

Published on Al-Islam.org (https://www.al-islam.org)

<u>Home</u> > <u>Discursive Theology Volume 1</u> > <u>Lesson 27: Misgivings of the Predeterminists</u> > <u>Review Questions</u>

Lesson 27: Misgivings of the Predeterminists

In theological books, some misgivings on the issue of man's free–will have been mentioned and by citing them some individuals have been inclined toward predeterminism (*jabr*). These misgivings have focused on some theological and ideological teachings and principles. The theological principles cited by the predeterminists are as follows:

- 1. The Divine decree and providence, or destiny;
- 2. The eternal knowledge and will of God;
- 3. The Divine Unity (taw sold) in Creatorship;
- 4. The universality of God's power; and
- 5. The Divine ways of guidance and misguidance.

Now, we shall scrutinize the predeterminists' misgivings on the basis of the said principles.

The Divine Decree, Predestination and the Eternal Knowledge of God

The common and deterministic interpretation of the Divine decree and providence is that the web of destiny as an unseen or hidden factor which puts under its sway every person, drawing him to whatever direction it desires from the moment of birth up to the point of death. The proponents of this theory would also cite reason and revelation to support their views, saying thus:

Since all happenings are inevitable and predetermined prior to the occurrence, their materialization is definite and unavoidable. The voluntary actions of man are also not an exception to this general rule and their materialization is definite and determined. The assumption of definiteness and fixedness is in conflict with free–will. For instance, the Holy Qur'an also explicitly declares, thus:

"No affliction visits the earth or yourselves but it is in a Book before We bring it about—that is indeed easy for Allah."1

The Correct Interpretation of Qass and Qadr

The word qa^{re} literally means fa^{re} (separation), qa^{re} (rupture) and dispeller of ambiguity and doubt. Sometimes, it takes the form of word (qawl) and in the form of action (fi'l) at other times. It is used to refer to God as well as to the human being.

Qatt in the following verse means the verbal gatt of God:

"Your Lord has decreed that you shall not worship anyone except Him."2

And in the following verse it refers to qa of God's action:

"Then He set them up as seven heavens in two days."3

Similarly, what is referred to in the expression "The judge decrees (qa \mathbb{T}) so-and-so" is the human verbal qa \mathbb{T} . And what is meant by the word qa \mathbb{T} aytum in the following verse is the qa \mathbb{T} of a human action:

"And when you finish your rites..."4

And every definite utterance is also called qa iyyah.5

In all cases where the word qa is used, definiteness and certainty are implied while ambiguity and doubt are dispelled. For instance, before the judge issues his judgment, there is ambiguity and uncertainty with respect to the guilt of the accused, but after the issuance of the said judgment, this ambiguity and uncertainty disappear. In the same manner, before a person decides to do something, its realization cannot be determined and unclear but after he decides, it turns into something definite.

Given this, the essence of the cosmic qa of God can be inferred, for all the contingent beings are created by God. On one hand, the wise will of God is to create His creatures through specific causes and effects. Accordingly, prior to the materialization of the complete cause of each of the phenomena, it is vacillating between occurrence and non-occurrence, but after the materialization of its complete cause, its occurrence is definite.

It is evident that as long as there is no Divine will or desire for the materialization of a phenomenon, its complete cause will not be materialized. In conclusion, the Divine decree (qa) is one of the Attributes of God's Action which can be abstracted from the Station of Action of God on the basis of its complete cause.6

Since God knows this certainty $(qa \mathbb{E}'iyyah)$ from the beginning, His essential knowledge of the said certainty is His essential decree.

