who quotes Zaid ibn Aslam quoting his father as saying, “I was among those who gathered firewood at Ali’s house. “Umar said, ‘By Allah! If Ali son of Abu Talib does not come out, I shall burn the house and everyone inside it!’”[54](#)

48. He also narrated through *isnad* to Muhammed ibn ‘Abd al-Rahman ibn al-Sa’ib ibn Zaid who quotes his father as saying, “I was with “Umar ibn al-Khattab when he wanted to burn the house of Fatima (sa). He said, ‘If they refuse to swear the oath of allegiance, I shall burn their house!’ I said to “Umar, ‘But Fatima (sa) is inside the house! Do you still intend to burn it?!’ He said, ‘I and Fatima shall meet.’”[55](#)

49. Ibn Hamzah al-Zaidi clearly indicated that the house of al-Zahra' (sa) was attacked many times, time and over again, gathering various narratives one of which says that when Ali (as) refused to swear fealty, he was joined by Talhah and al-Zubayr, and they did not come out until 'Umar went there and wanted to burn the house while they were inside it. Another says that Abu Bakr came out to the Mosque to pray, ordering Khalid ibn al-Walid to pray beside him then to kill Ali (as) as soon as Abu Bakr was to pronounce the *tasleem* following his prayers. A third narrative states that Ali (as) was brought by force, so he swore fealty against his wish. Ibn Hamzah comments on these incidents saying, "All this happened during different times, and there is no contradiction among these narratives, nor does any of them cancel the other."[56](#)

50. It has been narrated from the son of 'Abd al-Rahman that he said, "I heard Sharik saying, 'What do they have to do with Fatima (sa)?! By Allah! I shall never raise an army, nor shall I assemble people together! By Allah! Both men [Abu Bakr and 'Umar] have hurt the Messenger of Allah S in his grave!'"[57](#)

51. In a letter from Mu'awiyah to Muhammed son of Abu Bakr, the first says, "When Allah chose for His Prophet, peace and blessings with him, what He has, completing for him what He promised him and enabling his call to prevail, showing His proof, He took his soul away to Him. Immediately thereafter, your father [Abu Bakr] and his 'Faruq' ['Umar ibn al-Khattab] were the very first to usurp his rights and go against his orders. They both agreed with each other to do so, coordinating their effort. Then they called him [Ali (as)] to swear fealty to them, but he lagged behind, so they were very upset with him and decided to commit a great crime against him."[58](#)

52. Al-Mas'udi has said,

He paid them no heed. The Commander of the Faithful (as) and his Shi'as stayed at home, fulfilling a promise to the Messenger of Allah S. They ['Umar and Abu Bakr] sent people to his [Ali's] house. They assaulted him. They burn his house door. They took him out by force, and they squeezed the Head of the Women of the World with the door till she miscarried Muhsin. They required him to swear the oath of allegiance, but he refused saying, "I shall not swear it." They said to him, "Then we shall kill you." He said, "If you kill me, I am a servant of Allah and a Brother of His Messenger S." They made him stretch his hand, but he did not open it. They tried to open his hand but could not, so he [Abu Bakr] rubbed on it as it was withheld.[59](#)

53. Nasr ibn Muzahim has transmitted from Muhammed ibn 'Ubaydullah from al-Jurjani saying that 'Umar said to Mu'awiyah during the Battle of Siffin, "Let them have access to the water, for Ali (as) should not remain thirsty while you are not, and in his hands are the horses' reins as he looks at the Euphrates wondering if he will drink of it or die of thirst. You know how courageous he is, and the people of Iraq and Hijaz support him. Both you and I heard him say, 'Had I had only forty men when my house was assaulted, meaning the house of Fatima (sa)..., etc.'"[60](#)

54. During the sickness that preceded his demise, Abu Bakr said that he regretted three things which he

had done and how he wished he never did them. He stated those things. Among what he said was the following: “I wish I never searched the house of Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S and never permitted the men to enter it even if it had shut its door during war time...”[61](#)

Al-Majlisi commented on the above saying, “This proves what is already reported about his [“Umar’s] assault of the house of Fatima (sa) when Ali (as) and al-Zubayr and others assembled there and that he [Abu Bakr] sought his own self-interest rather than that of others.”[62](#)

What is noteworthy here is that Abu ‘Ubayd al-Qasim ibn Salim has mentioned this issue, but he did not openly admit such a characteristic [of Abu Bakr]. Rather, he was satisfied with saying, “As regarding the deed which I did and which I wish I never did, it was such-and-such.” Abu ‘Ubayd said, “I do not want to hear it! I wish on the day of *saqifat* Banu Sa’idah I did not take part at all..., etc.”[63](#)

Why did Abu ‘Ubayd, namely al-Qasim ibn Salim, hate this particular phrase rather than all others?! This is a question the answer for which is well known by everyone who knows the politics of those people, the truth of their intentions, their inclinations, cunning and conniving.

55. Al-Mas’udi Twists Words in His Book

Al-Mas’udi has stated the following: “‘Urwah ibn al-Zubayr used to excuse his brother, ‘Abdullah, for confining Banu Hashim to the valley and his gathering firewood to burn them. He used to say, ‘He intended by doing so to put an end to dissension, so that the Muslims would be unified, obedient [to Abu Bakr], so their word would be one, just as ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab did to Banu Hashim when they lagged behind and refused to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, for he gathered firewood in order to burn their house.’” Such is the text on p. 86, Vol. 3, of *Muruj al-Dhahab* by al-Mas’udi as printed by Al-Maymuniyya Press [Cairo, Egypt]. But all other printings of this same book[64](#) have deleted the sentence saying “... just as ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab did to Banu Hashim when they lagged behind and refused to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, for he gathered firewood in order to burn their house.”

The Mu’tazilite scholar[65](#) has cited al-Mas’udi’s text in its correct form as stated above in the edition printed by the Maymuniyya Press. This proves that the hands of betrayal and forgery played havoc with all editions of this book just as they have done in many others, and those who oppressed the family of Muhammed (S) “... **shall come to know to what final place of turning they shall turn back**” (*Qur’an, 26:227*).

6. The Book *Al-Ma’arif* Distorted

Because of the issue of al-Muhsin being miscarried, we find them not hesitating to distort the original contents of the book titled *Al-Ma’arif* by Ibn Qutaybah as we are told by Ibn Shahr Ashub who died in 588 A.H./1192 A.D. Says he, “Ibn Qutaybah states in his book titled *Al-Ma’arif* that Muhsin perished because of the squeezing [of his mother] by Qunfath of Banu ‘Adiyy.”[66](#)

Al-Kanji, the Shafi'i scholar who died in 685 A.H., cites the mentor, al-Mufid, saying, "He [Ibn Qutaybah] added to what most scholars have reported saying that Fatima, peace with her, miscarried after the demise of the Prophet (S) a son whom the Messenger of Allah (S) had named Muhsin. This is something which is not reported by anyone from among the transmitters except Ibn Qutaybah."[67](#)

It seems he means that Ibn Qutaybah has transmitted the above in his book titled *Al-Ma'arif* as Ibn Shahr Ashub testifies. But if you look at p. 92 of the edition of the same book printed in 1353 A.H., you will instead read the following sentence: "As for Muhsin son of Ali (as), he died young." Such is the case with all other editions now in circulation... So, why should some people resort to such distorting and such betrayal of the historical truth?! We wonder.

