

[Home](#) > [Tragedy of al-Zahra': Doubts and Responses](#) > [Texts And Legacies](#) > [Texts And Legacies From The Fourteen Infallible Ones](#) > What is Narrated from Imam al-Jawad (as)

Texts And Legacies From The Fourteen Infallible Ones

Traditions Regarding How al-Zahra' (sa) was Persecuted

There are numerous traditions cited by the Infallible Ones clearly outlining how al-Zahra' (sa) was persecuted. They deal with how her house was assaulted with the intention to burn it, how the burning did actually take place, how she was hit, how she miscarried, and many other details of what she went through during the said assault. These narrations are consecutively reported (*mutawatir*) even if we do not add to them what others narrated and what the historians and others recorded in their books as facts. The latter is also quite numerous, even consecutively reported, as we have already pointed out.

We would like here to cite a large number of texts narrated by the Infallible Ones (as) in particular so that this matter becomes quite clear; so, let us set out to explore the following narratives and sacred legacies, and surely Allah is the One Who grants success.

Two Narratives Before the Reader

In al-Tusi's *Amali*, the author states the following:

Relying on his *isnad*, from his mentor, from his father, may Allah be pleased with him, he is quoted as having said, "We were told by Muhammed ibn Muhammed as saying that 'Abu 'Abdullah, Muhammed ibn 'Imran, informed me saying that al-Zayyat said that Ahmed ibn Muhammed al-Jawhari said that al-Hassan ibn 'Alal al-'Anzi said that 'Abd al-Karam ibn Muhammed said that Muhammed ibn Ali said that Muhammed ibn Munqir cites Ziyad ibn al-Munthir saying that Shurahbil quotes Umm al-Fadl daughter of al-'Abbas said: When the Messenger of Allah S was under the weight of the sickness whereby he passed away, he once woke up, and we were weeping. He said: What causes you to weep? We said: O Messenger of Allah! We weep not to gain anything but to our departure from us; we weep for the cessation of the report from Heaven, and we weep over the nation after you. He said: You surely will be

the oppressed and the downtrodden after me.”^{[1](#)}

What Sacred Texts Narrate

1. Abu Bakr al-Shirazi, with regards to what is revealed in the Qur'an with reference to the Commander of the Faithful (as), quotes Muqatil quoting 'Ata' regarding the verse saying, "Verily, We granted Moses the Book" saying that the Torah used to have the following: "O Moses! I have chosen you and chosen a vizier for you who is your brother (Aaron) by your father and mother just as I chose for Muhammed Eleya who is his brother, vizier, *wasi* and successor. Congratulations to both of you for having such brothers, and congratulations to them for having you for brothers: Eleya, father of two grandsons, al-Hassan and al-Husayn and of a third one, al-Muhsin, one of his offspring, just as I created for your brother, Aaron, Shabar, Shubayr and Mushabbar.”^{[2](#)}

Note:

We started with both of these narratives despite our knowledge that the first is general to the degree that there is no room to count it among the narratives which we are in the process of presenting to you. The second is not narrated by the Infallible Ones (as).

FIRST: We would like to point out to the existence of many texts containing this same meaning, i.e. the persecution of the Household of the Prophet S and their being oppressed.

SECOND: We would like to prepare the reader to enter and be acquainted with the environments of transgression, humiliation, oppression and treating the family of the Prophet S as weaklings.

THIRD: This second tradition is narrated in some of Allah's revealed Books. For this reason, we included it on the list of such traditions. It also testifies to the oppression to which al-Muhsin was exposed and which some people try to deny.

