

# Texts And Legacies

## These Chapters

Now it is time to introduce some texts included in many books of history and *hadith*. Such books contain many texts proving that the house of al-Zahra' (sa) was, indeed, attacked, her privacy was invaded and she was beaten and hurt.

Apparently, this attack was repeated just as their attacks against the house of the Prophetic Mission were repeated, resulting in her miscarriage and her earning the honor of martyrdom. I find the following points to be worthy of being emphasized:

1. This case cannot be fully detailed but that we should restrict ourselves to what no fair-minded person can doubt. Otherwise, the written books are counted by the thousands, and we cannot quote them all here.
2. Even those who undertook the task of cleaning the legacy from impurities which they saw therein did not consider this event as one of those “impurities.” For example, the detail-oriented ‘allama Muhsin al-Amin, for example, who undertook the polishing of the text of *Majalis al-’Aza'*, relying on authentic references, as he puts it, including the book by Sulaym ibn Qays..., has mentioned these events, verified their authenticity and composed poetic verses about them. Listen to him saying the following:

“When I wrote *Al-Majalis al-Saniyya*, I purged them of all impurities, Praise be to Allah, distinguishing the peel from the pith, what is wrong from what is right.”<sup>1</sup>

He also said, “When I wrote *Lawa’ij al-Ashjan*, I incorporated in it the recitation of the epic of martyrdom (of Imam al-Husayn (as)), and the text recited by those who conducted such majalis was incorporated in *Al-Majalis al-Saniyya*. The *ahadith*, therefore, were sound, and the impurities were taken out.”<sup>2</sup>

But what al-Zahra' (sa) had to put up with is available mostly in books meeting the same criteria which he preconditioned for his own books for the collection of such *majalis* and for “polishing” them. This means that he endorses such criteria and considers them non-negotiable.

3. We have included in the part dedicated to the texts many chapters which have to be put together; so, take notice of the following:

- A. One Chapter contains about forty narratives among which many are authentic and reliable, all detailing what trials and tribulations al-Zahra' (sa) had to endure following the demise of her father S.
- B. Another Chapter contains poetry verses. Many of them are included there.
- C. We also cited many texts in a third Chapter discussing al-Muhsin.
- D. In addition to the above, there is a Chapter dealing with the sectarian debates regarding this matter during centuries.
- E. Another Chapter, titled "The Event in the Words of Narrators and Historians," contains scores of texts emphasizing the harm suffered by al-Zahra' (sa) following the demise of her father S.

If you put all of these Chapters together, you will get a large number of texts which cannot all be false or fabricated, and this is the meaning of *tawatur*, that is, consecutive reporting. Were we to convince ourselves of their falsehood, we will never be able to be convinced of any theological or historical fact. Or, say, we would find ourselves incapable of being convinced of many of them.

- 4. It may be noticed that there is some similarity between some texts. This suggests that there is no need to repeat the same text. Yet, we repeated it in order to attract the attention to the existence of a variation or a particularity in the narrative, or in the narrator. This has taken place in just a few places the number of which does not exceed the fingers on one hand; so, take note.
- 5. We mentioned a very small number of texts cited by late authors because we found them containing some particularities which we could not research and verify by comparing them with what early authors had recorded; so, take note of this, too.
- 6. Finally, if someone relies sometimes, for issuing his verdicts, on one single narrative, be it commended, verified or regarded as weak, one where there is no need to lie, requiring all people in all lands to act on it, is it reasonable that he rejects or doubts the fixing of the text of such a huge number of texts where the sources are continuously emphasizing its context, confirming one's conviction that it did take place?!

No matter what, we can add the following Chapters to what we have already presented, apologizing to the kind reader about being satisfied with this much. Anyone can find more of what is useful. Try it, and you will find the proof.

Let us now proceed to our undertaking. From Allah do we derive help, and on Him do we rely.

OPPRESSING AL-ZAHRA' (sa)

## IN CENTURIES OF ARABIC POETRY

### Poetry is a Reliable Historical Chronicle

We are of the view that poets have thoroughly covered the oppression through which al-Zahra' (sa) underwent, the persecution, the beating and the miscarriage since the first generations and till our time. They let their poetry target those who participated in all of that or did not stop it. Some of them were contemporary to the Imams (as), or their time was close to that of the Imams'.

This is regarded as a reliable and strong historical record. Its strength underscores the fact that its contexts were true as it was transmitted by traditionists and historians. Here we would like to cite a bouquet of such poetry in successive centuries and till our time:

#### 1. Sayyid al-Himyari<sup>3</sup> (d. 173 A.H./789 A.D.)

Sayyid al-Himyari, may Allah have mercy on him, was contemporary to Imams al-Sadiq and al-Kazim (as) and he says the following:

*Beaten, she was, and of her rights deprived,*

*And was made to taste after his demise of wounds.*

*God sever the hands that her did they hit,*

*And of that who agreed thereto and followed suit.*

*God may never forgive him nor*

*Spare him of the horror of leaving the grave.<sup>4</sup>*

#### 2. Al-Barqi (d. 245 A.H./859 A.D.)

Al-Barqi, namely 'Abdullah ibn 'Ammar, has said,

*They gathered the firewood at the house,*

*And those who ignited it kept taunting,*

*While none were at the house except*

*The Purified Lady, the Truthful one,*

*And the Prophet's two grandsons.<sup>5</sup>*

#### 3. Al-Nu'man, the Judge (d. 363 A.H./974 A.D.)

Judge al-Nu'man, an Isma'ili, composed a poem about what happened following the demise of the Messenger of Allah S in one inclusive poem wherein he says,

*Both swore fealty to him and said:*

*The best, you are, of everyone in state!*

*Among them were people of those at Badr slain,*

*And at others, people of confined grudge, plain.*

*They swore fealty, the heads of their folks,*

*So people swore, too, on that day*

*Except a few who recognized the way*

*Of their Prophet, so they kept away.*

*To Ali, their Imam, they went;*

*Said he: Your effort is already spent!*

*They said: No, We shall do it for sure!*

*So he said: Set out now and your heads shave*

*So people will know you then come in a wave*

*To me so we may fight, God will make a way*

*For us to judge, and we will see what He does say.*

*They failed when they saw him determined,*

*So those who went to him counted only seven,*

*While fealty was sworn by all the rest*

*Who thought swearing it was the best.*

*I did call them by their very names.*

*He said: I shall not fight you for sure*

*For few you are and cannot meet the rest*

*So they sat to see what he would do*

*With them and what order to issue.*

*"Umar came to them with a group*

*Seeing the man they installed was not obeyed*

*Till they reached the door of Fatima*

*The Batul lady who boycotted them.*

*She intercepted between him and them*

*Hoping they would not reach her man*

*But he broke the door, the first such insan,*

*And they forced their way through her veil*

*As she did cry, ask for help and wail.*

*They hit her, so she did miscarry*

*Al-Zubayr heard the call and went in a hurry*

*But stumbled, his sword was taken*

*And was surely by them broken*

*So they caught al-Zubayr and he*

*In their hands a captive came to be.*

*The wasi came out with the rest of the men*

*Seeing their defenses were totally in vain.*

*Them did they surely overpower*

*Bringing them to 'Ateeq in an hour..*

He goes on to say:

*What a sigh in my heart*

*Like fire I feel in my mind.*

*Their killing al-Zahra' Fatima*

*Ignited in my insides the fire*

*For it is known among the people*

*She died after having miscarried*

*She ordered to be at night buried*

*And her grave's marks obliterated*

*Now nobody knows where she is buried.*

*So that only her cousin would be there*

*And his family, and in distress she did disappear.*

*Her Lord greets her, with her nations she was displeased.*

*They swore fealty to him against their wish, so pay heed,*

*As taqiyya. Alas! God for His servants did allow*

*Not to be forced to make for the ruler an untrue vow.*

Till he says,

*It is narrated for sure*

*That he said when he came:*

*Swear it! Said he: I shall not!*

*He said: Then I shall have you killed!*

*May Allah testify that he was weak*

*When he swore fealty to the usurper*

*Fearing being killed, and others swore too*

*For fear of those who were there, they knew.*

*If they made the Trusted One so weak*

*Before him Aaron was treated the same*

*By the nation of Moses when they willed*

*To otherwise have him killed*

*Treading the same steps indeed*

*The steps the wasis had to tread*

*Just as the sent Messenger said.*

#### 4. Mihyar al-Daylani (d. 428 A.H./1037 A.D.)

The brilliant poet, Mihyar al-Daylami, may Allah have mercy on his soul, has said the following lines in a poem he wrote:

*How come it was not severed*

*The hand that stretched to harm you?*

*That of the son of one inferior to you?*

*They were elated when they insulted you,*

*Being wrongful to your own father.*

#### 5. Ali ibn al-Muqarrab (d. 629 A.H./1232 A.D.)

Prince Ali ibn Muqarrab, of al-Ahsa' (Saudi Arabia), one of the wise and well known men of letters, has said:

*I wonder which one of them shall I mourn*

*And for whom shall my tears pour down?*

*To the wasi when, at his mosque, he was crowned*

*By the sword before bowing down?*

*Or to the Batul, Fatima, who was deprived*

*Of her inheritance, rightfully hers according to all*

*And according to one who to her said:*

*You sought wrong, so desist*

*Your father loudly declared before many:*

*"We, prophets, leave for our sons nothing to inherit.*

*"What we leave is for each and all."*

*So be pleased with what your father said.*

*She said: "Give me what my father left me*

*The best of all people, the one with intercession."*

*But they regarded their testimony as void*

*And the text of the Book did not convince them.*

*She remained oppressed, persecuted, when her claim*

*Was rejected, when her ribs were crushed.*

*Or should I mourn the one who had to drink*

*From their Ju'da the cup of disguised poison?*<sup>6</sup>

6. Al-Khalī'i (d. 750 A.H./1349 A.D.)

Shaikh Ali ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz al-Khalī'i al-Hilli said the following among other verses in a poem:

*O Lord of the one who was disputed about*

*What her father left her of inheritance and who*

*Was sought by those of grudge and hatred*

*And who made one drink the cup of grief*

*To a father because of her son*

*Like the son of Marjana, the accursed one*

*Who made me of it drink*

*And who before even called a liar*

*Someone by the Lord from sins purified*

*And is there another son of a Prophet*

*For whom fire was lit*

*As those who did circle and spurn*

*My home did they indeed burn?*[7](#)

7. 'Ala' ad-Din al-Hilli (killed in 786 A.H./1384 A.D.)

The virtuous scholar and accomplished man of letters, 'Ala' ad-Din son of Shaikh Ali ibn al-Husayn al-Hilli al-Shafhani, a contemporary of the First Martyr, who, may Allah have mercy on him, explained some of his poets, said,

*They unanimously agreed on it, with their whims,*

*Ignorance and hope, to burn the house of al-Zahra'*

*Fatima! What an awful momentous thing to do!*

*A house wherein five whose sixth is Gabriel*

*Without a just cause was set ablaze,*

*And the Murtada from his home was forcibly taken...*[8](#)

8. Mughamis al-Hilli (d. in the late 900s A.H./15th Century A.D.)

Shaikh Mughamis al-Hilli said the following in one of his poems:

*The Purified One, Fatima, her inheritance was seized*

*By the worst of people as her tears were shed*

*After having miscarried because of a blow,*

*So she passed away, what was hers confiscated.*[9](#)

9. Muflih al-Saymari (d. 900 A.H./1495 A.D.)

The famous '*allama*', the great *faqih* and respected man of letters, Shaikh Muflih al-Saymari, said the following in one of his poems:

*Shackled in the straps of his own sword they took Ali*

*And 'Ammar before his rib crushed and was assaulted,*

*And they raided the home of the daughter of the Chosen One*

*And of their own Imam as one kept calling:*

*In her house burn a fire!*

*Of inheritance of the Prophet was she deprived*

*And, moreover, she was whipped and slapped.* [10](#)

10. Al-Hurr al-'Amili (d. 1104 A.H./1693 A.D.)

The public speaker and 'allama, faqih Shaikh al-Hurr al-'Amili, author of the modern encyclopedia known as *Wasa'il al-Shi'a*, wrote a poem wherein he says,

*Her children are five: Hassan and Husayn*

*And Zainab, older than Umm Kultham*

*And Muhsin was miscarried when*

*"Umar forcibly opened their door*

*As it became known to all.*

*So she died after the Prophet*

*Willingly went to her Lord satisfied*

*With what He for her had been decreed.*

*Such brings pain to the heart*

*And every other calamity is surely less in pain*

*What grief, humiliation, persecution and oppression*

*And savagery became clear to everyone.*

Then he explains how she died saying,

*Its cause, it was said, natural death but*

*It was also said that it was caused of the pain*

*Inflicted from a blow dealt to her by that man*

*When she instantly miscarried her fetus*

*For whom she kept weeping and wailing.* [11](#)

## 11. Al-Salih al-Fattani al-'Amili

Shaikh Muhammed Mahdi al-Fattani al-Nabati al-'Amili, a scholar, poet, imam of *fiqh*, *hadith* and *tafsir*, has said,

*O Master! O Messenger of Allah! Stand and see*

*What happened to your very family:*

*More that what you did tell:*

*They took away caliphate from Ali,*

*And what you said many did deny.*

*They led him to so-and-so to swear fealty,*

*Against his wish, oppressors taking him forcefully.*

*For that, he was with the sword his Shabir became*

*A martyr, and by poison his Shubbar died.*

*As if he was not the like of the Prophet*

*Nor was he, by his Lord, purified.*

*And Fatima is there, her sanctity did they violate,*

*By one who caused her rib at the door to break.*

*Your Husayn, without a cause, slain,*

*His body cut to parts, with blood stained*

*Dusted, lying on the ground is your Husayn.[12](#)*

## 12. Sayyid Hayder al-Hilli (d. 1304 A.H./1887 A.D.)

The great poet and man of letters and one of the most prominent poets of Iraq of his time, namely Sayyid Hayder al-Hilli, has said the following in one of his poems:

*No, by your pardon, the folks did no pardon implement,*

*Nor, by your clemency, were the folks at all clement:*

*What your mother carried they did cause to miscarry,*

*Your grandfather's son with arrow to death did they carry.* [13](#)

13. Sayyid Baqir al-Hindi (d. 1329 A.H./1911 A.D.)

The great scholar and prominent poet, Sayyid Baqir son of Sayyid Muhammed al-Hindi, has said,

*You don't know with fire they burned the door,*

*Thus they hoped to put out, with fire, the noor.*

*You don't know what the nail had to do*

*With Fatima's chest, if you only knew*

*In what condition her broken rib was*

*What miscarriage, why red were her eyes,*

*Why her ear-rings on the ground did scatter,*

*Unveiled was she when her house they did enter,*

*As Ali looked on, the man of manliness*

*The honorable, the fearless.*

*The Lion of Allah did they harass,*

*Like a camel did they lead him in duress.*

*The Batul behind them stumbled*

*On the tail of her robe which they pulled*

*With moaning that in the hearts did it ignite*

*The fir in anxiety melted the stones of height.*

*She called on them: Let my cousin Ali alone or I*

*To the Hearing One, the Seeing, shall I cry.*

*They paid her no heed,*

*By them she was scared indeed,*

*So they took Ali as a captive away,*

*Tied, like a captive; they had their day...*

He goes on till he says the following:

*Ali sees and hears, and the sword is sharp*

*And Ali's might is not to be taken lightly*

*But his Brother's will restricted what he could*

*Which was more than one really would,*

*So patience, O one entrusted with the affair*

*One whose judgment is wise and fair*

*One with a calamity that is on and on*

*One that melts one whose heart is stone.*

*How many calamities my narration of them to prolong*

*Wherein purity was stripped in time not so long?*

*How, eyes being quite red, can thee control,*

*O Son of Taha, a sweet slumber at all?*

*So weep and sigh, since her foes*

*Did not let her weep and wail her woes.*

*As if I can see him saying, as he does weep,*

*With little solace but with tears high and deep:*

*May I after her never take for my relief*

*A home of happiness after her "house of grief."*

*So when, O son of Fatima, will you bring to life in a way*

*Tyrants and oppressors even before the Judgment Day?[14](#)*

14. 'Allama al-Qazwini (d. 1335 A.H./1917 A.D.)

The virtuous 'allama, Sayyid Muhammed son of Sayyid Mahdi al-Qazwini al-Hilli al-Najafi, has said,

*Salim said something, said I: O Salman!*

*Did they really enter without permission?!*

*Said he: Yes, by the Glory of the Great One*

*While al-Zahra' had no veil at all.*

*But she behind the door sought refuge,*

*Observing the rules of veil that are huge.*

*When they saw her, they did squeeze*

*Her, almost killing her, may my life*

*Be her ransom. Said she; O Fidda!*

*Support me, for surely have they*

*Killed my fetus this very day.*

*She miscarried, the Daughter of*

*Guidance, O sorrow, O pain!*

*Miscarried her son,*

*The one called Muhsin.* [15](#)

15. Hafiz Ibrahim (d. 1351 A.H./1932)

(Egyptian) Hafiz Ibrahim, Poet of the Nile, whose poem is quoted above on p. 161, has said,

*A statement to Ali said by "Umar,*

*How great the one who heard,*

*How respectful the one who said!*

*"To burn your home shall I*

*"Leave none in it if you*

*"Do not swear fealty," though*

*"The Daughter of the Chosen one is inside."*

*Only Abu Hafs could thus say*

*To ‘Adnan’s knight and protector.* [16](#)

Commenting on the above-cited verses, Grand Ayatollah ‘allama al-Muzaffar, may Allah have mercy on his soul, has said, “This poet mistakenly thought that the said statement was indicative of the *courage* of ‘Umar who demonstrated no courage at all during (all) famous battles, nor did he ever record any feats of valor during the many wars waged by the Prophet S! This was only due to a trust entrusted to him [Ali (as)] by the Prophet S who admonished him to be patient. Had he (Ali (as)) confronted ‘Umar, the latter would surely have fled away.” [17](#)

16. Al-Isfahani, the Critic (d. 1361 A.H./1942 A.D.)

The great philosopher and religious authority and mentor/critic, al-Isfahani, said the following in a poetic *urjuza* in his *diwan* known as *Al-Anwar al-Qudsiyya*:

*Her calamity, the opening to all calamities,*

*Was what she went through at the door,*

*For the talk about that door is surely grievous*

*Due to what the hands of betrayal committed.*

*Did the foes really assault*

*The House of Guidance,*

*The landing place of Revelation,*

*The center of all bliss?*

*Was the fire they did ignite*

*At her house’s door*

*And the Sign of Nur*

*Overwhelms it with light?*

*Her door is the door of the Prophet*

*Of mercy, the Prophet of salvation*

*Of this and every nation.*

*Nay! Her door is the door of*

*The most High, the most Exalted.*

*As though Allah's Countenance was manifested.*

*With that fire they gained nothing but shame*

*After which there will be that of the Fire of Hell.*

*How ignorant some people are!*

*The fire burns not the Nur of Allah!*

*The most Exalted, the most Sublime!*

*But the breaking of the rib has none to repair*

*Except the sword of one of might and power.*

*What wrenched those sacred ribs was a calamity*

*None like it in all eternity.*

*From the spring of blood that gushed out of her chest*

*Can one tell what she suffered, through what she went.*

*They transgressed all limits when they*

*On the cheek slapped her, may*

*The hand of oppression God paralyze.*

*And still remains the redness of her eyes*

*Of the eyes of knowledge can only be remedied*

*By white swords when the banner is spread.*

*And the whips have a sound of dreariness*

*Heard by Time, lacking any happiness.*

*Remains, like a bracelet, the mark*

*On the wrist of al-Zahra' that was so dark*

*The very strongest of any argument.*

*From the blackness of her arm the firmament*

*Was blackened, O Arm of Allah! O Imam al-Murtada!*

*How the sword's scabbard was on her side planted*

*Bringing to memory all what to her happened.*

*I know not the story of the nail,*

*So ask the Custodian of all secrets.*

*In the womb of glory things that*

*Cause the inside to bleed.*

*Can they really hide*

*What is known and wide?*

*What about the door, the wall, the blood?*

*True witnesses which none can hide.*

*The criminal committed against her son*

*His crime the like of which is none.*

*So mountains were crushed*

*On hearing her wailing, though hushed.*

*Is this how the Prophet's Daughter should be treated*

*With such cruelty should she be meted?*

*Running after power, sins do they heap!*

*Should one a grieved, saddened woman keep,*

*For fear of slander, forbidding her to weep?*

*By Allah! She ought to shed tears of blood*

*As long as the earth remains and the world*

*For having lost the dear one, her great father*

*For her oppression and for insulting her protector.*

*Should the inheritance of the Truthful One*

*Become free for all but her legacy none?*

*From the very best of creation?*

*How could one call her statement a lie*

*For it will be one's answer to the implication*

*Of the meaning of the verse of Purification...?*

*Should the faith be learned from a bedouin*

*Leaving aside the one referred to in the Book?*

*Thus they confiscated what she did own*

*Committing the extreme calamity like none.*

*Woe on them! They asked for a proof*

*Contrary to the clearly defined Sunnah!*

*And their rejection of those who did testify*

*Is the greatest testimony to what we clarify.*

*Filling the gaps was not coincidental*

*Nay! They closed hers and the Murtada's door.*

*They turned away from the truth and sins score,*

*The did close its door, as though their intention*

*Was feeling secure against its retribution.*

*Should part of the Greatly Purified one*

*Be buried at night, her grave unknown to man?*

*She was not buried at night and secretly*

*Except because she was with the oppressors angry.*

*Nobody heard that she could ever thus be*

*In esteem unrecognized, her grave unknown to you and me.*

*Woe unto them from the Wrath of the Great One*

*For having oppressed the flower of the Chosen One.*[18](#)

17. Kashifal-Ghita' (d. 1373)[19](#)

The renown scholar, authority and mentor Muhammed Husayn Kashifal-Ghita', may Allah have mercy on him, said the following in one of his poems:

*At the Taff did a wounded hero fall as did one*

*Behind the door fall named al-Muhsin,*

*And in every tent*

*A fire was set*

*From the very flame*

*That did burn in shame*

*The door of the house where did reside*

*The daughter of the Prophet sent to guide.*[20](#)

There are other renowned poets whom we cannot cite here hoping this much should suffice to make our point clear, and we seek help from none but Allah.

## 2. Beating Women

What he, may Allah have mercy on him, considered as a justification for discrediting an Arab man beating a woman as not eligible for justification at all for the following reasons:

FIRST: The statement of the Commander of the Faithful (as) about shaming a man who beats a woman does not mean it was impossible for them to do it in the presence of a stronger motive which would prompt them to do the most heinous crime and discard the greatest sanctities. This is so especially when such a motive is lust for power and authority, when the government, once well established, could wipe out such shame by the awe it enforces and by the wealth and power it would enjoy. Necks would bow down to it either out of fear or greed. Then the challenger finds himself overwhelmed by the post of

succession to the Prophetic Mission, by its awe and sanctity, by respect for the creed, for conviction among the general public.

On the other hand, it was a shame to kill newborn females or kill a son or a brother for worldly gains. Al-Khayzaran killed her son out of lust for authority, as they claim, and al-Ma'mun killed his brother (al-Amin), and they are well known for their statement that "authority is sterile; it has no womb." [21](#)

Had there been adherence to abstention from doing what is ugly, they would not have said to the Prophet S, and he heard what they said, "The Prophet is hallucinating." This happened although the religious obligation is stronger than that of customs and traditions. Pronouncing a statement like this about the Prophet brings them eternal shame, and it is much greater than hitting a woman or invading her home or letting her listen to very rude and insolent words.

To sum up, if one fears shame, he has to fear it in all his affairs and circumstances, not fearing it here rather than there. For one to fear shame here and not there, as in daring to say something like the above to the Messenger of Allah S, is not clear, nor is it acceptable. Rather, when we see him having "courage" to accept shame in certain situations makes us hesitate to brand as lies what is attributed to him in another situation. So, how is it when this is proven with decisive proofs and clear evidences? Can this person who casts doubts afford to deny their threats against al-Zahra' (sa) to set her house to fire while she and her children were all inside it? Is this not a shame for those who make such threats? Is it possible that slapping her on the cheek is the only shame while nothing is?!

**SECOND:** This individual, who seeks support from what Kashif al-Ghita' says, is the same one who places big question marks on the authenticity of texts recorded in *Nahjul Balagha* and in other books if they point out to any weakness in woman's personality. This text, the one which he cites as testimony for such a weakness, says, "... They are weak in body, in spirit, and in mind." Yet he himself has doubted the particularity of this same text more than once! So, how can he cite a proof here for something which he somewhere else denies altogether?!

**THIRD:** During the battle of Kerbala', the daughters of the Messenger of Allah S were beaten with whips when dark grudge blinded their minds and visions, distracting them from considering its shameful consequences in this life and their being exposed to the Wrath of the Almighty in the life to come.

There are many historical proofs which testify that in the presence of an impetus stronger than keeping shame away, they do not for a moment hesitate to accept such a shame. We would like to mention some of these proofs as follows:

1. A father used to bury his female newborn in the ground for fear she would eat his food; Allah Almighty has said, "And when the female infant buried alive is asked for what sin she was killed" (Qur'an, 81:8-9).
2. The same person states that Ibn Ziyad, may Allah curse him, was about to kill Lady Zainab when she reminded him of things which outraged him. 'Amr ibn Hareeth interfered, stopping him by saying to him,

“She is only a woman; can she be held accountable for what she said? She cannot be blamed when she thus prattles.”<sup>22</sup>

3. This same person, who seeks from the statement by Kashif al-Ghita’ support for his own claim, states that Zainab (sa) was whipped, and so were the daughters who were born to the one who received the *wahi*<sup>23</sup>, peace with them all; so, refer to his books and speeches.

4. Sumayya, mother of ‘Ammar ibn Yasir, was killed while being tortured in Mecca by the “Pharaoh of Quraish,” namely Abu Jahl, may Allah curse him, becoming the first lady martyr in Islamic history.<sup>24</sup>

5. “Umar (ibn al-Khattab) used to torture a bondmaid from Banu Mu’ammal. He used to keep beating her till he felt tired of it. It is then that he would say to her, “I apologize to you for stopping beating you; I only stopped because I felt bored.”<sup>25</sup> Umm Sharik, may Allah have mercy on her, was tortured, too; so, why did someone’s fear of shame stop him from committing such shameful acts?

6. Books of history and tradition tell us that when ‘Othman ibn Math’un died, women wept, so “Umar (ibn al-Khattab) kept whipping them. The Messenger of Allah S took the whip away from “Umar’s hands as he (as) said to him, “Wait, O “Umar! Let them weep..., etc.”<sup>26</sup>

7. “Umar (ibn al-Khattab) beat the women who mourned the death of Abu Bakr, so much so that the Mu’tazilite scholar said, “The first to be beaten by “Umar was Umm Farwah daughter of Abu Quhafah [sister of Othman ibn ‘Affan]. Abu Bakr died, so women mourned him, and among them was his sister, Umm Farwah. “Umar prohibited them repeatedly, yet they kept doing it, so he took Umm Farwah from among them and kept hitting her with his baton. The other women dispersed as they fled away.”<sup>27</sup> Others have documented this incident, so let those who would like to research it do just that.<sup>28</sup>

8. When Khalid ibn al-Walid died, women assembled at the house of Maymuna to mourn him. [Then caliph] “Umar came and beat them with his baton. The veil of one of them fell on the ground, so they said, “O commander of the faithful! Her veil!” He said, “Leave her, for she has no sanctity.”<sup>29</sup>

9. The Prophet S permitted anyone to kill Hubar ibn al-Aswad because of what he had committed against Zainab [Prophet’s step-daughter] as is well known.

FOURTH: Why does the conscience of these folks not recognize that “Umar was the one who hit al-Zahra’ (sa), justifying it by attaching shame to him, while their conscience accepts to attach the same to Qunfath instead?! Just as “Umar was an Arab who was apprehensive of a stigma, so was Qunfath al-’Adawi [of the Banu ‘Udayy tribe]! Just as “Umar belonged to the tribe of Banu ‘Udayy, so was Qunfath. Why apply a principle to one and not to the other?!

But al-Tasatturi<sup>30</sup>, the critic, has stated that Qunfath belonged to Taim tribe, that he was not ‘Adawi, and that the meaning of the text is that he was loyal to Bana ‘Udayy because he was their slave... Whether he belonged to Banu ‘Udayy or to Bana Taim, if Arabs regarded beating a woman as a foul act, any

Arab should denounce such an act and reject it, whether this person committed it or that. If a slave committed such an act to an Arab woman, an Arab man would confront him, according to their concepts, with a greater sensitivity and denunciation.

FIFTH: Ali (as) is quoted as having said that they did not confiscate Qunfath's property, as they would have done to any of their slaves had such a slave committed an act like that *because* they appreciated how he hit al-Zahra<sup>31</sup>...

Their appreciation of his having hit a woman, namely al-Zahra' (sa), the Head of the Women of Mankind, is an additional shame attached to them. It indicts them and shatters the veil of their hidden intentions. It proves that they were not concerned about such shame nor about enraging Allah and His Messenger S on account of al-Zahra' (sa) being angered if they found a stronger impetus, particularly the achievement of power that would enable them to virtually rule the entire Islamic world and become the successors of the Prophet S, a post which has its sanctity and significance as well as people's respect.

This also invalidates the claim of one who says that they used to hold Fatima (sa) in very high esteem, that they respected her and sought to please her, etc.

As regarding their attempt to appease her, we will prove that it was nothing but a political ploy, a failed and an unacceptable one.

1. A`yan al-Shi`a, Vol. 10, p. 173.

2. Ibid., Vol. 1, p. 343.

3. His full name is Isma`il ibn Muhammed ibn Yazid ibn Rabi`ah ibn Mufrigh al-Himyari, "Abu Hashim" and also "Abu `amir". He was born during the Umayyad's time, and he blasted them in his poetry. I must add that the author, may the Almighty reward him, seems to have spent little effort providing us with brief biographies of the individuals to whom he refers throughout his two-volume book, perhaps thinking that we already know them. – Tr.

4. Al-Sirat al-Mustaqim, Vol. 3, p. 13.

5. Ibid.

6. Adab al-Taff, Vol. 4, p. 32 from Ithbat al-Hudat.

7. Al-Turayhi, Al-Muntakhab, p. 161.

8. Al-Amini, Al-Ghdir, Vol. 6, p. 391.

9. Al-Turayhi, Al-Muntakhab, p. 293.

10. Ibid., p. 137.

11. Urjaja fi Tawarikh al-Nabi wal `A'imma, pp. 13–14 (a manuscript at the library of the Center of Islamic Studies). Refer to the biographies of renown women on pp. 316–17, Vol. 2.

12. Adab al-Taff, Vol. 5, pp. 329–30 from p. 323, Vol. 2, of Al-Majma` al-Ra`iq (manuscript at the Library of Imam al-Sadiq (as), Kazimiyya, Iraq).

13. Ibid., Vol. 8, p. 26. Sayyid Hayder al-Hilli, Diwan.

14. Riyad al-Madh wal Ratha', pp. 197–98.

15. Ibid., p. 6.

16. Hafiz Ibrahim, Diwan, Vol. 1, p. 75 (published by Dar al-Kutub al-Misriyya, Egypt).

17. Dala'il al-Sidq, Vol. 3, p. 54.

18. Al-Anwar al-Qudsiyya, pp. 42–44.

- [19.](#) The late Muhammed-Husayn āl Kashif al-Ghita was born in al-Najaf al-Ashraf in 1294 A.H./1876 A.D. and died in 1373 A.H./1954 A.D. – Tr.
- [20.](#) Al-Muqarram, Maqtal al-Husayn (as), p. 3
- [21.](#) Ibn al-Athir, Al-Kamil fil Tarikh, Vol. 6, pp. 99–100. Al-Tabari, Tarikh, Vol. 8, p. 205.
- [22.](#) Jannat al-Ma'wa, p. 82. `Abd al-Razzaq al-Muqarram, Maqtal al-Husayn, p. 424 (English translation by Yasin T. al-Jibouri).
- [23.](#) Al-Insan wal Hayat, p. 271.
- [24.](#) Refer to Al-Isti`ab (as referred to in a footnote in Al-Isaba), Vol. 4, pp. 330–31, 333 and Al-Isaba, Vol. 4, pp. 334–35. Ibn Kathir, Al-Sira al-Nabawiyya, Vol. 1, p. 495. Usd al-Ghaba, Vol. 5, p. 481. Al-Ya`qubi, Vol. 2, p. 28.
- [25.](#) Ibn Hisham, Al-Sira al-Nabawiyya, Vol. 1, p. 341. Al-Sira al-Halabiyya, Vol. 1, p. 300. Ibn Kathir, Al-Sira al-Nabawiyya, Vol. 1, p. 493. Al-Mahbar, p. 184.
- [26.](#) Ahmed ibn Hanbal, Musnad, Vol. 1, pp. 237, 335. Al-Hakim, Mustadrak, Vol. 3, p. 190, labeling it as “authentic.” In his Talkhis, al-Dhahbi says in a footnote that its isnad is accurate. Al-Tayalisi, Musnad, p. 351. Mujma` al-Zawa'id, Vol. 3, p. 17.
- [27.](#) Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 1, p. 181.
- [28.](#) Al-Amini, Al-Ghadir, Vol. 6, p. 161, quoting Kanz al-`Ummal, Vol. 8, p. 119 and Al-Isaba, Vol. 3, p. 606.
- [29.](#) Al-Amini, Al-Ghadir, Vol. 6, p. 162, quoting Vol 8, p. 118, of Kanz al-`Ummal.
- [30.](#) Refer to Qamus al-Rijal, Vol. 7, pp. 393–94.
- [31.](#) Jannat al-Ma'wa, p. 84. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, pp. 302–03. Sulaym ibn Qays, Vol. 2, pp. 674–75. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 413.

## Texts And Legacies From The Fourteen Infallible Ones

### **Traditions Regarding How al-Zahra' (sa) was Persecuted**

There are numerous traditions cited by the Infallible Ones clearly outlining how al-Zahra' (sa) was persecuted. They deal with how her house was assaulted with the intention to burn it, how the burning did actually take place, how she was hit, how she miscarried, and many other details of what she went through during the said assault. These narrations are consecutively reported (*mutawatir*) even if we do not add to them what others narrated and what the historians and others recorded in their books as facts. The latter is also quite numerous, even consecutively reported, as we have already pointed out.

We would like here to cite a large number of texts narrated by the Infallible Ones (as) in particular so that this matter becomes quite clear; so, let us set out to explore the following narratives and sacred legacies, and surely Allah is the One Who grants success.

## **Two Narratives Before the Reader**

In al-Tusi's *Amali*, the author states the following:

Relying on his *isnad*, from his mentor, from his father, may Allah be pleased with him, he is quoted as having said, "We were told by Muhammed ibn Muhammed as saying that 'Abu 'Abdullah, Muhammed ibn 'Imran, informed me saying that al-Zayyat said that Ahmed ibn Muhammed al-Jawhari said that al-Hassan ibn 'Alal al-'Anzi said that 'Abd al-Karam ibn Muhammed said that Muhammed ibn Ali said that Muhammed ibn Munqir cites Ziyad ibn al-Munthir saying that Shurahbil quotes Umm al-Fadl daughter of al-'Abbas said: When the Messenger of Allah S was under the weight of the sickness whereby he passed away, he once woke up, and we were weeping. He said: What causes you to weep? We said: O Messenger of Allah! We weep not to gain anything but to our departure from us; we weep for the cessation of the report from Heaven, and we weep over the nation after you. He said: You surely will be the oppressed and the downtrodden after me."<sup>1</sup>

## **What Sacred Texts Narrate**

1. Abu Bakr al-Shirazi, with regards to what is revealed in the Qur'an with reference to the Commander of the Faithful (as), quotes Muqatil quoting 'Ata' regarding the verse saying, "Verily, We granted Moses the Book" saying that the Torah used to have the following: "O Moses! I have chosen you and chosen a vizier for you who is your brother (Aaron) by your father and mother just as I chose for Muhammed Eleya who is his brother, vizier, *wasi* and successor. Congratulations to both of you for having such brothers, and congratulations to them for having you for brothers: Eleya, father of two grandsons, al-Hassan and al-Husayn and of a third one, al-Muhsin, one of his offspring, just as I created for your brother, Aaron, Shabar, Shubayr and Mushabbar."<sup>2</sup>

Note:

We started with both of these narratives despite our knowledge that the first is general to the degree that there is no room to count it among the narratives which we are in the process of presenting to you. The second is not narrated by the Infallible Ones (as).

**FIRST:** We would like to point out to the existence of many texts containing this same meaning, i.e. the persecution of the Household of the Prophet S and their being oppressed.

**SECOND:** We would like to prepare the reader to enter and be acquainted with the environments of transgression, humiliation, oppression and treating the family of the Prophet S as weaklings.

**THIRD:** This second tradition is narrated in some of Allah's revealed Books. For this reason, we included it on the list of such traditions. It also testifies to the oppression to which al-Muhsin was exposed and which some people try to deny.

## **What is Narrated From the Messenger of Allah (S)**

2. Sulaym ibn Qays has quoted ‘Abdullah ibn al-‘Abbas, when Jabir ibn ‘Abdullah [al-Ansari] was sitting next to him, as saying that the Prophet S said to Ali (as) at the conclusion of a lengthy sermon, “Quraish will revolt against all of you, and they will be unanimous in oppressing you. So, if you find supporters, you should fight them back. But if you do not find supporters, hold your hand away and do not shed your blood. Martyrdom is behind you, and may Allah condemn your killer.” Then the Prophet S faced his daughter (sa) and said, “You will be the first to join me from among my Ahl al-Bayt, and you are the Head of the Women of Paradise. You will face oppression and malice, so much so that you will be hit, and one of your ribs will be broken; may Allah condemn your killer...”<sup>3</sup>

3. Ibrahim ibn Muhammed al-Juwayni al-Shafi’i, relying on the *isnad* of Ali bin Ahmed ibn Musa al-Daqqaq from Muhammed ibn Abu ‘Abdullah al-Kufi from Musa ibn ‘Imran al-Nakh’i from al-Nawfali from al-Hassan ibn Ali ibn Abu Hamzah from his father from Sa’id ibn Jubayr from Ibn ‘Abbas, has narrated saying that the Messenger of Allah S was once sitting when al-Hassan (as) came. Seeing him, the Prophet (S) wept.

Then he said, “Come to me, come to me, O son!” Then al-Husayn (as) came followed by Fatima (sa). After that the Commander of the Faithful (as) came. His companions asked him, and he answered them. Among what he said to them was: “As for my daughter Fatima (sa), she is the Head of the Women of Mankind... When I saw her, I remembered what she will have to endure after me. It is as if humiliation entered her house, violating her privacy, confiscating her rights, depriving her of her inheritance, breaking her side, causing her to miscarry as she will call our: ‘O Muhammed!’ but there will be none to respond to her.

She will seek help, but she will not be helped. She will remain after me grieved, depressed, tearful... Then she will see herself humiliated after being, during her father’s lifetime, honored and dignified... She will be the first to rejoin me from among my Ahl al-Bayt. She will come to me sad, depressed, usurped, murdered. It will then be said by the Messenger of Allah S, ‘O Lord! Condemn whoever condemned her! Punish whoever confiscated what belonged to her! Humiliate whoever humiliated her! And keep in Your Fire whoever hit her on her side till she miscarried her son!’ The angels will at that time say, ‘Ameen!’<sup>4</sup>

Shaikh al-Islam, ‘allama al-Majlisi, while citing this narrative, says, “This is narrated by al-Saduq in his *Amali* depending on a reliable *isnad* from Ibn ‘Abbas.”

4. ‘Allama al-Majlisi has said: “I have found something handwritten by Shaikh Muhammed ibn Ali al-Jib’i, grandfather of Shaikh al-Baha’i, transmitted via the handwriting of the martyr, may Allah raise his status, who cites the *Musbah* of Shaikh Abu Mansur, may Allah make his resting-place good, saying that it has been narrated that the Prophet S entered once the house of Fatima (sa) who prepared for him some food comprised of dates, a round loaf of bread and some oil. They all sat down to eat, he, Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as). Once they have finished eating, the Messenger of Allah S

prostrated.

Then he smiled. Then he wept. Then he sat. The one who had the most courage to speak was Ali (as) who said, ‘O Messenger of Allah S! We have seen you today doing what we have never seen you doing before!’ He S said, “When I ate with you, I was pleased and felt happy for your safety and your assembling together, so I prostrated to Allah to thank Him.

It was then that Gabriel (as) descended and asked me, ‘Have you prostrated for being happy with your family?’ ‘Yes,’ I said. He said, ‘shall I inform you of what will happen to them after you?’ I said, ‘Yes, O my Brother, Gabriel! Do so.’ He said, ‘As for your daughter, she will be the first to rejoin you after being oppressed, what belongs to her will be taken away from her, and she will be deprived of her inheritance, and her husband will be dealt with unjustly. Her rib will be broken.