57. Al-Shahristani, who dies in 548 A.H./1153 A.D., discussing al-Nizam, who died in 231 A.H./846 A.D., says, "He provided more details about the tragedy saying that "Umar hit the stomach of Fatima (sa) on the day when people swore the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr] till she miscarried a fetus from her womb, and he used to shout, 'Burn her house and everyone inside it!' And there was none in the house except Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as)."[68](#)

[Al-Khateeb] al-Baghdadi has quoted al-Nizam [Nizam al-Dawla, the Abbaside] as saying that "Umar hit Fatima (sa) and deprived the Progeny of the Prophet (S) of their inheritance."[69](#)

Al-Maqrizi says, "... It is alleged that he hit Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S) and deprived the Prophet's Progeny of their inheritance."[70](#)

Al-Safadi has also quoted him as saying, "'Umar hit the stomach of Fatima (sa) on the day when the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr] was taken, so she miscarried al-Muhsin."[71](#)

Important Note

Al-Jahiz الجاحظ has said the following about al-Nizam: "He used to be the most critical of the Rafidis because of their casting doubts about the characters of the *sahaba*."[72](#)

58. In their biography of Muhammed ibn 'Abdullah ibn "Umar ibn Muhammed ibn al-Hassan al-Faris, namely Abul-Hayat, the preacher from Balkh [Baluchistan], "Ali ibn Mahmud has told me that the preacher from Balkh was addicted to taunting the *sahaba*, so I attended his meeting place once. He said, 'Fatima (sa) wept once, whereon Ali (as) said to her, 'Are you crying because of me?! Did I confiscate your property (Fadak)? Did I usurp what belongs to you? Did I do such-and-such...?' and he kept counting the things which the Rafidis claim that both *shaikhs* [Abu Bakr and "Umar] did to Fatima (sa). All the Rafidis present there wept loudly.'" He died in Safar of 196 A.H./812 A.D."[73](#)

59. Ibn Sa'd, through his *isnad* to Salma, has said, "Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S) fell sick among us. On the day when she died, Ali (as) went outside. She said to me, 'O bondmaid! Pour the water for me so I may bathe.' I poured it for her, and she took the best bath then said, 'Bring me my

mourning clothes.’ I brought them to her and helped her put them on. Then she said to me, ‘Let my bed be in the middle of the house.’ I did, and she slept on it, facing the *qibla*. Then she said to me, ‘O bondmaid! I am dying now, and I have already taken my bath; so, nobody should uncover even my shoulder.’ She died. Ali (as) returned, and I informed him of what happened. He said, ‘No, by Allah! Nobody shall ever uncover even her shoulder!’ He carried her and buried her as she was.”[74](#)

60. In another text, it is stated that when Abu Bakr received the oath of allegiance from the public, Ali (as) and al-Zubayr kept consulting with Fatima (sa), and ‘Umar heard about it, so he went to Fatima (sa) and said, “O daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S)! By Allah! Nobody at all I love more than I love your father, and nobody is more dear to us after your father than your own self. By Allah! This does not stop me at all from burning the door of these individuals assembling with you!” When ‘Umar went out, she said to them, “You know that ‘Umar has been here and he swore by Allah to burn the house door. By Allah! He shall carry out what he swore to do; so, disperse to your destinations and flee.” They left her and did not return to her till they had sworn fealty...”[75](#)

61. Al-Balathiri has quoted Ibn ‘Abbas as saying, “Abu Bakr and ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab sent for Ali (S) when he refused to swear the oath of allegiance. He said, ‘Bring him to me in the most violent way.’ When he was brought to him, a dialogue went on between them both. He [Ali (as)] said to ‘Umar, ‘Milk some milk only a portion of which is yours. By Allah! You are not concerned about his [Abu Bakr’s] government so much except that in the future he will advance you for it.”[76](#)

62. Al-Ya’qubi has said, “It came to the knowledge of Abu Bakr and ‘Umar that a group of the Muhajirun and Ansar assembled with Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) at the house of Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S). They went in a group till they assaulted the house. Ali (as) went out carrying his sword. ‘Umar met him and they had a brawl. Ali (as) subdued ‘Umar and broke his sword. They entered the house by force, so Fatima (sa) went out and said, “I plead to you in the Name of Allah to get out or else I shall uncover my hair and lodge a complaint to Allah against you!” Everyone in the house went out. The people stayed for days and one by one swore the oath of allegiance save Ali (as) who did not do so except six months later or, according to some, forty days.”[77](#)

His statement that “Ali (as) went out carrying his sword” is not accurate; what is accurate is that al-Zubayr did so as is well known from all texts.

63. Zaid ibn Aslam has said,

I was one of those who carried firewood with ‘Umar to Fatima’s house door when Ali (as) and his supporters refused to swear the oath of allegiance. ‘Umar said to Fatima (sa), “Get out of the house or else I shall burn it and everyone inside it!” Ali (as), al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and a group from among the companions of the Prophet (S) were inside it. Fatima (sa) said to ‘Umar, “Shall you really burn my sons?!” “Yes,” ‘Umar answered, “by Allah, if they all do not come out to swear fealty.”[78](#)

The narrator goes on to say, “This is also narrated by Ibn Kharthamah or Ibn Kharthabah or Ibn

Khayranah or Ibn Khathabah.”[79](#)

Al-Waqidi has said that “Umar went to Ali (as) with a group of people which included Assad ibn al-Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam al-Ashhali and said, “Get out, or else we shall burn you all!”[80](#)

Al-Hurr al-’Amili, may Allah have mercy on him, has said,

Narrators have transmitted, and so have chroniclers, that when “Umar secured the oath of allegiance to his friend [Abu Bakr] and Ali (as) lagged behind, he went to Fatima’s house to demand that Ali (as) swear fealty. He used a very rough language and ordered firewood to be brought in order to burn the house and everyone inside it. Inside it were: the Commander of the Faithful (as), his wife and sons (as). Those who supported Ali (as) included al-Zubayr and a group from the Banu Hashim. Among those who narrated the incident in detail are: al-Waqidi, Ibn Jubayr and Ibn ‘Abd Rabbih.[81](#)

65. Musa ibn ‘Uqbah has quoted Ibn Shihab saying that men from among the Muhajirun were very angry when people swore the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr. Among them was Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) and al-Zubayr ibn al-’Awwam. They entered the house of Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S). “Umar ibn al-Khattab went there accompanied by a group from among the Muhajirun and Ansar which included Assad ibn Hudayr, Salamah ibn Aslam ibn Waqsh, both from Banu al-Ashhal, and Thabit ibn Qays ibn Shammas al-Khazraji. They spoke to both of them till one of those folks took al-Zubayr’s sword and kept hitting it on a stone till he broke it.[82](#)

Musa ibn ‘Uqbah has said the following in his book which discusses the Prophet’s military campaigns [*Kitab al-Maghazi*]:

Sa’d ibn Ibrahim is quoted as saying, “My father narrated to me that his father, ‘Abd al-Rahman ibn ‘Awf, was with “Umar [when they all attacked Fatima’s house], and that Muhammed ibn Maslamah broke al-Zubayr’s sword. Then Abu Bakr delivered a sermon and apologized to the people.”[83](#)

66. Having listed the names of those who refused to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr and who sided with Ali ibn Abu Talib (as), Ibn al-Shahnah says the following: “Then “Umar went to Fatima’s house to burn it and everyone inside it. Fatima (sa) met him. He said to her, ‘Join what the rest of the nation has done.’ Ibn Wasil says that Ali (as) went out to Abu Bakr and swore fealty to him. ‘A’isha said that Ali (as) never swore the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr till Fatima (sa) died.”[84](#)

67. Ibn ‘Abd Rabbih, a Mu’tazilite, is quoted by al-Balathiri and others as having said,

As regarding Ali (as), al-’Abbas and al-Zubayr, they took to Fatima’s house till Abu Bakr sent them “Umar ibn al-Khattab to get them out of Fatima’s house, saying to him, “If they refuse, you should fight them.” “Umar brought a torch of fire in order to burn their house. Fatima (sa) met him and said to him, “O son of al-Khattab! Have you really come here to burn our house?!” Or she said to him, “Are you really going to burn my house door?” or “my house?” He said, “Yes, if you do not join the rest of the

nation.” Or he said, “Yes, and this is stronger than what your father had brought.” Ali (as) went and swore fealty.[85](#)

68. Ibn Jarir [al-Tabari] has said,

Ibn Hamad has narrated to us saying that Jarir quotes al-Mughirah quoting Ziyad ibn Kulayb as saying that “Umar ibn al-Khattab went to the house of Fatima (sa) where Talhah and al-Zubayr and men from among the Muhajirun were assembling. He said to them, “By Allah! I shall burn your house or else you should get out to swear the oath of allegiance!” Al-Zubayr went out to meet him, bearing his unsheathed sword, but he stumbled, so the sword fell from his hand. They leaped at him and arrested him.[86](#)

69. In another text, the same author says,

Ali (as) and al-Zubayr lagged behind [did not swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr]. Al-Zubayr unsheathed his sword and said, “I shall not place it back in its scabbard until people swear the oath of allegiance to Ali (as)!” Abu Bakr and “Umar came to know about it. “Umar said, “Take al-Zubayr’s sword and hit it on a stone.” “Umar set out to meet them. He arrested both of them saying, “You shall both swear fealty at will or else we shall force you to swear it.” So they swore fealty.[87](#)