The word *qadar* or *qadr* literally means the measurement or magnitude of a thing, and with respect to the existing phenomena while considering the principle of causation, it refers to the existential characteristics and properties of each of the phenomena which are the effects of characteristics and properties of its cause.7

In other words, each of the parts of the cause provides its own suitable measurement and form to the effect, and the occurrence of the effect is consistent and concordant with the totality of measurements determined for it by the complete cause.8

What is meant by the Divine decree is that God has foreknowledge of the limits and characteristics of each of the creatures and as such, they will be materialized. For instance, the Holy Qur'an states:

"There is not a thing but that its sources are with Us, and We do not send it down except in a known measure."9

It is also stated, thus:

"Certainly Allah has set a measure for everything." 10

"Indeed We have created everything in a measure." 11

"And everything is by [precise] measure with Him."12

It can thus be inferred that *qadar* (decree) has two stage: (1) the stage prior to the existence of the thing (mental decree) and (2) the stage parallel to the existence of the thing (actual decree). 13

In a tradition narrated by YInus ibn 'Abd al-RaImIn from ImIm al-RiII ('a), qaII and qadar have been interpreted to mean the existential fixedness and limits of the things. For instance, on the interpretation of qadar, it is thus stated:

"It is the geometry and determination of the limits [of a thing] in terms of subsistence and extinction."

And on the interpretation of qa \P , it is thus stated:

"It is to strengthen and build up a reality." 14

Reinforcement of the Free-will on the Basis of the Principle of Qatt and Qadar

The above analysis and interpretation of qa and qadar is not only not in conflict with man's free-will but it even reinforces it, for as stated earlier, qa means qa fiyyah (finality or fixedness) of the occurrence of an action which differs according to the realization of its complete cause. And since the ontological peculiarity of human actions is their being adherents and free, it follows that as demanded by the realness and conformity of the Divine knowledge with the known thing (ma'l m) as well as the fixedness and certainty of the Divine will, the actions of human agents are volitional and voluntary and not fatalistic and involuntary.

In reply to the misgiving regarding predeterminism on the basis of the eternal knowledge of God, **Eadral-Muta'allih** has said:

"Although the knowledge of God is a cause (sab@biyyah) with respect to the materialization of man's action, its being a cause is through the agency of man's ability and freewill, for his ability and freewill are

also among the causes of the materialization of his action. The incumbency of the materialization of the action thus emanates from man's ability and free-will. Incumbency emanates from free-will and it is not in conflict with it."15

A refutation is also given to this misgiving that if the knowledge of the past is the source of the action's fatalistic nature, God cannot also be a free agent. Sa'd al-Din al-Taftazini has also mentioned these two answers in refuting the notion of predeterminism on the basis of the eternal knowledge and will of God.

Moreover, man's conscience differentiates his voluntary actions although they may be the same from the perspective of the foreknowledge of God.

God's Will and Man's Free-will

The notion of predeterminism on the basis of the will of God maintains that as dictated by reason ('aql) and revelation (naql), no phenomenon will come into existence without the will and decree of God, and on this basis, man's actions are also linked with the will of God. And since God's will does not deviate from His purpose and that His purpose will definitely happen, the materialization of man's actions is something inevitable and certain, and in this case, the human free–will and desire are nothing but hypothetical and have no reality.

The reply to this objection becomes clear from the points stated above and does not need further elaboration because God's will and desire are expressed through man's ability and free-will, and as a result, they are in no conflict with the voluntary nature of his action. In fact, if man's actions were not voluntary, these will become necessary for God's will to deviate from His purpose. 16

Is Will a Voluntary Action?

Here, there is a popular misgiving being raised and that is, since the chain of causes of the events ends up with the will of God, the emergence of man's will also emanates from God's will, and as dictated by the inevitability of God's will, the materialization of the will in man is also a fixed and predetermined matter, and as a result, all his voluntary actions are also predetermined. 17

The reply to this objection is that the criterion for man's independence is not that he is a free agent. Instead, the essence of free-will regarding man is that he is naturally and innately a selector being, and this is his innate and ontological nature. However, the essence of free-will is in the actions of his bodily limbs and parts.

Awareness of the action is also regarded as one of the bases of voluntary actions and it is said that voluntary action is that which is derived from knowledge and will. That is, we become aware of man's nature as free and selector through the agency of knowledge and will, but with respect to his internal or

inward actions, knowledge (which is acquired and apart from man's essence) and will are not the key to free-will. For instance, whenever numerous questions are posed on a person who acquires expertise in one field of science, he would instantly construct various mental forms and infer the suitable answers from the abstract and simple mental forms.