As regarding your cousin, he will be dealt with unjustly, he will be deprived of his right (to the caliphate), and he will be killed. As for al-Hassan (as), he will be dealt with unjustly; he will be deprived of his right and will be poisoned. As for al-Husayn (as), he will be dealt with unjustly; he will be deprived of his right, his progeny will be killed, and his body will be crushed under the horses’ hoofs.

His belongings will be plundered; his women and offspring will be taken captive; he will be buried shrouded by his blood, and strangers will bury him.’ I, therefore, wept and asked him, ‘Will anyone visit his grave?’ He said, ‘Strangers will visit it.’ I asked him, ‘What rewards will be received by those who visit it?’ He said, ‘For each of them will be written down in his/her book of deeds the rewards of performing the pilgrimage a thousand times and the ‘umra a thousand times, all in your own company,’ so I smiled.”<sup>5</sup>

5. ‘Umar ibn al-Khattab asked Huthayfan ibn al-Yaman about a statement made by the Prophet S regarding a dissension that would treat people as the raging waves treat a ship in the sea. Huthayfah said, “It is a dissension between which and yourself there is a closed door.” “Umar said, “Will the door, O Huthayfah, be opened or will it be broken?” Huthayfah said, “It will be broken.” “Umar said, “If the door is broken, then it ought not to be closed till the Day of Judgment.”<sup>6</sup>

Then they attributed to Huthayfah the statement that what is meant by the broken door is the assassination of “Umar ibn al-Khattab and by the gate of dissension is ‘Othman taking charge.<sup>7</sup>

We say the following:

Had Huthayfah really said so, such *ijtihad* is not precise because the “shura” which “Umar invented was the one that brought ‘Othman to power, albeit whether “Umar was to be killed or to die naturally. He invented it after someone stabbed him in the stomach.

Installing ‘Othman as the caliph was not the cause of the dissension which still remains till our time and will continue till the Judgment Day. Rather, it was the issue of Imamate which was usurped through the

violence that manifested itself by the assault on Fatima's house, by breaking her door and taking Ali (as) out by force to swear the oath of allegiance against his will. It is well known that the most serious dissension among the nation is the one regarding the issue of Imamate. No sword was ever taken out of its scabbard based on a theological basis like the one taken out against the Imamate in every time and clime, as al-Shahristani and others have stated.

## **What is Narrated from Imam Ali (as)**

6. Sulaym ibn Qays has narrated saying that "Umar ibn al-Khattab once fined all his governors half of their salaries, exempting Qunfath al-'Adawi from having to pay such a fine, and he was one of those governors. He even returned to him what he had taken away from him, the sum of twenty thousand dirhams.

Nor did he deduct the tilth, nor half the tilth. Aban said that Salim has said, "I met Ali (as) and asked him about what he thought regarding what "Umar had done. He said, 'Do you know why he ("Umar) exempted Qunfath and did not fine him or deduct anything from his salary?' I said, 'No.' He said, 'Because he is the one who hit Fatima, peace and blessings of Allah with her, with the whip when she came to act as a barrier between me and them. So she died, peace and blessings of Allah with her, and there was still a mark on her wrist like a bracelet.'"<sup>8</sup>

7. Aban has said that Salim said, "I went to a study circle at the Mosque of the Messenger of Allah S. The non-Hashemites were Salman, Abu Dharr, al-Miqdad, Muhammed ibn Abu Bakr, "Umar ibn Abu Salamah and Qays ibn Sa'd ibn 'Abadah. Al-'Abbas said to Ali (as), 'I wonder what stopped "Umar from fining Qunfath as he did to all his other governors.' Ali (as) looked around him, then his eyes were filled with tears. He then said, 'He did so in appreciation of his hitting Fatima (sa) with the whip, so she died and her wrist bore the mark of the hit like a bracelet.'"<sup>9</sup>

8. Salim quotes Ibn 'Abbas as saying, "I visited Ali (as) at Thi Qar. He took out a tablet and said to me, 'O son of 'Abbas! This is a tablet written according to what the Messenger of Allah (S) dictated to me, and it is in my own handwriting.' I said, 'O Commander of the Faithful! Please read it for me.' He read it, and it contained a narrative of the events from the demise of the Messenger of Allah S to the martyrdom of al-Husayn (as), detailing how he would be killed, the name of his killer, the names of his supporters, and who would be martyred in his company. He wept profusely, causing me to weep, too. Among what he read to me was what would happen to him (to Ali (as)), how Fatima (sa) would be martyred, how al-Hassan (as) would be betrayed by the nation then be martyred, etc."<sup>10</sup>

9. Ali (as) is quoted, at the time when he buried al-Zahra' (sa), as saying, "... And your daughter shall inform you of how the nation assisted each other in oppressing her, so inquire of her and ask her about the conditions, for there are many agonies filling her chest for which she found no outlet..."<sup>11</sup>

His speech, peace with him, above, although free of frankly stating what took place to al-Zahra' (sa), is

indicative of the fact that there were many injustices that remained inside her chest, peace with her, for which she found no outlet. Among such injustices are: the confiscation of Fadak, the confiscation of her inheritance, the usurpation of the caliphate that belonged to her husband, because these issues she did publicly and clearly announce, using them as proofs indicting the oppressors, delivering a great sermon while explaining them.

10. Refer to what is mentioned by the mentor al-Kaf'ami, who died in 905 A.H./1499 A.D., in his book titled *Al-Misbah* which he compiled from about two hundred and forty references. He states that he compiled it "... from books the authenticity of which is reliable and upholding which is mandated, and this cannot be altered by the evil efforts of time or by the endeavor of those with twisted minds."

*Books, like the sun, whose light*

*Is written above the most high of height.* [12](#)

He, may Allah have mercy on him, recorded a supplication transmitted by Ibn 'Abbas which Ali (as) used to recite in his *qunut*. In a footnote, he described it as, "a great supplication, one of a lofty status." About this supplication, Ali (as) says, "One who recites it is like one who shot a million [13](#) arrows in defense of the Prophet S during the battles of Badr and of Hunain."

Among the text of that supplication is the following with reference to the Household of the Prophet S: "... And they both killed his children, vacated his pulpit from his *wasi* and the heir of his knowledge, reneging from their fealty to his Imamate... and a womb which they cut open, and a fetus which they caused to miscarry, and a rib which they crushed, and a covenant which they tore to pieces..., etc." [14](#)

In a comment which he made about it and which he included in a footnote of his book, *Misbah*, and which is cited by 'allama al-Majlisi, "The mentor/scholar As'ad ibn 'Abd al-Qahir said the following in his book titled *Rashh al-Bala'*: 'When he referred to their demolition of the House of the Prophetic Mission, he was referring to the harm inflicted by the first (caliph) and the second against Ali and Fatima (as), their desire to burn Ali's house, how they led him away like a wounded camel, how they squeezed Fatima at her door till she miscarried al-Muhsin... She ordered to be buried at night and that neither the first nor the second [caliph] should be present at her funeral.'" [15](#)

He also referred to the rib that was crushed, the covenant that was torn to pieces, to what they committed against Fatima (sa), how they tore her property's title (of the Fadak real estate) to pieces, and how her rib was crushed. [16](#)

11. Muhammed ibn al-Hassan ibn Ahmed ibn al-Walid cites Ahmed ibn Idris, Muhammed ibn Yahya al-'Attar, who all quote Muhammed ibn Ahmed ibn Abu Hamzah al-Bata'ini quoting Ibn 'Umayrah quoting Muhammed ibn 'Utbah quoting Muhammed ibn 'Abd al-Rahman quoting his father quoting Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) as saying, "While I, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) were all in the company of the Messenger of Allah (S), he turned to us and wept. I asked him, 'What is that for, O Messenger of Allah

S?!’ He said, ‘I weep for you and how you will be hit on the head with the sword, and I weep for Fatima (sa) and how she will be slapped on the cheek.”[17](#)

Al-Majlisi describes this narrative as reliable; so refer to his work.[18](#)

12. Ahmed ibn al-Khasab, citing Ja’far ibn Muhammed al-Mufaddal quoting Muhammed ibn Sinan al-Zahiri quoting ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Abd ar-Rahman al-Asam quoting Madah ibn Harun ibn Sa’d saying, “I heard the father of al-Tufayl, namely ‘amir ibn Wa’ilah citing the Commander of the Faithful (as) saying to ”Umar, among other things, the following:

“It is the fire that you ignited at the door of my house in order to burn me and burn Fatima (sa), daughter of the Messenger of Allah S, and burn my sons, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and also burn my daughters Zainab and Umm Kulthum..., etc.”[19](#)

13. What proves violence against Ali (as) and that he was forced to swear fealty is a letter which Mu’awiyah wrote him as well as his answer to it. Mu’awiyah said to him that he was too slow to swear fealty to the “caliphs,” so he was taken to swear it against his wish as a run-away camel is taken.[20](#)

Among what he said to him was, “You envied Abu Bakr, swerved from his path, wished his attempt would fail, kept sitting at home and attracted a group of people to you till they lagged behind rather than swear fealty to him.” He went on to say, “None of these men except that you sought the upper hand over him and were sluggish to swear fealty to him till you were taken to him by force like a frightened camel.”[21](#)

The Commander of the Faithful (as) answered him with a letter wherein he said, “And you said that I was led like a frightened camel in order to swear fealty. By Allah! You intended to speak ill of me but you praised me, and to expose me but exposed your own self. There is no harm in a Muslim being oppressed so long as he does not entertain any doubts about his religion..., etc.”[22](#)

This narrative proves that they entered his house and took him out by force, underscoring the fact that they did not have any respect for the privacy of al-Zahra’ (sa) who tried to keep them away from him as much as she could as indicated in many narratives although this particular narrative did not disclose how they were directly involved in harming al-Zahra’ (sa).

14. Al-Daylami has stated that al-Zahra’ (sa) detailed what she had to go through. Among what she said was the following:

“... Then they sent to our house Qunfath accompanied by ”Umar ibn al-Khattab and Khalid ibn al-Walid in order to get my cousin Ali (as) to the *saqifa* of Bani Sa’idah for their lost-cause fealty, but he would not go out to meet them, being busy carrying out the will of the Messenger of Allah S and with his wives, with compiling the Qur’an and with the repayment of eighty thousand dirhams which he S@had instructed him to pay on his behalf: the price of [military] equipment and payment of debt [incurred against the

Prophet S].

They collected plenty of firewood at our door. Then they brought a torch to set it ablaze and to burn us. I stood at the door's knob and pleaded to them in the Name of Allah to leave us alone and to come to our aid. "Umar took the whip from the hand of Qunfath, slave of Abu Bakr, and hit me with it on the wrist. The whip twisted itself around my wrist, leaving a mark like a bracelet on it. He kicked the door with his foot. Ali (as) shut it back, and I was pregnant. I fell on my face as the fire kept burning, parching my face. He ["Umar] slapped me with his hand, causing my ear-ring to fall on the ground into bits and pieces. Labor overtook me, so I miscarried al-Muhsin who was killed without having committed any crime. Is this a nation that blesses me?! Allah and His Messenger disowned them and I, too, disowned them."

The Commander of the Faithful (as) carried out her will. He did not inform anyone about her demise. At al-Baqi', he dug up forty graves during the night in one of which he buried Fatima (sa).

Then the Muslims, having come to know about the death and burial of Fatima (sa), went to the Commander of the Faithful (as) to offer their condolences. They said, "O Brother of the Messenger of Allah S! Order us to prepare her for burial and to dig up her grave." He said, "She has already been buried, joining her father S." They said, "We belong to Allah, and to Him shall we return. How can the daughter of our Prophet Muhammed S, his only offspring, die and we do not perform her funeral prayers?! This is truly very serious!" He said, "Suffices you what you have committed against Allah, the Messenger of Allah S and his Progeny.

By Allah! I would not violate her will which she entrusted to me, that is, that none of you should perform her funeral prayers, and there is no blame on one who carries out someone's will." Those folks shook the dust off their clothes and said, "We have to perform the funeral prayers for the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S)." They immediately went to al-Baqi' and found forty graves freshly dug up. They could not tell which one of them was hers. People exchanged blame and accusations and said, "You did not witness the demise of the daughter of your Prophet, nor did you perform the funeral prayers for her, and now you do not even know where her grave is so you may visit it!"

Abu Bakr said, "Let a number of trustworthy Muslims dig up these graves till you find her grave so that we may perform her funeral prayers and visit it."

The Commander of the Faithful (as) heard about it, so he went out of his house angrily. His face was red with anger, his eyes burning, his cheeks puffed up, and he was carrying on his hand his yellow outer garment which he never put on except on an ill-fated day. He was using his sword, Thul-Fiqr, like a walking stick till he reached al-Baqi'. Prior to his arrival, report reached people that he was going there. A warner said to them, "Here is Ali (as) coming as you can see swearing by Allah that no brick of these graves will be moved from its place except that he will let his sword do its business against the unlucky ones from among this nation." People fled away in hordes.[23](#)

15. Among the verses of poetry which were narrated by traditionists and historians and which were composed by al-Zahra' (sa) eulogizing the greatest of all Prophets (as) are the following:

*Why should one who sniffs the earth*

*Where Ahmed is buried that he shall not*

*As long as he lives sniff musk at all?*

*Calamities were poured over me had they*

*Been poured on the light of day,*

*They would have turned it into night.*

*So today I am submitting to humiliation*

*Shunning the oppression,*

*Defending myself against the oppressor*

*Even with my own outer garment.* [24](#)

Had the calamities to which she refers in these lines been one relevant to the demise of her father, she would not have used the plural, nor has she resorted to submitting to humiliation or to defending herself with her outer garment. Another verse of poetry refers to her defending herself against her oppressor with her own mantle, referring to the oppression which was not confined to usurping her inheritance, and to Fadak, for these do not need to defend against the oppressor with her outer mantle, but she went out and demanded restitution, providing arguments.

Add to all the above the fact that one who used her outer mantle to defend against oppression is one who exerts a physical endeavor which she, peace with her, had to exert. She did not confine herself to delivering a speech and to provide arguments supporting her claims.

## **What Imam al-Hassan al-Mujtaba (as) Narrates**

16. It is narrated from al-Sha'bi, Abu Mikhraf, Yazid ibn Habib al-Misri the tradition of Imam al-Hassan al-Mujtaba (as) in which he argued with 'Amr ibn al-'As, al-Walid ibn 'Uqbah, 'Amr ibn 'Othman and 'Utbah ibn Abu Sufyan in the presence of Mu'awiyah, and it is quite a lengthy tradition. In it, the Imam (as) says to al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah, "You are the one who hit Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S, causing her to bleed and she miscarried, thus humiliating the Messenger of Allah S, disobeying his order and violating his sanctity since the Messenger of Allah S had said to her, 'O Fatima! You are the Head of all the women of Paradise.'"[25](#)

The great ‘allama and mentor Shaikh al-Tibrisi, in his Introduction to his book *Al-Ihtijaj*, has said, “Most of what we cite of any report we quote it according to its own *isnad* either because there is a consensus in its regard, or it agrees with what other thinkers have pointed out, or it is famous in biography books of those who disagree as well as those who agree with us except the speech of the father of Muhammed, namely (Imam) al-Hassan al-’Askari (as), which I have cited, for nothing is more famous than it, although it contains the same as we have already introduced. For this reason, I mentioned its *isnad* at the beginning of each report of the same...”<sup>26</sup>

The researching ‘allama and mentor, al-Tehrani, has said the following in *Al-Thari'a*، الذریعۃ، “This statement of his is quite clear in that everything he has cited in this regard is famous as agreed on by those who disagree as well as by those who agree with us. It is one of the highly regarded books on which scholars such as ‘allama al-Majlisi and the traditionist al-Hurr al-’Amili and their peers depend.”<sup>27</sup>

## **What is Narrated by al-Sajjad (as)**

17. Muhammed ibn Jarir ibn Rustam al-Tabari has recorded the following: “We have been informed by Makhal ibn Ibrahim al-Nahdi who says that Matar ibn Arqam has said that Abu Hamzah al-Thumali has said that Ali ibn al-Husayn (as) has said the following:

When he (S) passed away, and when Abu Bakr received the oath of allegiance, Ali (as) lagged behind, so “Umar said to Abu Bakr, “Are you not going to send someone to this lagging man to come and swear the oath of allegiance to you?” He (Abu Bakr) said, “Qunfath! Go to Ali and tell him that the successor of the Messenger of Allah S tells you to come and swear the oath of allegiance.” Ali (as) raised his voice saying, “Praise to Allah! How quickly you have told lies about the Messenger of Allah S!” He returned and informed Abu Bakr of it. “Umar again said, “Are you not going to send someone to this lagging man to come and swear the oath of allegiance to you?” He (Abu Bakr) said to Qunfath, “Go to Ali and tell him that the commander of the faithful tells you to come and swear the oath of allegiance.” Qunfath went there and knocked at the door. He said, “Who is it?” He said, “It is I, Qunfath.” He said, “What brought you here?” He said, “The commander of the faithful tells you to go and swear fealty.” Ali (as) raised his voice as he said, “Glory to Allah! He claims what is not his!” Qunfath returned and told Abu Bakr everything. “Umar stood up and said, “Let us go to this man to bring him here.” A group of men went with him.

They knocked at the door. When Ali (as) heard their voices, he said nothing. A woman spoke and inquired who they were. They said, “Tell Ali to come out and swear fealty.” Fatima (sa) raised her voice as she said, “O Messenger of Allah S! What have we suffered at the hands of Abu Bakr and ‘Umar after you?!” When the men heard her voice and words, many of them wept.

Then they went away. “Umar remained, accompanied by a number of men. They took Ali (as) out and led him to Abu Bakr till they seated him in front of the latter. Abu Bakr said to him, “Swear fealty (to me).” Ali (as) said, “What if I don’t?” Abu Bakr said, “Then, by Allah, the One and only God, your neck

shall be struck with the sword.” Ali (as) said, “You do that to me although I am a servant of Allah S and the Brother of His Messenger?! ” Abu Bakr said, “Swear it.” Ali (as) said, “What if I don’t?! ” Abu Bakr said, “Then, by Allah, the One and only God, your neck shall be struck with the sword.” Ali (as) turned to the grave (of the Messenger of Allah (S)) and said, “O Brother! The people deem me weak, and they almost killed me.” He swore fealty then left.[28](#)

## **What Either al-Baqir or al-Sadiq (as) has Narrated**

18. ‘Allama al-’Ayyashi, may Allah have mercy on him, has cited one of these Imams (as) narrating a lengthy tradition at the end of which he said,

Abu Bakr sent him a message to go there to swear the oath of allegiance to him. Ali (as) said, “I shall not come out till I finish compiling the Qur’an.” He sent for him again. He said, “I shall not come out till I am through.” Abu Bakr sent for him a third time a cousin of his called Qunfath. Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S went out to act as a barrier between the men and Ali (as). Qunfath hit her, returning without Ali (as). It was feared that he would amass a group of opponents. Abu Bakr ordered firewood to be brought and placed around Ali’s house. Then ‘Umar set out with a torch in his hand and wanted to burn Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as). When Ali (as) saw all of that, he was forced to come out to swear fealty against his wish.[29](#)

19. Muhammed ibn Yahya quotes Muhammed ibn al-Husayn quoting Muhammed ibn Isma’il quoting Salih ibn ‘Uqbah quoting ‘Abdullah ibn Muhammed al-Ju’fi quoting Abu Ja’far and Abu ‘Abdullah (as) as saying, “When they did what they did, Fatima (sa) seized ‘Umar by the collar, pulled him and said, ‘O son of al-Khattab! Had I not feared that some innocent people would be hurt, I would have submitted a plea to Allah to which He will respond swiftly.’”[30](#)

The mentor of the Muslims, Shaikh al-Majlisi, has said the following while explaining the beginning of the quotation of the Imam cited above, “He means their forceful entry into Fatima’s house.”[31](#)

## **What is Narrated from Imam al-Baqir (as)**

20. Ibrahim ibn Ahmed al-Tabari, relying on Ali ibn ‘Umar ibn Hassan ibn Ali al-Siyari who cites Muhammed ibn Zakariyya al-Ghulabi citing Ja’far ibn Muhammed ibn ‘Imarah citing his father citing Jabir al-Ju’fi citing Abu Ja’far Muhammed ibn Ali ibn al-Husayn (as) citing his father citing his grandfather citing Muhammed ibn ‘Ammar ibn Yasir رض in a tradition saying the following:

... She was pregnant with al-Hassan (as). Having given birth to him, she conceived forty days thereafter with al-Husayn (as), then she was blessed with Zainab and Umm Kulthum. Then she was big with al-Muhsin. When the Messenger of Allah S passed away, and when the folks did what they did on that day, forcefully entering her house and taking her cousin, the Commander of the Faithful (as), out by force. After the harm dealt to her by that man (“Umar), she miscarried her son. That was the original cause of

her sickness then subsequently death, peace and blessings of Allah with her.<sup>32</sup>

21. Muhammed ibn Jarir ibn Rustam al-Tabari stated that Ali (as) lagged behind when Abu Bakr received the people's oath of allegiance, so they went to his house and intended to set it to fire. They wanted to burn him and Fatima (sa), so al-Zubayr came out with his sword unsheathed, and they broke his sword. Muhammed ibn Harun has narrated from Aban ibn 'Othman saying that Sa'd ibn Qudamah cites Za'ida saying that Abu Bakr invited Ali (as) to swear the oath of allegiance to him, but he refused. Then the narrator details how Ali (as) argued with them and goes on to say, "I asked Za'idah ibn Qudamah, 'Who did you hear this from?' He said, 'I heard it from Abu Ja'far Muhammed ibn Ali ibn al-Husayn (as).'"<sup>33</sup>

22. Abu al-Jarud is cited quoting Abu Ja'far being asked about when al-Qa'im (as) will come out (of his occultation). He provided a lengthy answer wherein he referred to "the firewood which they collected in order to burn Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as). And this is the firewood which we keep inheriting..."<sup>34</sup>

## **What Imam al-Sadiq (as) is Quoted Narrating**

23. Muhammed ibn 'Abdullah ibn Ja'far al-Himyari quotes his father quoting Ali ibn Muhammed ibn Salim quoting Muhammed ibn Khalid quoting 'Abdullah ibn Hammad al-Basri quoting 'Abdullah ibn Ali ibn Abd al-Rahman al-Asam quoting Hammad ibn 'Othman quoting Abu 'Abdullah (as) saying,

When the Prophet S was taken for the night journey, it was said to him that Allah would test him in three instances. So the angel kept counting them till he said, "As for your daughter Fatima (sa), she will be oppressed and deprived and her right will be confiscated, the inheritance which you will leave her. And she will be hit while she is pregnant; insults and humiliation will affect her, then she will miscarry what is in her womb and be beaten, and she will die from such beating... The first to raise a complaint against his killer (on the Day of Judgment) will be Muhsin son of Ali (as), then Qunfath and his fellow (Abu Bakr) will be brought..."<sup>35</sup>

24. Abul-Hassan ibn Shathan quotes his father quoting Muham-med ibn al-Hassan ibn al-Walid quoting Muhammed ibn al-Husayn ibn al-Saffar quoting Muhammed ibn Ziyad from Mufaddal ibn "Umar from Yunus ibn Ya'qub from al-Sadiq (as) saying the following in a lengthy tradition: "O Yunus! My grandfather, the Messenger of Allah (S), said, 'Cursed is whoever oppresses my daughter Fatima (sa) and confiscates what belongs to her and kills her.'"<sup>36</sup>

25. The author of *Al-Kafi* cites some of our folks citing Ahmed ibn Muhammed from al-Qasim from his grandfather from Abu Busayr from Abu 'Abdullah (as) quoting his forefathers saying, "The Commander of the Faithful (as) has said, 'When the ones you miscarry meet you on the Day of Judgment, they will ask their parents why they did not give them names. The Messenger of Allah (S) had named Muhsin before his birth.'"<sup>37</sup> This narrative is also included among the 400 *ahadith*. Refer also to al-Saduq's book

titled *Al-Khisal*.

Regarding the *isnad* of this tradition, al-Majlisi has said that it is reliable.<sup>38</sup>

26. Ibrahim ibn Sa'd al-Thaqafi has said, "Ahmed ibn 'Amr al-Bijli has told me that we have been told by Ahmed ibn Habib al-'Amiri who quotes Hamran ibn A'yan quoting Abu 'Abdullah Ja'far ibn Muhammed S as saying, 'By Allah! Ali (as) did not swear the oath of allegiance (to Abu Bakr) except after the smoke had entered his house.'"<sup>39</sup>

27. Al-Husayn ibn Hamdan quotes Muhammed ibn Isma'il and Ali ibn 'Abdullah al-Husayni citing Abu Shu'ayb and Muhammed ibn Nasir quoting "Umar ibn al-Furat quoting Muhammed ibn al-Mufaddal ibn "Umar as saying,

I asked my master, al-Sadiq (as), "Is there a particular time for the reappearance of the Awaited One, al-Mahdi (as), which people know?" He (as) said, "Far, it is, from Allah to time his reappearance to one known by our Shi'as..." The narrative continues till it refers to how Salman al-Farisi was beaten, how the fire was set at the house door of the Commander of the Faithful and Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) in order to burn them, how the hand of the Truthful Lady, Fatima (sa), was whipped, how her stomach was kicked, and how she miscarried al-Muhsin..., the story of Abu Bakr and how he sent out Khalid ibn al-Walid, Qunfath (his slave) and "Umar ibn al-Khattab, how the latter gathered people to get the Commander of the Faithful (as) out of his house in order to swear fealty to Abu Bakr at the *saqifa* of Bani Sa'idah... "Umar said, "Come out, Ali, and join what the Muslims have all done; otherwise, we shall kill you." Fidda, maid of Fatima (sa), said to them, "The Commander of the Faithful (as) is busy, and it will be a good deed if you are true to your own selves and be fair to him" (and how "Umar taunted her in response). They gathered plenty of firewood at the door in order to burn the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as) as well as Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), as well as Zainab, Umm Kulthum and Fidda. They set the door to fire. Fatima (sa) went out to address them from behind the door. She said to them, 'Woe unto you, O "Umar! How dare you thus offend Allah and the Messenger of Allah S?! Do you want to put an end to his (Prophet's) offspring in this world, exile him and put out the *noor* of Allah? Yet Allah shall complete His *noor*.' "Umar rebuked Fatima (sa). He said to her, "Fatima! Enough of that! Neither Muhammed is present nor are the angels bringing orders from Allah to do or not to do! Ali is like any other Muslim. You have the option either to get him out to swear fealty to Abu Bakr, or I shall burn you all." Crying, Fatima (sa) supplicated thus: "Lord! I complain to You about how I miss Your Prophet, Messenger and chosen one, how Your nation has turned its back on us, and how they have confiscated what belongs to us and which You thus stated in the Book You revealed to the Prophet You sent!" "Umar said to her, "Abandon, O Fatima, the *foolishness* of women, for Allah will not let both Prophetic Mission and caliphate be yours." As he spoke these words, fire had already consumed the door's wood. Qunfath the accursed stretched his damned hand in order to open the door (from inside). "Umar hit Fatima's hand with his whip. The whip left a mark on her wrist like a black bracelet. He kicked the door with his foot, and the door hit Fatima's stomach. She was six months big with al-Muhsin whom she

miscarried...

"Umar attacked, and so did Qunfath and Khalid ibn al-Walid. "Umar slapped Fatima (sa) on her cheek, breaking her ear-ring under her veil, and she was crying loudly as she said, "O father! O Messenger of Allah! Your daughter Fatima is treated as a liar, is hit, and her fetus is killed in her womb!" The Commander of the Faithful (as) came out of the house with red eyes, wearing nothing on his head. He put his outer mantle on Fatima (sa), hugged her and said, "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S)! You already know that your father was sent as a mercy to the whole world..." Then he turned to "Umar and said, "O son of al-Khattab! Woe unto you from this day of yours and from the day thereafter and the ones that follow! Get out (of my house) before I unsheathe my sword and annihilate the bygone of the nation!" "Umar went out and so did Khalid ibn al-Walid, Qunfath, and Abd al-Rahman ibn Abu Bakr. They were outside when the Commander of the Faithful (as) called on Fidda to tend to her mistress who was undergoing the pain of miscarriage... Fatima (sa) miscarried al-Muhsin, so Ali (as) said, "He is joining his grandfather, the Messenger of Allah (S), to whom he will lodge a complaint. And al-Muhsin will come out (on the Judgment Day) carried by (his maternal grandmother) Khadija daughter of Khuwaylid and (his paternal grandmother) Fatima daughter of Assad, mother of the Commander of the Faithful (as), and they shall be wailing. His mother shall say, 'This is the Day about which you were warned.'"

Al-Mufaddal asked the Imam (as), "Master! What do you say about the verse that says, 'When the female infant buried alive is asked for what sin she was killed' (Qur'an, 81:8–9)?" The Imam (as) said, "O Mufaddal! The infant buried alive, by Allah, is Muhsin, because he is one of us. Anyone who says otherwise is a liar." Al-Mufaddal said, "Master! Then what?" Imam al-Sadiq (as) said, "Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S will stand and say, 'Lord! Carry out Your promise to me and regarding myself against whoever oppressed me, confiscated what belonged to me, hit me and killed all my sons!'"<sup>40</sup>

28. In another tradition, Imam al-Sadiq (as) said to al-Mufaddal, "There is no tragedy like ours at Kerbala' despite what happened one day at the *saqifa* and how the fire was set at the door of the Commander of the Faithful (as), thus endangering him, al-Hassan, al-Husayn, Fatima, Zainab and Umm Kulthum (as) as well as Fidda. And the killing of Muhsin, when someone kicked his mother in the stomach, is greater, more tragic and more bitter because it is the origin of the Day of Torment."<sup>41</sup>

29. The head of the Shi'a, namely Shaikh al-Mufid, has said the following in his book titled *Al-Ikhtisas* where he cites Ahmed ibn Muhammed ibn 'Isa quoting his father, and also from al-'Abbas ibn Ma'ruf from 'Abdullah ibn al-Mughirah saying that 'Abdullah ibn 'Abd al-Rahman al-Asam cited 'Abdullah ibn Bakr al-Arjani as saying, "I accompanied Abu 'Abdullah (as) on his way from Mecca to Medina...", then he narrated a lengthy discourse wherein he quoted Abu 'Abdullah (as) as saying, "... killer of the Commander of the Faithful (as), killer of Fatima (sa), killer of al-Muhsin, killer of al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as)..., etc."

This is narrated in *Kamil al-Ziyarat* from another *isnad* from ‘Abdullah ibn al-Asam from ‘Abdullah ibn Bakr al-Arjani. In it, the Imam (as) is quoted as saying, “... and the killer of Fatima (sa) and Muhsin..., etc.,” so you may refer to it.<sup>42</sup>

30. Ali ibn Ibrahim quotes his father quoting Sulayman al-Daylami quoting Abu Busayr quoting Abu ‘Abdullah (as) as saying, “On the Day of Judgment, Prophet Muhammed S shall be called on, and he will be clad in a rosy outfit... Then it will be called from the depths of the ‘Arsh by the Lord of Glory and the Sublime Horizon, ‘How good your father, O Muhammed, is, who is Ibrahim, and how good your brother is, who is Ali ibn Abu Talib (as), and how good your grandsons are, and they are al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and how good your fetus is, and he is Muhsin, and how good the rightly guided Imams (as) are..., etc.”<sup>43</sup>

31. Abu Muhammed, citing ‘Abdullah ibn Sinan from Abu ‘Abdullah (as) says the following:

When the Messenger of Allah (S) passed away, Abu Bakr took his seat on his pulpit. He sent for the [business] agent of Fatima (sa) and expelled him... Abu Bakr then wrote her a property title, returning Fadak to her possession. But “Umar met her and asked her, “O Daughter of Muhammed! What is this sheet in your hand?” She said, “A property title which Abu Bakr wrote me, returning Fadak to my possession.” He said, “Give it to me.” She refused, so he kicked her with his foot in the stomach, and she was pregnant with a son named al-Muhsin whom she instantly miscarried. “Umar then slapped her on her cheek, causing her ear-ring to break into bits and pieces. Then he took the property title and tore it to pieces. Fatima (sa) went away. For seventy-five days from the time “Umar kicked her, she remained sick, then she passed away. On her death-bed, she called Ali (as) to her presence and said to him, “You may either guarantee to carry out what I shall say to you or I shall ask al-Zubayr [to do so].” Ali (as) said, “I guarantee to carry out your will, O Daughter of Muhammed!” She said to him, “I ask you in the right of the Messenger of Allah S that if I die, both men (“Umar and Abu Bakr) should not be present near me, nor should they attend my funeral prayers.” He said, “You will have what you desire.” When she passed away, he buried her at night. In the morning, the people of Medina, including Abu Bakr and “Umar, wanted to attend her funeral. Ali (as) went out and was met by both men. They asked him, “What have you done to the daughter of Muhammed S regarding preparing her for her burial, O father of al-Hassan?” Ali (as) said, “By Allah, I have already buried her.” They said, “What caused you to bury her without informing us that she had died?” He (as) said, “She had ordered me to do just that.” “Umar said, “By Allah! I am about to dig up her grave and perform the funeral prayers for her.” Ali (as) said, “By Allah! As long as my heart is still resting inside my rib cage, and as long as I can hold (my sword) Thul-Fiqr in my hand, you shall never be able to dig her body out, and you know best what I can do!” Abu Bakr said (to “Umar), “Go, for he is more worthy of her than we are.” People then dispersed.<sup>44</sup>

32. Muhammed ibn Harran al-Tal’akbari cites his father as saying that “Abu Ali,” Muhammed ibn Humam ibn Suhail, has said that Ahmed ibn Muhammed al-Barqi has cited Ahmed ibn Muhammed al-

Ash'ari al-Qummi citing 'Abd al-Rahman ibn Abu Najran citing 'Abdullah ibn Sinan citing Ibn Maskan citing Abu Busayr quoting Abu 'Abdullah (as) saying the following:

Fatima (sa) was born on the 20th of Jumada al-ākhira, when the Prophet S was forty-five years old... The reason for her death is that Qunfath, slave of the man (Abu Bakr), poked her with the sword's scabbard as ordered by his master, so she miscarried Muhsin. She fell seriously sick because of the incident, and she did not allow any of those who harmed her enter her house. Two men (Abu Bakr and "Umar) from among the companions of the Prophet S requested the Commander of the Faithful (as) to intercede on their behalf with her. He requested her, and she agreed. When they entered, they asked her, "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah S! How do you feel?" She said, "Well, all Praise is due to Allah." Then she said to them, "Did you not hear the Prophet S say, 'Fatima (sa) is part of me; whoever harms her harms me, and whoever harms me harms Allah'?" They answered in the affirmative. She said, "By Allah! You both have harmed me." They went out while she was still angry with them.<sup>45</sup>

The *isnad* of this narrative is authentic.

33. Shaikh al-Tusi has said that Imam al-Sadiq (as) is quoted as saying that when the Commander of the Faithful (as) was taken forcefully out of his house, Fatima (sa) went out behind him. All women from Banu Hashim went out with her and they all were near the grave (of the Prophet (S) which was inside the room nearby). Fatima (sa) said to them, "Leave my cousin alone for, by Allah, if you do not leave him alone..., etc."<sup>46</sup>

This narrative, too, proves that they entered his house by force and took him out by force although Fatima (sa) was there, demonstrating a total lack of respect for her and for her privacy.

34. Judge 'Abd al-Jabbar, who died in 415 A.H./1024 A.D. and who was contemporary to Shaikh al-Mufid (d. 413 A.H./1022 A.D.), may Allah have mercy on him, has said that the Shi'a put forth claims on a narrative by Imam Ja'far ibn Muhammed [al-Sadiq] (as) and others which says that "Umar (ibn al-Khattab) hit Fatima (sa) with his whip.<sup>47</sup>

We do not know if he is referring to the narratives which we have been citing or to others, so we set his quoted statement aside for this reason.

## **What is Narrated from Imam al-Kazim (as)**

'Allama al-Majlisi, may Allah Almighty have mercy on him, has transmitted from *Kitab al-Tara'if fi Ma'rifa Mathahib al-Tawa'if* الطرائف في معرفة مذاهب الطوائف by the great 'allama Sayyid Ibn Tawus<sup>48</sup>, from *Kitab al-Wasiyya* by Shaikh 'Isa ibn al-Mustafad al-Darar from Musa ibn Ja'far from his father saying that when the Messenger of Allah S was about to leave this world for the next, he said, "O men of the Ansar! Parting is opportune... The door of Fatima (sa) is my door, her house is mine; so, whoever violates its sanctity violates the sanctity of Allah's barrier." 'Isa goes on to say that the father of al-Hassan (as) wept

for a long time. He discontinued his narrative then said, “By Allah! Allah’s barrier was violated! By Allah! Allah’s barrier was violated! By Allah! Allah’s barrier was violated, O nation blessed by Allah!”<sup>49</sup>

36. Harun ibn Musa is quoted by Ahmed ibn Muhammed ibn ‘Ammar al-’Ijli al-Kufi quoting ‘Isa al-Darar quoting Imam al-Kazim (as) saying, “I asked my father, ‘What happened after the departure of the angels from the Messenger of Allah S?’ He said, ‘He called to his presence Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and told all others to leave them alone... He then said to Ali (as), ‘Be informed, O Ali, that I am pleased with whomsoever my daughter Fatima is pleased with, and so is my Lord and His angels. O Ali! Woe unto whoever oppresses her! Woe unto whoever confiscates what belongs to her! Woe unto whoever violates her sanctity! Woe unto whoever burns her door! Woe unto whoever harms her friend! Woe unto whoever exposes her to hardship or antagonizes her! Lord! I am clear of all of them, and they are clear of me.’ Then the Messenger of Allah S named them, hugged Fatima, Ali, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and said, ‘Lord! I am peace with them and with whoever follows them, and I hope they will all enter Paradise. And I am a foe and war against anyone who antagonizes them, who oppresses them, who goes ahead of them or lags behind them and behind their followers (Shi’as), and I hope all these will enter the Fire! O Fatima! I shall never be pleased except when you are pleased! No, by Allah! I shall never be pleased except when *you* are pleased! I shall never be pleased except when *you* are pleased!’”<sup>50</sup>

37. Muhammed ibn Yahya quotes al-’Amraki quoting Ali quoting Ali ibn Ja’far quoting his brother quoting the father of al-Hassan (as) as saying, “Fatima (sa) is a truthful lady and a martyr, and daughters of prophets do not menstruate.”<sup>51</sup>

Both al-Majlisi I and II, who are among the greatest of our scholars, have commented about the above-quoted tradition saying that it is authentic.<sup>52</sup>

38. The great ‘*allama* and ascetic worshipper, Sayyid Ibn Tawus, through his *isnad* from Imam al-Kazim (as) who quotes his father (as) as saying, “The Messenger of Allah S said, ‘O Ali! What are you going to do when certain people plot against you after me and push themselves over you, and (so-and-so) will call on you to swear fealty, then you will be covered with your garment and led like a fleeting camel, humiliated and despised, grieved and depressed, and thereafter humiliation will descend...?’”<sup>53</sup>

## **What is Narrated From Imam al-Rida (as)**

39. The great ‘*allama* and ascetic worshipper, Sayyid Ibn Tawus, may Allah have mercy on him, has transmitted a supplication by our master, Imam al-Rida (as), to be recited during *sajdat al-shukr* (prostration of thanksgiving) which he narrates through *isnad* to Sa’d ibn ‘Abdullah in a book detailing the rewards of supplication. He cites Abu Ja’far quoting Muhammed S ibn Isma’il ibn Bazee’ quoting Imam al-Rida (as) and also Bakar ibn Salih from Sulayman ibn Ja’far from al-Rida (as). Both men say that they visited him once as he was performing the thanksgiving prostration. He prolonged his prostration then raised his head. They said to him, “You surely have prolonged your prostration!” He said, “Anyone

who supplicates to Allah reciting this plea will be regarded as though he had shot arrows during the battle of Badr in the company of the Messenger of Allah S.” They asked him if they should write it down. He said, “Write down that once you are prostrating during *sajdat al-shukr*, you should say..., etc.” He cited the supplication which contains the following: “... and they both ridiculed Your Messenger and killed the son of Your Prophet S..., etc.”<sup>54</sup>

## What is Narrated from Imam al-Jawad (as)

40. Citing his father, Muhammed ibn Harun ibn Musa transmits from Muhammed ibn al-Hassan ibn Ahmed ibn al-Walid, from Ahmed ibn Abu ‘Abdullah al-Barqi from Zakariyya ibn Adam saying,

I was in the company of al-Rida (as) when Abu Ja’far, peace with him, was brought in. He was not yet forty years old. He hit the ground with his hand then raised his head to the sky and contemplated for a long time. Al-Rida (as) said to him, ‘May I be your sacrifice! About what have you prolonged your contemplation?!’ He said, ‘About what was done to my mother Fatima (sa)..., by Allah..., etc.’ Then he, peace with him, stated how those who did so would be punished.”<sup>55</sup>

We say that this narrative, though not detailing what took place, also considers her, peace with her, as having been exposed to a great injustice.