70. The Mu’tazilite scholar (Ibn Abul-Hadid) has said,

Abu Bakr [namely Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-’Aziz] has said that Abu Sa’d, ‘Abd al-Rahman ibn Muhammed, narrated to us saying that Ahmed ibn al-Hakim has said that ‘Abdullah ibn Wahab narrated to us citing Layth ibn Sa’d saying that Ali (as) did not swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, so he was taken out tied up. He was dragged in a hurry as he kept saying, “O Muslims! Why should a Muslim be killed because he lagged behind others not because of a disagreement but because he has something very important to do [the compilation of the text of the Holy Qur’an]?” Whenever he passed by a meeting place, he was told to go and swear the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr].[88](#)

71. The same author has also said,

Only Ali (as) refused to swear the oath of allegiance, confining himself to Fatima’s house, so they took him out by force. Fatima (sa) went to the house door and said something to the person who went there seeking to arrest him.[89](#)

72. Ibn Abul-Hadid, the Mu’tazilite Shafi’i scholar, has also said,

“I said that he took this theme from some poets belonging to Banu Talib, from the people of Hijaz. Al-Naqib Jalal ad-Din ‘Abd al-Hamid ibn Muhammed ibn ‘Abd al-Hamid, the ‘Alawide, recited it to me. He said that the poet himself had recited it to me, but I forgot his name. Said he,

O father of Hafs! Wait! You would not have been to plead to

Had it not been for the death [of the Prophet].

Should al-Batul die angry while we are pleased?

Such are not the deeds of gracious sons at all.

The poet was addressing ‘Umar saying, “Slow down! Wait! O ‘Umar! Have some compassion and some wisdom, and do not be rough like that with us. You are not qualified to talk to us like that, nor should we ask you gently, nor could you have entered the house of Fatima (sa) by force had her father, because of whom her house was safeguarded and respected, had died, so you coveted what you could not have coveted before.” Then he says something like this: “Should our mother [Fatima (sa)] die while still angry and we are pleased? We would not be then good offspring at all because a good son is pleased when his parents are pleased and angry when they, too, are angry.” I have confirmed that she died while being still very angry with Abu Bakr and ‘Umar and that she left a will saying that they both should not perform her funeral prayers.[90](#)

73. The same scholar has also said,

Abu Bakr [namely Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-‘Aziz] has said that Abu Bakr al-Bahili has cited Isma’il ibn Mujalid quoting al-Sha’bi saying that Abu Bakr said, “O ‘Umar! Where is Khalid ibn al-Walid?” He said, “Here he is.” Abu Bakr said, “Go to both of them (meaning to Ali (as) and al-Zubayr) and bring them to me.” They both went there. ‘Umar entered while Khalid remained outside at the door. ‘Umar said to al-Zubayr, “What is this sword for?” Al-Zubayr [ibn al-‘Awwam] said, “I have prepared it to swear the oath of allegiance to Ali (as).” There were many people at the house including al-Miqdad ibn al-Aswad and many from Banu Hashim. ‘Umar took [al-Zubayr’s] sword and hit it on a rock at the house till it broke. Then he dragged al-Zubayr by the hand, forced him to stand, then pushed him out. Then he said, “O Khalid! Take this one!” Khalid took hold of him. With Khalid outside the house were many people sent by Abu Bakr as reinforcements. Then ‘Umar entered again and said to Ali (as), “Stand up and swear the oath of allegiance.” Ali (as) relented. ‘Umar grabbed Ali (as) by the hand and told him to stand up, but he refused, so he carried him and pushed him just as he had done to al-Zubayr. Khalid arrested both men. ‘Umar and those with him dragged them violently as a large number of people looked on. The streets of Medina were filled with people. Fatima (sa) saw what ‘Umar had done, so she screamed and complained, and many women from Banu Hashim and from others assembled around her. She went out to the door of her chamber and called out saying, “O Abu Bakr! How swift you are in waging an assault on the family of the Messenger of Allah (S)! By Allah! I shall never speak to ‘Umar till I meet Allah!”[91](#)

74. The Mu’tazilite Shafi’i scholar narrated the incident of the *saqifa*[92](#) from al-Jawhari saying:

Abu Bakr [Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-‘Aziz] has said that Abu Zaid, ‘Umar ibn Shabbah, has said that Ahmed ibn Mu’awiyah narrated to us saying that he was told by al-Nadar ibn Shumayl saying that Muhammed ibn ‘Amr has cited Salamah ibn ‘Abd al-Rahman saying that when Abu Bakr seated himself on the pulpit [of the Prophet (S)], Ali (S) and al-Zubayr and many people from Banu Hashim were at Fatima’s house.

“Umar went to them and said, “I swear by the One Who holds my life in His hands that if you do not come out to swear the oath of allegiance, I shall burn your house!” Al-Zubayr went out unsheathing his sword. A man from the Ansar and Zaid ibn Labid overpowered him, causing his sword to fall. From his place on top of the pulpit, Abu Bakr shouted, “Hit it on the stone!” He did so [breaking al-Zubayr’s sword]. ‘Amr ibn Hammas said, “I saw the stone with the marks of such hitting and said, ‘Here was al-Zubayr’s sword broken.’” Abu Bakr then said, “Leave them alone, for Allah shall bring them.” They went out after that and swore the oath of allegiance to him.[93](#)

75. Abu Bakr [Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-‘Aziz] has also said, “It is narrated in another narrative that Sa’d ibn Abu Waqqas was with them at the house of Fatima (sa), and so was al-Miqdad ibn al-Aswad. They assembled with Ali (S) to swear the oath of allegiance to him, so “Umar went there to burn their house. Al-Zubayr went out carrying his sword to meet him. Fatima (sa), too, went out crying and wailing, separately from the rest of people. They said, ‘We have not committed any sin, nor do we oppose anything good about which people come to an agreement, but we gathered in order to compile the text of the Qur’an in one single book.’[94](#) Then they swore the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, thus people felt secure.”

76. Abu Bakr [Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-‘Aziz] has also said,

Abu Zaid, “Umar ibn Shabbah, has quoted some of his men as saying that “Umar went to the house of Fatima (sa) accompanied by a number of men from among the Ansar and a very small number from among the Muhajirun. He said, “By the One Who holds my life in His hand! You shall have to come out to swear fealty or I shall burn your house!” Al-Zubayr went out to meet him, unsheathing his sword. Ziyad ibn Labid al-Ansari and another man grabbed him, and the sword fell from his hand which “Umar hit on a stone, breaking it. Then “Umar dragged them from their clothes violently till they swore fealty to Abu Bakr.[95](#)

77. Abu Zaid has said that al-Nadar ibn Shumayl has narrated saying that al-Zubayr’s sword, when it fell from his hand, was carried to Abu Bakr as he was sitting on the pulpit delivering a speech. Abu Bakr said, “Hit it on a rock!” Abu ‘Amr ibn Hammas said, “I saw the rock with the mark of that hitting, and people were saying that it was left by al-Zubayr’s sword.”[96](#)

78. The Mu’tazilite scholar has said,

Ibn ‘Abd al-Hamid has said that when people were talking about how Ali (as) did not swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, and when Abu Bakr and “Umar pressured him to do so, the mother of Mastah ibn Athathah went out and stood at the grave [of the Messenger of Allah (S)] and cited the following verses of poetry [originally composed by Fatima (sa)]:

There were issues, events and hardships

Had you witnessed them, no calamities would have transpired.

We miss you as the earth misses its rain,

And your people slipped, so witness them and do not be absent.