What is Narrated From the Messenger of Allah (S)

2. Sulaym ibn Qays has quoted 'Abdullah ibn al-'Abbas, when Jabir ibn 'Abdullah [al-Ansari] was sitting next to him, as saying that the Prophet S said to Ali (as) at the conclusion of a lengthy sermon, "Quraish will revolt against all of you, and they will be unanimous in oppressing you. So, if you find supporters, you should fight them back. But if you do not find supporters, hold your hand away and do not shed your blood. Martyrdom is behind you, and may Allah condemn your killer." Then the Prophet S faced his daughter (sa) and said, "You will be the first to join me from among my Ahl al-Bayt, and you are the Head of the Women of Paradise. You will face oppression and malice, so much so that you will be hit, and one of your ribs will be broken; may Allah condemn your killer..."^{[3](#)}

3. Ibrahim ibn Muhammed al-Juwayni al-Shafi'i, relying on the *isnad* of Ali bin Ahmed ibn Musa al-Daqqaq from Muhammed ibn Abu 'Abdullah al-Kufi from Musa ibn 'Imran al-Nakh'i from al-Nawfali from

al-Hassan ibn Ali ibn Abu Hamzah from his father from Sa'id ibn Jubayr from Ibn 'Abbas, has narrated saying that the Messenger of Allah S was once sitting when al-Hassan (as) came. Seeing him, the Prophet (S) wept.

Then he said, "Come to me, come to me, O son!" Then al-Husayn (as) came followed by Fatima (sa). After that the Commander of the Faithful (as) came. His companions asked him, and he answered them. Among what he said to them was: "As for my daughter Fatima (sa), she is the Head of the Women of Mankind... When I saw her, I remembered what she will have to endure after me. It is as if humiliation entered her house, violating her privacy, confiscating her rights, depriving her of her inheritance, breaking her side, causing her to miscarry as she will call out: 'O Muhammed!' but there will be none to respond to her.

She will seek help, but she will not be helped. She will remain after me grieved, depressed, tearful... Then she will see herself humiliated after being, during her father's lifetime, honored and dignified... She will be the first to rejoin me from among my Ahl al-Bayt. She will come to me sad, depressed, usurped, murdered. It will then be said by the Messenger of Allah S, 'O Lord! Condemn whoever condemned her! Punish whoever confiscated what belonged to her! Humiliate whoever humiliated her! And keep in Your Fire whoever hit her on her side till she miscarried her son!' The angels will at that time say, 'Ameen!'"⁴

Shaikh al-Islam, 'allama al-Majlisi, while citing this narrative, says, "This is narrated by al-Saduq in his *Amali* depending on a reliable *isnad* from Ibn 'Abbas."

4. 'Allama al-Majlisi has said: "I have found something handwritten by Shaikh Muhammed ibn Ali al-Jib'i, grandfather of Shaikh al-Baha'i, transmitted via the handwriting of the martyr, may Allah raise his status, who cites the *Musbah* of Shaikh Abu Mansur, may Allah make his resting-place good, saying that it has been narrated that the Prophet S entered once the house of Fatima (sa) who prepared for him some food comprised of dates, a round loaf of bread and some oil. They all sat down to eat, he, Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as). Once they have finished eating, the Messenger of Allah S prostrated.

Then he smiled. Then he wept. Then he sat. The one who had the most courage to speak was Ali (as) who said, 'O Messenger of Allah S! We have seen you today doing what we have never seen you doing before!' He S said, "When I ate with you, I was pleased and felt happy for your safety and your assembling together, so I prostrated to Allah to thank Him.

It was then that Gabriel (as) descended and asked me, 'Have you prostrated for being happy with your family?' 'Yes,' I said. He said, 'shall I inform you of what will happen to them after you?' I said, 'Yes, O my Brother, Gabriel! Do so.' He said, 'As for your daughter, she will be the first to rejoin you after being oppressed, what belongs to her will be taken away from her, and she will be deprived of her inheritance, and her husband will be dealt with unjustly. Her rib will be broken.

As regarding your cousin, he will be dealt with unjustly, he will be deprived of his right (to the caliphate),

and he will be killed. As for al-Hassan (as), he will be dealt with unjustly; he will be deprived of his right and will be poisoned. As for al-Husayn (as), he will be dealt with unjustly; he will be deprived of his right, his progeny will be killed, and his body will be crushed under the horses' hoofs.