There is no doubt that the said action is one of the voluntary actions of man although they are not derived from [acquired] knowledge or will. The element of will and other inward actions of a person are also like that. Therefore, will is a voluntary action of the 'self' and it is not derived from another will. And in view of this peculiarity, it emanates from the will of God and its outcome, as stated earlier, is the reinforcement of free-will.

This reply can be observed briefly in the words of \mathbb{I} and \mathbb{I} and can be found extensively and explicitly in the words of \mathbb{I} al-Khumayn \mathbb{I} (r). 19

The Divine Unity in Creation and the Issue of Predetermination

One of the stages of the Divine Unity (tawerd) is tawerd in Creatorship (khridiqiyyah) which is supported by rational and textual proofs. According to this rational and religious principle, human actions are a creation of God. According to the determinists, to suppose that man is the agent and originator of his voluntary actions is in conflict with the stated principle. As such, defending the principle of the Divine Unity in Creatorship demands that we must reject man's agency and influence in his voluntary actions and we must consider him compelled.

Reply

The attribution of Creatorship (*kh* liqiyyah) to God has two meanings. One is that in the world of being, there is no creator and effector – whether independent or dependent – except God. This assumption necessitates negation of the principle of cause and effect, and as a result, all created beings are direct creations of God and He is the Direct Cause, as the Ash'ares do believe.20

The other meaning is that there is no independent and self-existing Creator and Cause except God, and although the order of creation is that of cause and effect and that some creatures are agents while others are actions and some are causes while others are effects, the agents and causes – just as they are intermediaries of and in need of God for their existence – they are intermediaries and dependent to God. According to this assumption, man is the agent of his own actions and his ability has an effect but not independently; rather, it is dependent on the power of God and it is below it.

The Universality of the Divine Power and Man's Freewill

Another principle cited by the determinists is the universality of God's power although believing that man's ability is a factor in the materialization of his actions is in conflict with the said principle, because

since combining two effective powers in the creation of a thing is impossible, whenever man's ability is influential in the existence of his action, the said action must be outside the domain of God's power.21

This misgiving is caused by the assumption of the human ability's independence in causing something, because with this assumption, his ability is rivals and at logger-heads with the power of God. And it is evident that combining two independent powers in the materialization of an action is impossible. As a result, defending the principle of the universality of God's power and its being effective in the materialization of man's action necessitates that we must consider man's ability devoid of any effect.

Such understanding or interpretation of man's ability ignores man's innate indigence and dependence of his existence and attributes on God. This error is exclusive to the Ash'ar® theologians. In fact, the Mu'tazil®s have also the same incorrect interpretation of man's ability and with the motive of defending the justice of God and proving the free–will of man, they were thus inclined toward *tafw*® (absolute freewill) as stated earlier.

The fact of the matter is that man's ability is below the power of God and combining the two powers – one being independent and the other being dependent – in the performance of an action is in no way impossible. In other words, since the salient feature of power is to exert influence, one must regard man's ability as influential in his action (thereby refuting the Ash'ar® view) and since man is dependent and not independent in his existence and attributes, one must not suppose that his ability is independent in exerting influence (thereby refuting the Mu'tazil® notion), and this is the position between two positions (*amr bayn al–amrayn*) which has been explained earlier.

The Divine Guidance and Misguidance and Man's Freewill

In some Qur'anic verses, it is clearly stated that God guides whoever He wills and misguides whoever He wills. For instance, it is thus stated:

"We did not send any apostle except with the language of his people, so that he might make [Our messages] clear to them. Then Allah leads astray whomever He wishes, and He guides whomsoever He wishes, and He is the All-mighty, the All-wise."22

In a bid to prove their claim, the determinists maintain that such verses convey the basic meaning, but such an argument is utterly weak and baseless because in order to obtain the real meaning of the verses of the Qur'an, it is necessary to employ the method of interpreting the Qur'an by the Qur'an, and one must study a set of verses through another set because as Im®m 'Al® ('a) said, some verses of the Qur'an are interpretations of some other verses:

"Some speak about some others and some testify to some others."23

While taking into account the said principle, we shall embark on interpreting the verses quoted above so as to clarify the truth of the matter concerning God's guidance and misguidance and their connection with the issue of man's free-will.