Abu Bakr, namely Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-’Aziz, has said that Abu Zaid, ‘Umar ibn Shabbah, has informed us that Ibrahim ibn al-Munthir has quoted Ibn Wahab quoting Ibn Lahi’ah quoting Abul-Aswad [al-Du’ali, the renown poet] saying that a man from the Muhajirun was angry with Abu Bakr receiving people’s oath of allegiance without any consultation, and so were Ali (S) and al-Zubayr. The latter entered the house of Fatima (sa). ‘Umar went there accompanied by a number of men, including Assad ibn Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam ibn Waqsh, both from Banu ‘Abd al-Ashhal, and they broke into the house. Fatima (sa) screamed and pleaded to them in the Name of Allah. They took the swords of Ali (S) and al-Zubayr and hit them on the wall till they broke them both. Then ‘Umar took them out, dragging them, till they swore fealty.[97](#)

79. The same scholar goes on to say that Abu Bakr [Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-’Aziz] has narrated the same incident from another venue saying that Thabit ibn Qays ibn Shammas was among those who were in ‘Umar’s company when the latter assaulted the house of Fatima (sa). Thabit belongs to Banu al-Harith ibn al-Khazraj.

80. He also narrates saying that Muhammed ibn Maslamah was with them, and that this Muhammed was the one who broke al-Zubayr’s sword.[98](#)

81. Accompanied by many men, ‘Umar went to Fatima’s house. Among those men were: Assad ibn Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam. He told those inside her house to get out to swear the oath of allegiance [to his friend, Abu Bakr], but they refused. Al-Zubayr came out to meet them with his sword. ‘Umar said, “Take care of the dog!” Salamah ibn Aslam leaped at him, took the sword from his hand and pushed him on the wall. Then they took him and Ali (S) with a number of Banu Hashim. Ali (S) kept saying to them, ‘I am a servant of Allah and the Brother of the Messenger of Allah (S).’ They brought Ali (S) to Abu Bakr. He was told to swear fealty. He said, “I am more worthy of this matter than you. I will not swear the oath of allegiance. Rather, you ought to swear it to me. You took this matter from the Ansar under the pretext of your kinship to the Messenger of Allah (S), so they submitted leadership to you, and I argue with you using the same argument you used with the Ansar. Be fair to us, if you fear Allah, and recognize our right just as the Ansar recognize it; otherwise, be afflicted with injustice, and you know it.” ‘Umar said, “We shall not leave you alone till you swear the oath of allegiance.” Ali (S) said to him, “O ‘Umar! Milk some milk in which you have a share! Support him [Abu Bakr] today so that he will hand it [caliphate] over to you tomorrow! By Allah! I shall not accept what you say, nor shall I swear fealty to him.”[99](#)

82. The Mu’tazilite scholar has also said, “As regarding the terrible things which the Shi’as mention about dispatching Qunfath to the house of Fatima (sa), and that he whipped her, leaving a mark on her wrist like a bracelet which lingered there till her death, and that ‘Umar squeezed her between the door

and the house, so she cried out, 'O Father! O Messenger of Allah!', that her fetus was born dead..., our fellows do not report such incidents... Rather, the Shi'as are alone in transmitting them." This is so despite the fact that the scholar himself is the one who transmitted from his mentor the incident of the miscarriage of al-Muhsin and wondered about the stand of the Messenger of Allah (S) in its regard. He did so when he narrated how Habar ibn al-Aswad was to be killed for terrorizing Zainab. When he demanded his mentor to tell him about it, his mentor told him that the incidents, according to him, were contradictory, and that he would leave the matter there. [100](#) We have also cited scores of texts narrated by non-Shi'as testifying to the authenticity of this incident, so his statement makes no sense.

83. Ibn Abul-Hadid has also said, "As regarding the incident of the attack on the house of Fatima (sa), we have already discussed it. Apparently, I can see the accuracy of what al-Murtada and the Shi'as narrate, but not all what they narrate, for some of it did take place, and Abu Bakr was right in regretting it and repenting, and this proves the strength of his conviction and fear of Allah Almighty. This ought to be used as a testimony for him rather than against him." [101](#)

84. He also says, "As regarding the incident of the burning and what awful things happened, and how some people have said that they dragged Ali (as) by his turban surrounded by people, this is far-fetched. Only the Shi'as make such a claim, but some traditionists have narrated *almost* the same." [102](#) We do not know how he compromises his statement that "Only the Shi'a make such a claim" with the one saying "A group of traditionists have narrated *almost* the same"! Some such traditionists were Mu'tazilites like him, and the reader has already come to know that everything this scholar sees as "far-fetched" has been narrated by the masses that follow his own creed. Sayyid al-Murtada has said that nobody should pay any attention to one who rejects texts by simply regarding them as "far-fetched" without producing any proof or evidence.

85. Ibn Qutaybah al-Daynuri has said,

"As regarding Ali (S) and al-'Abbas ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib and their supporters from among Banu Hashim, they dispersed to their mounts, and al-Zubayr ibn al-'Awwam was with them. "Umar went to them accompanied by a group of men which included Assad ibn Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam. They were told to go to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, but they refused. Al-Zubayr ibn al-'Awwam came out, sword in hand. "Umar said, "Take care of the man! Arrest him!" Salamah ibn Aslam leaped at him, took the sword from his hand and hit it on the wall. They took him away and he swore fealty, and Banu Hashim, too, went and swore it. Ali, may Allah glorify his countenance, was brought to Abu Bakr as he kept saying, "I am a servant of Allah and the Brother of His Messenger (S)." He was told to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr. He said, "I have more right to this issue than you. I shall not swear the oath of allegiance to you. Rather, you ought to swear it to me. You have taken this issue from the Ansar, arguing with them that you have kinship with the Prophet (S), yet you usurp it from us, while we are the members of his Ahl al-Bayt?! Did you not claim to the Ansar that you deserve it more than them since Muhammed (S) is from you, so they handed you the reins of leadership and granted you the

government?! I argue with you with the same argument which you used against the Ansar: We have more right to the Messenger of Allah (S), be he alive or dead, than you; so, be fair to us if you are believers; otherwise, be afflicted with injustice, and you know it.” “Umar said to him, “You shall not be left alone till you swear fealty.” Ali (as) said to him, “Milk some milk in which you have a share! Support him [Abu Bakr] today so that he will hand it [caliphate] over to you tomorrow!” Then he added saying, “By Allah, O “Umar! I shall not accept what you say, nor shall I swear fealty to him.”[103](#)

86. Ibn Qutaybah has also said, “Abu Bakr noticed that some people did not swear the oath of allegiance to him and were at the house of Ali, may Allah glorify his countenance, so he dispatched “Umar to them. “Umar called out to them as they were inside Ali’s house, but they refused to come out, so he ordered firewood to be brought and said, ‘I swear by the One Who holds “Umar’s life in His hand, you shall have to get out or else I shall burn the house and everyone inside it!’ Someone said to him, ‘O father of Hafs! But Fatima (sa) is inside it!’ He said, ‘So what?!’ They went out and swore fealty except Ali (as) who said, ‘I swore not to go out nor to put my outer garment on until I compile the text of the Qur’an.’ Fatima, may Allah be pleased with her, stood at her house door and said, ‘I have never seen people whose presence is worse than yours. You left the Messenger of Allah (S) as a corpse in front of us and managed your affair among yourselves without letting us take charge of you, nor did you uphold our rights.’ “Umar went to Abu Bakr and said, ‘Are you not going to take the oath of allegiance from this man who lagged behind and has not sworn it yet?’ Abu Bakr said to Qunfath, one of his slaves, ‘Go and bring Ali to me.’ He went to Ali (as) who asked him, ‘What do you want?’ He said, ‘The successor of the Messenger of Allah (S) invites you to his presence.’ Ali (as) said, ‘How quickly you all tell lies about the Messenger of Allah (S)!’ Qunfath returned and conveyed the message. Abu Bakr wept for a long time. For the second time, “Umar said to him, ‘Do not grant a respite to the man who has not sworn allegiance to you yet.’ Abu Bakr said to Qunfath, ‘Go back to him and tell him that the successor of the Messenger of Allah (S) invites you to swear fealty.’ Qunfath went to Ali (as) and conveyed the message. Ali (as) raised his voice as he said, ‘Praise be to Allah! He has claimed what does not belong to him!’ Qunfath returned and conveyed the message. Abu Bakr again wept for a long time. “Umar stood up and walked, accompanied by some men, till they reached the door of Fatima’s house. When Fatima (sa) heard their voices, she called as loudly as she could, ‘O Father! O Messenger of Allah (S)! What have we suffered after you at the hands of the son of al-Khattab and the son of Abu Quhafah?!’ When those men heard her voice and crying, they dispersed, weeping, and their hearts almost softened. “Umar remained alone with some of his folks. They took Ali (as) out by force, dragging him to Abu Bakr and told him to swear fealty. He said, ‘Suppose I do not, what will you do?’ They said, ‘We shall, by Allah, the One and only God, kill you.’ Ali (as) said, ‘You will then kill a servant of Allah and the Brother of His Messenger.’ “Umar said, ‘As regarding your being a servant of Allah, you are, indeed, a very good one, but we reject your being the Brother of His Messenger.’ During the whole time, Abu Bakr remained silent without saying anything. “Umar said to him, ‘Are you going to issue your order [of killing] in his regard?’ Abu Bakr said, ‘I shall not force him to do anything so long as Fatima (sa) is beside him.’ Ali (as) went to the grave of the Messenger of Allah (S) crying and calling out [a verse of the Holy Qur’an quoting prophet

Aaron pleading to his younger brother, prophet Moses (as)], ‘O son of my mother! The folks deemed me weak and almost killed me!’”[104](#)

87. Here, we would like to quote the exact Arabic text, which is written by Sunnis, of this portion for the benefit of Arabic speaking readers followed by its translation:

قال عمر لأبي بكر (رض): انطلق بنا إلى فاطمة، فإننا قد أغضبناها، فانطلقا جميعا، فاستأذنا على فاطمة، فلم تأذن لهما.