His belongings will be plundered; his women and offspring will be taken captive; he will be buried shrouded by his blood, and strangers will bury him.' I, therefore, wept and asked him, 'Will anyone visit his grave?' He said, 'Strangers will visit it.' I asked him, 'What rewards will be received by those who visit it?' He said, 'For each of them will be written down in his/her book of deeds the rewards of performing the pilgrimage a thousand times and the *'umra* a thousand times, all in your own company,' so I smiled." [5](#)

5. 'Umar ibn al-Khattab asked Huthayfan ibn al-Yaman about a statement made by the Prophet S regarding a dissension that would treat people as the raging waves treat a ship in the sea. Huthayfah said, "It is a dissension between which and yourself there is a closed door." 'Umar said, "Will the door, O Huthayfah, be opened or will it be broken?" Huthayfah said, "It will be broken." 'Umar said, "If the door is broken, then it ought not to be closed till the Day of Judgment." [6](#)

Then they attributed to Huthayfah the statement that what is meant by the broken door is the assassination of 'Umar ibn al-Khattab and by the gate of dissension is 'Othman taking charge. [7](#)

We say the following:

Had Huthayfah really said so, such *ijtihad* is not precise because the "shura" which 'Umar invented was the one that brought 'Othman to power, albeit whether 'Umar was to be killed or to die naturally. He invented it after someone stabbed him in the stomach.

Installing 'Othman as the caliph was not the cause of the dissension which still remains till our time and will continue till the Judgment Day. Rather, it was the issue of Imamate which was usurped through the violence that manifested itself by the assault on Fatima's house, by breaking her door and taking Ali (as) out by force to swear the oath of allegiance against his will. It is well known that the most serious dissension among the nation is the one regarding the issue of Imamate. No sword was ever taken out of its scabbard based on a theological basis like the one taken out against the Imamate in every time and clime, as al-Shahristani and others have stated.

[What is Narrated from Imam Ali \(as\)](#)

6. Sulaym ibn Qays has narrated saying that 'Umar ibn al-Khattab once fined all his governors half of their salaries, exempting Qunfath al-'Adawi from having to pay such a fine, and he was one of those governors. He even returned to him what he had taken away from him, the sum of twenty thousand dirhams.

Nor did he deduct the tilth, nor half the tilth. Aban said that Salim has said, "I met Ali (as) and asked him

about what he thought regarding what “Umar had done. He said, ‘Do you know why he (“Umar) exempted Qunfath and did not fine him or deduct anything from his salary?’ I said, ‘No.’ He said, ‘Because he is the one who hit Fatima, peace and blessings of Allah with her, with the whip when she came to act as a barrier between me and them. So she died, peace and blessings of Allah with her, and there was still a mark on her wrist like a bracelet.’”[8](#)

7. Aban has said that Salim said, “I went to a study circle at the Mosque of the Messenger of Allah S. The non-Hashemites were Salman, Abu Dharr, al-Miqdad, Muhammed ibn Abu Bakr, “Umar ibn Abu Salamah and Qays ibn Sa’d ibn ‘Abadah. Al-‘Abbas said to Ali (as), ‘I wonder what stopped “Umar from fining Qunfath as he did to all his other governors.’ Ali (as) looked around him, then his eyes were filled with tears. He then said, ‘He did so in appreciation of his hitting Fatima (sa) with the whip, so she died and her wrist bore the mark of the hit like a bracelet.’”[9](#)

