

Letter 75

Safar 17, 1330

I. Mother of the Believers is not Ruled by Emotions

1) The axis upon which your argument, regarding the mother of the believers in her frank hadith denying a will to 'Ali, revolves is twofolded:

One is your allegation that her biased indisposition against the Imam bids her to deny the will. Our rebuttal is that those who are familiar with her lifestyle deny the allegation that she yields to emotion while narrating hadith about the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his progeny, or that she seeks a special interest; so, she cannot be accused while quoting the Prophet's hadith, albeit if the subjectmatter of such hadith is someone she likes or someone she does not.

God forbid that interests dominate her mind to the extent that she lies while quoting hadith from the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his progeny, preferring to promote her own interest rather than telling the truth.

II. The Pleasant and the Ugly are Denied by Reason

2) The other is that reason alone refuses your claim that this hadith is authentic, for it is neither logical nor permissible to conclude that the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his progeny, would leave the religion of Allah, the Exalted and the Sublime, in its cradle, while Allah's servants are following a new creed, without having made a will instructing them regarding their affairs.

The answer to your claim is that this matter is based on rational goodness and ugliness, and the Sunnis disclaim it, for reason according to their judgment does not at all determine whether something is pleasant or ugly; rather, they believe that jurisdiction is the one that determines it. They believe that whatever the jurisdiction labels as good, they accept it as good, and whatever the jurisdiction describes as bad, they consider it as such, and reason cannot be relied upon at all in such matters.

III. Why Oppose the Claim of the Mother of Believers?

3) As regarding what you have mentioned at the conclusion of your Letter 74,

concerning your rejection of the claim of the mother of believers that the Prophet died on her chest, we are not familiar with any hadith narrated by Sunnis which disproves it; so, if you are aware of any such hadith, please oblige and state it, Wassalam.

Sincerely,

S

Source URL:

<https://www.al-islam.org/fr/al-murajaat-abd-al-husayn-sharaf-al-din-al-musawi/letter-75#comment-0>