فأتيا عليا فكلماه، فأدخلهما عليها، فلما قعدا عندها، حولت وجهها إلى الحائط، فسلما عليها، فلم ترد عليهما السلام.

فتكلم أبو بكر فقال: يا حبيبة رسول الله! والله إن قرابة رسول الله أحب إلي من قرابتي، وإنك لأحب إلي من عائشة ابنتي، ولوددت يوم مات أبوك أني مت، ولا أبقى بعده، أفتراني أعرفك وأعرف فضلك وشرفك وأمنعك حقك وميراثك . من رسول الله؟! إلا أني سمعت أباك رسول الله (ص) يقول: لا نورث، ما تركنا فهو صدقة .

فقالت: أرايتكما إن حدثتكما حديثا عن رسول الله (ص) تعرفانه وتفعلان به؟

قالا: نعم.

فقالت: نشدتكما الله ألم تسمعا رسول الله يقول: رضى فاطمة من رضاي، وسخط فاطمة من سخطي، فمن أحب فاطمة ابنتي فقد أحبني، ومن أرضى فاطمة فقد أرضاني، ومن أسخط فاطمة فقد أسخطني؟

قالا: نعم سمعناه من رسول الله (ص).

قالت: فإني أشهد الله وملائكته أنكما أسخطتماني وما أرضيتماني، ولئن لقيت النبي لأشكونكما إليه.

فقال أبو بكر: أنا عائد بالله تعالى من سخطه وسخطك يا فاطمة، ثم انتحب أبو بكر يبكي، حتى كادت نفسه أن تزهد، وهي تقول: والله لأدعون الله عليك في كل صلاة أصليها.

ثم خرج باكيا فاجتمع إليه الناس، فقال لهم: ببیت كل رجل منكم معانقا حليلته، مسرورا بأهله، وتركتموني وما أنا

فيه، لا حاجة لي في بيعتكم، أقبّلوني بيعتي

قالوا: يا خليفة رسول الله، إن هذا الأمر لا يستقيم، وأنت أعلمنا بذلك، إنه إن كان هذا لم يقدّم له دين

فقال: والله لولا ذلك وما أخافه من رجاوة هذه العروة ما بت ليلة ولي في عنق مسلم بيعة، بعدما سمعت ورأيت من فاطمة

قال: فلم يبايع علي كرم الله وجهه حتى ماتت فاطمة (رض)، ولم تمكث بعد أبيها إلا خمسا وسبعين ليلة، قال: فلما...توفيت أرسل. الخ

“Umar said to Abu Bakr, “Let us go to Fatima (sa), for we have made her angry.” They both set out and sought Fatima’s permission to meet her, but she did not grant them permission. They went to Ali (as) and talked to him. Ali (as) permitted them to come in. When they entered, Fatima (sa) turned her face away from them, facing the wall. They greeted her, but she did not respond to their greeting. Abu Bakr spoke saying, “O one loved by the Messenger of Allah (S)! By Allah! The kinsfolk of the Messenger of Allah (S) are dearer to me than my own kinsfolk, and you are dearer to me than my daughter, ‘A’isha. When your father (S) died, I wished that I, too, had died rather than survive him. So, do you think that since I know you and know your distinction and prestige, I would still deprive you of what belongs to you and of your inheritance from the Messenger of Allah (S) except that I heard your father, the Messenger of Allah (S), say, ‘We do not leave an inheritance; whatever we leave is charity’?”

She said, “If I narrate to you a tradition from the Messenger of Allah (S) with which you both are already familiar, are you going to act according to it?” They both answered in the affirmative. She said, “I ask you in the Name of Allah, did you not hear the Messenger of Allah (S) say, ‘What pleases Fatima pleases me, and what angers Fatima angers me; whoever loves Fatima loves me, and whoever angers Fatima angers me’?” Both men said, “Yes, we have heard the Messenger of Allah (S) say so.” She said, “Then I plead to Allah and to His angels to testify that you both have made me angry and never pleased me, and when I meet the Prophet, I shall complain to him against you.” Abu Bakr said, “I seek refuge with Allah, the most Exalted One, against His wrath and yours, O Fatima!”

Then Abu Bakr wept bitterly till his soul almost left his body as she kept saying, “By Allah! I shall plead to Allah against you in every prayer I perform.” Abu Bakr went out weeping. People assembled around him. He said to them, “Every man from among you goes to bed embracing his wife, happy with his family, while leaving me in my agony. I have no need for your oath of allegiance. Let me resign from your fealty.” They said to him, “O successor of the Messenger of Allah! This cannot be right, and you best know of that. If such is the case, the religion of Allah will not stand.” He said, “By Allah! Had the case not been so, and had I not feared such a knot will be loosened, I would not have spent the night without

relinquishing the oath of allegiance of any Muslim after having heard and seen what Fatima (sa) has said.”

Ali, may Allah glorify his countenance, did not swear the oath of allegiance till Fatima, may Allah be pleased with her, died. She lived only seventy–five days after the death of her father (S). When she died, Abu Bakr sent “Umar..., etc. [105](#)

88. “Umar Rida Kahalah has said, “Shi’a narrators have transmitted saying that Abu Bakr wrote Fatima (sa) a deed of her property of Fadak. When she came out carrying it, “Umar met her. He stretched his hand to take it from her by force, but she did not let him. He pushed his hand in her chest, taking the deed out and burning it.” [106](#)

89. ‘Abd al–Fattah ‘Abd al–Maqsad has said,

Rumors were swift that day tracing the path of “Umar ibn al–Khattab as he led a group of his followers and helpers to the house of Fatima (sa) with the intention to get the cousin of the Messenger of Allah (S), willingly or unwillingly, to do what he till then had refused to do...

Is there a deterrent on people that prohibits them from narrating the incident of the firewood which the son of al–Khattab ordered to surround with it the house of Fatima (sa) as Ali (as) and his followers were inside it in order to equip “Umar with the tool to either convince or trap Ali (as)? The man [“Umar] went there in a tirade as a revolution was boiling inside him determined to assault Ali’s house. His helpers and those whom he had brought there supported him, and they forced themselves in or almost did so.