8. Salim quotes Ibn ‘Abbas as saying, “I visited Ali (as) at Thi Qar. He took out a tablet and said to me, ‘O son of ‘Abbas! This is a tablet written according to what the Messenger of Allah (S) dictated to me, and it is in my own handwriting.’ I said, ‘O Commander of the Faithful! Please read it for me.’ He read it, and it contained a narrative of the events from the demise of the Messenger of Allah S to the martyrdom of al-Husayn (as), detailing how he would be killed, the name of his killer, the names of his supporters, and who would be martyred in his company. He wept profusely, causing me to weep, too. Among what he read to me was what would happen to him (to Ali (as)), how Fatima (sa) would be martyred, how al-Hassan (as) would be betrayed by the nation then be martyred, etc.”[10](#)

9. Ali (as) is quoted, at the time when he buried al-Zahra’ (sa), as saying, “... And your daughter shall inform you of how the nation assisted each other in oppressing her, so inquire of her and ask her about the conditions, for there are many agonies filling her chest for which she found no outlet...”[11](#)

His speech, peace with him, above, although free of frankly stating what took place to al-Zahra’ (sa), is indicative of the fact that there were many injustices that remained inside her chest, peace with her, for which she found no outlet. Among such injustices are: the confiscation of Fadak, the confiscation of her inheritance, the usurpation of the caliphate that belonged to her husband, because these issues she did publicly and clearly announce, using them as proofs indicting the oppressors, delivering a great sermon while explaining them.

10. Refer to what is mentioned by the mentor al-Kaf’ami, who died in 905 A.H./1499 A.D., in his book titled *Al-Misbah* which he compiled from about two hundred and forty references. He states that he compiled it “... from books the authenticity of which is reliable and upholding which is mandated, and this cannot be altered by the evil efforts of time or by the endeavor of those with twisted minds.”

Books, like the sun, whose light

Is written above the most high of height.[12](#)

He, may Allah have mercy on him, recorded a supplication transmitted by Ibn ‘Abbas which Ali (as) used to recite in his *qunut*. In a footnote, he described it as, “a great supplication, one of a lofty status.” About this supplication, Ali (as) says, “One who recites it is like one who shot a million¹³ arrows in defense of the Prophet S during the battles of Badr and of Hunain.”

Among the text of that supplication is the following with reference to the Household of the Prophet S: “... And they both killed his children, vacated his pulpit from his *wasi* and the heir of his knowledge, reneging from their fealty to his Imamate... and a womb which they cut open, and a fetus which they caused to miscarry, and a rib which they crushed, and a covenant which they tore to pieces..., etc.”¹⁴

In a comment which he made about it and which he included in a footnote of his book, *Misbah*, and which is cited by ‘allama al-Majlisi, “The mentor/scholar As’ad ibn ‘Abd al-Qahir said the following in his book titled *Rashh al-Bala’*: ‘When he referred to their demolition of the House of the Prophetic Mission, he was referring to the harm inflicted by the first (caliph) and the second against Ali and Fatima (as), their desire to burn Ali’s house, how they led him away like a wounded camel, how they squeezed Fatima at her door till she miscarried al-Muhsin... She ordered to be buried at night and that neither the first nor the second [caliph] should be present at her funeral.’”¹⁵

He also referred to the rib that was crushed, the covenant that was torn to pieces, to what they committed against Fatima (sa), how they tore her property’s title (of the Fadak real estate) to pieces, and how her rib was crushed.¹⁶

11. Muhammed ibn al-Hassan ibn Ahmed ibn al-Walid cites Ahmed ibn Idris, Muhammed ibn Yahya al-‘Attar, who all quote Muhammed ibn Ahmed ibn Abu Hamzah al-Bata’ini quoting Ibn ‘Umayrah quoting Muhammed ibn ‘Utbah quoting Muhammed ibn ‘Abd al-Rahman quoting his father quoting Ali ibn Abu Talib (as) as saying, “While I, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) were all in the company of the Messenger of Allah (S), he turned to us and wept. I asked him, ‘What is that for, O Messenger of Allah S?!’ He said, ‘I weep for you and how you will be hit on the head with the sword, and I weep for Fatima (sa) and how she will be slapped on the cheek.’”¹⁷