What is Narrated from Imam al-’Askari (as)

41. Sayyid Ibn Tawus, in his work titled *Zawa’id al-Fawa’id*, citing *Kitab al-Mukhtasar* by Shaikh Hassan ibn Sulayman, a copy handwritten by Ali ibn Muzahir al-Wasiti, through a continuous chain of *isnad* that ends with Muhammed ibn al-’Ala’ al-Hamadani al-Wasiti. Then he cites it from *Kitab al-Mukhtasar* at the conclusion of which he says that he copied it from an edition handwritten by Muhammed ibn Ali ibn Tay. In it, it is stated that Ibn Abul-’Ala’ al-Hamadani and Yahya ibn Muhammed ibn Hawejj disputed with each other regarding “Umar ibn al-Khattab, so they sought the arbitration of Ahmed ibn Ishaq al-Qummi, a friend of Imam al-Hassan al-’Askari (as). He narrated to them from what he had learned from Imam al-’Askari (as) who cites his father (as) saying that Huthayfah narrated a lengthy tradition about the Prophet S wherein he informed Huthayfan ibn al-Yaman a number of events that would take place after his demise. Huthayfah, seeing how what he had heard came true, said, “... And the Qur’an was distorted, and the house where revelation used to descend was burnt... and the face of the Lady of Virtue was slapped...”<sup>56</sup>

1. Al-Tusi, Amali, Vol. 1, p. 122. Refer to p. 191 of this edition published by Al-Wafa’ Establishment of Beirut, Lebanon. Ibn Sa`d, Tabaqat, Vol. 8, p. 278. Ansab al-Ashraf, Vol. 1, p. 551. Ahmed, Musnad, Vol. 6, p. 339. Al-Khasa’is al-Kubra, Vol. 2, p. 135. Al-Mufid, Amali, p. 215. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 40.

2. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 38, p. 145, citing Al-Manaqib.

3. Cited from the book of Sulaym ibn Qays (al-Hilali) (edited by al-Ansari), Vol. 2, p. 907.

4. Fara’id al-Simtayn, Vol. 2, pp. 34–35. Al-Saduq, Amali, pp. 99–101. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 1, pp. 280–81. Irshad al-Qulub, p. 295. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 37, 39 and Vol. 43, pp. 172–73. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 391–92 in the footnote of which a citation of p. 48 of Ghayat al-Maram, p. 48 and p. 109 of Al-Muhtadir. Al-Majlisi, Jala’ al-`Uyun, Vol. 2,

- pp. 186–88.
- [5.](#) Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 98, p. 44.
- [6.](#) Ibn Salam al-Abazi, *Bid' al-Islam wa Shara'i ad-Din*, p. 107. Al-Bukhari, *Sihah*, Vol. 1, pp. 67, 164, 212 (1309 A.H. edition). Ibn Majah, *Sunan*, Vol. 2, p. 1306. Al-Bayhaqi, *Dala'il al-Nubuwwa*, Vol. 6, p. 386.
- [7.](#) Refer to the references listed in the previous footnote.
- [8.](#) Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 30, pp. 302–03 and the book of Sulaym ibn Qays, Vol. 2, pp. 674–75. Al-'Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 413.
- [9.](#) Refer to the references listed in the previous footnote.
- [10.](#) Refer to the book of Sulaym ibn Qays as edited by al-Ansari, Vol. 2, p. 915. Ibn Shathan, *Al-Fada'il*, p. 141. Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, p. 73.
- [11.](#) Al-Kulayni, *Al-Kafi*, Vol. 1, p. 459. *Mir'at al-'Uqul*, Vol. 5, p. 329. *Nahjul-Balagha* (Sermon No. 202).
- [12.](#) Al-Kaf'ami, *Misbah*, p. 4.
- [13.](#) The word “million” does not exist in classical Arabic. Instead, Arabs say “a thousand thousands.” — Tr.
- [14.](#) Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 82, p. 261. Al-Kaf'ami, *Misbah*, p. 553. *Al-Balad al-Amin*, pp. 551–52. *'Ilm al-Yaqin*, p. 701.
- [15.](#) Refer to the footnotes of p. 553 of *Al-Misbah* by al-Kaf'ami, to pp. 551–52 of *Al-Balad al-Amin* and to p. 701 of *'Ilm al-Yaqin*.
- [16.](#) Refer to p. 555 of the previous reference and to p. 261, Vol. 82, of *Bihar al-Anwar*.
- [17.](#) Shaikh al-Saduq, *Amali*, p. 118. Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, p. 51; also refer to Vol. 44, p. 149. *Ithbat al-Hudat*, Vol. 1, p. 281. *'Awalim al-'Ulum*, Vol. 11, p. 397. *Jala' al-'Uyun*, Vol. 1, p. 189. *'Abd ar-Razzaq al-Muqarram*, *Wafat al-Siddiqah al-Zahra'* (sa), p. 60. Ibn Shahr Ashub, *Al-Manaqib*, Vol. 2, p. 209 (published by Intisharat 'Alamah, Qum).
- [18.](#) *Jala' al-'Uyun*, Vol. 1, p. 189.
- [19.](#) Al-Hidayah al-Kubra, p. 163.
- [20.](#) Ibn A`tham, *Al-Futuh*, Vol. 3, p. 474.
- [21.](#) Ibn Abul-Hadid, *Sharh Nahjul-Balagha*, Vol. 15, p. 186. *Al-Tasatturi*, *Ihqaaq al-Haqq*, Vol. 2, pp. 368–69.
- [22.](#) Ibn Abul-Hadid, *Sharh Nahjul-Balagha*, Vol. 28. Refer also to *Nahj al-Sa`da* and p. 369, Vol. 2, of *Ihqaaq al-Haqq*.
- [23.](#) Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 30, pp. 348–50, citing *Irshad al-Qulub* by al-Daylami.
- [24.](#) References of this poetry are numerous among the Muslims' books, so we find it sufficient to point out to p. 299, Vol. 1, of *Al-Manaqib* by Ibn Shahr Ashub.
- [25.](#) Al-Tibrizi, *Al-Ihtijaj*, Vol. 1, p. 414. Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 43, p. 197. *Mir'at al-'Uqul*, Vol. 5, p. 321. *Diya' al-'Alamin* (manuscript), Vol. 2, p. 64.
- [26.](#) Al-Tibrizi, *Al-Ihtijaj*, Vol. 1, p. 4.
- [27.](#) Al-Thari'a, Vol. 1, p. 282.
- [28.](#) Al-Mustarshid fi Imamate Ali ibn Abu Talib, pp. 65–66.
- [29.](#) Al-'Ayyashi, *Tafsir*, Vol. 2, pp. 307–08. Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, p. 231. Al-Burhan fi *Tafsir al-Qur'an*, Vol. 2, p. 434.
- [30.](#) Al-'Ayyashi, *Tafsir*, Vol. 2, pp. 307–08. Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, p. 231. Al-Burhan fi *Tafsir al-Qur'an*, Vol. 2, p. 434.
- [31.](#) Al-Kulayni, *Al-Kafi*, Vol. 1, p. 460.
- [32.](#) *Dala'il al-Imama*, pp. 26–27. Refer to *Al-'Awalim*, Vol. 11, p. 504.
- [33.](#) Al-Mustarshid fi *Imamat Ali ibn Abu Talib* (as), pp. 64–65.
- [34.](#) *Dala'il al-Imama*, p. 242.
- [35.](#) Kamil al-Ziyarat, pp. 232–35. Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, pp. 62–64. Refer also to Vol. 53, p. 23 of the same. *'Awalim al-'Ulum*, Vol. 11, p. 398. Al-Majlisi, *Jala' al-'Uyun*, Vol. 1, pp. 184–86.
- [36.](#) *Kanz al-Fawa'id*, Vol. 1, pp. 149–50. *Rawdat al-Jannat*, Vol. 6, p. 182.
- [37.](#) Al-Kafi, Vol. 6, p. 18. *'Awalim al-'Ulum*, Vol. 11, p. 411. Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 43, p. 195 and Vol. 101, p. 128 and Vol. 10, p. 112. Al-Khisal, Vol. 2, p. 434. *'Ilal al-Shara'i*, Vol. 2, p. 464. *Jala' al-'Uyun*, Vol. 1, p. 222.
- [38.](#) *Jala' al-'Uyun*, Vol. 1, p. 222.

39. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 269, 390, 411. On its footnote, it is stated that it cites al-Thaqafi's book Al-Gharat.
40. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 53, pp. 14, 18, 19, 23. Al-'Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 441–43. Al-Khasibi, Al-Hidaya al-Kubra, pp. 392, 407–08, 417. Hilyat al-Abrar, Vol. 2, p. 652. Refer also to Fatima al-Zahra' Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa, Vol. 2, p. 532 from Nawa'ib al-Duhur by Sayyid al-Meerjahani, p. 192.
41. Fatima al-Zahra' Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa, Vol. 2, p. 532, quoting Nawa'ib al-Duhur by Sayyid al-Meerjahani, p. 194. Al-Khasibi, Al-Hidaya al-Kubra, p. 417 (Beirut edition).
42. Shaikh al-Mufid, Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 343–44. Kamil al-Ziyarat, pp. 326–27. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 8, p. 213. Refer also to Basa'ir al-Darajat.
43. Al-Qummi, Tafsir, Vol. 1, p. 128. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 7, pp. 328–29 and Vol. 23, pp. 130–31 and Vol. 12, pp. 6–7. Nar al-Thaqalayn, Vol. 1, p. 348. Al-Burhan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Vol. 1, pp. 328–29.
44. Al-Mufid, Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 184–85. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 29, p. 192. Abd al-Razzaq al-Muqarram, Wafat al-Siddaqa al-Zahra', p. 78.
45. Dala'il al-Imama, p. 45. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, p. 170. `Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, pp. 411, 504.
46. Al-Tibrizi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, p. 222. Al-Mustarshid fi Imamat Ali ibn Abu Talib ﷺ, p. 67.
47. Judge `Abd al-Jabbar, Al-Mughni, Vol. 20, p. 335. Sayyid al-Murtada, Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, pp. 110–19. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balaghah, Vol. 16, p. 271.
48. Following is a list of some of the works of Ibn Tawus:

1- فلاح السائل : Al-Tahseen 2- الأمان من أخطار الأسفار : Al-Aman min Akhtar al-Asfar 3- التحصين : Falah al-Sa'i 4- فلاح السائل من أخطار الأسفار : Al-Tahseen 5- الدرع الواقية : Al-Duroo` al-Waqiya 6- جمال الأسبوع : Jamal al-aṣbuq 7- المجتني من دعاء المجتبى : Al-Mujtana min Du'a al-Mujtaba 8- فتح الأبواب : Fath al-Abwab 9- اليقين : Al-Yaqin 10- الطرائف في معرفة مذاهب الطوائف : Al-Tara'if fi Ma`rifat Mathahib al-Tawa'if 11- اللهو في قتل الطفوف : Al-Luhuf fi Qatla al-Tufuf 12- الملائم والفتن : Al-Malahim wal Fitān 13- بناء المقالة : Al-Malahim wal Fitān 14- سعد السعود : Sa`d al-Sa`ud 15- فرج المهموم : Faraj al-Mahmūm 16- فرحة الغري : Farhat al-Ghari 17- قبس من غياث سلطان الورى : Qabas min Ghiyath Sultan al-Wara 18- كشف المحة لثمرة المهجة : Kashf al-Mahajja li Thamarat al-Muhja .  
-Tr.

49. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, pp. 476–77. In its footnote, it cites pp. 18–21 of Al-Tara'if by Ibn Tawus.
50. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, pp. 484–85. In its footnote, p. 72 of Khasa'is al-A'imma is cited and so is p. 400, Vol. 11, of `Awalim al-'Ulum as well as pp. 92–34 of Al-Tara'if and also Musbah al-Anwar.
51. Al-Kulayni, Al-Kafi, Vol. 1, p. 458. `Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 260. Al-Khawajoo'i, Al-Rasa'il al-'Iqtadiyya, pp. 301–02.
52. Mir'at al-'Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 315. Rawdat al-Muttaqin, Vol. 5, p. 342.
53. Al-Kulayni, Al-Kafi, Vol. 1, p. 458. `Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 260. Al-Khawajoo'i, Al-Rasa'il al-'Iqtadiyya, pp. 301–02.
54. Muhaj al-Da`awat, pp. 257–58. Shaikh al-Kaf'ami, Al-Misbah, pp. 553–54. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, p. 393 and Vol. 83, p. 223. Al-'Ataridi, Musnad al-Imam al-Rida ؓ, Vol. 2, p. 65.
55. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 50, p. 59, citing Dala'il al-Imama by al-Tabari.
56. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 95, pp. 351, 353–54 and Vol. 31, p. 126. Shaikh Hassan ibn Sulayman, Al-Muhtadir, pp. 44–55 (as referred to in a footnote in Bihar al-Anwar). Also in the same footnote, it is stated that al-Tabari had narrated it in Dala'il al-Imama in the Part relevant to the Commander of the Faithful ؓ and is narrated by Shaikh Hashim ibn Muhammed (one of the sixth century A.H. scholars) in Misbah al-Anwar and by al-Jaza'iri in Al-Anwar al-Nu'maniyya through a different chain of isnad; so, you may refer to it.

# Oppressing Al-Zahra': Centuries-Old Sectarian Arguments

## **Testimonials**

The issue of assaulting al-Zahra' (sa) with beating, attacking her house, the attempt to burn it, the actual burning of it, her miscarriage, and other issues have all been included in the spheres of sectarian arguments since the very first [Hijri] century and till our time.

We would like to cite samples of arguments by orators and others in this regard from prominent personalities of this sect against their opponents across successive centuries so that it may become clear that such diction was not invented by those who recite commemorative ceremonies in order to extract people's tears with truthful and untruthful words, as someone terms it, leaving the option to research them to whoever wishes to do so.

So, let us say that on Allah do we depend, and from Him do we derive our will power, strength and success.

### **1. 'Abd al-Jabbar, the Judge (d. 415 A.H.)**

Judge 'Abd al-Jabbar, one of the most prominent Mu'tazilites, has said the following in his attempt to rebut the Shi'a, "... And among the charges they mention is the claim that Fatima (sa), on account of her anger with Abu Bakr and "Umar, willed that they both should not perform her funeral prayers, and that they both should not know where she was buried. So she was buried at night. In a narrative transmitted by Ja'far ibn Muhammed and others, they claim that "Umar hit Fatima (sa) with a whip and struck al-Zubayr with the sword. They also say that "Umar went to her house as Ali (as), al-Zubayr and a group of those who boycotted the swearing of fealty to Abu Bakr assembled there. He said to her, 'I find none after your father whom I love most but you. Yet by Allah! Since these folks have assembled at your house, they shall all be burnt.' She, therefore, prohibited people from assembling, and they did not go back to her till they swore fealty to Abu Bakr..., in addition to such far-fetched narratives. The answer to these narratives is that we do not believe them."<sup>1</sup>

He also said, "As regarding what they mentioned about "Umar in reference to such burning, had it been true, it would not be demeaning to "Umar because he was *right* in threatening those who refused to swear the oath of allegiance."<sup>2</sup>

### **2. Sayyid al-Murtada, the Flag of Guidance (d. 436 A.H./1014 A.D.)**

Sayyid al-Murtada, the flag of guidance (*'alam al-huda*), rebutting what the afore-mentioned Judge had

said, states the following:

We have made it quite clear that the narrative regarding such burning has been narrated by non-Shi'as who cannot be charged... The excuse which he used regarding this burning, if true, is quite interesting! How can *anyone* seek an excuse for someone who wanted to burn the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as) and of Fatima (sa)?!”<sup>3</sup>

Rebutting ‘Abd al-Jabbar’s rejection of Fatima (sa) being hit and her house attacked and her being threatened with burning, and in response to his saying, “We neither believe it, nor do we think it is possible at all,” Sayyid al-Murtada says, “You did not base your rejection on any proof or possibility whatsoever so you would defend your viewpoint. Rejecting what is narrated without producing any evidence whatsoever is totally disregarded.”<sup>4</sup>

When ‘Abd al-Jabbar claimed that to say that Fatima (sa) was hit reminds one of the narratives regarding the *hulal*, Sayyid al-Murtada responded to him by asking him: “Do you not know that this sect is referred to by those who believe in the *hulul*, and that reason proves the error of what they claim?! Do you say that reason concludes that it is impossible that Fatima (sa) was hit?! If you say that they both are the same, then prove how reason considers it impossible, just as you explain how impossible it is to believe in the *hulul*, and you will then nail down your argument. Surely it is well known that you cannot do it!”<sup>5</sup>

He also said, “There is no difference between a threat for the reason which he mentioned and hitting Fatima (sa) for the same reason, for burning houses is surely a greater offense than whipping someone. There is no sense in the author expressing his anger at such whipping and his calling the transmitter of the incident a liar.”<sup>6</sup>

### **3. Shaikh al-Tusi (d. 460 A.H./1068 A.D.)**

The sect’s mentor, Shaikh Muhammed ibn al-Hassan al-Tusi, may Allah have mercy on him, has said,

One of their offenses, which were held in contempt, was beating Fatima (sa). It is narrated that she was whipped, and it is well known without any contention among the Shi’as is that “Umar (ibn al-Khattab) hit her on the stomach, so she miscarried Muhsin. Such a narrative is quite famous among them. Add to this their attempt to burn her house when some people sought shelter in it, refusing to swear the oath of allegiance to him (to Abu Bakr).

Nobody denies this narrative at all because we have proven how such a narrative is transmitted by the Sunnis via al-Balathiri and others, and the narratives transmitted by the Shi’as are numerous, and there are no contradictions in them.

Nobody has the right to say that if this were true, it would not be a serious charge because a leader has the right to threaten those who refuse to swear fealty to him; he is unlike other Muslims. This is not true

because there is no excuse whatsoever for anyone to burn the house of Fatima (sa), of the Commander of the Faithful (as) and of al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as)... Can a heinous act such as this be really justified?!

Rather, one will be acting contrarily to the consensus of the Muslims had such consensus been confirmed and proven. It is accurate and fixed when the Commander of the Faithful (as) and those who refused to swear the oath of allegiance (to Abu Bakr) from among those who sought shelter at Fatima's house entering into it and not getting out of it.

What "consensus" is this while the Commander of the Faithful (as) refused to endorse it, let alone others who refused to swear the oath of allegiance to him? Anyone, such as al-Juba'i and others who say so clearly, demonstrates his animosity and fanaticism because the burning incident took place prior to the (forced) swearing of allegiance by the Commander of the Faithful (as) and the group of men who were then at his house (who were likewise forced to swear it). They claimed such "consensus" after such swearing, that is, when those who refused to swear did indeed swear it (though against their will). What we have rejected is surely contemptible.<sup>7</sup>

Shaikh al-Tusi has also said the following:

Al-Balathiri, quoting al-Mada'ini from Maslamah ibn Muharib from Sulayman al-Tamimi from Abu 'Awn, says: "Abu Bakr sent ("Umar) to Ali (as) requiring him to swear the oath of allegiance to him, but he refused, and also refused with him a number of others. Fatima (sa) met "Umar at the door and said to him, 'O son of al-Khattab! Are you really going to burn my house door?!' He said, 'Yes.<sup>8</sup> And this is stronger than what your father had brought (!).' Ali went and swore it."

This same incident is narrated by Shi'as from many venues. It is interesting that it is also narrated by the mentors of Sunni narrators of *hadith*, but they used to narrate what would protect them. They may be alert to some of what they narrate, so they stop narrating it. Yet what "choice" can one have when he sees his house door set to fire so that he would be forced to swear fealty?<sup>9</sup>

#### **4. Abul-Salah al-Halabi (d. 474 A.H.)**

The great *faqih* and gifted orator, Shaikh Abul-Salah al-Halabi, may Allah have mercy on him, has said the following:

They harmed Ali (as) because he did not go along with what they wanted him to do, and they were rough when they spoke to him and went too far in their threats to him. They brought firewood to burn his house and assault it with men without his permission. They brought him tied-up, thus forcing his wife, daughters, women and kinsfolk from Banu Hashim and others to go out of their homes. They surrounded him with their unsheathed swords and promised to kill him if he refused to swear fealty to them.<sup>10</sup>

## **5. 'Abd al-Jalal al-Qazwini (d. cir. 560 A.H./1165 A.D.)**

In his book, wherein he rebutted a book titled *Al-Naqd* (in response to “Some Rafidi Scandals”), ‘Abd al-Jalal al-Qazwini has said the following:

“... They claim that “Umar hit Fatima (sa) in the stomach, killing a fetus in her womb whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin...” The answer to it is this: This is true. Shi’as and Sunnis have recorded it in their respective books. But it has been narrated about the Chosen One S that he had said, “Actions are judged according to intentions.” If “Umar’s purpose was to secure the oath of allegiance from Ali (as), and he did not intend to cause any miscarriage, and perhaps “Umar did not know that Fatima (sa) was behind the door, his killing of her fetus will be by mistake, unintentionally. Even if he had killed him deliberately, he was not an infallible man. Allah is the One Who will judge him, not we, and nothing more can be said. Allah knows best about His servants’ actions, inward thoughts and what they hide.

“And they say that “Umar and ‘Othman prohibited Fatima (sa) from weeping over her father..., etc.”[11](#)

And he says in another place, ““Umar tore up Fatima’s property title of Fadak, hitting her in the stomach, and they prohibited her from weeping over her father.”[12](#)

We say that the excuse provided for killing al-Muhsin is truly odd and strange in the face of the huge torrent of narratives clearly proving that he (“Umar) knew that she was behind the door (where she spoke to him prior to being hit by him). Some narratives have even stated that he hit her fingers when she held the door trying to stop him from opening it, telling him that she had no veil on her so that he would not enter her house... He is the one who kicked her, slapped her and hit her, and so did Qunfath and others.

So, we do not know how one can regard the killing of al-Muhsin as “accidental” except that he has a different concept of the word “accident” which none conceives except the writer of those words and their originator...

No matter what, I have cited these paragraphs which he stated because they clearly indicate that she was hit, insulted, her door was broken and privacy forcefully invaded. Her miscarriage is a fact agreed on by all, and it is used by a party as an argument (against the other party), yet the latter party searches for justifications for it no matter how trivial and cold-hearted.

Had we endorsed such kinds of justifications, we shall never come across one criminal on the face of earth to indict and punish. Perhaps some people may be able to find an excuse for Satan. Al-Ghazali tried to relieve Satan of some of the blame, thus sparing him people’s curses, when he said, “There is no harm in remaining silent rather than cursing him.”[13](#)

Yes! He said exactly so as he attempted to clear Yazid, the man who was accustomed to drinking wine

and to debauchery, from his crime of killing al-Husayn (as). So, read on and be amazed. As long as you live, Time will show you wonders!

## **6. Yahya ibn Muhammed al-'Alawi al-Basri**

The Mu'tazilite scholar (who died in 656 A.H./1258 A.D.), quoting his mentor Abu Ja'far Yahya ibn Muhammed al-'Alawi al-Basri, says the following,

If you say that Fatima's house was entered by force and her veil was uncovered, all for the sake of "safeguarding" the Islamic system, and so that dissension might not spread and a group of Muslims would commit a mutiny, and it was done for the sake of a unified front..., you will be told that the veil of 'Aisha was likewise removed, and the privacy of her camel litter was invaded, and there was dissension among the Muslims, even the blood of Muslims was shed...; so, why do you regard invading the privacy of 'Aisha as one of the greatest sins which required an eternal abode in the fire of Hell, and people should dissociate themselves from the culprit, and that doing so is the strongest indication of conviction, while invading the privacy of Fatima (sa) and entering her house by force and collecting firewood at her door and threatening her with burning... as the most firm indication of conviction and the best to firm the foundations of Islam, something whereby Allah granted dignity to the Muslims, putting out thereby the fire of dissension, while both instances are invasions of privacy and both veils were sacred?!

What we would like to say to you is this: The sanctity of Fatima (sa) is greater; her status is more lofty; safeguarding her sanctity is done seeking nearness to the Messenger of Allah S is more binding on every Muslim, for she is part of him, part of his flesh and blood and is not like a wife from outside his family with whom he S has no kinship. How can 'Aisha or anyone else be compared with Fatima (sa) while all Muslims, those who love her and those who do not, recognize that she is the Head of the Women of Mankind?

How can we nowadays safeguard the Prophet's name with regard to his wife and safeguard the name of Umm Habibah with regard to her brother, while the *sahaba* did not uphold the safeguarding of the family of the Messenger of Allah S?![14](#)

## **7. Sayyid Ibn Tawus (d. 664 A.H./1266 A.D.)**

The pious and ascetic scholar and the man with dazzling blessings, namely Sayyid Radiyy ad-Din Ali ibn Tawus, uses the argument of what happened to al-Zahra' (sa) against followers of the other sects. He narrates to them the same narratives which they themselves have fixed in their references as facts, as we referred to in other places. One of those matters with which he obligated them are the following statements:

Some of this has already been documented in their *Sihah* books when they discussed how they joined Ali (as) in lagging behind rather than swearing the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, and when they discussed their famous meeting (at the *saqifa* of Banu Sa'ida), when Abu Bakr and "Umar wanted to

burn Ali (as) and al-'Abbas with the fire.[15](#)

One of the interesting narratives is mentioned by al-Tabari and al-Waqidi, as well as those who wrote precious works and who have already been referred to above, how they went to the house of Fatima, Ali, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) with the intention to burn it. Where do such despicable actions stand when we review the continuous recommendations of their Prophet, Muhammed S, on behalf of these individuals?![16](#)

One of the most interesting of all is their deliberate intention to burn Ali and al-'Abbas (as) with the fire; the writer said in this regard, "He brought a torch of fire in order to burn them both, and he was already inside the house of Fatima." In another narrative, they had with them at home al-Zubayr, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and a group of Banu Hashim who all boycotted and cast doubts about the legitimacy of the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr.

Why do folks who are endowed with sound minds from among the Muslims see how Muhammed S was, in their regard, the very best of creation, his Prophetic Mission the most significant, and swearing the oath of allegiance to him the most important oath. He was sent to people who worshipped idols and stones and to other atheists and disbelievers. Yet we never heard that he considered as *halal*, nor did he ever permit the burning of anyone who was reluctant to acknowledge his being a Prophet and, hence, refused to swear the oath of allegiance to him?!

To what extent did enmity to and jealousy of his family and negligence of his will reach, so they confronted such a family and threatened to burn it?

All rational people have testified that thus was the oath of allegiance to him: Forcing people to swear the oath of allegiance runs contrarily to each and every divine legislation, to the ways of the Prophets, and to customs. Ibn Mas'ud has narrated saying, "We were in the company of the Messenger of Allah S when we passed by a colony of ants, and there was a fire. The Prophet S objected to it by saying, 'Nobody should ever use a norm of torment [burning] which is the sole prerogative of Allah Almighty.'" 'Abd al-Mahmud said, "Since when are the family of the Prophet S less important than ants?!" How did they dare to say that they would torment them by a torment used by Allah, i.e. the fire?! By Allah! These issues are the most serious of all times.[17](#)

As for Ali (as), you have already come to know what happened to him, how he was deprived of his status and right to be the caliph, and how they went as far as burning him with the fire and violating his privacy.[18](#)

Ibn Tawus continues to say that the man (Abu Bakr) was not satisfied with all of that till he sent "Umar to the door of Ali (as) and Fatima (sa), who had with them al-'Abbas and a number of Banu Hashim, and they were all busy mourning the demise of Prophet Muhammed S and with his funeral. He ordered them to be buried if they did not come out to swear the oath of allegiance to him as mentioned by the author of *Al-'Iqd al-Farid* in Vol. Four of his book as well as by a group of those whose narratives nobody

doubts.

It is something which no previous prophet ever had to endure, nor any *wasi*, nor anything as cruel as committed by kings who were well known for their cruelty, nor even unbelieving kings. None of these had ever burnt those who refused to swear the oath of allegiance to them, nor did they even threaten anyone to be killed or beaten.

It has never come to our knowledge that any of such kings had a prophetic or divine authority. These folks had a sultan who made them rich after they had been impoverished, who rid them of humility and harm, who led them to happiness in the life of this world and in the hereafter, conquering through his Prophetic Mission the lands of the mighty ones. Then he died, leaving among them one single daughter from his own loins. He said to them, “She is the Head of the Women of Mankind” and two children with her and by her who were seven years old or younger. They rewarded such a Prophet S, or such a king, the subjects that they were, when they brought fire to burn his grandsons and daughter who were in the status of his own soul and heart.[19](#)

He also argues with others telling them that al-Waqidi has stated that “Umar went to Ali (as) leading a group of men including Assad ibn al-Hassan (the correct name is actually al-Hudayr) and Salamah ibn Aslam al-Ashhali. He said to Ali (as) and to the others, “Come out or else we shall burn you...”[20](#)

## **8. Nasir ad-Din al-Tusi (d. 672 A.H./1273 A.D.)**

## **9. ‘Allama al-Hilli (d. 726 A.H./1326 A.D.)**

## **10. Shams ad-Din al-Isfarayani (d. 826 A.H./1423 A.D.)**

## **11. Al-Qawshaji (d. 879 A.H./1474 A.D.)**

Researcher-imam Nasir ad-Din al-Tusi, namely Muhammed ibn Muhammed ibn al-Hassan, may Allah have mercy on his soul, has said, “... And he [Abu Bakr] sent people to the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as) when he refused to swear the oath of allegiance to him (to Abu Bakr), so he set it ablaze while Fatima (sa) and a number of Banu Hashim were still inside it.”[21](#)

‘Allama al-Hilli added to the above saying, “And they took Ali (as) out by force, and with him al-Zubayr was inside the house. They broke the latter’s sword and took him out of the house. Fatima (sa) was beaten, and she miscarried a son named Muhsin.”[22](#)

Making a list of criticisms against the second caliph, he also said, “... He intended to burn the house of the Prophet.”[23](#)

We would like to note here that neither Shams ad-Din al-Isfarayani, in his book titled *Tasdid al-’Aqa’id fi Tajrid al-Qawa’id*, which is also known as the ancient *Sharh*, nor al-Qawshaji denies what the researcher al-Tusi has said, nor did they cast any doubt about the authenticity of the narrative as they

used to do in other instances. Rather, he was satisfied with justifying Ali's lagging behind rather than swearing the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr by saying that he had an excuse, or something like that, so refer to it.<sup>24</sup>

This is so despite the fact that al-Qawshaji is so well known for his fanaticism, he is described by major Imamite scholars as a "stubborn and relentless fanatic."<sup>25</sup>

In another place, the same author says the following about him: "This, coming from him, is an outrageous arrogance, purely and simply so, because their lagging behind his (Usamah's) army, and his allegiance to him, is famous to both parties and is mentioned by them both. Nobody can refute it. When someone is honest and fair, you should surrender to him and obey him. Since al-Qawshaji is a stubborn arrogant man, a stubbornly argumentative man, he stopped him, as was his habit in all subjects, when providing an answer is impossible for him."<sup>26</sup>

There are other subjects wherein he discusses this characteristic of al-Qawshaji.<sup>27</sup>

## **12. The Virtuous al-Miqdad (d. 826 A.H./1423 A.D.)**

The orator, *faqih* and researcher, namely Shaikh al-Miqdad al-Sayyari, has said, "When Ali (as) and a group of others refused to swear the oath of allegiance (to Abu Bakr), and when they sought shelter at the house of Fatima (sa), rejecting such fealty, he (Abu Bakr) sent her 'Umar who hit her on her stomach, causing her to miscarry a son named Muhsin. He also lit a fire in order to burn their house although Fatima (sa) and a group of Banu Hashim were all inside it. They took Ali (as) out by force, handcuffing him with his own sword's suspenders. Nobody should say that only the Shi'as narrate this incident, for someone may say so only to scandalize them. We say that this incident has been narrated by way of the opponents. It is narrated by al-Balathiri and Ibn 'Abd al-Birr as well as by others. It is supported by what he ('Umar) had said at the time of his death: 'How I wish I left the house of Fatima alone and did not expose it (to invasion of privacy).'"<sup>28</sup>

I say that the major scholars of the sect, as I have proven by quoting them, insist on using this incident as an argument against their opponents, taking it for granted. The inability of others to get rid of the charge or to clear themselves of it clearly proves that denying or doubting it is not acceptable, even unreasonable. This is so in the presence of the huge number of texts and in the consecutive reporting of it by the Infallible Ones (as), something which leaves no excuse to anyone to deny it, nor does it permit any explanation or justification whatsoever.

## **13. Al-Bayadi al-'Amili**

The 'allama, *faqih* and alert orator, Shaikh Zayn ad-Din al-Bayadi, has said, "Among them is narrated by al-Balathiri. It is well known by the Shi'as that he ('Umar) squeezed Fatima (sa) behind the door till she miscarried Muhsin although everybody knew what her father (S) had said, that is, 'Fatima is part of me; whoever hurts her hurts me.'"<sup>29</sup>

They have said that 'A'isha was not the daughter of Muhammed S. When her camel was hamstrung, the Muslims' zeal to safeguard her was prompted out of respect for her husband (as), so heads and hands flew and flung around her. But the greatest abomination that happened to Fatima (sa) is much greater than a hamstrung camel. So, why did the Muslims not demonstrate the same zeal for her?"[30](#)

He also said, "He (Abu Bakr) and 'Umar sought to burn the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as) when he and a group of others refused to swear the oath of allegiance to him. Al-Waqidi has mentioned this incident and so has al-Tabari in his Tarikh as well as Ibn 'Abd Rabbih."[31](#)

#### **14. al-Gharawi and al-Harawi**

The *faqih* and orator, Muhammed ibn Ali ibn Abu Jumhur al-Ahsa'i, has said the following in his debate with the virtuous al-Harawi which took place in 878 A.H./1473 A.D. which is quite famous among the followers of the sect:

He ("Umar) wanted to burn the house of Fatima (sa) when Ali (as) and some members of Banu Hashim refused to swear the oath of allegiance to him [to Abu Bakr, his friend]. He squeezed her with the door till she miscarried her fetus. Qunfath hit her with his sword because he was ordered by him till she died while the pain of whips and their marks were still on her side, in addition to other such abominable acts. He said: "This is what you narrate through your own venues and it cannot be used as a proof against others." I said, "As regarding her inheritance..., etc. As regarding the incidents of the burning, the whipping and the miscarriage, some of them are narrated by you (Sunnis) as the 'intention to burn.' They are narrated by al-Tabari, al-Waqidi and Ibn Qutaybah."[32](#)

#### **15. The Researcher al-Karki (d. 940 A.H./1533 A.D.)**

Al-Karki, the researcher, has said, "... And he sought his oath of allegiance by insulting him and threatening to burn his house. He gathered firewood at the door and Fatima (sa) miscarried Muhsin. This is why they mentioned, as our folks have narrated, how they enticed the others to oppress them and to seek revenge against them."[33](#)

He also said, "... In addition to forcing him [i.e. forcing Ali (as)] to do it [to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr], putting a great deal of pressure on him, threatening him to burn his house, gathering firewood at his door, as narrators and historians, such as al-Waqidi and others, have narrated..., etc."[34](#)

He has also said, "Transmitters of events and those who have recorded history, and one who reviews the pages of biography books, will confirm that when 'Umar swore the oath of allegiance to his friend, and Ali (as) lagged behind and did not swear it, he went to the house of Fatima (sa) to ask Ali (as) to swear it, and he spoke rudely to him, ordering firewood to be brought in order to burn the house and everyone inside it. Inside it were: the Commander of the Faithful (as), his wife (sa) and sons (as) in addition to those who joined them, including al-Zubayr and a group from Banu Hashim."[35](#)

He also said, “Had the Messenger of Allah (S) recommended both of them to take charge, appointing them as the imams, he would never have permitted them to penalize anyone who refused to swear fealty to them by burning him even if he were among the least in status among the people and the most insignificant individual. So, what would you do when they both claimed caliphate..., etc?”<sup>36</sup>

## **16. Ibn Makhdam (d. 976 A.H./1568 A.D.)**

The knowledgeable scholar, Abu al-Fath ibn Makhdam al-’Arbashahi, has said the following in Chapter 11 of his *Sharh* while discussing the caliphate of Abu Bakr: “... He also sent people to the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as) when he refused to swear the oath of allegiance, setting it ablaze while the Head of the Women of Mankind was still inside it.”<sup>37</sup>

## **17. The Martyred Judge al-Tasatturi (d. 1019 A.H.)**

The happy martyr and gifted speaker and judge, Nur-Allah al-Tasatturi, has mentioned some texts proving the miscarriage of that fetus and the attempt to burn the house of al-Zahra’ (sa) and other issues. He said, “... What would you say about an issue wherein the chests of the Muhajirun are pressed, their swords broken, the swords are unsheathed against the chiefs of Muslims, and the desire to burn the houses of their masters and other things? How can it not be compulsion had the hearts not been blind, the visions not blinded, for the hearts that are inside the chests are indeed blinded..., etc.?”<sup>38</sup>

## **18. Ibn Sa’d al-Jaza’iri (d. 1021 A.H./1612 A.D.)**

The great researcher, Shaikh ‘Abd al-Nabi ibn Sa’d al-Jaza’iri, one of the greatest scholars of his time, may Allah have mercy on him, has said, “And one of them is that he sent people to the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as) on his refusal to swear fealty and ordered fire to be lit, invading the privacy of his house. In it was Fatima (sa) and a group of Banu Hashim. They took Ali (as) out and hit Fatima (sa), so she miscarried.”<sup>39</sup>

He continues to say, “How so since he (Ali (as)) went out against his wish [to swear fealty to Abu Bakr], following a prolonged argument, the setting of the house ablaze, the hitting of the Infallible Lady daughter of the Chosen One (S) and the annoying of the purified masters?”<sup>40</sup>

## **19. Al-Hurr al-’Amili (d. 1104 A.H./1693 A.D.)**

Discussing Abu Bakr and how he was unfit for being a caliph, the great traditionist, outspoken *faqih* and author of the leading modern encyclopedia titled *Wasa’il al-Shi'a*, has said the following: “Among them is that he and ‘Umar sought to burn the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as) when he and a group of others refused to swear the oath of allegiance to him. This is documented by al-Waqidi in his narrative, by al-Tabari in his *Tarikh* and by Ibn ‘Abd Rabbih in a slightly different wording.”<sup>41</sup>

He has delivered numerous different speeches on the level of debating and deriving evidence which we see no need here to quote. Whoever wishes may review them.[42](#)

## **20. 'Allama al-Majlisi (d. 1110 A.H./1698 A.D.)**

The very highly informed mentor of Islam, our master Shaikh Muhammed Baqir (al-Majlisi II), while dealing with the criticism against the caliphate of "Umar ibn al-Khattab, says, "... The 17th criticism is that he intended to burn the house of Fatima (sa) although inside it was the Commander of the Faithful (as), Fatima (sa), al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as). He threatened and harmed them." [43](#)

Al-Majlisi has also said, "It became clear from transmissions agreed on by us and by them is that "Umar attempted to burn the house of Fatima (sa) as ordered by Abu Bakr, or with his acquiescence, while inside it were the Commander of the Faithful, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), threatening and harming them despite their lofty status with Allah and with the Messenger of Allah S, something which nobody denies except those who renege from the Islamic faith." [44](#)

## **21. Abul-Hassan al-Fattani**

The honorable Abul-Hassan al-Fattani, one of the greatest scholars of his time[45](#), has said,

Now we are going to explain some of what she underwent after the demise of the Messenger of Allah S: the aggression and disrespect to which she was exposed, so much so that she openly complained about it, demonstrating her agitation and anger with those who assaulted her. She even willed that they should be banned from participating in her funeral. No fair person can overlook these facts if he keeps in mind her merits which we have listed. Their committing such atrocities clearly indicts them. First of all, they did not care about the *ahadith* of the Prophet S honoring her, then they did not fear the Wrath of Allah and of His Messenger S.

The Prophet S wept as his end came close, so he was asked about the reason. He said, "I weep over my offspring and how the evil ones from among my nation will fare with them. It is as though I see Fatima (sa) being oppressed after me, calling out: 'Father! Father!' while none from among my nation helps her."

This statement of the Prophet S is a reference to what I will state in the 4th essay of Part II which will clearly explain how "Umar and a group of men with him, according to orders issued by Abu Bakr, assaulted the house of Fatima (sa) in order to get Ali (as) and al-Zubayr out to swear the oath of allegiance to him. It will also explain how she was deprived of her Fadak property, of her share of the *khums* tax as well as the confiscation of whatever remained of her inheritance from her father (S).

There is no harm in mentioning a summary of the same here:

A group of writers, whose names will be mentioned in the said topic as well as the books wherein they

wrote, including al-Tabari, al-Jawhari, al-Qutaybi, al-Sayyuti, Ibn ‘Abd Rabbih, al-Waqidi and others have all stated that “Umar ibn al-Khattab and a group of men with him, including Khalid ibn al-Walid, were ordered by Abu Bakr to go to the house of Fatima (sa), where Ali (as) and al-Zubayr and others were. They knocked at the door, and “Umar called on them, but they refused to go out. When Fatima (sa) heard their voices, she cried out as loudly as she could,

وَأَبْتَاهُ! وَرَسُولُ اللهِ!