Then suddenly a face like that of the Messenger of Allah (S) appeared at the door intercepting, grief–stricken, showing signs of pain, with eyes overflowing with tears and with a forehead on which a boiling rage painted its marks. As she faced the sacred tomb [of the Messenger of Allah (S)], al–Zahra’ (sa) kept seeking help from this absent–present personality: “O Father! O Messenger of Allah! What have we faced after you at the hands of the son of al–Khattab and the son of Abu Quhafah?!” Her words left only hearts afflicted with grief. [107](#)

90. Ibn Abul–Hadid, the Mu’tazilite Shafi’i scholar, has said that he read to his mentor, Abu Ja’far al–Naqab, the story of Zainab’s grief and how she was terrorized by Habar ibn al–Aswad. Abu Ja’far said to him, “Since the Messenger of Allah (S) permitted the killing of Habar ibn al–Aswad because he terrorized Zainab, so she miscarried, apparently, had he been alive, he would have permitted the killing of the individual who terrorized Fatima (sa), so she miscarried.” Ibn Abul–Hadid said to his mentor, “Shall I quote you as saying that Fatima (sa) was terrorized, so she miscarried al–Muhsin?” He said, “Do not quote me, and do not narrate saying that this is not true, for I have my position regarding this topic due to the contradictions among the narratives which I have reviewed.” [108](#)

91. It has been said that Ahmed ibn Muhammed ibn Muhammed ibn al–Sari ibn Yahya ibn Abu Darim, the traditionist, that he remained on the right track all his life, but in his last days, he used to narrate

shameful events. One cites him as saying that “Umar kicked Fatima (sa) till she miscarried Muhsin. [109](#)

- [1.](#) Shaikh al-Mufid, Kitab al-Mazar, p. 156. Also p. 459 of Kitab al-Muqna`a by the same author. Refer to pp. 198, 278 of Al-Bald al-Amin. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, pp. 197-98.
- [2.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, p. 198. Its footnote cites pp. 26, 25 of Misbah al-Za`ir.
- [3.](#) Misbah al-Mutahajjid, p. 654. Iqbal al-A`mal, p. 624. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, p. 195.
- [4.](#) Iqbal al-A`mal, p. 625. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, pp. 199-200.
- [5.](#) Al-Saduq, Man la Yahdurhu al-Faqih, Vol. 2, p. 573.
- [6.](#) Ibid., Vol. 2, p. 574.
- [7.](#) This is a reference to her burial grounds.
- [8.](#) Al-Tusi, Tahthib al-Ahkam, Vol. 6, p. 10. Malath al-Akhyar, Vol. 9, p. 25. Al-Wafi, Vol. 14, pp. 370-71. Rawdat al-Muttaqin, Vol. 5, p. 345. Refer also to Ahadith al-Shi`a, Vol. 12, p. 264.
- [9.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 99, p. 220.
- [10.](#) Sahk صهك (pronounced as written) refers to a black prostitute. The reader will come across this word more on the next pages. I have researched this word in the famous Arab lexicon of Ibn Manzur, namely Lisan al-`Arab. I found on p. 82, Vol. 4 the word صهك which is pronounced “suhak” as a plural of صهك, sahk, which means: black concubines, bondmaids. If the reader entertains any doubts about this woman being a prostitute, he is advised to copy this Internet Link and paste it in his Internet Browser to review a number of authentic and highly respected Sunni sources admitting this fact: <http://sahak.kalamfikalam.com/t2-topic> [1] as well as many other sites. Just key the word صهك or the word صهك in your Internet’s SEARCH engine and see for yourself. – Tr.
- [11.](#) If you research the incident of Ghadir Khumm, you will come to know that the Prophet (S), as commanded by the Almighty, appointed Ali (as) as his successor: As soon as the rituals of the Farewell Pilgrimage حجة الوداع, the last pilgrimage performed by the Prophet (S), were completed, and to be exact on Dhul-Hijja 17, 10 A.H./March 18, 632 A.D., the divine order came to the Prophet embedded in verse 67 of Chapter 5 (a1-Ma`ida) to appoint Ali (as) as the successor of the Prophet (S) in faring with the Muslims’ affairs. A ceremony of swearing the oath of allegiance to Ali (as) started that day and went on for three days during which even women and children who were present there and then swore it. Both Abu Bakr and `Umar attended that ceremony, and the first to swear that oath of allegiance, in the presence of the Prophet (S), was none other than `Umar ibn al-Khattab who apparently was also the first to renege from it, to violate it, to do the opposite of what he had sworn. Abu Bakr took charge on Rabi` l 13, 11 A.H./June 8, 632 A.D. If you calculate, you will find out that the time that separated the divine appointment of Ali (as) as Commander of the Faithful from Abu Bakr taking charge was only few days, just over two months...! – Tr.
- [12.](#) This lengthy text is quoted from pp. 584-594 of Vol. 2 of the book by Sulaym ibn Qays which al-Ansari edited. Refer to pp. 210-16, Vol. 1, of al-Tibrisi’s Al-Ihtijaj and to Jala’ al-`Uyun. Also refer to pp. 319-320, Vol. 5, of Mir’at al-`Uqul. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 261, 268, 270, 299 and Vol. 43, pp. 197-200. Also refer to pp. 400-404, Vol. 11, of Al-`Awalim. Refer to Diya’ al-`Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 3, pp. 63-64.
- [13.](#) Muhammed Baqir al-Ansari al-Zanjani Kitab Sulaym ibn Qays, Vol. 2, pp. 862-68. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 297-99 and Vol. 43, p. 197. Refer to Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 400-04.
- [14.](#) From the book by Sulaym ibn Qays (edited by al-Ansari), Vol. 2, pp. 871-73. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 306. Refer to Kamil Baha’i, Vol. 1, p. 314. Also refer to Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 400-04.
- [15.](#) Al-Mufid, Amali, pp. 49-50. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 231-32.
- [16.](#) Kitab al-Jamal, pp. 117-18.
- [17.](#) Kifayat al-Talib, p. 413.
- [18.](#) Al-Mufid, Al-Irshad, Vol. 1, p. 189.
- [19.](#) Shaikh al-Mufid, Al-Amali, pp. 172-73 (the edition printed at the Hayderi Press, Najaf al-Ashraf, Iraq).
- [20.](#) Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 185-86. Al-`Ayyashi, Tafsir, Vol. 2, pp. 66-67. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 227-28. Al-Burhan fi Tafsir al-Qur’an, Vol. 2, p. 93. Mir’at al-`Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 320.
- [21.](#) Al-Mustarshid fi Imamate Ali ؑ, p. 66. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, p. 383.
- [22.](#) `Imad ad-Din al-Tabari, Kamil Baha’i (printed at the press of the Al-Mustafawi Library, Qum, Iran), Vol. 1, p. 306.

- [23.](#) Ibid., vo. 1, pp. 312–13.
- [24.](#) Al-Qawshaji, namely `Ala' ad-Din Ali ibn Muhammed al-Qawshaji al-Samarqandi (after his birthplace, Samarkand, or Samarqand, [سamarqand](#), Russian [Самарканд](#), the second-largest city in Uzbekistan). He was an astronomer, mathematician and faqih, jurist, who adhered to the Hanafi Sunni School of Muslim Law. His exact date of birth is unknown, but he died in 879 A.H./1474 A.D. – Tr.
- [25.](#) Al-Ardabili, Hadiqat al-Shi`a, pp. 265–66.
- [26.](#) Refer to a footnote about him above. – Tr.
- [27.](#) Al-Khawajoo'i al-Mazandarani, Al-Rasa'il al-I'tiqadiyya, p. 447, the dissertation on “Tariq al-Rashad” (the Path of Guidance).
- [28.](#) Ibid., pp. 470–71.
- [29.](#) Al-Tibrisi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, p. 181.
- [30.](#) Ibid., Vol. 1, p. 202. Mir'at al-Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 319. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 204–05.
- [31.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, p. 293–95. Al-Khasibi, Al-Hidaya al-Kubra, p. 417.
- [32.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 39, pp. 41–42. Ma`ani al-Akhbar, pp. 205–07.
- [33.](#) Ibn Tawus, Kashf al-Mahajja, p. 115 (1412 A.H. edition published by the Office of Islamic Information, Qum, Iran).
- [34.](#) Rawdat al-Muttaqin, Vol. 5, p. 342.
- [35.](#) Jala' al-Uyun, Vol. 1, pp. 193–94.
- [36.](#) Mir'at al-Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 318. Almost the same wording is stated by al-A`lami in his book titled Tarajim al-Nisa' (women's biographies), Vol. 2, p. 321.
- [37.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 209–10.
- [38.](#) Ibid., Vol. 82, p. 264.
- [39.](#) See p. 39 of a book about the titles of the Messenger of Allah (S) and his progeny published among precious dissertations by Intisharat Basirati, Qum, Iran.
- [40.](#) al-Zahra' (sa) Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa (S) citing Al-Sawarim al-Hasima fi Tarikh Ahwalat al-Zahra' Fatima (sa) (manuscript) written by Muhammed Rida al-Husayni al-Kamali al-Istarbadi. He is also quoted on p. 157, Vol. 3, of the book titled Nawa'ib al-Duhur by al-Mir Jahani.
- [41.](#) Nawadir al-Akhbar, p. 183. `Ilm al-Yaqin, pp. 686–88. `Awalim al-Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 414.
- [42.](#) Qawa'id `Aqa'id Al Muhammed (S) (manuscript), p. 268. I have a photocopy of it.
- [43.](#) Ibid., pp. 669–70.
- [44.](#) Ibid., p. 270.
- [45.](#) Ibid.
- [46.](#) Ibid.
- [47.](#) I searched for information about this author and found it on page 542, Vol. 5 (Dar al-Ta`aruf lil Matbu`at, Beirut, Lebanon, 1420 A.H./2000 A.D. edition, which is in the library of the translator of this book). All we are told in the aforementioned reference, besides praise for his virtue, asceticism, piety, fiqh and narration of traditions, is that he wrote a history book in 1019 A.H./1610 A.D. – Tr.
- [48.](#) Al-`Amili, Al-Tatimma fi Tawarikh al-`A'imma, p. 35.
- [49.](#) Al-Turayhi, Al-Muntakhab, p. 136.
- [50.](#) Conference of Baghdad's Scholars, pp. 135–37 (printed in 1415 A.H./1994 A.D.) at Dar al-Irshad al-Islami, Beirut, Lebanon).
- [51.](#) Sirat al-`A'imma al-Ithna `Ashar, Vol. 1, p. 132.
- [52.](#) Ibid., Vol. 1, p. 133.
- [53.](#) Ibn Hamzah, Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, p. 171.
- [54.](#) Ibid., Vol. 4, p. 173.
- [55.](#) Ibid. Ibn Hamzah pointed out what Fatima (sa) had to go through in more than one place in his book, so refer to his book titled Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, pp. 202–03.
- [56.](#) Ibn Hamzah, Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, p. 202.
- [57.](#) Taqrib al-Ma`arif, p. 256.