First of all, in some verses of the Qur'an, guidance and misguidance have been delegated to man's free-will and desire, as it is thus stated:

"And say, '[This is] the truth from your Lord: let anyone who wishes believe it, and let anyone who wishes disbelieve it'."24

It is also said, thus:

"This is indeed a reminder. So let anyone who wishes take the way toward his Lord."25

"It is just a reminder for all the nations, for those of you who wish to be steadfast." 26

Of course, in order to avoid thinking that man's free-will or will power acts independently, and thus, he himself is the independent agent of his voluntary actions, there is a reminder that man's free-will cannot be formed except through the will of God:

"But you do not wish unless it is wished by Allah, the Lord of the worlds."27

Secondly, in other verses of the Qur'an the guidance given to those who are guided and the misguidance experienced by those who are misguided as well as the reasons behind them which lie within man's free-will and ability have been stated.

Elements of Guidance

1. Faith and clinging to Allah

"As for those who have faith in Allah, and hold fast to Him, He will admit them to His mercy and grace, and He will guide them on a straight path to Him." 28

2. Doing that which pleases Allah

"Certainly there has come to you a light from Allah and a manifest Book. With it Allah guides those who follow [the course of] His pleasure to the ways of peace, and brings them out from darkness into light by His will, and guides them to a straight path." 29

3. Struggle in the way of Allah

"As for those who strive in Us, We shall surely guide them in Our ways, and Allah is indeed with the virtuous."30

3. Repentance and humility to Allah

"Allah chooses for it whomever He wishes and He guides to it whoever returns penitently."31

Elements of Misguidance

1. Friendship with the enemies of God

"O you who have faith! Do not take My enemy and your enemy for friends, [secretly] offering them affection (for they have certainly defied whatever has come to you of the truth, expelling the Apostle and you, because you have faith in Allah, your Lord)... and whoever among you does that has certainly strayed from the right way."32

2. Following the chiefs of corruption and arrogance

"And they will say, 'Our Lord! We obeyed our leaders and elders, and they led us astray from the way." 33

3. Imaginary and delusive calculation

"Look, how they coin epithets for you; so they go astray, and cannot find a way." 34

4. Attachment to materialistic life

"[They are] those who prefer the life of this world to the Hereafter, and bar [others] from the way of Allah, and seek to make it crooked. They are in extreme error."35

5. Association with the deviants

"Woe to me! I wish I had not taken so and so as a friend! Certainly he led me astray from the Reminder after it had come to me, and Satan is a deserter of man."36

A study of the verses quoted above clearly shows that man's guidance and misguidance – though this cannot be materialized without the cosmic will and decree of God and not in an involuntary and fatalistic way – happen through specific causes and factors which are within man's control. Given this, one can discern the real meaning of the verses "He guides whomever He wishes" and "He leads astray whoever He wishes" and realize that God's will to guide or misguide people is consistent with what each of them deserves.