*Wa Abatah! Wa Rasool-Allah!*

*O Father! O Messenger of Allah S! What have we suffered after you at the hands of the son of al-Khattab and the son of Abu Quhafah!”*

According to the al-Qutaybi [Ibn Qutaybah] and a group of others narrate it, when they refused to come out, “Umar ordered firewood to be brought then said, “By the One Who holds in His hand “Umar’s life, you shall have to come out or else I shall burn all of you!” Someone said to him, “But Fatima (sa) is inside it!” He said, “So what?”

According to the narrative of Ibn ‘Abd Rabbih, Fatima (sa) said to him, “O son of al-Khattab! Did you come to burn our house?” He said, “Yes.”

According to the narrative of Zaid ibn Aslam, she said to him, “Are you going to burn Ali (as) and my children?!” “Umar said, “Yes, by Allah, unless they come out and swear the oath of allegiance (to Abu Bakr).” Then when those in the company of “Umar heard Fatima (sa) crying, most of them dispersed weeping, leaving behind “Umar and a group of men with him who took Ali (as) away.

Most of them narrate saying that “Umar entered the house by force and took out al-Zubayr then Ali (as).

People assembled looking on. Fatima (sa) screamed and wailed, and she came out to the door of her chamber and said, “How swift you are in assaulting the house of the family of your Prophet S!”

In his book titled *Al-Milal wal Nihal*, al-Sharistani has said that the ruling system transmitted saying that “Umar hit the stomach of Fatima (sa) on that day till she miscarried al-Muhsin, and that he [“Umar] was shouting, ‘Burn it and everyone inside it!’”

According to the narratives of Ahl al-Bayt (as), “Umar pushed the door in order to force his way in while Fatima (sa) was behind it. The door hit her stomach, causing her to miscarry her son, al-Muhsin. She died on account of that pain.

Some writers narrate saying that “Umar hit her with the whip on her back. In another narrative, it was Qunfath who hit her as ordered by “Umar.

(Here the author, may Allah have mercy on him, summarizes what is recorded in the book of Sulaym ibn Qays and also cites what Imam al-Hassan (as) said to al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah then adds saying:)

Suffices what they mentioned of what is proven as a fact that her house, which was one of the houses of the Prophet S. It was entered by force without her permission. She was hurt. They especially mention the threats of burning. Even *Al-Isti'ab* and the book titled *Al-Ghurar* as well as others cite Zaid ibn Aslam as saying, "I was one of those who carried firewood with 'Umar to the house of Fatima (sa)."

Some such incidents will be discussed in the 4th essay of Part II.[46](#)

It has been proven how both men ["Umar and Abu Bakr] harmed Fatima (sa) exceedingly on the day when Ali (as) was pressured to swear the oath of allegiance (to Abu Bakr), including how her house was assaulted, how people entered it by force without permission, even how she was hit, how firewood was gathered in order to burn it, how she was harmed when Fadak was confiscated from her, how she was deprived of her inheritance, and how her share of the *khums* was cut off, in addition to other such incidents.

Proven also is how she argued with those who harmed her, how she was angry with those who stood in her way till she died in the aftermath. We, Imamite people, do not doubt any of these incidents because of the consecutively reported incidents transmitted by her offspring from among the Purified Imams (as) as well as by the righteous companions who have recorded the same in their books, nay, even by the admission of a group of others as well, as we shall discuss some in addition to what we have already quoted of what those who chose to follow a path different from theirs have recorded.

As for the opponents, their case is truly odd in this regard because all the ancient ones (as) from among their traditionists have recorded all what we have quoted from them, providing many details. Most of such details are available in their respected reference books, even in their reliable *Sihah* books, especially both *Sihah* books (of al-Bukhari and Muslim) which, according to them, come next to the Book of Allah in reliability as they themselves have described.

You have already come to know how clear such texts are, including clarity in the way wherein she was dismissed and how she was deprived of her inheritance, of Fadak, of her *khums*, and how she remained angry because of all this till she died. Add to this how these texts agree to what is a known fact that she was buried secretly, how the whereabouts of her grave are unknown, so much so that they till know dispute with one another regarding its location.

He deleted from the text which he copied anything which clearly showed that she continued to be angry (till her death). He even cheated in the way he copied the texts in order to give the impression that there was no anger involved. He overlooked the fact that such an action is futile in the face of strong and numerous objections which are reliable and proven.

What is clearly concluded from the narratives of these folks and which we have cited from their own books their agreement with what the Imams (as) from among her offspring, as well as others, have

narrated. The latter is this: The causes of the harm did not concentrate on one single issue. Rather, they were numerous.

They kept exposing her to one harm after another since the death of her father S and till she died. The list includes: the assault on her house door, entering her house by force and without her permission, and all what we have already mentioned, even if we suppose that they did not commit anything other than their insults on the day when Ali (as) was required to swear the oath of allegiance.[47](#)

## **22. Al-Khawajoo'i al-Mazandarani (d. 1173 A.H./1759 A.D.)**

The virtuous researcher, al-Khawajoo'i al-Mazandarani, one of the greatest Shi'a scholars of his time, has said the following in his dissertation titled *Tariq al-Irshad* (the venue of guiding):

As regarding their harming Fatima (sa), this is quite well known and is recorded in the Sunnis' books. Abu Bakr sent some men to the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as) when he refused to swear the oath of allegiance, setting it ablaze although Fatima (sa) and a group of Banu Hashim were inside it. They took Ali (as) out and hit Fatima (sa), so she miscarried.

As regarding Qawshaji's answer wherein he says that Ali (as) did not lax from swearing the oath of allegiance due to dissension or mutiny but to an excuse and to something which had then taken place, this answer prompts one to ask this question: "Had the matter been so, what prompted him to set his house to fire and take him out by force?!"

Had this delay (in swearing fealty to Abu Bakr) been for something which necessitated lagging behind others in swearing fealty, the issue, as you have come to know, is the necessity to neglect doing so, and the valid excuse, in that case, there is no justification at all for getting him out by force or for setting his house on fire.

But if it was not like that, then how can anyone like Ali (as) lag behind others in swearing fealty without an excuse rather than swear the oath of allegiance to an imam whom he regarded as fit for the imamate? "Whoever dies without having sworn the oath of allegiance to his Imam dies the death of the days of *jahiliyya*," according to the narration of this *hadith* (of the Prophet (S)) by Ibn Maymun ibn Mahran.[48](#)

What was the fault of Fatima (sa) in all of this, and for what did she deserve to be beaten till she miscarried?!

After too much arguing, his statement proves what is stated because when he (al-Qawshaji) accepted the authenticity of the narrative, he did not cast any doubt about it. It clearly indicates that they beat Fatima (sa) daughter of the Prophet of Islam (S) severely. Before harming her, they had already hurt the feelings of the Messenger of Allah (S)... "[49](#)

Having mentioned a host of what Sunnis have narrated in paying tribute to Ahl al-Bayt (as) and to Lady al-Zahra' (sa), he said, "How do the Sunnis report these narratives then they oppress her, hurt her, confiscate what belongs to her, attribute telling lies and making a false claim to her, breaking her rib and causing her to miscarry...?"<sup>50</sup>

He also wrote saying, "So look, O wise, rational and terse reader, how the Sunnis narrate such narratives then oppress her, confiscate what belongs to her, break her rib and cause her to miscarry! So let one who imitates be forewarned... Our own sources indicate that she was an Infallible Lady, a truthful and a pleased martyr."<sup>51</sup>

### **23. Shaikh Yousuf al-Bahrani (d. 1186 A.H.)**

The great *faqih* and traditionist, Shaikh Yousuf al-Bahrani, has said the following by way of debating: "... And he took him out by force, leading him like any commoner, then gathered firewood at his house in order to burn it and everyone inside it... He hit al-Zahra' (sa) till she miscarried. And he slapped her till she fell face-long, hitting the ground with her forehead, and she audibly expressed her agony and grief."<sup>52</sup>

### **24. Shaikh Ja'far Kashifal-Ghita' (d. 1228 A.H./1813 A.D.)**

The renown *imam*, Shaikh Ja'far Kashifal-Ghita' Senior, trying to prove that the invalidity of the caliphate of Abu Bakr, has said, "... And one of them is the burning of the house of Fatima al-Zahra' (sa) while Ali, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) were all inside it, and when Ali (as) refused to swear the oath of allegiance to him (to Abu Bakr). This has been transmitted from among the Sunnis by a group which includes al-Tabari, al-Waqidi, Ibn Hazamah from Zaid ibn Aslam and Ibn 'Abd Rabbih, one of their distinguished scholars, and it is narrated in *Kitab al-Mahasin* and in others."<sup>53</sup>

Listing his criticisms against the second caliph, he also said, "... And one of the them [“Umar’s norms of conduct] is how he went to the house of the Prophet S and his progeny with the intention to burn it."<sup>54</sup>

### **25. Sayyid 'Abdullah Shubbar (d. 1243 A.H./1827 A.D.)**

The knowledgeable scholar, Sayyid 'Abdullah Shubbar, has said the following among his criticisms of "Umar ibn al-Khattab: "He intended to set the house of Fatima (sa) ablaze while the Commander of the Faithful, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) were all inside it, and he hurt them."<sup>55</sup>

### **26. Sayyid Muhammed Qulli al-Naishapuri al-Hindi (1189 – 1260 A.H./1775 – 1844 A.D.)**

The father of the author of '*Abaqat al-Anwar*', says the following in his book titled *Tashyeed al-Mata'in wa Kashf al-Dagha'in* تشييد المطاعن و كشف الضغائن wherein he recorded scores of pages containing many texts the translation of which is as follows:

"Umar threatened to burn Fatima (sa). He gathered firewood around her house as is narrated by trustworthy Sunni narrators and the most prominent of their reliable authorities and the greatest of their traditionists from the early generations and from the latter ones, such as al-Tabari, al-Waqidi, 'Othman ibn Abu Shaybah, Ibn 'Abd Rabbih, Ibn Jirayah, the compiler of *Al-Mahasin* and *Anfas al-Jawahir*, Ibn 'Abd al-Birr ibn Abu Shaybah, al-Balathiri, Ibn 'Abd al-Birr (author of *Al-Isti'ab*), Abu Bakr al-Jawahiri, author of the book titled *Al-Saqifa*, judge Jamal ad-Din Wasil, Abul-Fida' Isma'il ibn Ali ibn Mahmud (author of the book titled *Al-Mukhtasar*), Ibn Qutaybah, Ibrahim ibn 'Abdullah al-Yamani al-Shafi'i (author of the book titled *Al-Iktifa'*), al-Sayyuti (author of the book titled *Jam' al-Jawami'*, Mulla Ali al-Muttaqi (author of *Kanz al-'Ummal*) and Shah Wali-Allah al-Dahlawi..., etc.<sup>56</sup> Then he cited what these scholars have written. He also said that the burning of the house of al-Zahra' (sa) has been narrated by many writers and is supported by authentic proofs recorded in Sunni books.

## **27. Sayyid Muhammed al-Mahdi al-Husayni al-Qazwini (d. 1300 A.H./1883 A.D.)**

The renowned scholar and great sign, Sayyid Muhammed ibn al-Mahdi ibn al-Hassan al-Husayni al-Qazwini, one of the greatest scholars and major authorities of *taqlid* of his time, has said,

"They were not satisfied with all of this, so they harassed Ali (as) and Banu Hashim with regard to their oath of allegiance, setting the houses of the family of Muhammed S ablaze. Fatima (sa) tried to act as a barrier between both parties but, when she could not stop them, and when she opened the door, they squeezed her with it, breaking her rib and causing her to miscarry al-Muhsin. They broke the sword of al-Zubayr in the house's courtyard and handcuffed Ali (as) with the suspenders of his sword, leading him as they would a stray camel as indicated by al-Tabari, al-Waqidi, Ibn Jirayah (in his book titled *A-Nur*), Ibn 'Abd Rabbih, the compiler of the book titled *Nafa'is al-Jawahir* by Ibn Sahlawayh (who was inspector at public schools in Baghdad), "Umar ibn Shaybah and others. They did all of this after Ali (as) had refused for six months to swear the oath of allegiance (to Abu Bakr). Add to this how they deprived Fatima (sa) of the inheritance of her father, how they confiscated Fadak and all its orchards, how they rejected her argument and the testimony of Ali and both al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) as well as Umm Ayman, how they tore to pieces her property title from the Trusted Prophet (S) who was sent as mercy to the whole world, in addition to other behavior whereby they hurt Fatima (sa). They harassed her because she was mourning the death of her father (S) till she had to resort to *bayt al-ahzan*, how she fell sick because of their treatment of her, how she was buried secretly, even her death while still being depressed as al-Bukhari and others clearly indicated. So, all of this is so well proven...etc."<sup>57</sup>

## **28. Sayyid al-Khunsari (d. 1313 A.H./1895 A.D.)**

The renown 'allama and researcher, Sayyid al-Khunsari, may Allah have mercy on him, has said the following commenting on the *ahadith* relevant to "Fatima (sa) is part of me; whatever harms her harms me": "... So I do not know who hurt her, who hated her, who caused her to miscarry, who caused her to wail, who slapped her on her face, who hit her on the side..."<sup>58</sup>

## **29. Ayatollah al-Muzaffar (d. 1375 A.H./1955 A.D.)**

'Allama Ayatollah Shaikh Muhammed Hassan al-Muzaffar has said,

"As a whole, suffices the evidence of the intention to bury what is narrated by a host of their scholars, even the narrative of one of them, especially since it is consecutively reported by the Shi'as. Nobody is in need of the narratives of al-Bukhari or Muslim or their likes who were exhausted by their enmity towards the Progeny of Muhammed S and loyalty to their foes, who always courted their kings and rulers and enjoyed a good reputation among their commoners."<sup>59</sup>

He also said, "Anyone who is acquainted with how rough "Umar was as he dealt with the Prophet by word and by action does not find it hard to believe that he was the one behind the burning incident as well as the events that preceded it." He added saying, "Yet the burning, had it taken place (completely), is not greater than usurping the caliphate (from Ali (as))."<sup>60</sup>

## **30. Sayyid Sharafud-Din (d. 1377 A.H./1952 A.D.)**

In a previous chapter, I mentioned a little about the arguments presented by the renown imam, Sayyid 'Abd al-Husayn Sharafud-Din [al-Musawi] to others: threats to burn, which is proven by consecutively reported facts<sup>61</sup>, and that Abu Bakr invaded the privacy of Fatima's house and other issues, so we do not wish to be repetitive.

## **31. Martyr [Muhammed-Baqir] al-Sadr (d. 1400 A.H./1980 A.D.)**

The great Islamic thinker and happy martyr, Sayyid Muhammed Baqir al-Sadr, may Allah shower him with His mercy, has written saying, "'Umar is the one who assaulted your house (O Fatima!) which the Prophet (S) made as a center for his call. He ("Umar) assaulted the family of Muhammed S in their own home and set it ablaze or almost."<sup>62</sup>

He also said, "Such was the conduct of the caliph and his friends towards Ali (as) which reached the degree of cruelty that "Umar ordered to burn his house even though Fatima (sa) was still inside it. This means that Fatima (sa) or others from her offspring had no sanctity that would stop someone from treating them as someone would treat Sa'd ibn 'Abadah when he ordered people to kill him."<sup>63</sup>

<sup>1.</sup> Judge `Abd al-Jabbar, Al-Mughni, Vol. 20, p. 335. Sayyid al-Murtada, Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, p. 110. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balaghah, Vol. 16, p. 271.

<sup>2.</sup> Judge `Abd al-Jabbar, Al-Mughni, Vol. 2, p. 337. Sayyid al-Murtada, Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, pp. 119–20.

<sup>3.</sup> Sayyid al-Murtada, Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, pp. 119–20.

<sup>4.</sup> Ibid., Vol. 4, pp. 110–13. We, in this regard, would like to say to Sayyid al-Murtada, may Allah be merciful to him, "How similar today to yesterday!"

<sup>5.</sup> Ibid., Vol. 4, p. 117.

<sup>6.</sup> Ibid., Vol. 4, p. 120.

<sup>7.</sup> Talkhis al-Shafi., Vol. 3, pp. 156–57.

<sup>8.</sup> Ibid., Vol. 3, p. 76. Sayyid al-Murtada, Al-Shafi, Vol. 3, p. 241. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 389, 411 and the

- footnote on p. 268. Al-Balathiri, *Ansab al-Ashraf*, Vol. 1, p. 586. Refer also to the following references: Ibn `Abd Rabbih, *Al-`Iqd al-Farid*, Vol. 4, pp. 259, 260. Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi, *Kanz al-`Ummal*, Vol. 3, p. 149. Al-Riyad al-Nadira, Vol. 1, p. 167. *Al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar*, Vol. 1, p. 156. Al-Tara`if, p. 239. *Tarikh al-Khamis*, Vol. 1, p. 178. *Nahj al-Haqq*, p. 271. *Nafahat al-Lahut*, p. 79. *Al-`Awalim*, Vol. 11, pp. 602, 408. Ibn Hamzah, *Al-Shafi*, Vol. 4, p. 174.
9. *Talkhis al-Shafi*, Vol. 3, p. 76.
10. *Taqrib al-Ma`arif*, p. 233.
11. The previous paragraphs are translated from *Al-Naqd* by `Abd al-Jalal al-Qazwini, p. 298.
12. *Ibid.*, p. 302.
13. *Ihya' `Ulum ad-Din*, Vol. 3, p. 125 (published by Dar al-Ma`rifa).
14. Ibn Abul Hadid, *Sharh Nahjul-Balagha*, Vol. 20, pp. 16–17.
15. *Al-Tara`if*, p. 274.
16. *Ibid.*, p. 245.
17. *Al-Tara`if*, pp. 245–46.
18. *Ibid.*, p. 195.
19. *Kashf al-Mahajja*, pp. 120–21.
20. *Al-Tara`if*, pp. 238–39. *Al-Tasatturi, Ihqaq al-Haqq*, Vol. 2, p. 370.
21. Al-Tusi, *Sharh Tajrid al-A`tiqad* (included in *Kashf al-Murad*), p. 402. *Nahj al-Haqq*, pp. 271–72.
22. *Kashf al-Murad*, pp. 402–03.
23. *Nahj al-Haqq*, pp. 275–76.
24. Al-Qawshaji (d. 879 A.H./1474 A.D.), *Sharh al-Tajrid*, pp. 482–83 (ancient edition).
25. Al-Khawajoo`i, *Al-Rasa`il al-l`iqadiyya*, p. 409.
26. *Ibid.*, p. 412.
27. Refer to pp. 471 and 473 of the previous reference.
28. Al-Lawami` al-Ilahiyya fil Mabahith al-Kalamiyya, p. 302.
29. *Al-Sirat al-Mustaqim*, Vol. 3, p. 12.
30. *Ibid.*, Vol. 3, p. 13.
31. *Ibid.*, Vol. 2, p. 301.
32. Refer to pp. 47–48 of the debate between al-Gharawi and al-Harawi which was published in 1397 A.H./1977 A.D.
33. *Nafahat al-Lahut*, p. 130.
34. *Ibid.*, p. 65.
35. *Ibid.*, p. 78.
36. Refer to the previous reference.
37. *Miftah al-Bab*, p. 199, edited by Dr. Mahdi Muhaqqiq.
38. *Ihqaq al-Haqq*, Vol. 2, p. 374.
39. Al-Imama, p. 81 (manuscript). A photocopy of it is available at the library of the Center for Islamic Studies.
40. Refer to the previous reference.
41. *Ithbat al-Hudat*, Vol. 2, p. 368.
42. Refer to pp. 334, 361, 376, 377 of the previous reference.
43. Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 31, p. 59.
44. *Ibid.*, Vol. 28, pp. 408–09.
45. *Mir`at al-Anwar* (published as an Introduction to *Tafsir al-Burhan* by Sayyid Hashim al-Bahrani). *Lu`lu`at al-Bahrain*, p. 107.
46. *Diya` al-`Alamin* (manuscript), Vol. 2, pp. 60–64.
47. *Ibid.*, Vol. 2, pp. 96–97.
48. *Al-Rasa`il al-l`iqadiyya*, p. 446.
49. *Ibid.*
50. Al-Khawajoo`i al-Mazandarani, *Tariq al-Rashad* (of the dissertations of taqlid), p. 465.
51. *Al-Rasa`il al-l`iqadiyya*, p. 301.

- [52.](#) Refer to Al-Hada'iq al-Nadira, Vol. 5, p. 180.
- [53.](#) Kashf al-Ghita', p. 18.
- [54.](#) Ibid.
- [55.](#) Haqq al-Yaqin, pp. 187–88.
- [56.](#) Tashyeed al-Mata'in, Vol. 1, pp. 433–34 and scores before and after these pages all full of proofs and quotations. This book was written as a rebuttal to the book titled Al-Tuhfa al-Ithna `Ashariyya by al-Dahlawi.
- [57.](#) Al-Sawarim al-Madiya (manuscript), p. 56. A photocopy of it is available at the library of the Center for Islamic Studies in Beirut.
- [58.](#) Rawda al-Jannat, Vol. 1, p. 358.
- [59.](#) Dala'il al-Sidq, Vol. 3, p. 91.
- [60.](#) Ibid., pp. 89–90.
- [61.](#) Al-Musawi, Al-Muraja`at [translated into English by Yasin T. al-Jibouri as Al-Muraja`at: A Sunni-Shi'i Dialogue; its first edition was published in 1414 A.H./1995 A.D. by Imam Husayn Foundation of Beirut Lebanon and its second edition was published in 1422 A.H./2001 A.D. by Ansariyan Publications of Qum, Islamic Republic of Iran], p. 357 (Arabic edition printed in 1413 A.H./2000 A.D. by Intisharat Uswa, Qum, Islamic Republic of Iran). – Tr.
- [62.](#) Al-Sadr, Fadak fil Tarikh, p. 26 (published in Arabic in 1987 A.D. by the International House for Printing, Publishing and Distributing).
- [63.](#) Ibid., p. 91.

## Al-Muhsin In Texts And Legacies

### **Did al-Muhsin Die Young?!**

It is obvious that the subject of killing al-Muhsin embarrasses the scholars and dignitaries of a huge proportion of the Muslims who hold allegiance to those who played a part in what al-Zahra' (sa) had to go through. Yes, it will embarrass them as well as those who follow or support them. And it will embarrass them in the fields of debates and deduction with others.

For this reason, they felt that they had to find a solution for this problem which they faced. Some of them tried to deny the existence of al-Muhsin altogether. "Umar Abu al-Nasr has said, "Historians have disputed among themselves about his existence, as we have already stated, although al-Ya'qubi and al-Mas'udi as well as others stress his existence."<sup>1</sup>

He goes on to add, "Some historians deny the existence of al-Muhsin, but others, such as al-Mas'udi and Abul Fida', emphasize it."<sup>2</sup>

You may find few and rare allusions like this which we would not like to trace. Since this denial is considered as a serious risk, and there is no sufficient justification to insist on it, there is also no room to deny that an attack was launched on the house of al-Zahra' (sa) then the Commander of the Faithful Ali (as) was taken out by force from that house, the eyes were directed to other attempts of a different nature aiming at distancing the ghost and means of violence from reaching the mentality of ordinary

people.

One of the manifestations of such a trend is that a group of people has preferred to remain silent with regard to mentioning the name of al-Muhsin with the ability to seek an excuse for such silence by saying that it touches on discussing who from among Fatima's offspring lived and who did not. But all of this was never sufficient to reap the anticipated results.

The existence of al-Muhsin among the offspring of al-Zahra' (sa) is like a fire lit in a lighthouse or the sun at midday. It is not easy to ignore or deny it. Some people resorted to distancing the allegations from those who caused the killing of this oppressed fetus and dared to insult the Head of the Women of Mankind. They did so in a clever way which implies a denial and invalidates the story that a miscarriage took place by denying the subject altogether.

So, they claimed that Muhsin was born during the lifetime of the Prophet (S); therefore, the Prophet (S) named him "Muhsin." And they mention a way to support their claim which does not attach any insult to Ali (as). Their narrative demonstrates the insistence of Ali (as) three times on naming the newborn "Harb," but the Prophet (S) insisted otherwise. This gives the impression that Ali (as) used to live the mentality of a warrior who thought of nothing other than war...! The apparent unintentional result is that Ali (as) used to kill people during the wars and he had such an urge to kill them.

The issue, then, was not the issue of a sacrifice, of a scapegoat, of the desire to serve the creed as prompted by the divine obligation, so people's hatred towards Ali (as) would become quite justified.

No matter what, Ibn Shahr Ashub al-Mazandarani regarded the claim that al-Muhsin was born during the lifetime of the Prophet (S) as a lowly claim put forth by bad people prompted by stubbornness. Says he, "A group of bad people were carried away by stubbornness to the extent that it said that Abu Bakr was more courageous than Ali (as), that Marhab was killed by Muhammed ibn Maslamah, that Thu al-Thudayya was killed in Egypt, and that during the mission to convey Surat Bar'a'a, Abu Bakr was in charge over Ali (as). Some may even say that it was Anas ibn Malik who conveyed it, that Muhsin was born by Fatima (sa) during the lifetime of the Prophet (S) in a miscarriage, and that the Prophet (S)..., etc. Anyone who makes falsehood his conveyance will let his foot slip from the Straight Path: "And Satan made their deeds fair-seeming to them, so he kept them back from the Path, though they were endowed with intelligence and skill" (Qur'an, 29:38). Some openly expressed their enmity to Ali (as).<sup>3</sup>

Thus, it becomes quite obvious that these folks who attempted to coordinate the miscarriage of al-Muhsin with the others (who are responsible for it) being above doubt, being too pious and too great to commit such a crime. They, therefore, decided that there was, undoubtedly, a miscarriage, but it took place during the lifetime of the Prophet (S).

Then comes the narrative, which they label as authentic, to underscore such a conclusion by saying,

"Imam Ahmed has said the following in his *Musnad* which is also narrated by others through authentic

*isnad*: We have been told by Yahya ibn Adam who has said that we have been informed by Isra'il from Abu Ishaq from Hani ibn Hani from Ali (as) saying, “When al-Hassan (as) was born, I named him Harb. The Messenger of Allah S came and said, ‘Show me my son! What have you named him?’ I said to him that I named him Harb. He said, ‘No. His name is Hassan (as).’ When my son al-Husayn (as) was born, I named him Harb. The Messenger of Allah S came and said, ‘Show me my son! What have you named him?’ I said to him that I named him Harb. He said, ‘No. His name is Husayn (as).’ When the third son was born, the Messenger of Allah S came and said, ‘Show me my son! What have you named him?’ I said to him that I named him Harb. He said, ‘No. His name is Muhsin.’ Then he said, ‘I have named them after the sons of Harun (Aaron): Shabar, Shubayr and Mushbir.’”<sup>4</sup>

## **What the Foremost Tabi'in Have Said**

Others admitted the implication of this narrative, taking it for granted in their books and works. Here, we would like to cite what we can of their statements which all admit the existence of al-Muhsin but claim that he “died young”. We would like to point out that the claim that he “died young” does not necessarily obligate them to admit that he died during the lifetime of the Prophet (S). Rather, it contradicts what others have said, i.e. that he died as a result of a miscarriage.

Such texts are the following:

1. Al-Tabari and Ibn al-Athir have said, “... It has been mentioned that she conceived by him another son called Muhsin and that he died young.”<sup>5</sup>
2. Yunus has said that he heard Ibn Ishaq saying, “Fatima (sa) gave birth by Ali (as) to Hassan, Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*.”<sup>6</sup>
3. Ibn Ishaq has said, “Fatima (sa) gave birth by Ali to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin who died *young*.”<sup>7</sup>
4. Husam ad-Din Hamad ibn Ahmed al-Mahalli has said, “Al-Hassan and al-Husayn, peace and blessings of Allah with them<sup>8</sup>, and al-Muhsin who died *young*.”<sup>9</sup>
5. Al-Qastalani has said, “She gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*.”<sup>10</sup>
6. Ibn Hazm, of Andalusia, has said, “Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) married Fatima (sa), so she gave birth to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and al-Muhsin. Al-Muhsin died *young*.”<sup>11</sup> He also said, “These all, with the exception of al-Muhsin, left offspring. Al-Muhsin left no offspring. Al-Muhsin died *very young* at the time of his birth.”<sup>12</sup>
7. Al-Badkhashani al-Harithi has said, “As regarding her sons, she gave birth to three males: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin. As regarding al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), their discussion will

follow. As regarding al-Muhsin, he died as a *suckling infant*.”[13](#)

8. Al-Muhibb al-Tabari has said, “Al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) we have dealt with in detail in *Manaqib Thawi al-Qurba*, and they left behind offspring. As for Muhsin, he died young. Their mother is Fatima.”[14](#)

9. Al-Muhibb al-Tabari has also said, “Others (other than al-Layth ibn Sa’d) have said that she gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*. She also gave birth to Umm Kulthum.”[15](#)

10. Ibn al-Murtada has said the following about Fatima (sa): “She gave birth to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin who died *young*.”[16](#) He also said, “His sons by Fatima (sa) are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin, then Muhammed ibn al-Hanafiyya.”[17](#)

11. Al-Manawi has said, “Al-Layth has said that she gave birth by him to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin, who died *young*, and Umm Kulthum.”[18](#)

It seems that the phrase “died young” is added by al-Manawi since others have quoted what al-Layth has said without mentioning this phrase.

12. Ibn Fidaq, while listing the children of the Commander of the Faithful by Fatima (as), has said: “Al-Hassan son of Ali and al-Husayn son of Ali (as), and al-Muhsin son of Ali, who died *young*.”[19](#)

13. Al-Barri al-Talmasani has said, “Fatima (sa) gave birth by Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin who died *young*.”[20](#)

14. Ibn al-Athir has counted him among the *sahaba*! Said he, “Muhsin son of Ali son of Abu Talib son of ‘Abd al-Muttalib (as) al-Qarashi al-Hashimi. His mother is Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S.” Then he mentions how the Messenger of Allah S chose a name for him, adding, “Al-Muhsin died young. This is transmitted by Abu Musa.”[21](#)

15. Al-Asqalani has said the following about al-Muhsin: “Ibn Fathan corrected what Ibn ‘Abd al-Birr has said about him, saying, ‘I think he died young.’”[22](#) We do not know why he did not say that he thought he died in a miscarriage.

16. Ibn Qudamah al-Maqdisi has said, “Muhsin ibn Ali ibn Abu Talib (as): We do not know *anything* about him except in a tradition narrated by Hani ibn Hani from Ali (as).” Then he mentions the story of how al-Muhsin was originally named Harb then the Prophet (S) changed his name adding, “It seems that he died as a *young child*.”[23](#)

He also said, “She gave birth by Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Umm Kulthum and Zainab. It is said that she gave birth to a third son whom the Messenger of Allah S named Muhsin saying, ‘I named them after the sons of Aaron: Shaba, Shubayr and Mushabbar.’”[24](#)

17. "She gave birth by Ali, may Allah be pleased with both of them, to our masters al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), our Lady Zainab and our master Muhsin who died *young*."[25](#)
18. Ibn al-Jawzi has said, "... Ibn Ishaq added the name of Muhsin to the list of the children of Fatima (sa) by Ali (as) saying that (Muhsin) died *young*."[26](#)
19. Al-Sakhawi has said, "For the fourth (daughter of the Prophet S), namely al-Zahra' (sa), by Ali (as), and who did not marry anyone else, are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Umm Kulthum and Zainab; Muhsin died *young*."[27](#)
20. Al-'Amiri has said, "A Chapter dealing with her children and the date of their birth; they are: Hassan and Husayn (as), Muhsin, Umm Kulthum and Zainab," till he comes to say, "He S named the sons of Fatima (sa), i.e. Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin, after the sons of Aaron son of 'Imran (Amram). Muhsin died *young*."[28](#)
21. Al-Shiblinji has said, "As regarding her sons, may Allah be pleased with her, they are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin who died *young*."[29](#)
22. "Others (other than al-Layth ibn Sa'd) have said that she gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*."[30](#)
23. Ibn Kathir has said, "The first wife whom Ali, may Allah be pleased with him, married was Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S. He married her after the Battle of Badr, so she gave birth by him to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and, it is said, also Muhsin who died *young*."[31](#)
24. 'Imad ad-Din Isma'il Abul-Fida' has said, "Born to him by her are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and Muhsin, who died *young*, and Zainab..., etc."[32](#)
25. Al-Dalabi has quoted Ahmed ibn 'Abd al-Jabbar quoting Yunus ibn Bakir saying, "I have heard Ibn Ishaq saying that Fatima (sa), daughter of the Messenger of Allah S, gave birth by Ali to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*. She also gave birth to Umm Kulthum and Zainab."[33](#)
26. Ibn Qutaybah has said, "She gave birth by Ali (as) to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin and Umm Kulthum,"[34](#) adding, "As for Muhsin son of Ali (as), he died *young*."[35](#)
27. Al-Nuwayri has said, "It has been said that she gave birth to a son named Muhsin who died *young*."[36](#)

In another place, he said, "She, may Allah be pleased with her, gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*." He also said, "All the male children of Ali, may Allah be pleased with him, were five: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and Muhsin about whom there is a controversy... [and the girls Zainab and Umm Kulthum.]"[37](#)

28. Sibt ibn al-Jawzi has said, “Ibn Ishaq has added the name of Muhsin, who died *young*, to the list of Fatima’s children by Ali.”[38](#)

29. Al-Qastalani has said, “She gave birth by Ali to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin who [the latter] died *young*.”[39](#)

30. Sibt ibn al-Jawzi has said, “This testifies to what al-Zubayr ibn Bakar has said, that is, that Fatima (sa) conceived by Ali (as) with another son whose name is Muhsin and who died *young*.”[40](#)

31. Al-Qanduzi has said, “She gave birth to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin. Muhsin died *young*.”[41](#)

32. Ibn Sayyid an-Nas has said, “So she gave birth by him to Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin, who died *young*, Umm Kulthum and Zainab, etc.”[42](#)

33. Khawand Ameer has said, “Ibn Ishaq and al-Layth ibn Sa’d, may Allah be pleased with them, have both narrated saying that Fatima (sa) had two other children. Their names are: Muhsin and Ruqayya. They both died *young*.”[43](#)

34. Al-Ya’qubi has said, “He (Ali (as)) had four children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, who died *young*...”[44](#)

35. Al-Maqdisi has said, “As regarding Muhsin son of Ali (as), he died *young*.”[45](#)

36. Ibn KhayrAllah al-”Omari al-Musilli (the public speaker) has said, “... And it is stated in *Al-Tabyeen* that she gave birth to a third son besides al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), so the Prophet (S) named him Muhsin.”[46](#)

## **Mentioning al-Muhsin Without Mentioning the Reason for His Death**

It is quite obvious that many scholars have included the name of al-Muhsin among the offspring of Ali (as) and Fatima (sa) without pointing out to his fate. This does not negate the fact that he was miscarried. As regarding those who did not count him among Ali’s sons, their doing so does not mean that they denied his existence because they intended to discuss only those who lived from among the offspring, peace with both of them.

We would like to list some of them here:

1. Al-Fayrooz-Abadi has said, “The name Shabbar is like Baqqam; Shubayr is like Qomayr, and Mushabbir is like Muhaddith: sons of Aaron, peace with him. It is said that the Prophet (S) coined after them the names of al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and al-Muhsin.”[47](#)

2. Al-Zubaidi has said, “It is said that the Prophet (S) coined the names of his sons al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and al-Muhsin, after theirs (the sons of Aaron). Thus is written in some narratives.”

Ibn Barri has said, “I have found Ibn Khalawayh explaining these names. He says that Shabar and Shubayr and Mushabbar are the sons of Aaron, peace with him. In Arabic, they mean Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin respectively.”

3. He went on to say, “According to them did Ali, may Allah be pleased with him, name his sons: Shabar, Shubayr and Mushabbar, meaning Hassan and Husayn (as) and Muhsin.”[48](#)

4. Abu ‘Abdullah Muhammed ibn Ishaq ibn Mandah al-Isbahani, may Allah have mercy on him, has said the following in *Kitab al-Ma’rifa*: “Ali (as) married Fatima (sa) in Medina one year after the Hijra. About a year thereafter, she gave birth by him to al-Hassan then al-Husayn (as), then al-Muhsin, then Zainab al-Kurbra, then Umm Kulthum al-Kubra.”[49](#)

5. Ibn al-Athir, quoting Ibn ‘Abbas, has said in one of his discussions, “Fatima (sa) was the wife of Ali (as). She gave birth by him to Hassan and Husayn (as), Muhsin and Zainab.”[50](#)

6. Al-Layth ibn Sa’d is quoted as having said, “Ali (as) married Fatima (sa) who gave birth by him to Hassan and Husayn (as), Muhsin, Zainab and Umm Kulthum.”[51](#)

7. Al-Dhahbi has said, “Ibn ‘Abd al-Birr has said that he (Ali (as)) married her (Fatima (sa)) after the Battle of Uhud. She gave birth by him to al-Hassan and al-Husayn, Muhsin, Umm Kulthum and Zainab.”[52](#)

8. Al-’Asqalani has listed him among the *sahab* saying, “Al-Muhsin son of Ali (as) ibn Abu Talib ibn ‘Abd al-Muttalib, of Banu Hashim, a grandson of the Prophet.”[53](#) then he cited what Ibn Fathan has written about him.