- [58.](#) al-Mas`udi, Muruj al-Dhahab, Vol. 3, pp. 12–13.
- [59.](#) Ithbat al-Wasiyya, p. 143. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 308–09.
- [60.](#) Al-Minqari, Siffeen, p. 163.
- [61.](#) Al-Ya`qubi, Tarikh, Vol. 2, p. 137. Al-Dhahbi, Tarikh al-Islam, Vol. 1, pp. 117–18. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, pp. 359, 367–68. Ibn `Abd Rabbih, Al-`Iqd al-Farid, Vol. 4, p. 268. Ibn Shathan, Al-Iyadah, p. 161. Al-Imama wal Siyasa, Vol. 1, p. 18. Siyar A`lam al-Nubala` (biography of the “righteous caliphs”), p. 17. Al-Kaf`ami, Majma` al-Ghara`ib, p. 288. Al-Mas`udi, Muruj al-Dhahab, Vol. 1, pp. 414 and Vol. 2, p. 301. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 1, p. 130 and Vol. 17, pp. 164, 168 and Vol. 6, p. 51 and Vol. 2, pp. 46–47 and Vol. 20, pp. 17, 24. Mizan al-I`tidal, Vol. 3, p. 109 and Vol. 2, p. 215. Al-Imama (manuscript), p. 82; a photocopy of it is available at the Library of the Center for Islamic Studies, Beirut, Lebanon. Lisan al-Mizan, Vol. 4, p. 189. Al-Tabari, Tarikh al-`Umam wal Mulak, Vol. 3, p. 430 (the edition published by Al-Ma`arif Press). Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi, Kanz al-`Ummal, Vol. 3, p. 125 and Vol. 5, pp. 631–32. Al-Rasa`il al-I`tiqadiyya (the dissertation on Tariq al-Rashad), pp. 470–71. Muntakhab Kanz al-`Ummal (referred to in a footnote in Ahmed’s Musnad), Vol. 2, p. 171. Al-Tabrani, Al-Mu`jam al-Kabir, Vol. 1, p. 62. Diya` al-`Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, pp. 90, 108 which cites a large number of references. Al-Nass wal Ijtihad, p. 91. Al-Sab`a minal Salaf, pp. 16–17. Al-Amini, Al-Ghadir, Vol. 7, p. 170. Ma`alim al-Madrasatayn, Vol. 2, p. 79. Ibn `Asakir, Tarikh (in the biography of Abu Bakr). Mir`at al-Zaman. Zahr al-Raba`, Vol. 2, p. 124. Anwar al-Malakat, p. 227. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, pp. 123, 136, 138, 141, 352. Nafahat al-Lahut, p. 79. Hadaqat al-Shi`a, Vol. 2, p. 252. Tashyid al-Mata`in, Vol. 1, p. 340. Dala`il al-Sidq, Vol. 3, p. 32. Al-Khisal, Vol. 1, pp. 171–73. Hayat al-Sahaba, Vol. 2, p. 24. Al-Murtada, Al-Shafi, Vol. 3, p. 170. `Abd al-Jabbar, Al-Mughni, Vol. 20, pp. 340–41. Nahj al-Haqq, p. 265. Abu `Ubayd, Al-Amwal, p. 194. Mujma` al-Zawa`id, Vol. 5, p. 203. Talkhis al-Shafi, Vol. 3, p. 170. Al-Tusi, Tajrad al-I`tiqad, p. 402. Kashf al-Murad, p. 403. Arab-Shahi, Muftah al-Bab (edited by Mahdi Muhaqqiq), p. 199. Taqrib al-Ma`arif, pp. 366–67. Dimashq, Vol. 13, p. 122. Manal al-Talib, p. 280.
- [62.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, p. 138–39.
- [63.](#) Al-Amwal, p. 194.
- [64.](#) Refer, for example, to p. 77, Vol. 3, of the same book, namely Muruj al-Dhahab, which was printed in 1965 at Dar al-Ma`rifa.
- [65.](#) Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 20, pp. 146–47. Al-Mas`udi, too, has quoted the same as you read in the footnote to p. 373, Vol. 2, of Ihqaq al-Haqq.
- [66.](#) “Abul-Hassan” Ali ibn Muhammed al-Wasiti al-Maghazili (d. 483 A.H./1090 A.D.), Manaqib Ali ibn Abu Talib, Vol. 3, p. 407 as printed by Dar al-Adwa`. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, p. 233.
- [67.](#) Kifayat al-Talib, p. 413.
- [68.](#) Al-Shahristani, Al-Milal wal Nihal, Vol. 1, p. 57. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 416. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 271 (footnote), 281. Bahj al-Sibagha, Vol. 5, p. 15. Bayt al-Ahzan, p. 124. Ihqaq al-Haqq, Vol. 2, p. 374; refer also the footnote on p. 372 of the same reference.
- [69.](#) Al-Farq Baynal Firaq, p. 148.
- [70.](#) Al-Maqrizi, Al-Khutat (in the section about wise sayings and morals), Vol. 2, p. 346.
- [71.](#) Al-Wafi bil Wafiyyat, Vol. 6, p. 17.
- [72.](#) Ibn Abul-Hadid (the Mu`tazilite Shafi`i scholar), Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 20, p. 32.
- [73.](#) Refer to Lisan al-Mizan, Vol. 5, p. 218. Al-Wafi bil Wafiyyat, Vol. 3, p. 344.
- [74.](#) Ibn Sa`d, Tabaqat, Vol. 8, p. 27 printed by Sadir Press or p. 18 of its Leiden edition. Al-Isaba, Vol. 4, p. 379 from Ahmed. Siyar A`lam al-Nubala`, Vol. 2, p. 129, except here there is a minor distortion of his statement; so, refer to either the Sadir or the Leiden (Germany) edition.
- [75.](#) Muntakhab Kanz al-`Ummal (as referred to in a footnote in Ahmed’s Musnad), Vol. 2, p. 1174 from Ibn Abu Shaybah. This incident is also narrated in Sharh Nahjul-Balagha by the Mu`tazilite scholar, Vol. 2, p. 45 from al-Jawhari and in Al-Shafi by al-Murtada, Vol. 4, p. 110, and in Al-Mughni by Judge `Abd al-Jabbar, Vol. 20, p. 335. It is also cited in Qurrat al-`Ayn by Waliyy Allah al-Dahlawi of Peshawar, p. 78, in Al-Shafi by Ibn Hamzah, Vol. 4, p. 174; in Nihayat al-Arab, Vol. 19, p. 40; in Al-Isti`ab (as referred to in a footnote in Al-Isaba), Vol. 2, pp. 254–55; in Al-Wafi bil Wafiyyat, Vol. 17, p. 311; in Iffham al-`A`da` wal Khusum, p. 72; in Kanz al-`Ummal, Vol. 5, p. 651. It is also quoted from Ibn Abu Shaybah on p. 567, Vol. 14 of the same. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 313.