Review Questions

- 1. What is the correct interpretation of gate and gadar?
- 2. Are God's decree and power in conflict with man's free-will?
- 3. Write down the predeterminists' misgiving by citing the will of God along with the refutation to it.
- 4. What is the criterion for man's free-will?
- 5. Present and criticize the predeterminists' misgiving by citing the Creatorship (*kh* liqiyyah) of God.
- 6. Present and criticize the predeterminists' misgiving by citing the universality of God's power.
- 7. How are the Divine guidance and misguidance compatible with man's free-will?
- 8. Write down three examples of the elements of guidance and misguidance while taking into account Qur'anic verses.
 - 1. Serat al-eaded 57:22.
 - 2. Strat al-Isrt' (or Bant Isrt'tl) 17:23.
 - 3. Strat al-Futtilat 41:12.
 - 4. Sirat al-Bagarah 2:200.
 - 5. Reghib al-lefahene, Al-Mufradet, under the word quee.
 - 6. Al-Mezen fe Tafser al-Qur'en, vol. 13, pp. 72-73.
 - 7. Sayyid Mutammad tusayn al-tabitabit, Nihtyat al-tikmah, chap. 12.
 - 8. @ab@ab@'e, Sh@'ah dar Isl@m, p. 77.
 - 9. Srat al-Hijr 15:21.
 - 10. Serat al-ealeq 65:3.
 - 11. Serat al-Qamar 54:49.
 - 12. Serat al-Ra'd 13:8.
 - 13. Al-Mrzen fe Tafser al-Qur'en, vol. 12, p. 144.
 - 14. Use al-Ksfs, vol. 1, section (bsb) on the Divine decree and predeterminism, sadeth 4.
 - 15. Al-Asfer al-Arba'ah, vol. 6, p. 385.
 - 16. Al-Mezen fe Tafser al-Qur'en, vol. 1, p. 109.
 - 17. One of the exponents of this misgiving in Christian Theology is Spinoza (1632–1677), a famous predeterminist Jewish philosopher. See Sayr-e Eikmat dar Orepe (The Trend of Philosophy in Europe), vol. 2, p. 54.
 - 18. Al-Asfor al-Arba'ah, vol. 6, p. 162.
 - 19. ©alab wa Ir®dah, p. 109; Jabr wa Ir®dah, pp. 204-207.
 - 20. Share al-Maqeeid, vol. 4, p. 105.
 - 21. Ibid., vol. 8, p. 148.
 - 22. Strat lbrthtm 14:4. The following verses have similar contents:
 - ﴾ أَفَمَنْ زُيّنَ لَهُ سُوءُ عَمَلِهِ فَرَآهُ حَسَنًا فَإِنَّ اللَّهَ يُضِلُّ مَنْ يَشَاءُ وَيَهْدي مَنْ يَشَاءُ فَلا تَذْهَبْ نَفْسُكَ عَلَيْهِمْ حَسَرَات إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَلِيمٌ بِمَا يَصِنْعُونَ ﴿
 - "Is someone the evil of whose conduct is presented as decorous to him, so he regards it as good [like one who is truly virtuous]?" (Strat Ftti (or al-Maltikah) 35:8)
 - ﴾ وَالَّذِينَ كَذَّبُوا بِآيَاتِنَا صُمٌّ وَبُكُمٌ فِي الظُّلُمَات مَنْ يَشَأَ اللَّهُ يُضْلِلْهُ وَمَنْ يَشَأَ يَجْعَلْهُ عَلَى صِرَاطٍ مُسْتَقِيم ﴿
 - "Those who deny Our signs are deaf and dumb, in a manifold darkness. Allah leads astray whoever He wishes, and

whomever He wishes He puts him on a straight path." (Serat al-An'em 6:39)

- ﴾ وَلَوْ شَاءَ اللَّهُ لَجَعَلَكُمْ أُمَّةً وَاحِدَةً وَلَكِنْ يُضِلُّ مَنْ يَشَاءُ وَيَهْدي مَنْ يَشَاءُ وَلَتُسْأَلُنَّ عَمَّا كُنْتُمْ تَعْمَلُونَ ﴿
- "Had Allah wished, He would have made you one community, but He leads astray whomever He wishes and guides whomever He wishes, and you will surely be questioned concerning what you used to do." (Sirat al-Nail 16:93)
- 23. Nahj al-Balghah, Sermon 133.
- 24. Serat al-Kahf 18:29.
- 25. Serat al-Muzzammil 73:19; Serat al-Insen (or al-Dahr) 76:27. Serat al-Muddaththir 74:55 and Serat al-'Abasa 80:12 have the same contents.
- 26. Serat al-Takwer 81:29.
- 27. S rat al-Takw r 81:29.
- 28. Serat al-Nise' 4:175.
- 29. Srat al-Mridah 5:15-16.
- 30. Srat 'Ankabrt 29:69.
- 31. Serat al-Shere 42:13.
- 32. STrat al-Mumtatanah 60:1.
- 33. Strat al-Atztb 33:67.
- 34. Strat al-Isrt' (or Bant Isrt'tl) 17:48.
- 35. Sirat Ibrihim 14:3.
- 36. Serat al-Furqen 25:28-29.

Source URL:

https://www.al-islam.org/discursive-theology-volume-1-ali-rabbani-gulpaygani/lesson-27-misgivings-predeterminists#comment-0