9. Shams ad-Din, namely Muhammed S ibn Tolon, has said, “Ali (as) had the following children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Umm Kulthum..., etc.”[54](#)

10. Al-Nawawi has said, “Ali, may Allah be pleased with him, had the following children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Umm Kulthum al-Kubra and Zainab al-Kubra. All of them were by Fatima (sa).”[55](#)

11. Al-Diyar Bakri has said, “Al-Layth ibn Sa’d is quoted as saying that Ali (as) married Fatima (sa), so she gave birth by him to Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Zainab..., etc.”[56](#)

12. Ibn Kathir has said, “... ‘So she gave birth by him to Hassan (as), so he is called ‘Abul-Hassan,’ and al-Husayn (as), who was martyred in Iraq.’ I said: ‘And Muhsin...,’ etc.”[57](#)

13. Ibn Hassan has said, “Ali (as) ibn Abu Talib had twenty-five children. Among his sons are: al-

Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin. He also had Umm Kulthum..., etc.”[58](#)

14. “Ali’s children by Fatima (sa) were three males: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin, and two daughters: Zainab and Umm Kulthum. All of them left offspring with the exception of Muhsin.”[59](#)

15. “He had fourteen males; among them were: al-Hassan, al-Husayn and Muhsin, all by Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S).”[60](#)

16. Al-Layth ibn Sa’d is quoted as having said, “Ali (as) married Fatima (sa), so she gave birth by him to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Zainab, Umm Kulthum and Ruqayya.”[61](#)

17. In the book titled *Bughyat al-Talib*, it is stated that his children, may Allah be pleased with them, were fourteen sons and eighteen daughters according to the scholars’ consensus. There is a difference of opinion regarding the males whom some count as twenty and regarding the females whom some count as twenty-two. As regarding the males, they are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn and Muhsin...”[62](#)

18. Muhammed ibn al-Shahnah has said, “It was born for Ali (as) of the males fourteen and of the females many. By Fatima, may Allah be pleased with her, he had al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin and Zainab.”[63](#)

19. Al-Khawarizmi has said, “For Ali (as), she gave birth to al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), al-Muhsin, Umm Kulthum al-Kubra..., etc.”[64](#)

20. “Umar Abu al-Nasr has said, “Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S was blessed by her husband, Imam Ali ibn Abu Talib (as), with five children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) al-Muhsin, Zainab al-Kubra (the elder) and Umm Kulthum al-Kubra.”[65](#)

21. Al-Mazandarani has said, “He [Ali (as)] gave her [Fatima (sa)] these *kunyats*: mother of al-Hassan and of al-Husayn (as), mother of al-Muhsin, mother of the Imams, and mother of her father..., etc.”[66](#)

22. Shaikh ‘Abbas al-Qummi has said, “... Al-Mas’udi states in *Muruj al-Dhahab*, Ibn Qutaybah in *A/-Ma’arif*, and Nur ad-Din al-’Abbas al-Musawi al-Shami in *Azhar Bustan al-Nazirah* have all said that Muhsin is counted among the offspring of the Commander of the Faithful, peace with him.”[67](#)

23. In a tradition about Imam al-Sadiq (as) wherein he mentions the call from the depths of the ‘Arsh, he says, “... And how good your grandsons, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), are, and how good your fetus, al-Muhsin...!”[68](#)

24. In a text citing the Torah, it is stated: “Eliya (Ali (as)), father of the grandsons (of the Prophet S), al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and of Muhsin, one of his offspring. And I made for your brother Aaron Shubar, Shubayr and Mushabbir.”[69](#)

## **Deleting Muhsin's Name without Saying Why**

1. The author of *Al-Kafi*, *Al-'Idda*, citing Ahmed ibn Muhammed from his grandfather from Abu Busayr from Abu Abdullah (as) from his forefathers (as), has said, "The Commander of the Faithful (as) has said, 'On the Day of Judgment, if you chose no name for your children born during miscarriages, when the latter meet you, each will ask his father, 'Why did you not choose a name for me?' The Messenger of Allah (S) chose a name for Muhsin even before his birth." [70](#)
2. "Some people say that the Commander of the Faithful (as) had the following children by Fatima (sa): al-Hassan and al-Husayn, al-Muhsin, a stillborn, and Umm Kulthum..., etc." [71](#)
3. Kamal ad-Din ibn Talhah, the Shafi'i scholar, may Allah have mercy on him, has said, "Chapter 11: His Offspring: Be informed, may Allah support you with a Spirit from Him, that people have varied in their views regarding the number of his offspring, males and females. Some of them list a large number, including the miscarriage without excluding lineage, and others discounted that, seeing no need to count him, so each statement came according to what he took into consideration." [72](#)
4. Al-Sabban has said, "Fatima (sa) gave birth by Ali (as) to six children, three males and three females. The males are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn and al-Muhassin [thus differing from others' spelling of al-Muhsin]. The females were: Zainab..., etc. As for al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), they both left offspring, numerous and good, and they will both be discussed later. As for al-Muhassan, he died in a miscarriage." [73](#)
5. Ibn Abul-Thalj has said, "The following children were born for the Commander of the Faithful (as) by Fatima (sa): al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and Muhsin who died in a miscarriage." [74](#)
6. "And some other people have added to the above al-Muhsin as a brother of al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and who died in a miscarriage." [75](#)
7. Al-Tibrizi, listing the offspring of the Commander of the Faithful (as), has said, "Al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and al-Muhsin who died in a miscarriage." [76](#)
8. Al-Mamqani has said, "... She gave birth by him to Hassan and al-Husayn (as), Muhsin, Zainab and Umm Kulthum. She miscarried Muhsin." [77](#)
9. Al-Tibrizi has said, "Fatima (sa) had five children, males and females: al-Hassan and al-Husayn, peace with them both, Zainab al-Kubra (senior), and Zainab al-Sughra (junior) who is nicknamed Umm Kulthum, may Allah be pleased with her. Also she gave birth after the demise of the Prophet, greeting and salutation on him, to another son in a miscarriage whom the Messenger of Allah S had already named, even as he was in his mother's womb, as Muhsin." [78](#)

10. Ibn al-Sabbagh, the Malikite scholars, has said, “They have stated that among them is Muhsin, a brother of al-Hassan and al-Husayn, peace with them both, whom the Shi’as mention, and that he died in a miscarriage.”<sup>79</sup>

11. Al-Safari, the Shafi’i scholar, has said, “Al-Hassan (as) is the first of Fatima’s five children: al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), al-Muhsin, who died in a miscarriage, Zainab al-Kubra and Zainab al-Sughra.”<sup>80</sup>

12. Shaikh al-Mufid has said, “... Among the Shi’as are those who state that Fatima (peace and blessings of Allah be on her), had a miscarriage after the demise of the Prophet (S) of a boy whom the Messenger of Allah (S) had named, even as he was in his mother’s womb, Muhsin.”<sup>81</sup>

13. Close to this text is what is mentioned by al-Fadl ibn al-Hassan al-Tibrisi.<sup>82</sup>

14. This is also mentioned by ‘allama al-Hilli in his own summary of *Al-Irshad*.<sup>83</sup>

15. Also close to this text is stated by Ibn al-Batriq<sup>84</sup>; so, you may refer to it.

16. Jamal ad-Din, the Harawi traditionist, having listed Muhsin among the children of Ali (as), says, “As regarding Muhsin, he died young, in fact, he died in a miscarriage.”<sup>85</sup>

17. Ibn Talhah has said, “Anyone who lists more (of the offspring of Imam Ali (as)) includes her miscarriage of al-Muhsin.”<sup>86</sup>

18. Ibrahim al-Tarabulsi al-Hanafi says the following in the family tree which he prepared for (caliph) al-Nasar and a copy of which was made for the library of Salah ad-Din (Saladin) al-Ayyubi: “Muhsin son of Fatima (sa) was miscarried. It is also said that he died young, but the truth is that Fatima (sa) did miscarry a fetus.”<sup>87</sup>

19. Al-Hamzawi, the Malikite scholar, has said, “As regarding al-Muhsin, he died in a miscarriage.”<sup>88</sup>

20. Sayyid Mahdi al-Suweej has quoted that particular text from many references including *Manaqib al-Hassan and al-Husayn* (as) by al-Jawhari, from the author of *Jawharat al-Kalam* and from *Al-Anwar* by Abul-Qasim.

#### Referring to the Miscarriage and why

1. It has already been stated that al-Maqdisi attributes the miscarriage of al-Muhsin to the Shi’as who state that it was because “Umar beat al-Zahra’ (sa).

2. He has said, “And among them is what is narrated by al-Balathiri, whose statement is famous among the Shi’a, saying that “Umar squeezed Fatima (sa) behind the door till she miscarried Muhsin despite everyone’s knowledge of her father’s statement: ‘She is part of me; whoever hurts her hurts me.’”<sup>89</sup>

3. ‘Imad ad-Din al-Tabari (one of the 7th century scholars) has said the following: “And they have said that Fatima (sa) miscarried Muhsin because “Umar beat her on her stomach.”[90](#)

4. Sayyid Taj ad-Din Ali ibn Ahmed al-Husayni (one of the four scholars of the 11th Hijri century) has said, “The reason for her death is the beating which she received in the aftermath of which she miscarried the fetus.”[91](#)

Listing the sons of Ali (as), he said, “... And the miscarried son whom the Prophet (S) named ‘Muhsin’ in his own lifetime even prior to birth.”[92](#)

5. Ali ibn Muhammed al-”Omari, the genealogist, has said, “And they did not count Muhsin because he was born dead. Shi’as have reported the incident of al-Muhsin and of how his mother was kicked. I have found some genealogy books referring to al-Muhsin by name without saying anything about such kicking from a venue on which I rely.”[93](#)

6. According to some folks, “And her sons are: al-Hassan and al-Husayn, and al-Muhsin who was miscarried. According to *Al-Ma’arif* of Ibn Qutaybah, al-Muhsin was damaged because of the pressure of Qunfath al-’Adawi.”[94](#)

In another place, he said, “So Fatima (sa) gave birth to al-Hassan, al-Husayn and al-Muhsin whom she miscarried.”[95](#)

7. Ali (as) is also quoted as having said, “... And Muhsin will come [on the Judgment Day], drenched in his blood, carried by Khadija daughter of Khuwaylid and Fatima (sa) daughter of Assad... and Gabriel will announce the name of Muhsin who will say, ‘I am wronged, so redress!’ The Messenger of Allah S will take Muhsin in his hands and raise him to the heavens as he says..., etc.”[96](#)

8. He (as) is also quoted in a tradition as saying, “... And the killer of Fatima (sa), and the killer of al-Muhsin..., etc.”[97](#)

9. He (as) is also quoted as having said, “... So he kicked her with his foot, and she was pregnant by a son named al-Muhsin, causing her to miscarry al-Muhsin.”[98](#)

10. He (as) is also quoted as having said, “And the reason for her death is that Qunfath, slave of the man (Abu Bakr) pinched her with his sword’s scabbard according to his master’s orders, causing her to miscarry Muhsin.”[99](#)

11. In a supplication by Imam al-Rida (as) during the thanks-giving prostration (*sajdat al-shukr*), he says, “... And they both [Abu Bakr and ”Umar] killed the son of your Prophet.”[100](#)

12. Ibn Sa’d al-Jaza’iri has said, “... And they beat Fatima (sa), so she miscarried a fetus.”[101](#)

13. Al-Fattani al-’Amili has said, “... According to narratives told by Ahl al-Bayt (as), ”Umar pushed the

door in order to enter by force, and Fatima (sa) was behind it. The door hit her stomach, so she miscarried her fetus named al-Muhsin.”[102](#)

14. Al-Khawajoo’i al-Mazandarani has said, “... And they hit Fatima (sa), so she miscarried her fetus.”[103](#)

15. He also said, “What was the shortcoming of Fatima (sa), the Purified one, and for what did she deserve to be beaten till she miscarried her fetus?”[104](#)

16. He also said, “... And they broke her rib and caused her to miscarry her son.”[105](#)

17. Shaikh Yousuf al-Bahrani has said, “... and their beating al-Zahra’ (sa) till she miscarried her fetus.”[106](#)

18. Sayyid Muhammed Qulli al-Musawi has detailed this incident, so refer to him.[107](#)

19. The great religious authority, Sayyid Muhammed Mahdi al-Qazwini[108](#), has said, “... And when she opened the door, they pushed it on her, breaking her rib and causing her to miscarry her fetus, al-Muhsin.”[109](#)

20. Sayyid al-Khunsari, discussing al-Zahra’ (sa), has said, “... And who caused her to miscarry her fetus, and who made her loudly wail..., etc.”[110](#)

21. Shaikh al-Tusi has said, “What is well known and regarding which there is no contention among the Shi’as is that “Umar hit Fatima (sa) on her stomach till she miscarried Muhsin, and the incident in this regard is quite famous among them.”[111](#)

22. ‘Abd al-Jalal al-Qazwini has said, ““Umar beat the stomach of Fatima (sa), killing her fetus whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin.”[112](#)

23. Al-Fadil al-Miqdad has said, “He dispatched “Umar to her who beat her on the stomach, causing her to miscarry Muhsin.”[113](#)

24. Al-Bayadi has said, “It is well known among the Shi’as that he (“Umar) squeezed Fatima (sa) with the door, causing her to miscarry Muhsin.”[114](#)

25. Ibn Abu Jumhur has said, “... and how she was squeezed by the door till she miscarried her fetus.” He also said, “As regarding the incident of the burning, the beating, and the miscarriage of the fetus, some of it is quoted from you..., etc.”[115](#)

26. Al-Karki, the researcher, has said the following protesting against them, “... And how he gathered firewood at the door, and how he caused Fatima (sa) to miscarry Muhsin...”[116](#)

27. Al-Tasatturi, the judge, has stated some proofs about the miscarriage, so refer to what he has

said.[117](#)

28. Al-Husayni has said, “... So they rushed towards the door, pushing it in her direction, and she was pregnant, causing her to miscarry a son whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin.”[118](#)

29. Al-Mas’udi has said, “... And they pressed the door against the Head of the Women of the World till she miscarried Muhsin.”[119](#)

30. Al-Nizam is quoted as having said, “Umar hit the stomach of Fatima (sa) on the day of the swearing of allegiance [to Abu Bakr] till she miscarried the fetus, al-Muhsin, in her womb.”[120](#)

31. Ibn Abul-Hadid, the Mu’tazilite scholar, has transmitted the Shi’as saying that “Umar pressured her between the door and the wall, so Fatima (sa) called out, “O Father! O Messenger of Allah S!,” causing her to miscarry.”[121](#)

32. Al-Nu’mān, the judge, has said, “... So they beat her, hence her miscarriage.”[122](#)

33. Mughamis al-Hilli has said:

*Having miscarried because of a blow she received,*

*She passed away as her property remained seized.*[123](#)

34. Shaikh al-Hurr al-Amili has composed the following lines:

*Five are her sons: Husayn, Hassan, Zainab and Umm Kulthum*

*And Muhsin, miscarried when “Umar opened the door as known.*

He goes on to say the following about the cause of her death:

*She soon miscarried her fetus and remained*

*Till death mourning him, moaning, she stayed.*[124](#)

35. Al-Isfahani, the researcher, has said:

*In the fetus of glory there is something that*

*Causes the insides to bleed;*

*Can they really hide what is already known?*

*The door, the wall and the blood testify*

*As witnesses from which nothing can hide:*

*The oppressor committed against her fetus a crime*

*So the mountains, from her anxiety, are undermined.*[125](#)

36. In a narrative transmitted about the Prophet (S), it is recorded that “Her rib was broken, and she miscarried her fetus,” till he comes to say, “Lodged forever in Your Fire the one who hit her side till she miscarried her son.”[126](#)

37. In her *ziyarat*, it is stated: “... the one whose son was killed.”[127](#)

38. Al-Kaf’ami has said that the cause of her death was her being beaten and subsequent miscarriage.[128](#)

39. Sulaym ibn Qays has said, “... He shoved her, breaking her rib, so she miscarried her fetus.”[129](#)

40. Al-Kanji has added the following to what Shaikh al-Mufid has stated: “He added to what the majority have reported saying that Fatima (sa) miscarried a male after the demise of the Prophet (S) whom the Messenger of Allah (S) had named Muhsin.”[130](#)

41. Al-Maqdisi al-Ardabili has said, “... ‘Umar in person hit her on her stomach, and his slave whipped her on her shoulder. That was the reason for her miscarriage.”[131](#)

42. In a letter from ‘Umar to Mu’awiyah, the first admits the following: “And her pain of childbirth intensified. I entered the house, so she miscarried a son whom Ali called Muhsin.”[132](#)

43. Al-Saduq has transmitted from some mentors the following explanation of the Prophet’s statement to Ali (as): “There is a treasure for you in Paradise”: “This treasure is his son al-Muhsin, the one whom Fatima (sa) miscarried when she was squeezed between both doors.”[133](#)

44. In a narrative from Imam al-Sadiq (as), he said, “... And she was beaten even while being pregnant..., and she miscarried because of such beating... The first in whose regard a judgment will be issued shall be Muhsin son of Ali (as) against his killer, *then* against Qunfath.”[134](#)

45. In another narrative from Imam al-Sadiq (as), he says, “He kicked her in the stomach, hence the miscarriage of Muhsin.” The same narrative also says, “And he kicked the door with his foot till he hit her stomach, and she was six months pregnant with al-Muhsin, causing her to miscarry.” It also states: “... And she was beaten, and her fetus was killed inside her womb... Due to the kick, she suffered from childbirth, and when he slammed the door, she miscarried Muhsin... And Muhsin shall come [on the Day of Judgment] carried by [his grandmothers] Khadija daughter of Khuwaylid and Fatima daughter of Assad... The one unjustly killed (referred to in 81:8 of the Holy Qur'an) is, by Allah, Muhsin...”[135](#)

46. In another tradition from Imam al-Sadiq (as), he says, “And the killing of Muhsin with that kick is surely a greater [sin] and more bitter.”[136](#)

47. Abul-Sa'adat, namely As'ad ibn Abd al-Qahir, has said, "... And they both squeezed Fatima (sa) behind her door till she miscarried al-Muhsin." [137](#)
48. Imam Ali (as) used to supplicate in his *qunut* saying, "... and a fetus which they caused to miscarry, and a rib which they crushed, and a property title which they tore to pieces..." [138](#)
49. In a narrative transmitted by al-Daylami about al-Zahra' (sa), she is quoted as having said, "... And he kicked the door with his foot, slamming it on me, and I was pregnant, so I fell on my face... And childbirth overcame me, so I miscarried Muhsin who was killed without having committed any crime." [139](#)
50. Addressing al-Mughirah, Imam al-Hassan (as) has said to the latter, "You are the one who hit Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S till you caused her to bleed and to miscarry what she had in her womb, thus humiliating the Messenger of Allah S..., etc." [140](#)
51. Imam al-Baqir (as) has said, "And she was big with Muhsin. When the Messenger of Allah S passed away, and when the folks forced their way into her house, taking her cousin, the Commander of the Faithful (as), out by force, and when she was harmed by that man ('Umar ibn al-Khattab), she miscarried a boy..., etc." [141](#)
52. Al-Majlisi I has said, "Due to the beating [of Fatima (sa)], a son named Muhsin was miscarried." [142](#)
53. Al-Majlisi II has said, "They squeezed her behind the door, so she miscarried one whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin." [143](#)
- He also said, "So, she miscarried a fetus whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin." [144](#)
- He also said, "Our narratives have over-flowed, so have their narratives as well, with the incident of how Fatima (sa) was scared till she miscarried what she had in her womb." [145](#)
- He has also said, "And they both squeezed Fatima (sa) behind her door till she miscarried Muhsin." [146](#)
54. Al-Kashani has said, "That beating was the most serious cause of her miscarriage of a son whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin." [147](#)
55. Al-Turayhi has said, "When Khalid ibn al-Walid squeezed her, she miscarried Muhsin." [148](#)
56. The author of the book *Conference of the Scholars of Baghdad* has said, "'Umar squeezed Fatima (sa) between the wall and the door very hard and with cruelty till she miscarried her fetus.' has said, "'Umar squeezed Fatima (sa) between the wall and the door very hard and with cruelty till she miscarried her fetus.'

## **Al-Maqdisi and the Miscarriage of al-Muhsin**

Al-Maqdisi has said, “The grandsons of the Messenger of Allah S are: ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Othman, Ali ibn Abul-‘As, Umama daughter of Abul-‘As, al-Hassan and al-Husayn, Muhsin, Umm Kulthum and Zainab, eight all in all.”[149](#)

He also said, “He has eighteen children, eleven males and seven females. Among them from Fatima (sa) are five: al-Hassan and al-Husayn, Muhsin, Umm Kulthum al-Kubra and Zainab al-Kubra..., etc.”[150](#)

He has been already quoted as having said, “... As for Muhsin son of Ali (as), he perished young.”[151](#)

57. He has also said, “She gave birth to Muhsin; he is the one the Shi’as claim was miscarried because ‘Umar hit her. Many historians are not familiar with Muhsin.”[152](#)

It appears from his statements that:

- 1) Shi’as, generally speaking, say that “Umar hit Fatima (sa), so she miscarried Muhsin.
- 2) He himself counts Muhsin as one of the grandsons of the Prophet (S) and one of the sons of Fatima (sa), saying that he died young as his statements above indicate.
3. His statement that many historians are not familiar with Muhsin, as we indicated, is not quite accurate because these historians pay attention to those who lived rather than to whoever died by miscarriage.

## **Muhsin was miscarried because of Grief for the Demise of the Prophet (S)**

58. ‘Umar Abu al-Nasr has said, “The author of the book titled *Al-Isnad fi Ma’rifat Hujaj-Allah ‘alal ‘Ibad* says that Fatima, may Allah be pleased with her, miscarried al-Muhsin after the demise of the Messenger of Allah S. She may have miscarried him due to her intense grief and anxiety.”[153](#)

I think that the last sentence belongs to “Umar Abu al-Nasr, not to the author of the book titled *Al-Isnad fi Ma’rifat Hujaj-Allah*. (Obviously, the correct titled is *Al-Irshad fi Ma’rifat Hujaj-Allah ‘ala al-’Ibad*, one of the books written by al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy on him).

Nevertheless, it is quite obvious that this is a blatant insult to al-Zahra’ (sa) by saying that she lost patience while facing the destiny of Allah, Glory to Him, to such an extent although she is much more pious and righteous to attribute such impatience to her which reached the extent of jeopardizing the health of her fetus and killing him. She is the patient and persevering woman who said once to the ladies of Banu Hashim, when they gathered to mourn the Prophet S, “Do not wail; take to supplication.”[154](#)

The Messenger of Allah S had admonished Fatima (sa) saying, “If I die, do not scratch your face, nor should you let your hair loose, nor should you wail nor lament.”<sup>155</sup>

Regarding the same occasion, he admonished her thus: “Rely on Allah, and persevere just as your forefathers from among the prophets persevered.”<sup>156</sup>

Al-Zahra’ (sa) was not to go against the command of her father, peace and blessings of Allah with him and his purified progeny, nor can we imagine her going against the Commandments of Allah in obedience to her emotions. But those who harbor mischief, and the vicious ones, tried to depict Fatima (sa) as the woman who lost her patience and was wailing and lamenting and whose impatience reached the extent of killing her fetus and miscarrying him, so much so that someone reported that “She remained, following the death of her father, tying her head with a scarf, very thin, fatigued, weeping, depressed, falling into swoons from time to time and saying to both her sons..., etc.”<sup>157</sup>

Someone else added in another text to the previous statements saying, “And whenever she sniffed his shirt, she would lose consciousness.”<sup>158</sup> This depicts her as violating her father’s instruction not to wail, calling out thus: “O Father! The Garden of Eternity is his reward! O Father! Near the One of the Throne is his abode! O Father! Gabriel used to visit him! O Father! After this day, I shall never see him!”<sup>159</sup>

Add to the above the narrative which they transmit from her maid, Fidda, and other such stuff.

We may interpret this as a justification for getting her out of her house and near her father’s grave. It is to justify prohibiting her from showing her grief which exposes the oppression to which she was exposed and how the Commander of the Faithful (as) was forced to build her “bayt al-ahzan” at al-Baqee’ so that this name may remain forever a document indicting the new oppression and harsh persecution to which she was exposed.

## **Is This Historical “Confusion”?**

59. Al-Maliki, the Shafi'i scholar who died in 377 A.H./987 A.D., may Allah have mercy on him, listing statements by Hisham ibn al-Hakam, has said, “... Abu Bakr passed by Fatima (sa), so he kicked her in the stomach. She miscarried, and that was the cause of her sickness and subsequent death.”<sup>160</sup>

What is well known is that the one who kicked al-Zahra’ (sa) in the stomach was ‘Umar, not Abu Bakr. Perhaps the confusion originated from those who cited Hisham or from al-Maliki himself.

1. ‘Umar Abul-Nasr, Fatima bint Rasul Allah Muhammed (S), p. 94 (Beirut edition).

2. Ibid., footnote of p. 93.

3. Manaqib al Abu Talib, Vol. 1, p. 16.

4. Ahmed, Musnad, Vol. 1, pp. 98, 118. Tarikh Dimashq (in the biography of Imam al-Husayn ↓ edited by al-Mahmudi), p.

18. Al-Sunan al-Kubra, Vol. 6, p. 166 and Vol. 7, p. 63. Tahthib Tarikh Dimashq, Vol. 4, p. 204 from Ahmed, al-Tabrani, Ibn Abu Shaybah, Ibn Jarir, Ibn Haban, al-Hakim and al-Dulabi. Al-Adab al-Mufrad, p. 121. Uṣd al-Ghaba, Vol. 2, p. 18 and Vol. 4, p. 308. Al-Isaba, Vol. 3, p. 471. Al-Tabrani, Vol. 3, pp. 28, 96, 97. Al-Thurriyya al-Tahira, p. 97. Al-Iṣṭi`ab

(referenced in a footnote in Al-Isaba), Vol. 1, p. 369. Nihayat al-‘Arab, Vol. 18, p. 213. Al-Riyad al-Mustataba, p. 293. Tarikh al-Khamis, Vol. 1, p. 418. Muntakhab Kanz al-`Ummal (referenced in a footnote in Ahmed’s Musnad), Vol. 5, p. 108. Mukhtasar Tarikh Dimashq, Vol. 7, pp. 7, 117. Al-Hakim, Mustadrak, Vol. 3, pp. 165–66. Mujma` al-Zawa`id, Vol. 8, p. 52 from al-Bazzar and al-Tabrani in Al-Kabir. The author says, “Ahmed’s sources as well as those of al-Bazzar are the same sources cited in the Sihah book in addition to Hani ibn Hani who is a trusted authority.” al-Dhahbi, Talkhis al-Mustadrak (references in a footnote in Al-Mustadrak) and is referred to as authentic. Thakha’ir al-`Uqba, p. 119 from Ahmed and Abu Hatim. Ansab al-Ashraf (edited by al-Mahmadi), Vol. 3, p. 144; refer to its footnotes. Al-Tabyeen fi Ansab al-Qarashiyyin, pp. 133, 192. Kifayat al-Talib, p. 208. Tathkirat al-Khawass, p. 193. Al-Zarqani, Vol. 4, p. 339. Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya, Vol. 7, p. 332. Taj al-`Arus, Vol. 3, p. 389. Kanz al-`Ummal, Vol. 6, p. 221. Refer also to the biography of Imam al-Hassan عليه السلام from the section which was not printed of Al-Tabaqat al-Kubra of Ibn Sa`d, p. 34. Al-Ihsan fi Taqrib Sihah Ibn Haban, Vol. 15, p. 410. Kashf al-Astar, quoting al-Bazzar’s Musnad, Vol. 2, p. 216. Mawarid al-Zam’an, p. 551 citing Al-Sira al-Halabiyya, Vol. 3, p. 292.

[5. Al-Kamil](#), Ibn al-Athir, Vol. 3, p. 397. Al-Tabari, Tarikh Umam wal Muluk, Vol. 5, p. 153.

[6. Al-Bayhaqi](#), Dala’il al-Nubuwwa, Vol. 3, p. 161.

[7. Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya](#), Vol. 3, p. 346.

[8. Al-Hada’iq al-Wardiyya](#), Vol. 1, p. 52.

[9. Al-Mawahib al-Laduniyya](#), Vol. 1, p. 198.

[10. Jamharat Ansab al-‘Arab](#), p. 16. Refer also to p. 37.

[11. Ibid.](#), p. 37.

[12. Nuzul al-Abرار](#), p. 134.

[13. Al-Riyad al-Nadira](#), Vol. 4, p. 239. Thakha’ir al-`Uqba, pp. 116–17.

[14. Thakha’ir al-`Uqba](#), p. 55. Irshad al-Sari, Vol. 6, p. 141.

[15. Al-Bahr al-Zakhkhar](#), Vol. 1, p. 221.

[16. Ibid.](#), Vol. 1, p. 221.

[17. Ithaf al-Sa’il](#), p. 33.

[18. Lubab al-Ansab wal Alqab wal A`qab](#), Vol. 1, p. 337.

[19. Al-Jawhara fi Ansab al-Imam Ali wa Alih](#), p. 19.

[20. Usd al-Ghaba](#), Vol. 4, p. 308.

[21. Al-Isaba](#), Vol. 4, p. 471.

[22. Al-Tabyeen fi Ansab al-Qarashiyyin](#), p. 133.

[23. Ibid.](#), pp. 91–92.

[24. Tarikh al-Hijra al-Nabawiyya](#), p. 58.

[25. Sifat al-Safwa](#), Vol. 2, p. 9.

[26. Al-Tuhfa al-Latifa fi Tarikh al-Medina al-Sharifa](#), Vol. 1, p. 19.

[27. Refer to Al-Riyad al-Mustataba by al-`Amiri al-Yamani](#), pp. 292–93.

[28. Nur al-Absar](#), p. 147.

[29. Tarikh al-Khamis](#), Vol. 1, p. 279.

[30. Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya](#), Vol. 7, p. 332.

[31. Al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar](#), Vol. 1, p. 181.

[32. Al-Thurriyya al-Tahira](#), pp. 90, 155.

[33. Al-Ma`arif](#), pp. 143, 210.

[34. Ibid.](#), p. 211.

[35. Nihayat al-‘Arab](#), Vol. 20, p. 221.

[36. Ibid.](#), Vol. 18, p. 213.

[37. Ibid.](#), Vol. 20, p. 223.

[38. Tathkirat al-Khawass](#), p. 322.

[39. Refer to Sharh al-Mawahib by al-Zarqani](#), Vol. 4, p. 339.

[40. Tathkirat al-Khawass](#), p. 193.

- [41.](#) Yanabi` al-Mawadda, p. 201. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 539.
- [42.](#) `Uyun al-Athar, Vol. 2, p. 290.
- [43.](#) Habib al-Siyar, Vol. 1, p. 436.
- [44.](#) Al-Ya`qubi, Tarikh, Vol. 2, p. 213.
- [45.](#) Al-Bid' wal Tarikh, Vol. 5, p. 75.
- [46.](#) Al-Rawda al-Fayha' fi Tawarikh al-Nisa', p. 252.
- [47.](#) Al-Qamus al-Muhit, Vol. 2, p. 55. The same is cited on p. 238, Vol. 43, of Bihar al-Anwar.
- [48.](#) Taj al-`Arus, Vol. 3, p. 389. Ibn Manzur, Lisan al-`Arab, Vol. 4, p. 393.
- [49.](#) Al-Bayhaqi, Dala'il al-Nubuwwa, Vol. 3, p. 162. Refer to p. 213, Vol. 43 of Bihar al-Anwar and to p. 480, Vol. 11, of `Awalim al-`Ulum.
- [50.](#) Jam` al-Usul, Vol. 12, pp. 9–10. The author says that this statement is transmitted by Razan and by the author of Diya' al-`Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 4, p. 2.
- [51.](#) Thakha'ir al-`Uqba, p. 55. Irshad al-Sari, Vol. 6, p. 141. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 539.
- [52.](#) Siyar A`lam al-Nubala', Vol. 2, p. 119.
- [53.](#) Al-Isaba, Vol. 3, p. 471.
- [54.](#) Al-A'imma al-Ithna-`Ashar, p. 58.
- [55.](#) Tahthib al-Asma', Vol. 1, p. 349.
- [56.](#) Tarikh al-Khamis, Vol. 1, pp. 278–79.
- [57.](#) Ibn Kathir, Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya, Vol. 5, p. 293.
- [58.](#) Al-Thiqat, Vol. 2, p. 304.
- [59.](#) Al-Ashkhar al-Yamani, Sharh Bahjat al-Mahafil, Vol. 2, p. 138.
- [60.](#) Ma'athir al-Inafa, Vol. 1, p. 100.
- [61.](#) Thakha'ir al-`Uqba. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 539.
- [62.](#) Nur al-Absar, p. 103.
- [63.](#) Rawdat al-Munazir, Vol. 7, p. 195 (cited in a footnote of Al-Kamil fil Tarikh).
- [64.](#) Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 1, p. 272, citing al-Khawarizmi's book Maqta'l al-Husayn ﷺ, p. 83.
- [65.](#) `Umar Abul-Nasr, Fatima (sa) bint Rasul Allah Muhammed (S), p. 93.
- [66.](#) Manaqib al-Abu Talib, Vol. 3, p. 132. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, pp. 16–17. Al-Hidayah al-Kubra, p. 176. Diya' al-`Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, p. 11 from Al-Manaqib and `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 69.
- [67.](#) Muntaha al-Amal, Vol. 1, p. 263.
- [68.](#) Al-Qummi, Tafsir, Vol. 1, p. 128. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 7, pp. 328–39 and Vol. 23, pp. 130–31 and Vol. 12, pp. 6, 7. Tafsir Nar al-Thaqalayn, Vol. 1, p. 348 and Tafsir Al-Burhan, Vol. 1, pp. 328–39.
- [69.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 38, p. 145, citing Al-Manaqib.
- [70.](#) Al-Kafi, Vol. 6, p. 18. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 411. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, pp. 195 and Vol. 10, p. 112 and Vol. 101, p. 118. Refer to Al-Khisal, Vol. 2, p. 634, `Ilal al-Sha'i', Vol. 2, p. 464 and Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, p. 222.
- [71.](#) Tarikh Ahl al-Bayt, quoting statements from Imams al-Baqir ﷺ, al-Sadiq ﷺ, al-Rida ﷺ, and al-`Askari ﷺ, p. 93.
- [72.](#) Al-Irbili, Kashf al-Ghumma, Vol. 2, p. 67, citing al-Shafii'i.
- [73.](#) Is`af al-Raghibin (included in a footnote in Nur al-Absar), p. 86.
- [74.](#) Tarikh al-A'imma (included among precious essays and published by Intisharat Basirati, Qum, Iran), p. 16.
- [75.](#) Al-Irbili, Kashf al-Ghumma, Vol. 2, p. 67 from Kamal ad-Din ibn Talhah, may Allah have mercy on him.
- [76.](#) Taj al-Mawalid, p. 18.
- [77.](#) Tanqih al-Maqal, Vol. 3, p. 82.
- [78.](#) Taj al-Mawalid, pp. 23–24 (published among precious essays by Intisharat Basirati, Qum, Iran).
- [79.](#) Al-Fusul al-Muhimma, p. 126. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 32, p. 90.
- [80.](#) Nuzhat al-Majalis, Vol. 2, pp. 184, 194.
- [81.](#) Shaikh al-Mufid, Al-Irshad, Vol. 1, p. 355. Al-Irbili, Kashf al-Ghumma, Vol. 2, p. 67. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 42, p. 90.
- [82.](#) I`lam al-Wara, p. 203.

- [83.](#) Al-Mustajad min Kitab al-Irshad, p. 140 (published among precious essays by the Basirati Library, Qum, Iran).
- [84.](#) Al-'Umda, p. 30.
- [85.](#) Kitab al-Arba'in, pp. 67–68.
- [86.](#) Matalib al-Su'l, p. 45.
- [87.](#) Sayyid Mahdi al-Suweej, Awlad al-Imam Ali ﷺ, p. 46, quoting p. 6 of the said family tree.
- [88.](#) Refer to the previous reference as cited by Mashariq al-Anwar by al-Hamzawi, p. 132.
- [89.](#) Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, p. 370. Al-Bayadi (may Allah have mercy on him), Al-Sirat al-Mustaqqim, Vol. 3, p. 12.
- [90.](#) Kamil Baha'i (in Persian), p. 309.
- [91.](#) Al-Tatimma fi Tawarikh al-A'imma, p. 28 (1412 A.H. edition), p. 28 (distributed by Dar al-Kitab al-Islami, Beirut, Lebanon).
- [92.](#) Ibid., p. 39.
- [93.](#) Al-Mujdi fi Ansab al-Talibiyyin, p. 12.
- [94.](#) Ibn Shahr Ashub, Al-Manaqib, Vol. 3, p. 407 (published by Dar al-Adwa'). Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, pp. 237, 233. Al-'Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 539.
- [95.](#) Ibn Shahr Ashub, Manaqib al-Abu Talib. Refer also to p. 91, Vol. 42 of Bihar al-Anwar.
- [96.](#) Fatima al-Zahra': Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa, Vol. 2, p. 532. Nawa'ib al-Duhur, p. 192.
- [97.](#) Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 343–44. Kamil al-Ziyarat, pp. 326–27. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 25, p. 373. Basa'ir al-Darajat.
- [98.](#) Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 184–85. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 29, p. 192. Al-Muqarram, Wafat al-Siddiqah al-Zahra' (sa), p. 78.
- [99.](#) Dala'il al-Imama, p. 45. Bihar al-Anwar, vo. 43, p. 170. 'Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, pp. 411, 504.
- [100.](#) Muhaaj al-Da`awat, pp. 257–58. Al-Kaf`ami, Misbah, pp. 553–54. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 3, p. 393 and Vol. 83, p. 223. Al-'Ataridi, Musnad al-Imam al-Rida ﷺ, Vol. 2, p. 65.
- [101.](#) Al-Imama (manuscript), p. 81
- [102.](#) Diya' al-'Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, pp. 62–64.
- [103.](#) Al-Khawajoo'i, Al-Rasa'il al-l'tiqadiyya, p. 444.
- [104.](#) Ibid., p. 446.
- [105.](#) Al-Khawajoo'i, Taraq al-Rashid (included among Al-Rasa'il al-l'tiqadiyya), p. 301.
- [106.](#) Al-Hada'iq al-Nadira, Vol. 5, p. 180.
- [107.](#) Sayyid Muhammed Qulli Al-Musawi, Tashyeed al-Mata'in, Vol. 1 where he has written scores of pages detailing this incident.
- [108.](#) Al-Sawarim al-Madiya (manuscript), p. 56.
- [109.](#) Rawdat al-Jinan, Vol. 1, p. 358.
- [110.](#) Talkhis al-Shafi, Vol. 3, pp. 156–57.
- [111.](#) Al-Naqd, p. 298.
- [112.](#) Al-Lawami' al-Ilahiyya fi al-Mabahith al-Kalamiyya, p. 302.
- [113.](#) Al-Sirat al-Mustaqqim, Vol. 3, p. 12.
- [114.](#) A Debate Between al-Gharawi and al-Harawi (published in 1397 A.H.), pp. 47–48
- [115.](#) Nafahat al-Lahut, p. 130.
- [116.](#) Al-Tasatturi, Ihqaq al-Haqq, Vol. 2, p. 374.
- [117.](#) Sirat al-'A'imma al-Ithnai 'Ashar, Vol. 2, p. 374.
- [118.](#) Ithbat al-Wasiyya, p. 143. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 308–309.
- [119.](#) Al-Shahristani, Al-Milal wal Nihal, Vol. 1, p. 57. 'Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 416. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 271, 281. Bahj al-Sibagha, Vol. 5, p. 15. Al-Wafi bil Wafiyat, Vol. 6, p. 17. Bayt al-Ahzan, p. 124.
- [120.](#) Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balaghah, Vol. 2, p. 60.
- [121.](#) Al-Urjuza al-Mukhtara, pp. 88–93.
- [122.](#) Al-Turayhi, Al-Muntakhab, p. 293.
- [123.](#) Urjuza fi Tawarikh al-Nabiyy wa al-'A'imma (as) (manuscript), pp. 13, 14. A photocopy of this book is available at the Library of the Center for Islamic Studies in Beirut, Lebanon. Refer to A'lam al-Nisa', Vol. 2, pp. 316, 317.
- [124.](#) Al-Anwar al-Qudsiyya, pp. 42–44.

125. Fara'id al-Simtayn, Vol. 2, pp. 34, 35. Shaikh al-Saduq, Al-Amali, pp. 99–101. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 1, pp. 280–81. Al-Daylami, Irshad al-Qulub, p. 295. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 37–39 and Vol. 43, pp. 172–73. Al-'Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 391–92. Jala' al-'Uyun, Vol. 1, pp. 186–88. Bisharat al-Mustafa, pp. 197–200. Ibn Shathan, Al-Fada'il, pp. 8–11 edited by al-Armawi. Ghayat al-Maram, p. 48. Al-Muhtadir, pp. 199–200.
126. Iqbal al-A'mal, p. 625. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, pp. 199–200.
127. Al-Kaf'ami, Misbah, p. 522.
128. Sulaym ibn Qays's book, pp. 590–97. Al-Tibrizi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, pp. 210–16. Jala' al-'Uyun, Vol. 1. Refer also to Mir'at al-'Uql, Vol. 5, pp. 319–20. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 268, 270 and Vol. 43, pp. 197–200. Al-'Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 400, 404 and Diya' al-'Alamin, Vol. 2, pp. 63, 64.
129. Kifayat al-Talib, p. 413.
130. Hadaqat al-Shi'a, pp. 265–66.
131. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, pp. 294–95.
132. Ma'ani al-Akhbar, pp. 205–07. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 39, pp. 41–42.
133. Kamil al-Ziyarat, pp. 332–35. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 62–64. Refer also to Vol. 53, p. 23. 'Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 398. Al-Majlisi, Jala' al-'Uyun, Vol. 1, pp. 184–86.
134. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 53, pp. 14–23. Al-'Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 441–443. Al-Hidayah al-Kubra, p. 392. Hilyat al-Abrar, Vol. 2, p. 652.
135. Fatima al-Zahra': Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa, Vol. 2, p. 532, citing Nawa'ib al-Duhur, p. 194. Al-Hidayah al-Kubra, p. 417.
136. Refer to the footnote on p. 553 of Shaikh al-Kaf'ami's book Al-Misbah. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 82, p. 261.
137. Al-Kaf'ami, Al-Misbah, p. 553. Al-Balad al-Amin, pp. 551–52. 'Ilm al-Yaqin, p. 701. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 2, p. 261.
138. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, pp. 348–50, citing al-Daylami's Irshad al-Qulub.
139. Al-Tibrizi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, p. 414. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, p. 197. Mir'at al-'Uql, Vol. 5, p. 321. Diya' al-'Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, p. 321.
140. Dala'il al-Imama, pp. 26–27. Al-'Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 504.
141. Rawdat al-Muttaqin, Vol. 5, p. 342.
142. Jala' al-'Uyun, Vol. 1, p. 193.
143. Mir'at al-'Uql, Vol. 5, p. 318. Refer to the biographies in A'lam al-Nisa', Vol. 2, p. 321.
144. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 209–10.
145. Ibid., Vol. 82, p. 264.
146. Nawadir al-Akhbar, p. 183. 'Ilm al-Yaqin, pp. 686, 688. 'Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 414.
147. Al-Turayhi, Al-Muntakhab, p. 136.
148. Conference of Baghdad's Scholars, pp. 135–37.
149. Al-Bid' wal Tarikh, Vol. 5, pp. 20–21.
150. Ibid., Vol. 5, p. 73.
151. Ibid., Vol. 5, p. 75.
152. Ibid., Vol. 5, p. 20.
153. 'Umar Abu al-Nasr, Fatima (sa) Bint Rasul Allah Muhammed (S), p. 94 (published by the office of 'Umar Abu al-Nasr for authorship, translation and journalism, Beirut, Lebanon).
154. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, p. 522, quoting Al-Kafi and p. 294, Vol. 1, of Manaqib Al Abu Talib by Ibn Shahr Ashub.
155. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, p. 496 in a footnote from p. 66, Vol. 2, of Al-Kafi.
156. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, p. 502 in a footnote citing pp. 32–33 of Al-Amali by the mentor al-Tusi.
157. Ahmed Fahmi, Al-Batul al-Tahira, p. 128 from Al-Manaqib by Ibn Shahr Ashub.
158. Refer to the book titled Fatima al-Zahra' (sa) in al-Ahadith al-Nabawiyah, pp. 183–84 and p. 87 of Al-Nafahat al-Qudsiyya from Rawdat al-Wa'izin.
159. Consult the following references: p. 126 of Al-Batul al-Tahira by Shaikh Ahmed Fahmi Muhammed from al-Suddi, p. 43, Vol. 13 of Sharh Nahjul-Balagha by the Mu'tazilite scholar [Ibn Abul-Hadid], pp. 527–28, Vol. 22, of Bihar al-Anwar by al-Majlisi, p. 294, Vol. 1 of Manaqib Al Abu Talib, p. 85 of Al-Nafahat al-Qudsiyya by 'Abd al-Razzaq Kammuna (published in 1390 A.H./1970 A.D. by Dar al-Sadiq in Beirut, Lebanon) from p. 312, Vol. 1 of al-Nisa'i's Sunan and other references.