- [76.](#) Al-Balathiri, *Ansab al-Ashraf*, Vol. 1, p. 587. Al-Shafi, *Talkhis*, Vol. 3, p. 75, quoting the first.
- [77.](#) Al-Ya`qubi, *Tarikh*, Vol. 2, p. 126.
- [78.](#) *Ithbat al-Hudat*, Vol. 2, pp. 334, 383. *Nahj al-Haqq*, p. 271–72 from Ibn Khayr. Al-Tara`if, p. 239. *Ihqaq al-Haqq*, Vol. 2, p. 373. *Mir`at al-Uqul*, Vol. 5, pp. 318–19. Refer also to *Dala'il al-Sidq*, Vol. 3, p. 78. *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, p. 339. *Diya' al-Alamin* (manuscript), Vol. 2, p. 64.
- [79.](#) He is referring to Vizier Ja`far ibn al-Fadl ibn Ja`far ibn al-Furat al-Baghdadi who died in 391 A.H./1001 A.D. "Ibn Kharthabah" is the author of the book titled *Al-Masalik wal Mamalik*. He died in 300 A.H./913 A.D. "Ibn Khayranah" is Muhammed ibn Khayranah al-Maghribi [of North Africa], the famous traditionist, one of the scholars of the fourth century A.D. "Ibn Khathabah" is `Abdullah ibn Muhammed ibn Khathabah.
- [80.](#) Refer to the previous references and to pp. 370–71, Vol. 2, of *Ihqaq al-Haqq*.
- [81.](#) *Ithbat al-Hudat*, Vol. 2, p. 376.
- [82.](#) *Al-Riyad al-Nadira*, Vol. 1, p. 241. *Tarikh al-Khamis*, Vol. 2, p. 169. *Al-Mustarshid*, pp. 379, 378. *Ithbat al-Hudat*, Vol. 2, p. 383.
- [83.](#) *Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya*, Vol. 5, p. 250. *Siyar A`lam al-Nubala'* (in the section dealing with the "righteous caliphs"), p. 26. *Al-Riyad al-Nadira*, Vol. 1, p. 241.
- [84.](#) *Rawdat al-Munazir* (referred to in a footnote in *Al-Kamil fil Tarikh*), Vol. 7, pp. 164–65.
- [85.](#) Al-Balathiri, *Ansab al-Ashraf*, Vol. 1, p. 586. *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, footnote on p. 268, pp. 339, 389, 411. *Sayyid al-Murtada*, Al-Shafi, Vol. 3, p. 241. *Al-Riyad al-Nadira*, Vol. 1, p. 167. *Tarikh al-Khamis*, Vol. 1, p. 178. *`Awalim al-Ulum*, Vol. 11, pp. 408, 602. *Ibn Hamzah*, Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, p. 174. *Talkhis al-Shafi*, Vol. 3, p. 76. *Ibn Abul-Hadid*, *Sharh Nahjul-Balagha*, Vol. 20, p. 147. *Ibn `Abd Rabbih*, *Al-Iqd al-Farid*, Vol. 4, pp. 247, 259–60 of the edition printed by *Dar Ihya' al-Turath*. *Nafahat al-Lahut*, p. 79. *Al-Kuna wal Alqab*, Vol. 1, p. 352. *Al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar*, Vol. 1, p. 156. *A`lam al-Nisa'*, Vol. 3, p. 127. Al-Tara`if, p. 239. *Nahj al-Haqq*, pp. 271–72. *Al-Ghadir*, Vol. 7, p. 77 and Vol. 5, p. 369.
- [86.](#) Al-Tabari, *Tarikh al-Umam wal-Muluk* (the edition printed by *Dar al-Ma`arif*), Vol. 3, p. 202. Al-Tara`if, pp. 238–39. *A`lam al-Nisa'*, Vol. 4, p. 114. *Nahj al-Haqq*, pp. 271–72. *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, p. 338. *Al-`Awalim*, Vol. 11, p. 407. *Ithbat al-Hudat*, Vol. 2, pp. 333–34.
- [87.](#) Al-Tabari, *Tarikh Muluk*, Vol. 3, p. 203.
- [88.](#) *Ibn Abul-Hadid*, *Sharh Nahjul-Balagha*, Vol. 6, p. 45.
- [89.](#) *Ibid.*, Vol. 2, p. 21. *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, p. 110.
- [90.](#) *Ibn Abul-Hadid*, *Sharh Nahjul-Balagha*, Vol. 6, pp. 49–50.
- [91.](#) *Ibn Abul-Hadid*, *Sharh Nahjul-Balagha*, Vol. 6, pp. 48–49 and Vol. 2, p. 57. *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, p. 204.
- [92.](#) This is a reference to the saqifa (shed) of Banu Sa`idah where the "election", by a small number of people, of Abu Bakr took place amidst a great deal of dissension, arguments and threats. `Umar pushed Abu Bakr to be the caliph and was the first to swear the oath of allegiance to him just as he was the first to swear it days ago to Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) on Thul-Hijja 18, 10 A.H./March 19, 632 A.D., a date well known in Islamic history as "Yawm al-Ghadir" or "Eid al-Ghadir." The "Ghadir" was then an area where rain water formed a shallow lake, and it is located in the Juhfa valley near the crossroads of trade and pilgrimage caravans coming from Medina, Egypt, Iraq, Syria and Najd on their way to Medina. A mosque, called *Masjid al-Ghadir*, was later built on the same spot where the Prophet ﷺ nominated Ali (as) as his successor and where Ali (as) received the oath of allegiance from scores of thousands of Muslim men, women and children. Nowadays, understandably, only Shi`as celebrate Eid al-Ghadir... __ Tr.
- [93.](#) *Ibn Abul-Hadid*, *Sharh Nahjul-Balagha*, Vol. 2, pp. 48, 56.
- [94.](#) *Ibid.*
- [95.](#) *Ibid.*
- [96.](#) *Ibid.*, Vol. 6, p. 48.
- [97.](#) *Ibid.*, Vol. 2, p. 50 and Vol. 6, p. 47 and Vol. 3, p. 49. *Ibn Sa`d*, *Tabaqat*, Vol. 8, p. 228.
- [98.](#) *Ibn Abul-Hadid*, *Sharh Nahjul-Balagha*, Vol. 2, pp. 50–51 and Vol. 6, p. 48.
- [99.](#) *Ibid.*, Vol. 6, p. 11.
- [100.](#) *Ibid.*
- [101.](#) *Ibid.*, Vol. 17, p. 168.

[102.](#) Ibid., Vol. 2, p. 21. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 310–11.

[103.](#) Ibn Qutaybah, Al-Imama wal Siyasa, Vol. 1, pp. 28–29. Ihqaq al-Haqq, Vol. 2, p. 351.

[104.](#) Ibid., Vol. 1. Talkhis al-Shafi, Vol. 2, pp. 144–45. A`lam al-Nisa', Vol. 4, p. 114. There are numerous other references which all cite similarly to Ibn Qutaybah, such as Tashyeed al-Mata`in and others.

[105.](#) The references of this narrative have already been stated in a previous chapter.

[106.](#) A`lam al-Nisa', Vol. 4, p. 124.

[107.](#) `Abd al-Fattah `Abd al-Maqsud, Al-Imam Ali ibn Abu Talib, Vol. 1, pp. 190–91. He is also cited on pp. 103–04, Vol. 3, of Al-Ghadir.

[108.](#) Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 14, p. 193. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 323. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, pp. 337–38, 360.

[109.](#) Mizan al-I`tidal, Vol. 1, p. 139. Siyar A`lam al-Nubala', Vol. 15, p. 578. Lisan al-Mizan, Vol. 1, p. 268.

Source URL:

<https://www.al-islam.org/tragedy-al-zahra-doubts-and-responses-jafar-murtadha-al-amili/incident-working-traditionists-and#comment-0>

Links

[1] <http://sahak.kalamfikalam.com/t2-topic>