# Incident In The Wording Of Traditionists And Historians

## Ziyarat of al-Zahra' (sa), the Truthful Lady

1. Shaikh al-Mufid has recorded one *ziyara* for Fatima (sa) saying, “Peace with you, O Messenger of Allah S! Peace with your daughter, the truthful, the purified one! Peace with you, O Fatima daughter of the Messenger of Allah S! O Head of the Women of the World! O *batul* / البتول, martyr, purified one..., etc.”<sup>1</sup>

2. Another text reads: “Peace with you, O martyred *batul*, daughter of the Prophet of Mercy!”<sup>2</sup>

There is another text that says, “Peace with you, O truthful martyr!”<sup>3</sup>

3. Another text says: “Peace with you, O martyred truthful one whose inheritance was confiscated, whose rib was broken, whose husband was oppressed and whose son was killed!”<sup>4</sup>

Shaikh al-Saduq, may Allah have mercy on him, has said, “I have not found any specific *ziyara* for the Truthful Lady, so I have commended what I have stated in this book to my reader what I commend for my own self.”<sup>5</sup> He said so commenting on the afore-mentioned *ziyara* which contains this statement: “Peace with you, O Truthful Lady, O Martyr!”<sup>6</sup>

4. Citing her *ziyara*, Shaikh al-Tusi, may Allah have mercy on him, addresses her thus: “O one who was tried, tried by Allah...” I found this narrative about Fatima (sa). As regarding what I found our own folks saying when reciting her *ziyara*, you must stand at one of the two locations which we mentioned<sup>7</sup> and say: “Peace with you, O daughter of the Messenger of Allah S... Peace with you, O truthful lady, martyr..., etc.”<sup>8</sup>

5. Another text reads: “O Lord! Bless the bereaved lady, the honorable and the praised one, the lofty martyr.”<sup>9</sup>

6. Al-Kaf'ami has said that Fatima's children were five and that the cause of her death was beating and miscarriage.”

As regarding the details of the oppression to which she was exposed, some such details have been cited above as well as what the historians and authors have written in their books. We started by what Sulaym

ibn Qays has narrated in his valuable book which is one of the reliable references which contain details of what actually took place.

7. Islam's mentor, 'allama Shaikh al-Majlisi, has narrated reliable transmissions by Sulaym ibn Qays al-Hilali and others from both Salman and al-'Abbas saying (the following text is from Sulaym's book):

Sulaym ibn Qays said, "When Ali (as) saw how people betrayed him and were reluctant to support him, agreeing with Abu Bakr, paying homage to him and respecting him, he remained at home. "Umar said to Abu Bakr, 'What stops you from calling on him to swear the oath of allegiance to you since nobody else remains to do so except him and these four men?' Abu Bakr was more soft-hearted than "Umar and more intelligent, as well as more far-sighted, whereas the other ("Umar) was the most rough, rude and crude. Abu Bakr said, 'Who should we send to him?' "Umar said, 'Let us send Qunfath to him, for he is a rough and tough man and a *taleeq*, one of the Banu 'Adiyy ibn Ka'b.' He sent him together with helpers to Ali (as). He sought Ali's permission to enter, but Ali (as) refused to let him in. Those in Qunfath's company returned to Abu Bakr and "Umar, who were sitting at the Mosque surrounded by people, and told them that they were not granted permission to enter. "Umar said, 'Go back. If he permits you, enter, but if he does not, enter without his permission!'"

They returned and again sought permission to enter. Fatima (sa) said to them, "I shall expose you to embarrassment if you enter my house without permission." They returned whereas the accursed Qunfath remained. They narrated what Fatima (sa) had told them, adding, "We felt too embarrassed to enter without permission."

"Umar then was angry and said, "Why should we pay attention to women?!" Then he ordered some men to carry firewood, and "Umar, too, carried firewood with them, placing it around the house where Ali and Fatima (as) and both their sons (as) lived. Then "Umar called out so Ali (as) and Fatima (sa) could hear him saying: "By Allah! You shall have to come out, O Ali, and you shall have to swear the oath of allegiance to the successor of the Messenger of Allah S or else I shall set your house ablaze!"

Fatima (sa) said, "O "Umar! What feud is there between us and you?" He said, "Open the door or else I shall burn your house!" She said, "O "Umar! Do you not fear Allah so you want to enter my house by force?" He refused to leave.

"Umar now ordered fire to be lit at the door. Then he pushed the door and forced himself inside. He found himself face-to-face with Fatima (sa) who called out: "O father! O Messenger of Allah S!" "Umar raised his sword which was still inside its scabbard, hitting her side with it. She screamed: "O father!" "Umar raised his whip and hit her arm. She called out: "O Messenger of Allah S! How badly have Abu Bakr and "Umar succeeded you!"

Ali (as) leaped and pulled "Umar's clothes, then he pulled him and wrestled him to the ground, fracturing his nose and neck and was about to kill him. Then he remembered what the Messenger of Allah S had told him and how he admonished him to deal with those folks. Ali (as), therefore, said to "Umar, "I swear

by the One Who honored Muhammed S with the Prophetic Mission, O son of Sahk<sup>10</sup>, that had it not been for a Book from Allah and a covenant entrusted to me by the Messenger of Allah S, you would have come to know that you are not such who would enter my house!"

"Umar cried out for help. People came and entered the house. Ali (as) took to his sword, so Qunfath returned to Abu Bakr fearing that Ali (as) would kill him, knowing his might and prowess.

Abu Bakr said to Qunfath, "Go back. If he comes out, that is alright; otherwise, enter his house by force. If he refuses to come out, set their house to fire." The accursed Qunfath set out. He and those in his company entered Ali's house by force and without permission.

Fatima (sa) intercepted them at the door. The cursed Qunfath hit her with the sword. When she died, her wrist had a mark looking like a bracelet because of being whipped by that damned slave.

Ali (as) was taken by force and brought to Abu Bakr. "Umar was standing next to Abu Bakr with his sword unsheathed. Khalid ibn al-Walid, Abu 'Ubaydah ibn al-Jarrah, Salim (slave of Abu Huthayfah), Mu'ath ibn Jabal, al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah, Aseed ibn Hassin, Bashar ibn Sa'd and other people were all sitting around Abu Bakr, all armed.

I said to Salman, "Did they really enter the house of Fatima (sa) without permission?" He said, "Yes, by Allah, and she did not have a veil, so she cried out, 'O Father! O Messenger of Allah! O how badly you have been succeeded by Abu Bakr and 'Umar while your eyes can still see though you are in your grave!' She called that out as loudly as she could. I saw Abu Bakr and those around him weeping (as they heard her say those words). They all wept except "Umar, Khalid ibn al-Walid and al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah. "Umar kept saying, 'We have nothing to do with what women say.' They took Ali (as) to Abu Bakr as he was saying, 'O by Allah! Had I had my sword in my hand, you would surely know that you would not be able to do what you are doing at all. By Allah! I do not blame myself if I fight you.

Had I only had forty supporters, I would have been able to disperse all the people you have rallied behind you. But the curse of Allah be on people who swore the oath of allegiance to me then betrayed me.' When Abu Bakr saw Ali (as), he shouted, 'set him free!' Ali (as) said, 'O Abu Bakr! How swiftly you have transgressed against the Messenger of Allah S! What gives you the right or which status permits you to invite the people to swear the oath of allegiance to you? Did you not yourself swear the oath of allegiance to me a few days<sup>11</sup> ago as ordered by Allah and as enjoined by the Messenger of Allah (S)?'

Qunfath, the curse of Allah on him, hit Fatima (sa) with the whip when she threw herself between him and her husband. "Umar had instructed him thus: "If Fatima (sa) intercepts you from reaching him (reaching Ali (as)), you should whip her." Qunfath, the curse of Allah on him, cornered her at the knob of her house's door, pushed her and broke one of her ribs, so she miscarried a fetus. She remained in bed since then till she died as a martyr in the aftermath.

When Ali (as) was brought to Abu Bakr, "Umar rebuked him and rudely said to him: "Swear the oath of

allegiance (and leave such falsehood of yours aside).” He (as) said to “Umar, “And if I do not, what are you all going to do?” They said, “We shall kill you in the most humiliating and contemptible way.” He (as) said, “You will then kill a servant of Allah and a Brother of His Messenger.” Abu Bakr said, “As regarding you being a servant of Allah, yes, I agree with that.

But as regarding you being the Brother of the Messenger of Allah S, we do not recognize you as such.” Ali (as) said, “Do you deny that the Messenger of Allah (S) had established Brotherhood between himself and myself [when he established brotherhood between the Ansar and the Muhajirun in Medina in the first Hijri year]?!” Abu Bakr said, “Yes.” Ali (as) repeated his question to them three times! Then Ali (as) said, “O Muslims! O Muhajirun and Ansar! I ask you in the Name of Allah, have you heard the Messenger of Allah S on the Day of Ghadir Khumm say such-and-such?! And have you heard him in the Invasion of Tabuk say such-and-such?!” Ali (as) continued reminding them of what the Messenger of Allah (S) had said about him. They said, “Lord! We testify that he (as) said it.”

When Abu Bakr was afraid of a change of public opinion in favor of Ali (as) and that they would now oppose him, he said to Ali (as), “Any word of truth you have said we have heard it with our ears and recognized it, and our hearts have understood it. But we have also heard the Messenger of Allah (S) say, ‘We are members of a House whom Allah chose and honored, choosing for us the Hereafter over the temporal life. Allah decreed not to grant us both Prophetic Mission and Caliphate’.” Ali (as) asked Abu Bakr, “Has any of the *sahaba* of the Messenger of Allah S ever heard the Prophet S saying so besides yourself?” “Umar immediately said, “The successor of the Messenger of Allah S has said the truth, and I have heard it just as he stated it.” Abu ‘Ubaydah, Salim (slave of Abu Huthayfah) and Mu’ath ibn Jabal said, “He said the truth; we, too, heard the Messenger of Allah S say it.” Ali (as) said to all of them, “You have all fulfilled the promise which you had vowed as recorded in your (damned) *sahifa* to whose contents you swore at the Ka’ba saying, ‘If Allah causes Muhammed S to be killed, or if he dies, we shall shift this matter (caliphate) from Ahl al-Bayt.’”

Abu Bakr asked Ali (as), “How do you know about it and we never acquainted you with what is in it?!” Ali (as) said, “You, Zubayr, and you, Salman, and you, Abu Dharr, and you, Miqdad! I ask you in the Name of Allah and in the name of Islam, did you hear the Messenger of Allah (S) say as you heard: ‘So-and-so, till he counted the names of these five individuals, wrote a covenant and made a pledge and an agreement to which they all swore to do such-and-such if I am killed or if I die’? They all said, “We invoke Allah to witness that yes, we have heard the Messenger of Allah S say so to you, that they made an agreement and a covenant to do what they have already done, writing a document to this effect that if the Prophet S was killed or if he died, they would oppose you and shift this (caliphate) from you, O Ali!” You yourself said, “May my parents be sacrificed for your sake, O Messenger of Allah S! What do you order me to do if this comes to pass?” He said to you, “If you find supporters, you should oppose and fight them. But if you do not find enough supporters, you should swear fealty and safeguard your own blood.”

Ali (as) then said, “By Allah! Had those forty men who swore allegiance to me fulfilled their promise, I would have fought you. But, by Allah, none of your offspring shall ever achieve it till the Day of Judgment. What proves that you have told a lie about the Messenger of Allah S is the verse of the most Exalted One wherein He says, ‘Or do they envy the people for what Allah has bestowed on them of His grace? But indeed We have given Abraham’s children the Book and the wisdom, and We have given them a grand kingdom’ (Qur'an, 5:54), for the Book, the Prophetic Mission, the wisdom, the Sunnah, the kingdom and the caliphate are all ours, for we are from the family of Abraham.”

Al-Miqdad stood up and said, “O Ali (as)! What do you order me to do? By Allah! If you order me to strike anyone with my sword, I will do it. And if you do not, I shall refrain.” Ali (as) said, “Stop it, Miqdad, and remember the covenant with the Messenger of Allah (S) and what he ordered you to do.”

I stood up and said, “By the One in Whose hand my life is, had I known that I keep away oppression and thus strengthen the creed of Allah, I would have taken out my sword and striken with it one after another. Do you really all leap like that on the Brother of the Messenger of Allah S and his successor over his nation and the father of his offspring?! Then receive the good news of tribulation and lose hope of prosperity!”

Abu Dharr stood up and said, “O nation confused after its Prophet S, betrayed because of its mutiny, Allah says,

***‘Surely Allah chose Adam and Noah and the descendants of Abraham and the descendants of 'Imran (Amram) above all nations: offspring, one of the other, and Allah is Hearing, Knowing.’ (Qur'an, 3:33-34).***

The Progeny of Muhammed S are the descendants of Noah, the family of Abraham are he descendants of Abraham, and the elite from among the lineage of Ishmael, the family of Prophet Muhammed S!

They are the household of the Prophetic Mission and the place of the Message. Angels visit them, and they are like the raised heavens, the fixed mountains, the veiled Ka'ba, the pure spring, the guiding stars, the blessed tree which emits light and whose decoration is blessed! Muhammed S of the Prophetic Mission is the seal of all the prophets, the master of the offspring of Adam, while Ali (as) is the *wasi* of all *wasis*, the Imam of the righteous, the leader of the good ones, the greatest Siddiq, the greatest Faruq, the *wasi* of Muhammed (S) of the Prophetic Mission, the heir of his knowledge and the one who has more authority over the believers than the believers have over their own selves just as the Almighty says,

***‘The Prophet has a greater claim on the Faithful (as) than they have on their own selves, and his wives are their mothers; and those of kinship have better claim in the ordinance of Allah of Prophetic Mission to inheritance, one with respect to the other, than (other) believers, and (than) those who have fled (their homes), except that you do some good to your friends; this is written in the Book’ (Qur'an, 33:6).***

So now you should prefer those whom Allah has preferred, and let others behind you, those whom Allah left behind, and make the authority and inheritance to those for whom Allah assigned them.”

“Umar stood up and said to Abu Bakr as the latter was sitting on the pulpit, “What keeps you sitting on this pulpit since this man is fighting you and is not swearing the oath of allegiance to you? Do you issue an order to kill him so we may strike his neck with the sword?” Al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) were both present... When they heard what “Umar said, they wept. Ali (as) hugged them and said, “Do not weep, for by Allah, they both (“Umar and Abu Bakr) shall never be able to kill your father.”

Umm Ayman, who nursed the Messenger of Allah S in his childhood, came in and said, “O Abu Bakr! How swiftly you have revealed your envy and hypocrisy!” Abu Bakr ordered her to be kicked out of the Mosque saying [repeating the words of his friend, “Umar], “Why should we bother about women?”

Buraydah al-Aslami stood up and said, “O “Umar! Do you really leap against the Brother of the Messenger of Allah S and the father of his offspring while you are one whom we, Quraishites, know very well who he is?! Are you both not the ones to whom the Messenger of Allah S said, ‘Go, both of you, to Ali (as) and address him as the Commander of the Faithful (as)’ and you both asked him, ‘Is this an order from Allah and His Messenger?’ and he said to you, ‘Yes,’?” Abu Bakr said, “This did, indeed, take place, but the Messenger of Allah S said after that, ‘My Ahl al-Bayt (as) shall not have both Prophetic Mission and caliphate.’” He said, “By Allah do I swear that the Messenger of Allah S *never* said so! By Allah do I swear that I shall never live in a town where you sit in charge.” “Umar ordered him to be beaten and expelled! Then “Umar said, “Stand up, O son of Abu Talib, and swear the oath of allegiance.” Ali (as) said, “And what if I do not?” “Umar said, “Then by Allah we shall kill you.” Ali (as) argued with them in vain three times after which he stretched his hand without opening it. Abu Bakr slapped on it and accepted it as a token of his allegiance. But before doing so, Ali (as), while the rope was still around his neck, loudly recited this verse:

***“O son of my mother! Surely the people deemed me weak and almost killed me” (Qur'an, 7: 150).***

Al-Zubayr was told to swear the oath of allegiance, but he refused, whereon “Umar, Khalid ibn al-Walid, al-Mughirah ibn Shu’bah and other people leaped at him and took his sword away from him, hitting it on the ground and breaking it. Al-Zubayr, while “Umar was on his chest, said to the latter, “O son of a sahk صهك! By Allah! Had my sword been in my hands, you would not have had the courage to stand in my way.” Then he was forced to swear it.

Salman said, “Then they took me and crushed my neck till they left it like a goiter. Then they took my hand and twisted it, so I swore the oath of allegiance even against my wish.”

Then Abu Dharr and al-Miqdad swore it against their will. Only Ali (as) and these four men were forced to swear the oath of allegiance against their will. Al-Zubayr was the toughest in his speech. Having sworn it, he (addressing “Umar ibn al-Khattab) said, “O son of A sahk! By Allah! Had it not been for the tyrants who supported you, you would never have had the courage to face me while my sword is with

me due to your well known cowardice and meanness. But you found oppressors whereby you deem yourself strong, so you now use them as your weapon.” “Umar was angry and asked him, “Do you mention the name of *Sahk* (at this place)?” “And what stops me from mentioning her?!,” answered al-Zubayr, “and she was a prostitute.

Do you deny it?! Was she not a slave woman from Ethiopia and the property of my grandfather ‘Abd al-Muttalib?! Your grandfather, Nufayl, committed adultery with her, so she gave birth to your father al-Khattab. ‘Abd al-Muttalib then gave her away to your grandfather after the latter had committed adultery with her, so she gave birth to him [to al-Khattab]. Is he not a slave of my grandfather and the son of a prostitute?!” Abu Bakr interceded between both men, pushing each one of them aside from the other.

Sulaym ibn Qays said, “I asked Salman [al-Farisi], ‘Did you really swear the oath of allegiance, O Salman, to Abu Bakr without saying anything at all about that?’ He said, ‘Having sworn it, I said, ‘Woe unto you for eternity! Do you not know what you have committed against your own souls? You hit the mark while missing it! You followed the way of the people before you, the people of dissension and disunity, and you missed the Sunnah of your Prophet S, so much so that you took this Sunnah out of its substance and out of the hands of its people.’” “Umar said, “O Salman! Since your friend has sworn it, and since you yourself have done likewise, you may say whatever you wish to say, and you may do whatever you please, and let your friend, too, say whatever he likes.” Salman said, “I heard the Messenger of Allah S saying that on you (O “Umar!) and on your fellows shall fall the like of the sins of all his [Prophet’s] nation till the Day of Judgment and the like of all their torment.” He (“Umar) said, “Say whatever you wish to say.

Have you not sworn the oath of allegiance and Allah did not cool your eyes by seeing your friend [Ali (as)] taking charge of it?!” Salman said, “I testify that I have read in some of the Books revealed by Allah about the people of this Household that you, in your name and in your lineage and characteristics, are one of the Gates of Hell.” “Umar said to Salman, “Say whatever you wish to say.

Has Allah not removed it [caliphate] from the people of this House which you chose as lords besides Allah?” Salman said, “I testify that I heard the Messenger of Allah S saying that you yourself are implied in the following verse about which I asked him: ‘On that Day, no one shall chastise with (anything like) His chastisement, and no one shall bind with (anything like) His binding’ (Qur’an, 89:25–26).” “Umar said, “Shut your mouth, may Allah shut it forever, you slave and son of the stinking woman!” Ali (as) said to Salman, “O Salman! I ask you in the Name of Allah to remain silent.” [12](#)

#### 8. In another text by Sulaym ibn Qays, the following is stated:

Ali (as), Banu Hashim, Abu Dharr, al-Miqdad, Salman and a few others did not swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr. “Umar said to Abu Bakr, “Look, you, all people have sworn the oath of allegiance to you except this man and his family members as well as these individuals; so, send someone to fetch him.” Abu Bakr sent a cousin of “Umar named Qunfath to fetch Ali (as). He said to

him, “Qunfath! Set out to Ali (as) and say to him, ‘Answer the call of the successor of the Messenger of Allah S.’” Qunfath set out and conveyed the message. Ali (as) said, “How swiftly you all are in telling lies about the Messenger of Allah S! You have reneged from your oath [to the Messenger of Allah S] and you have betrayed [the one whom he S had assigned as his successor, namely Ali (as)]! By Allah! The Messenger of Allah S did not leave a successor to him besides myself. So, Qunfath! Go back, for you are only a bearer of a message, and tell him that by Allah, the Messenger of Allah S never assigned you as his successor, and you know exactly who the successor of the Messenger of Allah *really* is.”

Qunfath went to Abu Bakr and conveyed the message. Abu Bakr said, “Ali (as) has said the truth! The Messenger of Allah S did NOT assign me as his successor!” “Umar became angry and leaped from his place, but Abu Bakr told him to sit. Then Abu Bakr said to Qunfath, “Go back and say to him, ‘Answer the call of the commander of the Faithful Abu Bakr.’”

Qunfath returned, entered Ali’s house and conveyed the message. Ali (as) said, “By Allah do I swear that he (Abu Bakr) has lied! Set out to him and say to him, ‘By Allah! You have assumed a title which is not yours, and you know very well that the commander of the faithful is someone else other than yourself!’”

Qunfath returned and did so. “Umar, now became even angrier, leaped again and said, “By Allah! I know how silly he is and how weak his view is, and we shall never be able to take full control unless we kill him, so let me bring his head to you!” Abu Bakr said, “Sit down,” but “Umar refused to sit. Then Abu Bakr pleaded to “Umar in the Name of Allah to sit, so he sat... Abu Bakr then said, “Qunfath! Set out to him and say, ‘O Ali! Answer the call of Abu Bakr.’”

Ali (as) said to Qunfath, “I am too busy to be concerned about them, and I am not going to abandon the will of my friend and Brother S. Go back to Abu Bakr and to whatever oppression you all have set your minds on.”

Qunfath set out and conveyed the above to Abu Bakr, whereon “Umar, outraged, leaped out of his place, called on Khalid ibn al-Walid and Qunfath and ordered them to carry firewood and a torch of fire. He went to Ali’s house door while Fatima (sa) was behind it, her head bandaged and body extremely thin due to the effects of the demise of the Messenger of Allah S. “Umar came and knocked at the door then shouted out, “O son of Abu Talib! Open the door!” Fatima (sa) said to him, “O “Umar! What feud is there between us and yourself? Why don’t you leave us in our pain?” He said to her, “Open the door or else I shall burn you all!” She said, “O “Umar! Don’t you have any fear of Allah, the most Exalted and the most Great, at all? Do you want to enter my house (by force) and assault my family?” But he refused to leave. Then “Umar ordered the door to be set to fire, burning it. “Umar pushed the door. Fatima (sa) met him face-to-face and screamed, “O Father! O Messenger of Allah!” He lifted his sword as it was still in its scabbard and hit her side with it, so she screamed. He raised the whip and hit her on her arm, causing her to scream, “O Father!”

Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) then leaped and pulled “Umar by his clothes, shaking him and throwing him on the ground. He smashed his nose and neck and was about to kill him. But he remembered what the Messenger of Allah S had told him and how he enjoined him to be patient, so he said to ‘Umar, “I swear by the One Who honored Muhammed S with the Prophetic Mission, O son of Sahk, that had it not been for a Book from Allah which He already revealed, you should know that you would not be able to enter my house!”

“Umar sent for help. People came and entered the house. Khalid ibn al-Walid pulled his sword out of its scabbard in order to hit Fatima (sa)! Ali (as) attacked Khalid with his own sword, but ‘Umar pleaded to Ali (as) in the Name of Allah not to kill Khalid, so he refrained.

Al-Miqdad, Salman, Abu Dharr, ‘Ammar and Buraydah al-Aslami came and entered the house to support Ali (as). A great sedition was about to befall the Islamic nation. Ali (as) was taken out, followed by people and by Salman, Abu Dharr, al-Miqdad, ‘Ammar and Buraydah al-Aslami (may Allah have mercy on them all) as they were saying to ‘Umar, “How swiftly you have betrayed the Messenger of Allah, you and Khalid, letting grudge come out of your chests!”

Buraydah ibn al-Khasab al-Aslami said, “O ‘Umar! Do you, Khalid, really leap on the Brother of the Messenger of Allah and his *wasi* and on his daughter, so you hit her, and you are the one whom we, Quraishites, all know who he is?!” Khalid ibn al-Walid raised his sword, which was still in its scabbard, to hit Buraydah, but ‘Umar held him back and forbade him.

Finally, they brought Ali (as) to Abu Bakr handcuffed. Once Abu Bakr laid his eyes on him, he shouted at the men to release him. Ali (as) said to Abu Bakr, “How swiftly you all have attacked the Ahl al-Bayt (as) of your Prophet S! O Abu Bakr! By what right or by what will, or by what merit of your own, do you urge people to swear the oath of allegiance to you?! Did you not yourself swear the oath of allegiance days ago as ordered by the Messenger of Allah S?!” ‘Umar interrupted saying, “Leave such talk aside, Ali, for by Allah, if you do not swear the oath of allegiance, we shall kill you.”

‘Umar again said, “Stand up and swear fealty.” Ali (as) asked him, “And what if I do not?” ‘Umar said, “Then we, by Allah, shall kill you.” Ali (as) said, “You, by Allah, have lied, O son of a *sahk*! You cannot do that! You are too mean and too weak to do it!” Khalid ibn al-Walid jumped and unsheathed his sword as he said, “By Allah! If you do not do it, I shall kill you!” Ali (as) stood up and pulled Khalid by his clothes then shoved him, throwing him on the ground on his back. The sword fell from Khalid’s hand. ‘Umar said, “Stand up, Ali, and swear the oath of allegiance.” Ali (as) said to him, “And what if I do not?!” ‘Umar said, “We by Allah will then kill you.”

Three times did Ali (as) argue with them, but it was in vain. Then he stretched his hand *without opening* it. Abu Bakr slapped on it, accepting this as a token of his fealty. Then Ali (as) went back home followed by people.<sup>13</sup>

9. Sulaym ibn Qays has also recorded the following:

“Ibn ‘Abbas said, ‘... Then they cooked a plot and rehearsed their roles. They said, ‘We shall never be in full charge as long as this man (Ali (as)) is alive!’

“Abu Bakr asked, ‘Who can kill him for us?’ “Umar said, ‘Khalid ibn al-Walid!’ So they summoned him. Both men (“Umar and Abu Bakr) said to Khalid, ‘O Khalid! What would you say if we ask you to undertake a very serious errand?!’ He said, ‘Order me to do anything at all as you please, even if you order me to kill Ali ibn Abu Talib<sup>(as)</sup>, and I shall do it.’ They said to him, ‘We do not want you to do anything other than that!’ He said, ‘I am the man for it!’ Abu Bakr said, ‘Once we have performed the *fajr* prayers, stand beside him, and let your sword be with you. Once I offer the *tasleem*, you should kill him.’ Khalid agreed.

“They dispersed following their agreement. Abu Bakr contemplated a great deal on his plot to get Ali (as) killed. He realized that if he did so, a devastating war and a great calamity would take place, so he regretted ordering Khalid to do it. He could not sleep that night till dawn. At dawn, he went to the Mosque after the call for the prayers had already been made. He advanced and led the prayers, contemplating, not knowing what to say.

“Khalid came, carrying his sword, and stood beside Ali (as). Ali (as) was able to guess some of the plot against him. Once Abu Bakr finished the *tashahhud*, he called out, before the *tasleem*, ‘O Khalid! Do not do what I ordered you to do, for if you do it, I shall kill you!’ Then he made the *tasleem*, turning his face right and left.

“Ali (as) leaped and pulled Khalid by his clothes, pulling the sword from his hand then subdued him on the ground and sat on his chest. He pulled his sword to kill him. Those attending the prayer service gathered around Ali (as) trying to save Khalid from his grip but they could not. Al-’Abbas says, ‘They pleaded to him in the sanctity of the grave of the Messenger of Allah (S) to let Khalid alone, so he did. He stood up and went to his house.’

“Al-Zubayr, al-’Abbas, Abu Dharr, al-Miqdad and many people from among the Banu Hashim, with swords unsheathed, said, ‘By Allah! You shall not leave till we see what he wants to say and do!’ People disputed with each other, and there was a great deal of commotion.

“The women of Banu Hashim went out screaming and saying, ‘O enemies of Allah! As long as you seek this from the Messenger of Allah S, you shall never be able to achieve it. In the near past you killed his daughter (Fatima (sa)) and now you want to kill his Brother, cousin, *wasi* and the father of his offspring! You have lied, by the Lord of the Ka’ba! You shall never be able to kill him!’ People were apprehensive of a very serious sedition.”<sup>14</sup>

## **What al-Mufid Records in Al-Amali**

10. Abu ‘Abdullah, al-Mufid, has said,

Abu Bakr, namely Muhammed ibn "Umar al-Ji'abi, has said that Abu Bakr, Ahmed ibn Mansur al-Ramadi, has said that Sa'd ibn 'Afar saying that Ibn Lahi'ah quotes Khalid ibn Yazid, from Abu Hilal from Marwan ibn 'Othman, as saying that when people swore the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, Ali (as), al-Zubayr and al-Miqdad entered the house of Fatima (sa) and refused to go out (to swear it). "Umar ibn al-Khattab said, "Set the house on fire!" Al-Zubayr went out with his sword. Abu Bakr said, "Take care of the dog!" So they went in his direction. His foot slipped, and he fell on the ground, and the sword fell from his hand. Abu Bakr said, "Hit it [his sword] on the rock!" His sword was hit on a rock till it was broken.

Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) went out to a cliff. He was met by Thabit ibn Qays ibn Shammas who asked him, "O father of al-Hassan! What are you doing here?" He said, "They wanted to burn my house as Abu Bakr was sitting on the pulpit receiving the people's oath of allegiance without defending or even denouncing such an act." Thabit said to him, "My hand shall not part with yours till I am killed defending you." They both set out and entered Medina. Fatima (sa) was standing at her door. Her house was empty. She was saying, "I dissociate myself from people worse than whose presence there is nothing at all! You left the coffin of the Messenger of Allah S lying before us [as you went to the *saqifa* to "elect" Abu Bakr, not bothering about burying your Prophet S]; you violated your oath to be obedient to us, and you did not let us take charge of you. You have done what you have done to us without being mindful of our status."<sup>15</sup>

11. Shaikh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy on him, has also said,

When people from Banu Hashim and others assembled at the house of Fatima (sa) in order to demonstrate their opposition to Abu Bakr and to show that they differed in their views from him, "Umar ibn al-Khattab dispatched Qunfath, saying to him, "Get them out of the house. If they get out (to swear fealty), it is alright; otherwise, collect firewood at his (Ali's) house door and tell them that if they did not come out to swear fealty, you would burn their house."

Then "Umar led in person a group of people, including al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah al-Thaqafi and Salim slave of Abu Huthayfah, till they arrived at the door of Ali's house. "Umar shouted, "O Fatima daughter of the Messenger of Allah! Get those who have sought shelter at your house out or else I shall burn you all!" All this is very well known.<sup>16</sup>

12. Al-Kanji has attributed to al-Mufid and to Ibn Qutaybah their statement relevant to the miscarriage of Muhsin, the fetus. Al-Kanji has cited Shaikh al-Mufid as saying, "... And he added to what the masses have said that Fatima (sa) had miscarried after the demise of the Prophet S a male child whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin... This is something which only Ibn Qutaybah from among the transmitter has stated."<sup>17</sup>

But what we have stated in these chapters proves the inaccuracy and imprecision of his last statement. Such a fact exists in scores of references.

13. Shaikh al-Mufid has said,

Not many people attended the burial of the Messenger of Allah S because of the bickering which took place between the Muhajirun and the Ansar about the caliphate issue. Most of them missed the opportunity to perform the funeral prayers for him as well. Fatima (sa) kept lamenting that day's morning, whereon the second caliph said to her, "Your morning is surely evil."[18](#)

14. Al-Mufid has said that Abu Ja'far, namely Muhammed ibn Ali ibn al-Husayn, has said that his father narrates saying that Ahmed ibn Idris says that Muhammed ibn 'Abd al-Jabbar quotes al-Qasim ibn Muhammed al-Razi quoting Ali ibn al-HirMizan quoting Ali ibn al-Husayn ibn Ali (as) quoting his father, al-Husayn (as), as saying,

"When Fatima (sa) daughter of the Prophet S fell sick, she told Ali (as) by way of will to keep what was happening to her as a secret, not to tell anyone about her and not to announce her sickness, which he did. He used to look after her in person assisted by Asma' daughter of 'Umays, may Allah have mercy on her, on the condition that she, too, had to keep it a secret. When death approached her, she told the Commander of the Faithful (as) by way of will to take care of her burial and to obliterate all signs of the location of her grave. The Commander of the Faithful (as) did so, burying her and hiding the location of her grave."[19](#)

15. Al-Mufid and al-'Ayyashi have quoted 'Amr ibn Abu al-Miqdam quoting his father quoting his grandfather as saying,

Two occasions were the very hardest on Ali (as). The first of those occasions was when the Messenger of Allah S passed away. The second occasion was, by Allah, when I sat at the *saqifa* of Banu Sa'idah on the right side of Abu Bakr as people were swearing the oath of allegiance to him [to the latter]. "Umar said "You [Abu Bakr] have not done anything [worth doing] unless Ali (as) swears the oath of allegiance to you, so send for him so that he may come to you and swear fealty to you." Abu Bakr dispatched Qunfath after instructing him thus: "Say to him: 'Answer the call of the successor of the Messenger of Allah S'." Abu Bakr, "Umar, 'Othman, Khalid ibn al-Walid, al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah, Abu 'Ubaydah ibn al-Jarrah and Salim slave of Abu Huthayfah stood up, and I stood up and went with them. Fatima (sa) thought that nobody would enter her house without her permission, so she closed her house door and locked it. When they arrived at the door, "Umar kicked it with his foot and broke it, and it was made of palm branches. They forcefully entered Ali's house and arrested him.[20](#)

16. Muhammed ibn Jarir ibn Rustam al-Tabari has quoted al-Waqidi as saying that the son of Abu Hanifah has quoted Dawud ibn al-Hassan as saying that some men from among the Muhajirun and Ansar were very angry when Abu Bakr received the oath of allegiance. They said that he had done so without consulting them and without their consent. Ali (as) and al-Zubayr were both angry, too. They took to Fatima's house and did not swear it. "Umar, accompanied by a group of men which included Assad ibn Hassan and Salamat ibn Aslam ibn Jarish al-Ashhali. "Umar shouted, "Come out or else we

shall burn you all!” They refused to come out. Fatima (sa) called on those men and pleaded to them in the Name of Allah to leave. “Umar ordered Salamah ibn Aslam to enter by force. “Umar took the sword of one of them [al-Zubayr] and kept hitting it on the wall till he broke it. Then he led them after having arrested them till they were forced to swear the oath of allegiance (to Abu Bakr).

17. He has also said that he was told by Ishaq ibn Ibrahim that the latter was told by Salamah ibn al-Fadl who cited ‘Abdullah ibn A’yan quoting Harb ibn Abul-Aswad al-Du’ali as saying,

“My father sent me to Jundab ibn ‘Abdullah al-Bijli to ask him about what went on between Abu Bakr and “Umar on one hand and Ali (as) on the other when they invited the latter to swear the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr]. He said, ‘They took it [by force] from Ali (as).’ So he wrote him asking him to state, in writing, his view of what he had seen in person. He wrote him saying the following: ‘They both [Abu Bakr and “Umar] sent for Ali (as) who was brought to them tied. Once in their presence, they required him to swear the oath of allegiance. ‘What if I do not?’ Ali (as) inquired. They both told him that they would kill him. He said, ‘Then you will be killing a servant of Allah and a Brother of the Messenger of Allah S.’ They said, ‘As being a servant of Allah, yes, you are a very good one, indeed. But as for being the Brother of the Messenger of Allah S, No.’ Then they repeated their demand, and he repeated his question, whereupon they said, ‘Then you shall be humiliated and killed.’ He repeated his response, returning that day without swearing it..., etc.”[21](#)

18. ‘Imad ad-Din, namely al-Tabari, one of the seventh century [Hijri] scholars, has said the following (which is a translation from the original Persian text):

... Meanwhile, “Umar, accompanied by the folks of stubbornness and hypocrisy, arrived. He said, “O son of Abu Talib! Open the door or else I shall burn your house!” Fatima (sa) said, “O “Umar! Fear Allah with regard to the sanctity of the Messenger of Allah S! Do not enter, for you are prohibited.” “Umar insisted, forcing his way and the way of his hypocritical companions in. Fatima (sa) called out, “O Father! Witness what we have suffered at the hands of Abu Bakr and “Umar after you!” “Umar took his sword, which was still in its scabbard, and hit Fatima (sa) with it on the side. Qunfath hit her with the sword on her shoulder. Fatima (sa) screamed, “O Father! Witness what your Ahl al-Bayt (as) have suffered at the hands of Abu Bakr and “Umar after you!”[22](#)

19. The same author, discussing how Fatima (sa) was buried without the knowledge of the caliph and how “Umar became angry and almost hit al-Miqdad who told him the news, cites al-Miqdad as saying the following to “Umar: “Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S left this life while blood was coming out of her back and side because of you hitting her with the sword and with the whip.” The author goes on to state the following:

They went to Ali (as) and found him sitting at his house door surrounded by his companions. “Umar said to him, “O son of Abu Talib! You never abandon your ancient envy! Yesterday, you washed the corpse of the Messenger of Allah (S) without our knowledge, and today you perform the funeral prayers for

Fatima (sa) also without us.” ‘Aqil, may Allah have mercy on him, said to him, “And you, I swear by Allah, are the most of all people in your envy and more ancient in animosity towards the Messenger of Allah S and his Ahl al-Bayt. You hit her in the past, and she left this world and blood was on her back, and she was not pleased with you both [“Umar and Abu Bakr] at all.”[23](#)

20. Discussing “Umar [ibn al-Khattab], al-Maqdisi al-Ardabili (d. 993 A.H./1585 A.D.) has stated the following (a translation from the Persian text):

According to his order, they carried firework to the house of al-Zahra’ (sa) in order to burn it, seeing and knowing that Fatima (sa) was sitting behind the door. “Umar ordered her beaten and he, “Umar, himself beat her on her stomach, and his slave beat her with the whip on her shoulder. This was the cause of her miscarriage. The marks of the beating remained on her body. She fell sick because of that and died. All of this happened because of their [“Umar and Abu Bakr’s] orders. Sunnis do not deny any of these incidents, but some of them, such as al-Qawshaji[24](#), have tried to rebut it, but the rebuttals have come very cold and weak.[25](#)

21. Al-Khawajoo’i al-Mazandarani[26](#) has quoted a narrative transmitted by al-Kalbi from Ibn ‘Abbas as follows:

Al-Zuhri has quoted Abu Ishaq, namely Ibrahim al-Thaqafi, citing Za’idah ibn Qudamah as saying that he went out with “Umar accompanied by about sixty men. “Umar sought permission to enter their house, but he was not granted permission, so he made a lot of fuss and commotion.

Al-Zubayr went out to him, unsheathing his sword. The second [caliph, i.e. “Umar] fled away before them as was his habit. Al-Zubayr chased him, but he stumbled on a rock in his way, so he fell headlong. “Umar shouted, “Take care of the dog!” Al-Zubayr was surrounded. Salamah ibn Aslam took al-Zubayr’s sword and kept hitting it on a rock till it broke. Al-Zubayr was roughly led to Abu Bakr. “Umar returned to the door and again asked permission to enter. Fatima (sa) said to him, “I plead to you in the Name of Allah, if you are a believer, not to enter my house, for I am without a veil.” “Umar did not pay her any attention and attacked the house. Fatima (sa) called out, “O Father! Witness what we have suffered from Abu Bakr and “Umar after you!”

His supporters followed him inside. He demanded the Commander of the Faithful (sa) should come out. Ali (as) did not resist because of the instructions which he had been given by the Messenger of Allah S by way of will, thus avoiding a serious sedition among the Muslims.

“Umar went out with them, and the Pure Lady went out behind him and kept saying to him, “O son of the black woman [sahk صهك, prostitute]! How swiftly you permitted humiliation to enter the house of the Messenger of Allah S!” All the women belonging to Banu Hashim went out with her. When Abu Bakr saw Fatima (sa) coming to meet him, he stood up and said, “What caused you to come out like that, O daughter of the Messenger of Allah S?!” She said, “You and the son of the black woman caused me to come out.” Abu Bakr said, “O Daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S)! Do not talk like that, for he used

to love your father.” Fatima (sa) said, “Had he loved him, he would not have caused humiliation to enter his house.”<sup>27</sup>

22. Al-Khawajoo’i al-Mazandarani has also said, “They have narrated that Fatima (sa) had a house, and she had a door overlooking the Mosque. Abu Bakr said, ‘I have heard the Messenger of Allah S say that the door should not lead to the Mosque.’ He, therefore, ordered the door of her house to be removed or sealed. Then he regretted having left her house thus exposed and said, ‘How I wish I left Fatima’s house alone and did not expose it!’”<sup>28</sup>

We say that the regret referred to above by Abu Bakr was not because he left Fatima’s house exposed, but it was on account of assaulting her house on the day of his inauguration in office. What points out to this fact is his own statement at the end of his speech wherein he said: “... although it was shut down by force.”

23. Al-Tibrisi has narrated the incident of the assault. In a detailed narrative, he has said the following:

‘Othman and ‘Abd al-Rahman ibn ‘Awf and those in their company stood up and swore the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr]. Ali (as) and Banu Hashim went to Ali’s house, and al-Zubayr was with them.

“Umar went to them in a group of those who swore fealty, including Assad ibn al-Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam, and found them assembled. He said to them, “Swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, for the people have already done so.” Al-Zubayr was swift to take to his sword, so “Umar said to them, “Go take care of the dog and spare us his evil!” Salamah ibn Aslam took the sword out of al-Zubayr’s hand. “Umar took the sword and kept hitting it on the ground till he broke it.

They surrounded all those of Banu Hashim who assembled there and led them to Abu Bakr. When they were present there, they were told to swear fealty to Abu Bakr since other people had already done so.<sup>29</sup>

24. In another text stated by al-Tibrisi, the author says the following as he discusses “Umar:

He [“Umar] came to know that some people remained at home [rather than swear fealty to his friend, Abu Bakr], so he used to go to them accompanied by a large number of his fellows and bring them to the Mosque to swear fealty. After a few days, he went with a large number of people to the house of Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) and demanded that he should come out, but Ali (as) refused. “Umar ordered firewood and a torch to be brought and said, “I swear by the One Who holds “Umar’s life in His hand that he either comes out or I burn his house and everyone in it!” He was told that Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S was there, and so were al-Hassan and al-Husayn, grandsons of the Messenger of Allah S and his offspring, and people found the statement which he made [“So what?!] very contemptible.

When he knew that they resented his statement, “Umar said, “What is wrong with you?! Do you see that

I have done anything like that?! I only want to scare them.” Ali (as) sent them the following message; “I have no intention to leave the house because I am very busy compiling the text of the Holy Qur'an which you have left behind your backs, and your love for the life of this world has diverted your attention from it. I have sworn neither to come out of my house nor to put my outer garment on till I compile its entire text.”

Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S went out to reason with them. She stood behind the door and said, “I do not know any day of my life worse than the one when I face you like that. You left the corpse of the Messenger of Allah S to us as you decided your affair among yourselves and did not let us take charge of you, nor did you uphold our rights, as if you did not understand what the Prophet S had said to you on the Ghadir Khumm day, by Allah...!”<sup>30</sup>

25. Al-Majlisi, may Allah have mercy on him, detailed a letter sent by the second caliph to Mu'awiyah narrating what al-Zahra' (sa) had to go through at his own hand. Among its contents are the following details:

I went to his [Ali's] house bent on getting him out of it. I said to the maid, Fidda, “Tell Ali to come out to swear fealty to Abu Bakr since all the Muslims have already done so.” She said, “The Commander of the Faithful is busy.” I said to her, “Leave such talk aside and tell him to come out or else we shall enter and get him out by force.”

Fatima (sa) came out and stood behind the door. She said, “O you folks of misguidance and falsehood, what are you saying, and what do you want?!” I said, “O Fatima!” Fatima (sa) said, “What do you want, ‘Umar?!” I said, “What is wrong with your cousin? Why did he send you to answer the door as he sat behind the curtain?” She said, “It is your own oppression, you wretch, that has forced me to come out thus and has tied you to the evidence as a misguided deviator.” I said, “Leave such falsehood and women's fables aside and tell Ali to come out.” She said, “Neither love is there for you from us nor respect; are you scaring me with the Party of Satan, O ‘Umar?! Surely the Party of Satan is weak.” I decided that if he refused to come out, I would bring plenty of firewood and burn everyone in his house unless Ali is led to swear the oath of allegiance. I took the whip of Qunfath and hit her with it, then I said to Khalid ibn al-Walid, “Go, you and our men, and gather firewood, for I shall set it ablaze myself.” She said, “O enemy of Allah, of His Messenger and of the Commander of the Faithful!” I hit Fatima (sa) on the hand because she was holding the door, thus stopping me from entering. I tried to open it but I could not, so I hit her hands with the whip, and it hurt her. I heard her exhaling and crying, and I almost felt that my heart was becoming soft, then I remembered Ali's grudges and how much blood he had spilled of the *heroes of the Arabs*. I kicked the door. Fatima had supported the door with her body, and I heard her let out a scream whereby I thought she turned Medina upside down. She said, “O Father! O Messenger of Allah! Should this be done to the one you loved, to your daughter?! O Fidda! Take me, for by Allah what I have in my womb has been killed.” I heard her birth-pangs as she supported herself with the wall. I pushed the door and entered. She faced me with a face that caused my vision to be blurred,

so I slapped her on her cheeks from outside the veil. Her ear-ring was crushed into bits and pieces that scattered on the ground. Ali came out. When I sensed his presence, I hurried to get out of the house and said to Khalid, Qunfath and those in their company, “I have been saved from something tremendous!” According to another narrative, he said, “I have committed a great crime from which I do not feel safe for my life at all, and here is Ali (as) coming out of the house. Neither I nor all of you combined can overpower him. Ali (as) came out. She hit with her hands her forelock to expose it and to complain to Allah, the Great, because of what had befallen her. Ali threw her outer mantle on her saying, “O daughter of the Messenger of Allah! Allah sent your father as mercy to the worlds... so, O Head of the Women of the World, you, too, should be mercy to these afflicted folks, and do not be a torment.” The pain of child-birth intensified. She entered the room and miscarried a child whom Ali had named Muhsin. I gathered many people, not to overpower Ali but so that I would feel safer. I approached him as he was besieged and took him out of his house... Abu Bakr said to me, “Woe unto you, O ‘Umar! What have you done to Fatima?!”<sup>31</sup>

26. Al-Ishnani quotes his grandfather quoting Muhammed ibn ‘Ammar quoting Musa ibn Isma’il quoting Hammad ibn Salamah quoting Abu al-Tufayl quoting Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) as saying that the Messenger of Allah S said to him, “O Ali (as)! There is a treasure for you in Paradise, and you are Thul-Qarnain (Double-Horns) of this nation, so do not follow your eyes while performing the prayers.” Al-Saduq has said, “I have heard some mentors saying that this treasure is his son al-Muhsin, the one whom Fatima (sa) miscarried when she was squeezed between both doors.” He cites evidence from a narration saying that Muhsin will be at the gate of Paradise. He will be told to enter, but he will refuse saying, “No! I shall not enter till both my parents enter first.”<sup>32</sup>

27. Ibn Tawus has said the following in his will to his son: “I have mentioned to you in some of the most interesting incidents how they wanted to burn the house of Fatima (sa) and everyone inside it. Al-’Abbas, your grandfather Ali (as), al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and other good people were at the time inside it.”<sup>33</sup>

We have already quoted Ibn Tawus in a previous chapter.

28. On reaching the topic of how Fatima (sa) was martyred, in his commentary on the book titled *Man La Yahduruhu al-Faqih*, al-Majlisi I states the following:

She, peace and blessings of Allah with her, was martyred because of the beating which she had received at the hands of “Umar [ibn al-Khattab]... He hit her stomach with the door when he wanted the Commander of the Faithful (sa) to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr. Qunfath, slave of “Umar, hit her with a whip as “Umar had ordered him to do. The incident is very well known by both Sunnis and Shi’as and it is detailed in the book of Sulaym ibn Qays al-Hilali. Due to the beating, a male child named Muhsin was miscarried. This is also mentioned in the book titled *Al-Irshad* by al-Mufid (may Allah be pleased with him.).”<sup>34</sup>

29. Al-Majlisi II has said,

According to another narrative, “Umar hit her with a whip, so she died while her wrist still showed a mark that looked like a bracelet because of his whipping... She did not let them take Ali (as) away before they had squeezed her behind the door, causing her to miscarry a child whom the Messenger of Allah (S) had named Muhsin. She died in the aftermath.

In another narrative, al-Mughirah ibn Shu’bah, acting on orders which he had received from “Umar, pushed the door on her stomach, causing her to miscarry Muhsin. He took Ali (as) to the Mosque by force.[35](#)

30. Al-Majlisi II, commenting on an authentic tradition narrated from the father of al-Hassan (as), says that Fatima (sa) is a truthful martyr, adding,

This incident proves that Fatima, peace and blessings of Allah with her, was a martyr, and this is a consecutively reported fact. The reason is that when they confiscated the caliphate, and when most people swore the oath of allegiance to them, they sent for the Commander of the Faithful (as) to participate, but he refused. “Umar brought fire to burn the house and everyone inside it, and they wanted to enter his house by force. Fatima (sa) prohibited them at the door, so Qunfath, slave of “Umar, pushed the door on Fatima’s stomach, breaking her rib and causing her to miscarry a fetus whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin. She fell sick as a result, and she died, peace and blessings of Allah with her. Both al-Tabari and al-Waqidi have stated in their respective *Tarikh* books that “Umar ibn al-Khattab went to Ali (as) in a group of men which included Assad ibn Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam and said, “Get out or I shall burn you all.” This is narrated by Hazanah, too.[36](#)

31. Al-Majlisi has said the following about “Umar ibn al-Khattab: “Our [Shi’a] narratives, and also theirs [Sunnis] as well, are quite clear in reporting how he terrified Fatima (sa) till she miscarried.

Consecutively reported narratives have stated that when both men [referring to Abu Bakr and ‘Umar] harmed her, peace and blessings of Allah with her, they actually harmed the Messenger of Allah S and Ali (as). Both parties [Shi’as and Sunnis] quote the Prophet S as saying, ‘Whoever harms Ali (as) harms me.’ Allah, the most Exalted and Sublime, has said, ‘Surely those who harm Allah and the Messenger of Allah S [with their evil deeds or words] are cursed by Allah in the life of this world and in the hereafter, and He has prepared for them a humiliating chastisement’ (Qur’an, 33:58). ”[37](#)

32. Al-Majlisi, may Allah have mercy on him, said the following as he was explaining some supplications:

Referring to the harm done by the first [caliph] as well as the second to Ali (as) and Fatima (sa), and how they wanted to burn Ali’s house, how they led him by force like a fleeting camel, how they squeezed Fatima (sa) with her door till she miscarried Muhsin, so much so that she ordered to be buried at night so that neither the first nor the second [“caliph”] would attend her funeral..., etc.”[38](#)

33. Some ancient traditionists and historians from among our fellows have included “the martyr” among her titles. Why was she a martyr? “She was a martyr because they beat her at her house’s door on her stomach till her fetus, whom the Messenger of Allah S had named al-Muhsin, died.”[39](#)

34. Others have said that when Ali (as) was brought to the Mosque, he made a statement wherein he said, “You folks of betrayal and abomination, prepare your answers, for you shall be questioned tomorrow. You will be asked why you oppressed us, we Ahl al-Bayt! Why should al-Zahra’ be beaten in daylight, and why should you confiscate our right by force?... It is very hard for Ali son of Abu Talib to see how the wrist of Fatima is turned black while everyone knows his status and observed his valor.”[40](#)

35. Al-Kashani says,

... Then “Umar gathered a bunch of *taleeqs* and hypocrites and brought them to the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as). They found his door locked, so they shouted, “Come out, O Ali, for the successor of the Messenger of Allah calls you to his presence!” He did not open the door to them. They brought firewood and put it at the door. Then they brought a torch in order to set it ablaze. “Umar shouted, “By Allah! If you do not open the door, we shall surely burn it!” When Fatima (sa) realized that they were going to burn her house, she stood up and opened the door for them. Those folks pushed her before she could return. Fatima (sa) hid behind the door. Then they leaped on the Commander of the Faithful (as) as he was sitting on his bed, surrounded him and dragged him from his house tied by his own garment, dragging him to the Mosque. Fatima (sa) tried to intercept between them and her husband and said, “By Allah! I shall not let you drag my cousin unjustly like that! Woe unto you! How swiftly you are to betray Allah and His Messenger S in our regard?! The Messenger of Allah S told you to follow us, to love us, and to uphold us, for Allah Almighty has said, ‘Say: I do not ask you for any reward for it [for the Prophetic Message] except love for my near relatives’ (Qur’an, 42:23).” Most people deserted him [“Umar] on account of her statement, so “Umar ordered Qunfath, the curse of Allah on him, to hit her with his whip. Qunfath whipped her on her back and side till he worn her out, leaving marks on her sacred body. That beating was the main reason why she miscarried a boy whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin.[41](#)

36. Muhammed ibn Ahmed ibn al-Hassan al-Daylami has said, “... till he broke the sword of al-Zubayr. He [“Umar] insulted Salman, hit ‘Ammar, harmed Ali (as) and assaulted the house of Fatima (sa).”[42](#)

37. He also said, “Some people have said that a rope was brought and placed around the neck of Ali (as) who was told to swear fealty [to Abu Bakr] or be killed.”[43](#)

38. He has also said, “It has been reported that Ali (as) did not leave his house till his door was burnt, and he was dragged to swear fealty against his wish.”[44](#)

39. He narrated that “Umar said to Ali (as), “Swear the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr].” Ali (as) said, “What if I do not?” “Umar said, “Then we shall kill you.” Such is accepted neither by the Islamic Legislative System (Shari'a ) nor by reason.[45](#)

40. The author of the book titled *Al-Dawlatayn* has stated that "Umar took a torch of fire and went to the house of Fatima (sa). Fatima (sa) came out. He said to her, "Tell Ali and al-'Abbas to come out or else I shall burn the house." There is no doubt that if he was forced to do what he did not want, he would be excused for having done it.<sup>46</sup>

41. Sayyid Taj ad-Din ibn Ali ibn Ahmed al-Husayni al-'Amili<sup>47</sup> has written the following:

When he, peace with him, saw how few his supporters were and how those who swore the oath of allegiance to him [at Ghadir Khumm] betrayed him, he remained at home. "Umar ibn al-Khattab gathered a group of people and brought them to the house of Ali (as). They found its door locked. Nobody permitted them to enter. "Umar called for firewood to be brought and said, "By Allah! If you do not open it, we shall burn it!" When Fatima (sa) heard that, she went out and opened the door. "Umar pushed the door as she was behind it, squeezing her and causing her to miscarry then subsequently to die as is transmitted. They entered and leaped on the Commander of the Faithful (sa) whom they took out by force. Fatima (sa) tried to intercept them and said, "I plead to you in the Name of Allah not to take my cousin out unjustly! Woe unto you! How swift you are in betraying Allah and His Messenger in our regard!" "Umar ordered Qunfath to whip her. The marks of whipping remained on her body [till her death].<sup>48</sup>

42. Fakhr ad-Din al-Turayhi (d. 1085 A.H./1674), who was a contemporary of al-Majlisi, may Allah have mercy on him, has recorded the following:

"... So, my Brethren, if we reconsider, abandoning the worship of our ego and shunning those who strayed and followed their own inclinations, do you think that Fatima (sa) was pleased when Khalid ibn al-Walid squeezed her, so she miscarried Muhsin, and Qunfath, slave of Abu Bakr, whipped her, leaving marks on her body, or when her husband, cousin and father of the Prophet 's grandsons, was cheated out of the caliphate...?!"<sup>49</sup>

43. The following is recorded in the book titled *Conference of Baghdad's Scholars*:

Having taken the oath of allegiance to himself from the people through coercion, force, threats and intimidation, Abu Bakr sent "Umar and Qunfath with Khalid ibn al-Walid, Abu 'Ubaydah ibn al-Jarrah and a group of hypocrites to the house of Ali and Fatima (as). "Umar gathered firewood at the door of Fatima's house. That was the same door where the Messenger of Allah S many times stood and said: "Assalamo Alaikom, O Household of the Prophetic Mission!" and he never entered it without permission. "Umar burnt the door of that house.

When Fatima (sa) went behind that door to send "Umar and his party away, "Umar squeezed her between the wall and the door very hard, causing her to miscarry her fetus, and one nail planted itself in her chest. Fatima (sa) screamed, "O Father! O Messenger of Allah! See what we have suffered after you at the hands of the son of al-Khattab and the son of Abu Quhafah!" "Umar turned to those in his company and said, "Hit Fatima!" The one who was very much loved by the Messenger of Allah S and

who was part of him was whipped, so much so that they caused her body to bleed. Marks of the hard squeeze and the bitter shock took their toll on Fatima's body, so she fell sick and depressed, remaining so till she died only a few days later. So, the house of Fatima (sa) is the house of the Prophetic Mission. Fatima (sa) was killed because of "Umar ibn al-Khattab.[50](#)

44. Al-Hassani has said, "According to another narrative, when they wanted to enter her house and take Ali (as) out, she wanted to stop them. Qunfath hit her on her face, hurting her eyes."[51](#)

45. Al-Hassani has also said, "According to a third narrative, she stood behind the door to stop them from entering. They thrust themselves on the door, pushing it against her, and she was pregnant, so she miscarried a son whom the Messenger of Allah S had named Muhsin."[52](#) It is as if the author wants to exonerate the assailants from the consequences of killing al-Muhsin, as the reader understands, by saying that he was killed because of the folks' stampede. This is rebutted by consecutively reported narratives proving that someone ["Umar] intentionally killed him by squeezing his mother between the door and the wall as has already been explained.

46. Ibn Hamzah al-Zaidi, relying on the authority of Muhammed ibn Ishaq ibn 'Abd al-Rahman ibn al-Harith who cites Muhammed ibn Rakanah as saying,

"Umar ibn al-Khattab, Khalid ibn al-Walid, 'Ayyash ibn Rabi'ah went to the door of Fatima's house. They said, "By Allah! You have to come out for the swearing of fealty!" "Umar said, "By Allah! We shall burn your house and everyone inside it!" Fatima (sa) called out, "O Messenger of Allah! What have we suffered after you?!" Al-Zubayr came out to meet them with his sword unsheathed. He attacked them. When 'Ayyash saw him, he said to "Umar, "Beware of the dog!" 'Ayyash threw a garment on al-Zubayr, caught him with both his arms and pulled the sword from his hand. He kept hitting it on a rock till it broke.[53](#)

47. He also narrated through *isnad* to 'Abdullah ibn "Umar al-'Omari who quotes Zaid ibn Aslam quoting his father as saying, "I was among those who gathered firewood at Ali's house. "Umar said, 'By Allah! If Ali son of Abu Talib does not come out, I shall burn the house and everyone inside it!'"[54](#)

48. He also narrated through *isnad* to Muhammed ibn 'Abd al-Rahman ibn al-Sa'ib ibn Zaid who quotes his father as saying, "I was with "Umar ibn al-Khattab when he wanted to burn the house of Fatima (sa). He said, 'If they refuse to swear the oath of allegiance, I shall burn their house!' I said to "Umar, 'But Fatima (sa) is inside the house! Do you still intend to burn it?!" He said, 'I and Fatima shall meet."[55](#)

49. Ibn Hamzah al-Zaidi clearly indicated that the house of al-Zahra' (sa) was attacked many times, time and over again, gathering various narratives one of which says that when Ali (as) refused to swear fealty, he was joined by Talhah and al-Zubayr, and they did not come out until "Umar went there and wanted to burn the house while they were inside it. Another says that Abu Bakr came out to the Mosque to pray, ordering Khalid ibn al-Walid to pray beside him then to kill Ali (as) as soon as Abu Bakr was to pronounce the *tasleem* following his prayers. A third narrative states that Ali (as) was brought by force,

so he swore fealty against his wish. Ibn Hamzah comments on these incidents saying, “All this happened during different times, and there is no contradiction among these narratives, nor does any of them cancel the other.”<sup>56</sup>

50. It has been narrated from the son of ‘Abd al-Rahman that he said, “I heard Sharik saying, ‘What do they have to do with Fatima (sa)?! By Allah! I shall never raise an army, nor shall I assemble people together! By Allah! Both men [Abu Bakr and “Umar] have hurt the Messenger of Allah S in his grave!”<sup>57</sup>

51. In a letter from Mu’awiyah to Muhammed son of Abu Bakr, the first says, “When Allah chose for His Prophet, peace and blessings with him, what He has, completing for him what He promised him and enabling his call to prevail, showing His proof, He took his soul away to Him. Immediately thereafter, your father [Abu Bakr] and his ‘Faruq’ [“Umar ibn al-Khattab] were the very first to usurp his rights and go against his orders. They both agreed with each other to do so, coordinating their effort. Then they called him [Ali (as)] to swear fealty to them, but he lagged behind, so they were very upset with him and decided to commit a great crime against him.”<sup>58</sup>

52. Al-Mas’udi has said,

He paid them no heed. The Commander of the Faithful (as) and his Shi’as stayed at home, fulfilling a promise to the Messenger of Allah S. They [“Umar and Abu Bakr] sent people to his [Ali’s] house. They assaulted him. They burn his house door. They took him out by force, and they squeezed the Head of the Women of the World with the door till she miscarried Muhsin. They required him to swear the oath of allegiance, but he refused saying, “I shall not swear it.” They said to him, “Then we shall kill you.” He said, “If you kill me, I am a servant of Allah and a Brother of His Messenger S.” They made him stretch his hand, but he did not open it. They tried to open his hand but could not, so he [Abu Bakr] rubbed on it as it was withheld.<sup>59</sup>

53. Nasr ibn Muzahim has transmitted from Muhammed ibn ‘Ubaydullah from al-Jurjani saying that “Umar said to Mu’awiyah during the Battle of Siffin, “Let them have access to the water, for Ali (as) should not remain thirsty while you are not, and in his hands are the horses’ reins as he looks at the Euphrates wondering if he will drink of it or die of thirst. You know how courageous he is, and the people of Iraq and Hijaz support him. Both you and I heard him say, ‘Had I had only forty men when my house was assaulted, meaning the house of Fatima (sa)..., etc.’”<sup>60</sup>

54. During the sickness that preceded his demise, Abu Bakr said that he regretted three things which he had done and how he wished he never did them. He stated those things. Among what he said was the following: “I wish I never searched the house of Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S and never permitted the men to enter it even if it had shut its door during war time...”<sup>61</sup>

Al-Majlisi commented on the above saying, “This proves what is already reported about his [“Umar’s] assault of the house of Fatima (sa) when Ali (as) and al-Zubayr and others assembled there and that he [Abu Bakr] sought his own self-interest rather than that of others.”<sup>62</sup>

What is noteworthy here is that Abu ‘Ubayd al-Qasim ibn Salim has mentioned this issue, but he did not openly admit such a characteristic [of Abu Bakr]. Rather, he was satisfied with saying, “As regarding the deed which I did and which I wish I never did, it was such-and-such.” Abu ‘Ubayd said, “I do not want to hear it! I wish on the day of *saqifat* Banu Sa’idah I did not take part at all..., etc.”<sup>63</sup>

Why did Abu ‘Ubayd, namely al-Qasim ibn Salim, hate this particular phrase rather than all others?! This is a question the answer for which is well known by everyone who knows the politics of those people, the truth of their intentions, their inclinations, cunning and conniving.

## 55. Al-Mas’udi Twists Words in His Book

Al-Mas’udi has stated the following: “Urwah ibn al-Zubayr used to excuse his brother, ‘Abdullah, for confining Banu Hashim to the valley and his gathering firewood to burn them. He used to say, ‘He intended by doing so to put an end to dissension, so that the Muslims would be unified, obedient [to Abu Bakr], so their word would be one, just as “Umar ibn al-Khattab did to Banu Hashim when they lagged behind and refused to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, for he gathered firewood in order to burn their house.”’ Such is the text on p. 86, Vol. 3, of *Muruj al-Dhahab* by al-Mas’udi as printed by Al-Maymuniyya Press [Cairo, Egypt]. But all other printings of this same book<sup>64</sup> have deleted the sentence saying “... just as “Umar ibn al-Khattab did to Banu Hashim when they lagged behind and refused to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, for he gathered firewood in order to burn their house.”

The Mu’tazilite scholar<sup>65</sup> has cited al-Mas’udi’s text in its correct form as stated above in the edition printed by the Maymuniyya Press. This proves that the hands of betrayal and forgery played havoc with all editions of this book just as they have done in many others, and those who oppressed the family of Muhammed (S) “... **shall come to know to what final place of turning they shall turn back**” (*Qur'an, 26:227*).

## 6. The Book *Al-Ma’arif* Distorted

Because of the issue of al-Muhsin being miscarried, we find them not hesitating to distort the original contents of the book titled *Al-Ma’arif* by Ibn Qutaybah as we are told by Ibn Shahr Ashub who died in 588 A.H./1192 A.D. Says he, “Ibn Qutaybah states in his book titled *Al-Ma’arif* that Muhsin perished because of the squeezing [of his mother] by Qunfath of Banu ‘Adiyy.”<sup>66</sup>

Al-Kanji, the Shafi’i scholar who died in 685 A.H., cites the mentor, al-Mufid, saying, “He [Ibn Qutaybah] added to what most scholars have reported saying that Fatima, peace with her, miscarried after the demise of the Prophet (S) a son whom the Messenger of Allah (S) had named Muhsin. This is something which is not reported by anyone from among the transmitters except Ibn Qutaybah.”<sup>67</sup>

It seems he means that Ibn Qutaybah has transmitted the above in his book titled *Al-Ma’arif* as Ibn Shahr Ashub testifies. But if you look at p. 92 of the edition of the same book printed in 1353 A.H., you will instead read the following sentence: “As for Muhsin son of Ali (as), he died young.” Such is the case

with all other editions now in circulation... So, why should some people resort to such distorting and such betrayal of the historical truth?! We wonder.

57. Al-Shahristani, who dies in 548 A.H./1153 A.D., discussing al-Nizam, who died in 231 A.H./846 A.D., says, “He provided more details about the tragedy saying that ‘Umar hit the stomach of Fatima (sa) on the day when people swore the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr] till she miscarried a fetus from her womb, and he used to shout, ‘Burn her house and everyone inside it!’ And there was none in the house except Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as).”<sup>68</sup>

[Al-Khateeb] al-Baghdadi has quoted al-Nizam [Nizam al-Dawla, the Abbaside] as saying that “Umar hit Fatima (sa) and deprived the Progeny of the Prophet (S) of their inheritance.<sup>69</sup>

Al-Maqrizi says, “... It is alleged that he hit Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S) and deprived the Prophet’s Progeny of their inheritance.”<sup>70</sup>

Al-Safadi has also quoted him as saying, ““Umar hit the stomach of Fatima (sa) on the day when the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr] was taken, so she miscarried al-Muhsin.”<sup>71</sup>

## **Important Note**

Al-Jahiz الْجَاهِز has said the following about al-Nizam: “He used to be the most critical of the Rafidis because of their casting doubts about the characters of the *sahaba*.<sup>72</sup>

58. In their biography of Muhammed ibn ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Umar ibn Muhammed ibn al-Hassan al-Faris, namely Abul-Hayat, the preacher from Balkh [Baluchistan], “Ali ibn Mahmud has told me that the preacher from Balkh was addicted to taunting the *sahaba*, so I attended his meeting place once. He said, ‘Fatima (sa) wept once, whereon Ali (as) said to her, ‘Are you crying because of me?! Did I confiscate your property (Fadak)? Did I usurp what belongs to you? Did I do such-and-such...?’ and he kept counting the things which the Rafidis claim that both *shaikhs* [Abu Bakr and “Umar] did to Fatima (sa). All the Rafidis present there wept loudly.” He died in Safar of 196 A.H./812 A.D.”<sup>73</sup>

59. Ibn Sa’d, through his *isnad* to Salma, has said, “Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S) fell sick among us. On the day when she died, Ali (as) went outside. She said to me, ‘O bondmaid! Pour the water for me so I may bathe.’ I poured it for her, and she took the best bath then said, ‘Bring me my mourning clothes.’ I brought them to her and helped her put them on. Then she said to me, ‘Let my bed be in the middle of the house.’ I did, and she slept on it, facing the *qibla*. Then she said to me, ‘O bondmaid! I am dying now, and I have already taken by bath; so, nobody should uncover even my shoulder.’ She died. Ali (as) returned, and I informed him of what happened. He said, ‘No, by Allah! Nobody shall ever uncover even her shoulder!’ He carried her and buried her as she was.”<sup>74</sup>

60. In another text, it is stated that when Abu Bakr received the oath of allegiance from the public, Ali (as) and al-Zubayr kept consulting with Fatima (sa), and “Umar heard about it, so he went to Fatima

(sa) and said, “O daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S)! By Allah! Nobody at all I love more than I love your father, and nobody is more dear to us after your father than your own self. By Allah! This does not stop me at all from burning the door of these individuals assembling with you!” When “Umar went out, she said to them, “You know that “Umar has been here and he swore by Allah to burn the house door. By Allah! He shall carry out what he swore to do; so, disperse to your destinations and flee.” They left her and did not return to her till they had sworn fealty...”[75](#)

61. Al-Balathiri has quoted Ibn ‘Abbas as saying, “Abu Bakr and “Umar ibn al-Khattab sent for Ali (S) when he refused to swear the oath of allegiance. He said, ‘Bring him to me in the most violent way.’ When he was brought to him, a dialogue went on between them both. He [Ali (as)] said to “Umar, ‘Milk some milk only a portion of which is yours. By Allah! You are not concerned about his [Abu Bakr’s] government so much except that in the future he will advance you for it.’”[76](#)

62. Al-Ya’qubi has said, “It came to the knowledge of Abu Bakr and “Umar that a group of the Muhajirun and Ansar assembled with Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) at the house of Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S). They went in a group till they assaulted the house. Ali (as) went out carrying his sword. “Umar met him and they had a brawl. Ali (as) subdued “Umar and broke his sword. They entered the house by force, so Fatima (sa) went out and said, “I plead to you in the Name of Allah to get out or else I shall uncover my hair and lodge a complaint to Allah against you!” Everyone in the house went out. The people stayed for days and one by one swore the oath of allegiance save Ali (as) who did not do so except six months later or, according to some, forty days.”[77](#)

His statement that “Ali (as) went out carrying his sword” is not accurate; what is accurate is that al-Zubayr did so as is well known from all texts.

63. Zaid ibn Aslam has said,

I was one of those who carried firewood with “Umar to Fatima’s house door when Ali (as) and his supporters refused to swear the oath of allegiance. “Umar said to Fatima (sa), “Get out of the house or else I shall burn it and everyone inside it!” Ali (as), al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and a group from among the companions of the Prophet (S) were inside it. Fatima (sa) said to “Umar, “Shall you really burn my sons?!” “Yes,” “Umar answered, “by Allah, if they all do not come out to swear fealty.”[78](#)

The narrator goes on to say, “This is also narrated by Ibn Kharthamah or Ibn Kharthabah or Ibn Khayranah or Ibn Khathabah.”[79](#)

Al-Waqidi has said that “Umar went to Ali (as) with a group of people which included Assad ibn al-Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam al-Ashhali and said, “Get out, or else we shall burn you all!”[80](#)

Al-Hurr al-’Amili, may Allah have mercy on him, has said,

Narrators have transmitted, and so have chroniclers, that when “Umar secured the oath of allegiance to

his friend [Abu Bakr] and Ali (as) lagged behind, he went to Fatima's house to demand that Ali (as) swear fealty. He used a very rough language and ordered firewood to be brought in order to burn the house and everyone inside it. Inside it were: the Commander of the Faithful (as), his wife and sons (as). Those who supported Ali (as) included al-Zubayr and a group from the Banu Hashim. Among those who narrated the incident in detail are: al-Waqidi, Ibn Jubayr and Ibn 'Abd Rabbih.[81](#)

65. Musa ibn 'Uqbah has quoted Ibn Shihab saying that men from among the Muhajirun were very angry when people swore the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr. Among them was Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) and al-Zubayr ibn al-'Awwam. They entered the house of Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S). "Umar ibn al-Khattab went there accompanied by a group from among the Muhajirun and Ansar which included Assad ibn Hudayr, Salamah ibn Aslam ibn Waqsh, both from Banu al-Ashhal, and Thabit ibn Qays ibn Shammas al-Khazraji. They spoke to both of them till one of those folks took al-Zubayr's sword and kept hitting it on a stone till he broke it.[82](#)

Musa ibn 'Uqbah has said the following in his book which discusses the Prophet's military campaigns [*Kitab al-Maghazi*]:

Sa'd ibn Ibrahim is quoted as saying, "My father narrated to me that his father, 'Abd al-Rahman ibn 'Awf, was with "Umar [when they all attacked Fatima's house], and that Muhammed ibn Maslamah broke al-Zubayr's sword. Then Abu Bakr delivered a sermon and apologized to the people."[83](#)

66. Having listed the names of those who refused to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr and who sided with Ali ibn Abu Talib (as), Ibn al-Shahnah says the following: "Then "Umar went to Fatima's house to burn it and everyone inside it. Fatima (sa) met him. He said to her, 'Join what the rest of the nation has done.' Ibn Wasil says that Ali (as) went out to Abu Bakr and swore fealty to him. 'A'isha said that Ali (as) never swore the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr till Fatima (sa) died."[84](#)

67. Ibn 'Abd Rabbih, a Mu'tazilite, is quoted by al-Balathiri and others as having said,

As regarding Ali (as), al-'Abbas and al-Zubayr, they took to Fatima's house till Abu Bakr sent them "Umar ibn al-Khattab to get them out of Fatima's house, saying to him, "If they refuse, you should fight them." "Umar brought a torch of fire in order to burn their house. Fatima (sa) met him and said to him, "O son of al-Khattab! Have you really come here to burn our house?!" Or she said to him, "Are you really going to burn my house door?" or "my house?" He said, "Yes, if you do not join the rest of the nation." Or he said, "Yes, and this is stronger than what your father had brought." Ali (as) went and swore fealty.[85](#)

68. Ibn Jarir [al-Tabari] has said,

Ibn Hamad has narrated to us saying that Jarir quotes al-Mughirah quoting Ziyad ibn Kulayb as saying that "Umar ibn al-Khattab went to the house of Fatima (sa) where Talhah and al-Zubayr and men from among the Muhajirun were assembling. He said to them, "By Allah! I shall burn your house or else you

should get out to swear the oath of allegiance!” Al-Zubayr went out to meet him, bearing his unsheathed sword, but he stumbled, so the sword fell from his hand. They leaped at him and arrested him.[86](#)

69. In another text, the same author says,

Ali (as) and al-Zubayr lagged behind [did not swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr]. Al-Zubayr unsheathed his sword and said, “I shall not place it back in its scabbard until people swear the oath of allegiance to Ali (as)! ” Abu Bakr and “Umar came to know about it. “Umar said, “Take al-Zubayr’s sword and hit it on a stone.” “Umar set out to meet them. He arrested both of them saying, “You shall both swear fealty at will or else we shall force you to swear it.” So they swore fealty.[87](#)

70. The Mu’tazilite scholar (Ibn Abul-Hadid) has said,

Abu Bakr [namely Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-’Aziz] has said that Abu Sa’d, ‘Abd al-Rahman ibn Muhammed, narrated to us saying that Ahmed ibn al-Hakim has said that ‘Abdullah ibn Wahab narrated to us citing Layth ibn Sa’d saying that Ali (as) did not swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, so he was taken out tied up. He was dragged in a hurry as he kept saying, “O Muslims! Why should a Muslim be killed because he lagged behind others not because of a disagreement but because he has something very important to do [the compilation of the text of the Holy Qur’an]?!” Whenever he passed by a meeting place, he was told to go and swear the oath of allegiance [to Abu Bakr].[88](#)

71. The same author has also said,

Only Ali (as) refused to swear the oath of allegiance, confining himself to Fatima’s house, so they took him out by force. Fatima (sa) went to the house door and said something to the person who went there seeking to arrest him.[89](#)

72. Ibn Abul-Hadid, the Mu’tazilite Shafi’i scholar, has also said,

“I said that he took this theme from some poets belonging to Banu Talib, from the people of Hijaz. Al-Naqib Jalal ad-Din ‘Abd al-Hamid ibn Muhammed ibn ‘Abd al-Hamid, the ‘Alawide, recited it to me. He said that the poet himself had recited it to me, but I forgot his name. Said he,

*O father of Hafs! Wait! You would not have been to plead to*

*Had it not been for the death [of the Prophet].*

*Should al-Batul die angry while we are pleased?*

*Such are not the deeds of gracious sons at all.*

The poet was addressing “Umar saying, “Slow down! Wait! O “Umar! Have some compassion and some wisdom, and do not be rough like that with us. You are not qualified to talk to us like that, nor should we ask you gently, nor could you have entered the house of Fatima (sa) by force had her father,

because of whom her house was safeguarded and respected, had died, so you coveted what you could not have coveted before.” Then he says something like this: “Should our mother [Fatima (sa)] die while still angry and we are pleased? We would not be then good offspring at all because a good son is pleased when his parents are pleased and angry when they, too, are angry.” I have confirmed that she died while being still very angry with Abu Bakr and “Umar and that she left a will saying that they both should not perform her funeral prayers.[90](#)

73. The same scholar has also said,

Abu Bakr [namely Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-’Aziz] has said that Abu Bakr al-Bahili has cited Isma’il ibn Mujalid quoting al-Sha’bi saying that Abu Bakr said, “O ‘Umar! Where is Khalid ibn al-Walid?” He said, “Here he is.” Abu Bakr said, “Go to both of them (meaning to Ali (as) and al-Zubayr) and bring them to me.” They both went there. “Umar entered while Khalid remained outside at the door. “Umar said to al-Zubayr, “What is this sword for?” Al-Zubayr [ibn al-’Awwam] said, “I have prepared it to swear the oath of allegiance to Ali (as).” There were many people at the house including al-Miqdad ibn al-Aswad and many from Banu Hashim. “Umar took [al-Zubayr’s] sword and hit it on a rock at the house till it broke. Then he dragged al-Zubayr by the hand, forced him to stand, then pushed him out. Then he said, “O Khalid! Take this one!” Khalid took hold of him. With Khalid outside the house were many people sent by Abu Bakr as reinforcements. Then “Umar entered again and said to Ali (as), “Stand up and swear the oath of allegiance.” Ali (as) relented. “Umar grabbed Ali (as) by the hand and told him to stand up, but he refused, so he carried him and pushed him just as he had done to al-Zubayr. Khalid arrested both men. “Umar and those with him dragged them violently as a large number of people looked on. The streets of Medina were filled with people. Fatima (sa) saw what “Umar had done, so she screamed and complained, and many women from Banu Hashim and from others assembled around her. She went out to the door of her chamber and called out saying, “O Abu Bakr! How swift you are in waging an assault on the family of the Messenger of Allah (S)! By Allah! I shall never speak to “Umar till I meet Allah!”[91](#)

74. The Mu’tazilite Shafi’i scholar narrated the incident of the *saqifa*[92](#) from al-Jawhari saying:

Abu Bakr [Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-’Aziz] has said that Abu Zaid, “Umar ibn Shabbah, has said that Ahmed ibn Mu’awiyah narrated to us saying that he was told by al-Nadar ibn Shumayl saying that Muhammed ibn ‘Amr has cited Salamah ibn ‘Abd al-Rahman saying that when Abu Bakr seated himself on the pulpit [of the Prophet (S)], Ali (S) and al-Zubayr and many people from Banu Hashim were at Fatima’s house. “Umar went to them and said, “I swear by the One Who holds my life in His hands that if you do not come out to swear the oath of allegiance, I shall burn your house!” Al-Zubayr went out unsheathing his sword. A man from the Ansar and Zaid ibn Labid overpowered him, causing his sword to fall. From his place on top of the pulpit, Abu Bakr shouted, “Hit it on the stone!” He did so [breaking al-Zubayr’s sword]. ‘Amr ibn Hammas said, “I saw the stone with the marks of such hitting and said, ‘Here was al-Zubayr’s sword broken.’” Abu Bakr then said, “Leave them alone, for Allah shall bring them.” They went out after that and swore the oath of allegiance to him.[93](#)

75. Abu Bakr [Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-’Aziz] has also said, “It is narrated in another narrative that Sa’d ibn Abu Waqqas was with them at the house of Fatima (sa), and so was al-Miqdad ibn al-Aswad. They assembled with Ali (S) to swear the oath of allegiance to him, so ‘Umar went there to burn their house. Al-Zubayr went out carrying his sword to meet him. Fatima (sa), too, went out crying and wailing, separately from the rest of people. They said, ‘We have not committed any sin, nor do we oppose anything good about which people come to an agreement, but we gathered in order to compile the text of the Qur’an in one single book.’<sup>94</sup> Then they swore the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, thus people felt secure.”

76. Abu Bakr [Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-’Aziz] has also said,

Abu Zaid, “‘Umar ibn Shabbah, has quoted some of his men as saying that ‘Umar went to the house of Fatima (sa) accompanied by a number of men from among the Ansar and a very small number from among the Muhajirun. He said, “By the One Who holds my life in His hand! You shall have to come out to swear fealty or I shall burn your house!” Al-Zubayr went out to meet him, unsheathing his sword. Ziyad ibn Labid al-Ansari and another man grabbed him, and the sword fell from his hand which ‘Umar hit on a stone, breaking it. Then ‘Umar dragged them from their clothes violently till they swore fealty to Abu Bakr.<sup>95</sup>

77. Abu Zaid has said that al-Nadar ibn Shumayl has narrated saying that al-Zubayr’s sword, when it fell from his hand, was carried to Abu Bakr as he was sitting on the pulpit delivering a speech. Abu Bakr said, “Hit it on a rock!” Abu ‘Amr ibn Hammas said, “I saw the rock with the mark of that hitting, and people were saying that it was left by al-Zubayr’s sword.”<sup>96</sup>

78. The Mu’tazilite scholar has said,

Ibn ‘Abd al-Hamid has said that when people were talking about how Ali (as) did not swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, and when Abu Bakr and ‘Umar pressured him to do so, the mother of Mastah ibn Athathah went out and stood at the grave [of the Messenger of Allah (S)] and cited the following verses of poetry [originally composed by Fatima (sa)]:

*There were issues, events and hardships*

*Had you witnessed them, no calamities would have transpired.*

*We miss you as the earth misses its rain,*

*And your people slipped, so witness them and do not be absent.*

Abu Bakr, namely Ahmed ibn ‘Abd al-’Aziz, has said that Abu Zaid, “‘Umar ibn Shabbah, has informed us that Ibrahim ibn al-Munthir has quoted Ibn Wahab quoting Ibn Lahi’ah quoting Abul-Aswad [al-Du’ali, the renown poet] saying that a man from the Muhajirun was angry with Abu Bakr receiving people’s oath of allegiance without any consultation, and so were Ali (S) and al-Zubayr. The latter entered the house

of Fatima (sa). "Umar went there accompanied by a number of men, including Assad ibn Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam ibn Waqsh, both from Banu 'Abd al-Ashhal, and they broke into the house. Fatima (sa) screamed and pleaded to them in the Name of Allah. They took the swords of Ali (S) and al-Zubayr and hit them on the wall till they broke them both. Then "Umar took them out, dragging them, till they swore fealty.[97](#)

79. The same scholar goes on to say that Abu Bakr [Ahmed ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz] has narrated the same incident from another venue saying that Thabit ibn Qays ibn Shammas was among those who were in "Umar's company when the latter assaulted the house of Fatima (sa). Thabit belongs to Banu al-Harith ibn al-Khzraj.

80. He also narrates saying that Muhammed ibn Maslamah was with them, and that this Muhammed was the one who broke al-Zubayr's sword.[98](#)

81. Accompanied by many men, "Umar went to Fatima's house. Among those men were: Assad ibn Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam. He told those inside her house to get out to swear the oath of allegiance [to his friend, Abu Bakr], but they refused. Al-Zubayr came out to meet them with his sword. "Umar said, "Take care of the dog!" Salamah ibn Aslam leaped at him, took the sword from his hand and pushed him on the wall. Then they took him and Ali (S) with a number of Banu Hashim. Ali (S) kept saying to them, 'I am a servant of Allah and the Brother of the Messenger of Allah (S).' They brought Ali (S) to Abu Bakr. He was told to swear fealty. He said, "I am more worthy of this matter than you. I will not swear the oath of allegiance. Rather, you ought to swear it to me. You took this matter from the Ansar under the pretext of your kinship to the Messenger of Allah (S), so they submitted leadership to you, and I argue with you using the same argument you used with the Ansar. Be fair to us, if you fear Allah, and recognize our right just as the Ansar recognize it; otherwise, be afflicted with injustice, and you know it." "Umar said, "We shall not leave you alone till you swear the oath of allegiance." Ali (S) said to him, "O "Umar! Milk some milk in which you have a share! Support him [Abu Bakr] today so that he will hand it [caliphate] over to you tomorrow! By Allah! I shall not accept what you say, nor shall I swear fealty to him."[99](#)

82. The Mu'tazilite scholar has also said, "As regarding the terrible things which the Shi'as mention about dispatching Qunfath to the house of Fatima (sa), and that he whipped her, leaving a mark on her wrist like a bracelet which lingered there till her death, and that "Umar squeezed her between the door and the house, so she cried out, 'O Father! O Messenger of Allah!', that her fetus was born dead..., our fellows do not report such incidents... Rather, the Shi'as are alone in transmitting them." This is so despite the fact that the scholar himself is the one who transmitted from his mentor the incident of the miscarriage of al-Muhsin and wondered about the stand of the Messenger of Allah (S) in its regard. He did so when he narrated how Habar ibn al-Aswad was to be killed for terrorizing Zainab. When he demanded his mentor to tell him about it, his mentor told him that the incidents, according to him, were contradictory, and that he would leave the matter there.[100](#) We have also cited scores of texts narrated

by non-Shi'as testifying to the authenticity of this incident, so his statement makes no sense.

83. Ibn Abul-Hadid has also said, "As regarding the incident of the attack on the house of Fatima (sa), we have already discussed it. Apparently, I can see the accuracy of what al-Murtada and the Shi'as narrate, but not all what they narrate, for some of it did take place, and Abu Bakr was right in regretting it and repenting, and this proves the strength of his conviction and fear of Allah Almighty. This ought to be used as a testimony for him rather than against him." [101](#)

84. He also says, "As regarding the incident of the burning and what awful things happened, and how some people have said that they dragged Ali (as) by his turban surrounded by people, this is far-fetched. Only the Shi'as make such a claim, but some traditionists have narrated *almost* the same." [102](#) We do not know how he compromises his statement that "Only the Shi'a make such a claim" with the one saying "A group of traditionists have narrated *almost* the same"! Some such traditionists were Mu'tazilites like him, and the reader has already come to know that everything this scholar sees as "far-fetched" has been narrated by the masses that follow his own creed. Sayyid al-Murtada has said that nobody should pay any attention to one who rejects texts by simply regarding them as "far-fetched" without producing any proof or evidence.

85. Ibn Qutaybah al-Daynuri has said,

"As regarding Ali (S) and al-'Abbas ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib and their supporters from among Banu Hashim, they dispersed to their mounts, and al-Zubayr ibn al-'Awwam was with them. 'Umar went to them accompanied by a group of men which included Assad ibn Hudayr and Salamah ibn Aslam. They were told to go to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr, but they refused. Al-Zubayr ibn al-'Awwam came out, sword in hand. 'Umar said, "Take care of the man! Arrest him!" Salamah ibn Aslam leaped at him, took the sword from his hand and hit it on the wall. They took him away and he swore fealty, and Banu Hashim, too, went and swore it. Ali, may Allah glorify his countenance, was brought to Abu Bakr as he kept saying, "I am a servant of Allah and the Brother of His Messenger (S)." He was told to swear the oath of allegiance to Abu Bakr. He said, "I have more right to this issue than you. I shall not swear the oath of allegiance to you. Rather, you ought to swear it to me. You have taken this issue from the Ansar, arguing with them that you have kinship with the Prophet (S), yet you usurp it from us, while we are the members of his Ahl al-Bayt?! Did you not claim to the Ansar that you deserve it more than them since Muhammed (S) is from you, so they handed you the reins of leadership and granted you the government?! I argue with you with the same argument which you used against the Ansar: We have more right to the Messenger of Allah (S), be he alive or dead, than you; so, be fair to us if you are believers; otherwise, be afflicted with injustice, and you know it." 'Umar said to him, "You shall not be left alone till you swear fealty." Ali (as) said to him, "Milk some milk in which you have a share! Support him [Abu Bakr] today so that he will hand it [caliphate] over to you tomorrow!" Then he added saying, "By Allah, O 'Umar! I shall not accept what you say, nor shall I swear fealty to him." [103](#)

86. Ibn Qutaybah has also said, "Abu Bakr noticed that some people did not swear the oath of

allegiance to him and were at the house of Ali, may Allah glorify his countenance, so he dispatched "Umar to them. "Umar called out to them as they were inside Ali's house, but they refused to come out, so he ordered firewood to be brought and said, 'I swear by the One Who holds "Umar's life in His hand, you shall have to get out or else I shall burn the house and everyone inside it!' Someone said to him, 'O father of Hafs! But Fatima (sa) is inside it!' He said, 'So what?!" They went out and swore fealty except Ali (as) who said, 'I swore not to go out nor to put my outer garment on until I compile the text of the Qur'an.' Fatima, may Allah be pleased with her, stood at her house door and said, 'I have never seen people whose presence is worse than yours. You left the Messenger of Allah (S) as a corpse in front of us and managed your affair among yourselves without letting us take charge of you, nor did you uphold our rights.' "Umar went to Abu Bakr and said, 'Are you not going to take the oath of allegiance from this man who lagged behind and has not sworn it yet?' Abu Bakr said to Qunfath, one of his slaves, 'Go and bring Ali to me.' He went to Ali (as) who asked him, 'What do you want?' He said, 'The successor of the Messenger of Allah (S) invites you to his presence.' Ali (as) said, 'How quickly you all tell lies about the Messenger of Allah (S)!' Qunfath returned and conveyed the message. Abu Bakr wept for a long time. For the second time, "Umar said to him, 'Do not grant a respite to the man who has not sworn allegiance to you yet.' Abu Bakr said to Qunfath, 'Go back to him and tell him that the successor of the Messenger of Allah (S) invites you to swear fealty.' Qunfath went to Ali (as) and conveyed the message. Ali (as) raised his voice as he said, 'Praise be to Allah! He has claimed what does not belong to him!' Qunfath returned and conveyed the message. Abu Bakr again wept for a long time. "Umar stood up and walked, accompanied by some men, till they reached the door of Fatima's house. When Fatima (sa) heard their voices, she called as loudly as she could, 'O Father! O Messenger of Allah (S)! What have we suffered after you at the hands of the son of al-Khattab and the son of Abu Quhafah?!" When those men heard her voice and crying, they dispersed, weeping, and their hearts almost softened. "Umar remained alone with some of his folks. They took Ali (as) out by force, dragging him to Abu Bakr and told him to swear fealty. He said, 'Suppose I do not, what will you do?' They said, 'We shall, by Allah, the One and only God, kill you.' Ali (as) said, 'You will then kill a servant of Allah and the Brother of His Messenger.' "Umar said, 'As regarding your being a servant of Allah, you are, indeed, a very good one, but we reject your being the Brother of His Messenger.' During the whole time, Abu Bakr remained silent without saying anything. "Umar said to him, 'Are you going to issue your order [of killing] in his regard?' Abu Bakr said, 'I shall not force him to do anything so long as Fatima (sa) is beside him.' Ali (as) went to the grave of the Messenger of Allah (S) crying and calling out [a verse of the Holy Qur'an quoting prophet Aaron pleading to his younger brother, prophet Moses (as)], 'O son of my mother! The folks deemed me weak and almost killed me!"

[104](#)

87. Here, we would like to quote the exact Arabic text, which is written by Sunnis, of this portion for the benefit of Arabic speaking readers followed by its translation:

قال عمر لأبي بكر (رض): انطلق بنا إلى فاطمة، فإننا قد أغضبناها، فانطلقوا جميعاً، فاستأذنا على فاطمة، فلم تأذن لهما.

فأتيا عليا فكلماه، فأدخلهما عليها، فلما قعدا عندها، حولت وجهها إلى الحائط، فسلاما عليها، فلم ترد عليهما السلام.

فتكلم أبو بكر فقال: يا حبيبة رسول الله! والله إن قرابة رسول الله أحب إلي من قرابتني، وإنك لأحب إلي من عائلة ابنتي، ولو ددت يوم مات أبوك أني مت، ولا أبقى بعده، أفتراني أعرفك وأعرف فضلك وشرفك وأمنعك حقك وميراثك من رسول الله؟! إلا أني سمعت أباك رسول الله (ص) يقول: لا نورث، ما تركنا فهو صدقة.

قالت: أرأيتكما إن حدثكمَا حديثاً عن رسول الله (ص) تعرفانه وتفعلان به؟

قالا: نعم.

قالت: نشدتكما الله ألم تسمعا رسول الله يقول: رضى فاطمة من رضاي، وسخط فاطمة من سخطي، فمن أحب فاطمة ابنتي فقد أحبني، ومن أرضى فاطمة فقد أرضاني، ومن أسخط فاطمة فقد أسخطني؟

قالا: نعم سمعناه من رسول الله (ص).

قالت: فإني أشهد الله ومملائكته أنكم أسلطتماني وما أرضيتماني، ولئن لقيت النبي لأشكونكمَا إليه.

قال أبو بكر: أنا عائد بالله تعالى من سخطه وسخطك يا فاطمة، ثم انتصب أبو بكر يبكي، حتى كادت نفسه أن تزهد، وهي تقول: والله لأدعون الله عليك في كل صلاة أصليها.

ثم خرج باكيًا فاجتمع إليه الناس، فقال لهم: بيبيت كل رجل منكم معانقا حليلته، مسرورا بأهله، وتركتموني وما أنا فيه، لا حاجة لي في بيعتكم، أقيلوني بيعتني.

قالوا: يا خليفة رسول الله، إن هذا الأمر لا يستقيم، وأنت أعلمـنا بذلك، إنه إن كان هذا لم يقم لله دين

قال: والله لو لا ذلك وما أخافه من رخاوة هذه العروة ما بتليلة ولـي في عنق مسلم بيعة، بعدما سمعـت ورأـيتـ من فاطمة.

قال: فلم يباع على كرم الله وجهه حتى ماتت فاطمة (رض)، ولم تُمكث بعد أبيها إلا خمسا وسبعين ليلة، قال: فلما توفيت أرسل... الخ

"Umar said to Abu Bakr, "Let us go to Fatima (sa), for we have made her angry." They both set out and sought Fatima's permission to meet her, but she did not grant them permission. They went to Ali (as) and talked to him. Ali (as) permitted them to come in. When they entered, Fatima (sa) turned her face away from them, facing the wall. They greeted her, but she did not respond to their greeting. Abu Bakr spoke saying, "O one loved by the Messenger of Allah (S)! By Allah! The kinsfolk of the Messenger of Allah (S) are dearer to me than my own kinsfolk, and you are dearer to me than my daughter, 'A'isha. When your father (S) died, I wished that I, too, had died rather than survive him. So, do you think that since I know you and know your distinction and prestige, I would still deprive you of what belongs to you and of your inheritance from the Messenger of Allah (S) except that I heard your father, the Messenger of Allah (S), say, 'We do not leave an inheritance; whatever we leave is charity'?"

She said, "If I narrate to you a tradition from the Messenger of Allah (S) with which you both are already familiar, are you going to act according to it?" They both answered in the affirmative. She said, "I ask you in the Name of Allah, did you not hear the Messenger of Allah (S) say, 'What pleases Fatima pleases me, and what angers Fatima angers me; whoever loves Fatima loves me, and whoever angers Fatima angers me'?" Both men said, "Yes, we have heard the Messenger of Allah (S) say so." She said, "Then I plead to Allah and to His angels to testify that you both have made me angry and never pleased me, and when I meet the Prophet, I shall complain to him against you." Abu Bakr said, "I seek refuge with Allah, the most Exalted One, against His wrath and yours, O Fatima!"

Then Abu Bakr wept bitterly till his soul almost left his body as she kept saying, "By Allah! I shall plead to Allah against you in every prayer I perform." Abu Bakr went out weeping. People assembled around him. He said to them, "Every man from among you goes to bed embracing his wife, happy with his family, while leaving me in my agony. I have no need for your oath of allegiance. Let me resign from your fealty." They said to him, "O successor of the Messenger of Allah! This cannot be right, and you best know of that. If such is the case, the religion of Allah will not stand." He said, "By Allah! Had the case not been so, and had I not feared such a knot will be loosened, I would not have spent the night without relinquishing the oath of allegiance of any Muslim after having heard and seen what Fatima (sa) has said."

Ali, may Allah glorify his countenance, did not swear the oath of allegiance till Fatima, may Allah be pleased with her, died. She lived only seventy-five days after the death of her father (S). When she died, Abu Bakr sent "Umar..., etc. [105](#)

88. "Umar Rida Kahalah has said, "Shi'a narrators have transmitted saying that Abu Bakr wrote Fatima (sa) a deed of her property of Fadak. When she came out carrying it, "Umar met her. He stretched his hand to take it from her by force, but she did not let him. He pushed his hand in her chest, taking the

deed out and burning it.”[106](#)

89. ‘Abd al-Fattah ‘Abd al-Maqsad has said,

Rumors were swift that day tracing the path of “Umar ibn al-Khattab as he led a group of his followers and helpers to the house of Fatima (sa) with the intention to get the cousin of the Messenger of Allah (S), willingly or unwillingly, to do what he till then had refused to do...

Is there a deterrent on people that prohibits them from narrating the incident of the firewood which the son of al-Khattab ordered to surround with it the house of Fatima (sa) as Ali (as) and his followers were inside it in order to equip “Umar with the tool to either convince or trap Ali (as)? The man [“Umar] went there in a tirade as a revolution was boiling inside him determined to assault Ali’s house. His helpers and those whom he had brought there supported him, and they forced themselves in or almost did so.

Then suddenly a face like that of the Messenger of Allah (S) appeared at the door intercepting, grief-stricken, showing signs of pain, with eyes overflowing with tears and with a forehead on which a boiling rage painted its marks. As she faced the sacred tomb [of the Messenger of Allah (S)], al-Zahra’ (sa) kept seeking help from this absent-present personality: “O Father! O Messenger of Allah! What have we faced after you at the hands of the son of al-Khattab and the son of Abu Quhafah?!” Her words left only hearts afflicted with grief.[107](#)

90. Ibn Abul-Hadid, the Mu’tazilite Shafi’i scholar, has said that he read to his mentor, Abu Ja’far al-Naqab, the story of Zainab’s grief and how she was terrorized by Habar ibn al-Aswad. Abu Ja’far said to him, “Since the Messenger of Allah (S) permitted the killing of Habar ibn al-Aswad because he terrorized Zainab, so she miscarried, apparently, had he been alive, he would have permitted the killing of the individual who terrorized Fatima (sa), so she miscarried.” Ibn Abul-Hadid said to his mentor, “Shall I quote you as saying that Fatima (sa) was terrorized, so she miscarried al-Muhsin?” He said, “Do not quote me, and do not narrate saying that this is not true, for I have my position regarding this topic due to the contradictions among the narratives which I have reviewed.”[108](#)

91. It has been said that Ahmed ibn Muhammed ibn Muhammed ibn al-Sari ibn Yahya ibn Abu Darim, the traditionist, that he remained on the right track all his life, but in his last days, he used to narrate shameful events. One cites him as saying that “Umar kicked Fatima (sa) till she miscarried Muhsin.”[109](#)

1. Shaikh al-Mufid, Kitab al-Mazar, p. 156. Also p. 459 of Kitab al-Muqnna`a by the same author. Refer to pp. 198, 278 of Al-Bald al-Amin. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, pp. 197–98.

2. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, p. 198. Its footnote cites pp. 26, 25 of Misbah al-Za’ir.

3. Misbah al-Mutahajjid, p. 654. Iqbal al-A`mal, p. 624. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, p. 195.

4. Iqbal al-A`mal, p. 625. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 97, pp. 199–200.

5. Al-Saduq, Man la Yahdurhu al-Faqih, Vol. 2, p. 573.

6. Ibid., Vol. 2, p. 574.

7. This is a reference to her burial grounds.

8. Al-Tusi, Tahthib al-Ahkam, Vol. 6, p. 10. Malath al-Akhyar, Vol. 9, p. 25. Al-Wafi, Vol. 14, pp. 370–71. Rawdat al-

Muttaqin, Vol. 5, p. 345. Refer also to Ahadith al-Shi`a, Vol. 12, p. 264.

9. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 99, p. 220.

10. Sakh سهك (pronounced as written) refers to a black prostitute. The reader will come across this word more on the next pages. I have researched this word in the famous Arab lexicon of Ibn Manzur, namely Lisan al-`Arab. I found on p. 82, Vol. 4 the word سهك which is pronounced “suhak” as a plural of سهك, sahk, which means: black concubines, bondmaids. If the reader entertains any doubts about this woman being a prostitute, he is advised to copy this Internet Link and paste it in his Internet Browser to review a number of authentic and highly respected Sunni sources admitting this fact:

<http://sahak.kalamfikalam.com/t2-topic> [1] as well as many other sites. Just key the word صهák or the word سهák in your Internet's SEARCH engine and see for yourself. – Tr.

11. If you research the incident of Ghadir Khumm, you will come to know that the Prophet (S), as commanded by the Almighty, appointed Ali (as) as his successor: As soon as the rituals of the Farewell Pilgrimage حجۃ الوداع, the last pilgrimage performed by the Prophet (S), were completed, and to be exact on Dhul-Hijja 17, 10 A.H./March 18, 632 A.D., the divine order came to the Prophet embedded in verse 67 of Chapter 5 (al-Ma'ida) to appoint Ali (as) as the successor of the Prophet (S) in faring with the Muslims' affairs. A ceremony of swearing the oath of allegiance to Ali (as) started that day and went on for three days during which even women and children who were present there and then swore it. Both Abu Bakr and `Umar attended that ceremony, and the first to swear that oath of allegiance, in the presence of the Prophet (S), was none other than `Umar ibn al-Khattab who apparently was also the first to renege from it, to violate it, to do the opposite of what he had sworn. Abu Bakr took charge on Rabi` I 13, 11 A.H./June 8, 632 A.D. If you calculate, you will find out that the time that separated the divine appointment of Ali (as) as Commander of the Faithful from Abu Bakr taking charge was only few days, just over two months...! – Tr.

12. This lengthy text is quoted from pp. 584–594 of Vol. 2 of the book by Sulaym ibn Qays which al-Ansari edited. Refer to pp. 210–16, Vol. 1, of al-Tibrisi's Al-Ihtijaj and to Jala' al-'Uyun. Also refer to pp. 319–320, Vol. 5, of Mir'at al-'Uql. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 261, 268, 270, 299 and Vol. 43, pp. 197–200. Also refer to pp. 400–404, Vol. 11, of Al-'Awalim. Refer to Diya' al-'Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 3, pp. 63–64.

<sup>13.</sup> Muhammed Baqir al-Ansari al-Zanjani Kitab Sulaym ibn Qays, Vol. 2, pp. 862–68. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 297–99 and Vol. 43, p. 197. Refer to Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 400–04.

14. From the book by Sulaym ibn Qays (edited by al-Ansari), Vol. 2, pp. 871–73. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 306. Refer to Kamil Bahai, Vol. 1, p. 314. Also refer to Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 400–04.

<sup>15</sup> Al-Mufid, *Amali*, pp. 49–50. Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, pp. 231–32.

<sup>16</sup> Kitab al-Jamal, pp. 117–18.

<sup>17</sup> Kifayat al-Talib, p. 413.

<sup>18</sup> Al-Mufid, Al-Irshad, Vol. 1, p. 189.

<sup>19</sup> Shaikh al-Mufid, Al-Amali, pp. 172–73 (the edition printed at the Hayderi Press, Najaf al-Ashraf, Iraq).

<sup>20</sup> Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 185–86. Al-`Ayyashi, Tafsir, Vol. 2, pp. 66–67. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 227–28. Al-Burhan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Vol. 2, p. 93. Mir'at al-`Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 320.

<sup>21</sup> Al-Mustarshid fi Imamate Ali ؑ, p. 66. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, p. 383.

<sup>22</sup>. `Imad ad-Din al-Tabari, *Kamil Baha'i* (printed at the press of the Al-

<sup>23</sup> Ibid., vol. 1, pp. 312–13.

24 Al-Qawshajii, namely 'A

Samarqand, سمرقند, Russian Самарканд, the second-largest city in Uzbekistan). He was an astronomer, mathematician and faqih, jurist, who adhered to the Hanafi Sunni School of Muslim Law. His exact date of birth is unknown, but he died in 879 A.H./1474 A.D. – Tr.

25. Al-Ardabili, *Hadiqat al-Shi`a*, pp. 265–66.

26. Refer to a footnote about him above. – Tr.

<sup>27</sup> Al-Khawajoo'i al-Mazandarani, *Al-Rasa'il al-'tiqadiyya*, p. 447, the dissertation on "Tariq al-Rashad" (the Path of Guidance).

28. Ibid., pp. 470–71.

<sup>29</sup> Al-Tibrisi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, p. 181.

- [30.](#) Ibid., Vol. 1, p. 202. *Mir'at al-'Uqul*, Vol. 5, p. 319. *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, pp. 204–05.
- [31.](#) Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 30, p. 293–95. Al-Khasibi, *Al-Hidayah al-Kubra*, p. 417.
- [32.](#) Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 39, pp. 41–42. *Ma`ani al-Akhbar*, pp. 205–07.
- [33.](#) Ibn Tawus, *Kashf al-Mahajja*, p. 115 (1412 A.H. edition published by the Office of Islamic Information, Qum, Iran).
- [34.](#) *Rawdat al-Muttaqin*, Vol. 5, p. 342.
- [35.](#) *Jala' al-'Uyun*, Vol. 1, pp. 193–94.
- [36.](#) *Mir'at al-'Uqul*, Vol. 5, p. 318. Almost the same wording is stated by al-A`lamī in his book titled *Tarajim al-Nisa'* (women's biographies), Vol. 2, p. 321.
- [37.](#) Al-Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, pp. 209–10.
- [38.](#) Ibid., Vol. 82, p. 264.
- [39.](#) See p. 39 of a book about the titles of the Messenger of Allah (S) and his progeny published among precious dissertations by Intisharat Basirati, Qum, Iran.
- [40.](#) al-Zahra' (sa) Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa (S) citing Al-Sawarim al-Hasima fi Tarikh Ahwalat al-Zahra' Fatima (sa) (manuscript) written by Muhammed Rida al-Husayni al-Kamali al-Istarbadi. He is also quoted on p. 157, Vol. 3, of the book titled *Nawa'ib al-Duhur* by al-Mir Jahani.
- [41.](#) *Nawadir al-Akhbar*, p. 183. `Ilm al-Yaqin, pp. 686–88. `Awalim al-'Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 414.
- [42.](#) *Qawa'id `Aqa'id Al Muhammed (S)* (manuscript), p. 268. I have a photocopy of it.
- [43.](#) Ibid., pp. 669–70.
- [44.](#) Ibid., p. 270.
- [45.](#) Ibid.
- [46.](#) Ibid.
- [47.](#) I searched for information about this author and found it on page 542, Vol. 5 (*Dar al-Ta'aruf lil Matbu'at*, Beirut, Lebanon, 1420 A.H./2000 A.D. edition, which is in the library of the translator of this book). All we are told in the aforementioned reference, besides praise for his virtue, asceticism, piety, fiqh and narration of traditions, is that he wrote a history book in 1019 A.H./1610 A.D. – Tr.
- [48.](#) Al-'Amili, *Al-Tatimma fi Tawarikh al-'A'imma*, p. 35.
- [49.](#) Al-Turayhi, *Al-Muntakhab*, p. 136.
- [50.](#) Conference of Baghdad's Scholars, pp. 135–37 (printed in 1415 A.H./1994 A.D.) at *Dar al-Irshad al-Islami*, Beirut, Lebanon).
- [51.](#) *Sirat al-'A'imma al-'Ithna `Ashar*, Vol. 1, p. 132.
- [52.](#) Ibid., Vol. 1, p. 133.
- [53.](#) Ibn Hamzah, *Al-Shafi*, Vol. 4, p. 171.
- [54.](#) Ibid., Vol. 4, p. 173.
- [55.](#) Ibid. Ibn Hamzah pointed out what Fatima (sa) had to go through in more than one place in his book, so refer to his book titled *Al-Shafi*, Vol. 4, pp. 202–03.
- [56.](#) Ibn Hamzah, *Al-Shafi*, Vol. 4, p. 202.
- [57.](#) *Taqrib al-Ma`arif*, p. 256.
- [58.](#) al-Mas`udi, *Muruj al-Dhahab*, Vol. 3, pp. 12–13.
- [59.](#) *Ithbat al-Wasiyya*, p. 143. *Bihar al-Anwar*, Vol. 28, pp. 308–09.
- [60.](#) Al-Minqari, *Siffeen*, p. 163.
- [61.](#) Al-Yaqubi, *Tarikh*, Vol. 2, p. 137. Al-Dhahbi, *Tarikh al-Islam*, Vol. 1, pp. 117–18. *Ithbat al-Hudat*, Vol. 2, pp. 359, 367–68. Ibn `Abd Rabbih, Al-Iqd al-Farid, Vol. 4, p. 268. Ibn Shathan, Al-`Idyah, p. 161. *Al-Imama wal Siyasa*, Vol. 1, p. 18. *Siyar A`lam al-Nubala'* (biography of the "righteous caliphs"), p. 17. Al-Kaf`ami, *Majma` al-Ghara'ib*, p. 288. Al-Mas`udi, *Muruj al-Dhahab*, Vol. 1, pp. 414 and Vol. 2, p. 301. Ibn Abul-Hadid, *Sharh Nahjul-Balaghah*, Vol. 1, p. 130 and Vol. 17, pp. 164, 168 and Vol. 6, p. 51 and Vol. 2, pp. 46–47 and Vol. 20, pp. 17, 24. *Mizan al-l`tidal*, Vol. 3, p. 109 and Vol. 2, p. 215. *Al-Imama* (manuscript), p. 82; a photocopy of it is available at the Library of the Center for Islamic Studies, Beirut, Lebanon. *Lisan al-Mizan*, Vol. 4, p. 189. Al-Tabari, *Tarikh al-'Umam wal Muluk*, Vol. 3, p. 430 (the edition published by Al-Ma`arif Press). Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi, *Kanz al-'Ummal*, Vol. 3, p. 125 and Vol. 5, pp. 631–32. *Al-Rasa'il al-l`tiqadiyya*

(the dissertation on Tariq al-Rashad), pp. 470–71. Muntakhab Kanz al-`Ummal (referred to in a footnote in Ahmed's Musnad), Vol. 2, p. 171. Al-Tabrani, Al-Mu`jam al-Kabir, Vol. 1, p. 62. Diya' al-`Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, pp. 90, 108 which cites a large number of references. Al-Nass wal Ijtihad, p. 91. Al-Sab`a minal Salaf, pp. 16–17. Al-Amini, Al-Ghadir, Vol. 7, p. 170. Ma`alim al-Madrasatayn, Vol. 2, p. 79. Ibn `Asakir, Tarikh (in the biography of Abu Bakr). Mir'at al-Zaman. Zahr al-Raba`, Vol. 2, p. 124. Anwar al-Malakat, p. 227. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, pp. 123, 136, 138, 141, 352. Nafahat al-Lahut, p. 79. Hadaqat al-Shi'a, Vol. 2, p. 252. Tashyid al-Mata'in, Vol. 1, p. 340. Dala'il al-Sidq, Vol. 3, p. 32. Al-Khisal, Vol. 1, pp. 171–73. Hayat al-Sahaba, Vol. 2, p. 24. Al-Murtada, Al-Shafi, Vol. 3, p. 170. `Abd al-Jabbar, Al-Mughni, Vol. 20, pp. 340–41. Nahj al-Haqq, p. 265. Abu `Ubayd, Al-Amwal, p. 194. Mujma` al-Zawa'id, Vol. 5, p. 203. Talkhis al-Shafi, Vol. 3, p. 170. Al-Tusi, Tajrad al-l`tiqad, p. 402. Kashf al-Murad, p. 403. Arab-Shahi, Muftah al-Bab (edited by Mahdi Muhaqqiq), p. 199. Taqrib al-Ma`arif, pp. 366–67. Dimashq, Vol. 13, p. 122. Manal al-Talib, p. 280.

62. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, p. 138–39.

63. Al-Amwal, p. 194.

64. Refer, for example, to p. 77, Vol. 3, of the same book, namely Muruj al-Dhahab, which was printed in 1965 at Dar al-Ma`rifa.

65. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 20, pp. 146–47. Al-Mas`udi, too, has quoted the same as you read in the footnote to p. 373, Vol. 2, of Ihqaq al-Haqq.

66. "Abul-Hassan" Ali ibn Muhammed al-Wasiti al-Maghazili (d. 483 A.H./1090 A.D.), Manaqib Ali ibn Abu Talib, Vol. 3, p. 407 as printed by Dar al-Adwa'. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, p. 233.

67. Kifayat al-Talib, p. 413.

68. Al-Shahristani, Al-Milal wal Nihal, Vol. 1, p. 57. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 416. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 271 (footnote), 281. Bahj al-Sibagha, Vol. 5, p. 15. Bayt al-Ahzan, p. 124. Ihqaq al-Haqq, Vol. 2, p. 374; refer also the footnote on p. 372 of the same reference.

69. Al-Farq Baynal Firaq, p. 148.

70. Al-Maqrizi, Al-Khutat (in the section about wise sayings and morals), Vol. 2, p. 346.

71. Al-Wafi bil Wafiyat, Vol. 6, p. 17.

72. Ibn Abul-Hadid (the Mu`tazilite Shafi'i scholar), Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 20, p. 32.

73. Refer to Lisan al-Mizan, Vol. 5, p. 218. Al-Wafi bil Wafiyat, Vol. 3, p. 344.

74. Ibn Sa`d, Tabaqat, Vol. 8, p. 27 printed by Sadir Press or p. 18 of its Leiden edition. Al-Isaba, Vol. 4, p. 379 from Ahmed. Siyar A`lam al-Nubala', Vol. 2, p. 129, except here there is a minor distortion of his statement; so, refer to either the Sadir or the Leiden (Germany) edition.

75. Muntakhab Kanz al-`Ummal (as referred to in a footnote in Ahmed's Musnad), Vol. 2, p. 1174 from Ibn Abu Shaybah. This incident is also narrated in Sharh Nahjul-Balagha by the Mu`tazilite scholar, Vol. 2, p. 45 from al-Jawhari and in Al-Shafi by al-Murtada, Vol. 4, p. 110, and in Al-Mughni by Judge `Abd al-Jabbar, Vol. 20, p. 335. It is also cited in Qurrat al-`Ayn by Waliyy Allah al-Dahlawi of Peshawar, p. 78, in Al-Shafi by Ibn Hamzah, Vol. 4, p. 174; in Nihayat al-Arab, Vol. 19, p. 40; in Al-Isti`ab (as referred to in a footnote in Al-Isaba), Vol. 2, pp. 254–55; in Al-Wafi bil Wafiyat, Vol. 17, p. 311; in Ifham al-A`da' wal Khusum, p. 72; in Kanz al-`Ummal, Vol. 5, p. 651. It is also quoted from Ibn Abu Shaybah on p. 567, Vol. 14 of the same. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 313.

76. Al-Balathiri, Ansab al-Ashraf, Vol. 1, p. 587. Al-Shafi, Talkhis, Vol. 3, p. 75, quoting the first.

77. Al-Ya`qubi, Tarikh, Vol. 2, p. 126.

78. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, pp. 334, 383. Nahj al-Haqq, p. 271–72 from Ibn Khayr. Al-Tara'if, p. 239. Ihqaq al-Haqq, Vol. 2, p. 373. Mir'at al-`Uql, Vol. 5, pp. 318–19. Refer also to Dala'il al-Sidq, Vol. 3, p. 78. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 339. Diya' al-`Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, p. 64.

79. He is referring to Vizier Ja`far ibn al-Fadl ibn Ja`far ibn al-Furat al-Baghdadi who died in 391 A.H./1001 A.D. "Ibn Kharthabah" is the author of the book titled Al-Masalik wal Mamalik. He died in 300 A.H./913 A.D. "Ibn Khayranah" is Muhammed ibn Khayranah al-Maghribi [of North Africa], the famous traditionist, one of the scholars of the fourth century A.D. "Ibn Khathabah" is `Abdullah ibn Muhammed ibn Khathabah.

80. Refer to the previous references and to pp. 370–71, Vol. 2, of Ihqaq al-Haqq.

81. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, p. 376.

82. Al-Riyad al-Nadira, Vol. 1, p. 241. Tarikh al-Khamis, Vol. 2, p. 169. Al-Mustarshid, pp. 379, 378. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, p. 383.
83. Al-Bidaya wal Nihaya, Vol. 5, p. 250. Siyar A`lam al-Nubala' (in the section dealing with the "righteous caliphs"), p. 26. Al-Riyad al-Nadira, Vol. 1, p. 241.
84. Rawdat al-Munazir (referred to in a footnote in Al-Kamil fil Tarikh), Vol. 7, pp. 164–65.
85. Al-Balathiri, Ansab al-Ashraf, Vol. 1, p. 586. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, footnote on p. 268, pp. 339, 389, 411. Sayyid al-Murtada, Al-Shafi, Vol. 3, p. 241. Al-Riyad al-Nadira, Vol. 1, p. 167. Tarikh al-Khamis, Vol. 1, p. 178. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, pp. 408, 602. Ibn Hamzah, Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, p. 174. Talkhis al-Shafi, Vol. 3, p. 76. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 20, p. 147. Ibn `Abd Rabbih, Al-`Iqd al-Farid, Vol. 4, pp. 247, 259–60 of the edition printed by Dar Ihya' al-Turath. Nafahat al-Lahut, p. 79. Al-Kuna wal Alqab, Vol. 1, p. 352. Al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar, Vol. 1, p. 156. A`lam al-Nisa', Vol. 3, p. 127. Al-Tara`if, p. 239. Nahj al-Haqq, pp. 271–72. Al-Ghadir, Vol. 7, p. 77 and Vol. 5, p. 369.
86. Al-Tabari, Tarikh al-Umam wal-Muluk (the edition printed by Dar al-Ma`arif), Vol. 3, p. 202. Al-Tara`if, pp. 238–39. A`lam al-Nisa', Vol. 4, p. 114. Nahj al-Haqq, pp. 271–72. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 338. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 407. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, pp. 333–34.
87. Al-Tabari, Tarikh Muluk, Vol. 3, p. 203.
88. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 6, p. 45.
89. Ibid., Vol. 2, p. 21. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 110.
90. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 6, pp. 49–50.
91. bn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 6, pp. 48–49 and Vol. 2, p. 57. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 204.
92. This is a reference to the saqifa (shed) of Banu Sa`idah where the "election", by a small number of people, of Abu Bakr took place amidst a great deal of dissension, arguments and threats. `Umar pushed Abu Bakr to be the caliph and was the first to swear the oath of allegiance to him just as he was the first to swear it days ago to Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) on Thul-Hijja 18, 10 A.H./March 19, 632 A.D., a date well known in Islamic history as "Yawm al-Ghadir" or "Eid al-Ghadir." The "Ghadir" was then an area where rain water formed a shallow lake, and it is located in the Juhfa valley near the crossroads of trade and pilgrimage caravans coming from Medina, Egypt, Iraq, Syria and Najd on their way to Medina. A mosque, called Masjid al-Ghadir, was later built on the same spot where the Prophet ﷺ nominated Ali (as) as his successor and where Ali (as) received the oath of allegiance from scores of thousands of Muslim men, women and children. Nowadays, understandably, only Shi`as celebrate Eid al-Ghadir... — Tr.
93. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 2, pp. 48, 56.
94. Ibid.
95. Ibid.
96. Ibid., Vol. 6, p. 48.
97. Ibid., Vol. 2, p. 50 and Vol. 6, p. 47 and Vol. 3, p. 49. Ibn Sa`d, Tabaqat, Vol. 8, p. 228.
98. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 2, pp. 50–51 and Vol. 6, p. 48.
99. Ibid., Vol. 6, p. 11.
100. Ibid.
101. Ibid., Vol. 17, p. 168.
102. Ibid., Vol. 2, p. 21. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 310–11.
103. Ibn Qutaybah, Al-Imama wal Siyasa, Vol. 1, pp. 28–29. Ihqaq al-Haqq, Vol. 2, p. 351.
104. Ibid., Vol. 1. Talkhis al-Shafi, Vol. 2, pp. 144–45. A`lam al-Nisa', Vol. 4, p. 114. There are numerous other references which all cite similarly to Ibn Qutaybah, such as Tashyeed al-Mata`in and others.
105. The references of this narrative have already been stated in a previous chapter.
106. A`lam al-Nisa', Vol. 4, p. 124.
107. `Abd al-Fattah `Abd al-Maqsud, Al-Imam Ali ibn Abu Talib, Vol. 1, pp. 190–91. He is also cited on pp. 103–04, Vol. 3, of Al-Ghadir.
108. Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 14, p. 193. Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 323. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 2, pp. 337–38, 360.
109. Mizan al-l`tidal, Vol. 1, p. 139. Siyar A`lam al-Nubala', Vol. 15, p. 578. Lisan al-Mizan, Vol. 1, p. 268.

---

**Source URL:**

<https://www.al-islam.org/tragedy-al-zahra-doubts-and-responses-jafar-murtadha-al-amili/texts-and-legacies#comment-0>

**Links**

[1] <http://sahak.kalamfikalam.com/t2-topic>