Al-Majlisi describes this narrative as reliable; so refer to his work.¹⁸

12. Ahmed ibn al-Khasab, citing Ja’far ibn Muhammed al-Mufaddal quoting Muhammed ibn Sinan al-Zahiri quoting ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Abd ar-Rahman al-Asam quoting Madah ibn Harun ibn Sa’d saying, “I heard the father of al-Tufayl, namely ‘amir ibn Wa’ilah citing the Commander of the Faithful (as) saying to “Umar, among other things, the following:

“It is the fire that you ignited at the door of my house in order to burn me and burn Fatima (sa), daughter of the Messenger of Allah S, and burn my sons, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and also burn my daughters Zainab and Umm Kulthum..., etc.”¹⁹

13. What proves violence against Ali (as) and that he was forced to swear fealty is a letter which

Mu'awiyah wrote him as well as his answer to it. Mu'awiyah said to him that he was too slow to swear fealty to the "caliphs," so he was taken to swear it against his wish as a run-away camel is taken.²⁰

Among what he said to him was, "You envied Abu Bakr, swerved from his path, wished his attempt would fail, kept sitting at home and attracted a group of people to you till they lagged behind rather than swear fealty to him." He went on to say, "None of these men except that you sought the upper hand over him and were sluggish to swear fealty to him till you were taken to him by force like a frightened camel."²¹

The Commander of the Faithful (as) answered him with a letter wherein he said, "And you said that I was led like a frightened camel in order to swear fealty. By Allah! You intended to speak ill of me but you praised me, and to expose me but exposed your own self. There is no harm in a Muslim being oppressed so long as he does not entertain any doubts about his religion..., etc."²²

This narrative proves that they entered his house and took him out by force, underscoring the fact that they did not have any respect for the privacy of al-Zahra' (sa) who tried to keep them away from him as much as she could as indicated in many narratives although this particular narrative did not disclose how they were directly involved in harming al-Zahra' (sa).

14. Al-Daylami has stated that al-Zahra' (sa) detailed what she had to go through. Among what she said was the following:

"... Then they sent to our house Qunfath accompanied by "Umar ibn al-Khattab and Khalid ibn al-Walid in order to get my cousin Ali (as) to the *saqifa* of Bani Sa'idah for their lost-cause fealty, but he would not go out to meet them, being busy carrying out the will of the Messenger of Allah S and with his wives, with compiling the Qur'an and with the repayment of eighty thousand dirhams which he S had instructed him to pay on his behalf: the price of [military] equipment and payment of debt [incurred against the Prophet S].

They collected plenty of firewood at our door. Then they brought a torch to set it ablaze and to burn us. I stood at the door's knob and pleaded to them in the Name of Allah to leave us alone and to come to our aid. "Umar took the whip from the hand of Qunfath, slave of Abu Bakr, and hit me with it on the wrist. The whip twisted itself around my wrist, leaving a mark like a bracelet on it. He kicked the door with his foot. Ali (as) shut it back, and I was pregnant. I fell on my face as the fire kept burning, parching my face. He ["Umar] slapped me with his hand, causing my ear-ring to fall on the ground into bits and pieces. Labor overtook me, so I miscarried al-Muhsin who was killed without having committed any crime. Is this a nation that blesses me?! Allah and His Messenger disowned them and I, too, disowned them."

The Commander of the Faithful (as) carried out her will. He did not inform anyone about her demise. At al-Baqi', he dug up forty graves during the night in one of which he buried Fatima (sa).

Then the Muslims, having come to know about the death and burial of Fatima (sa), went to the Commander of the Faithful (as) to offer their condolences. They said, “O Brother of the Messenger of Allah S! Order us to prepare her for burial and to dig up her grave.” He said, “She has already been buried, joining her father S.” They said, “We belong to Allah, and to Him shall we return. How can the daughter of our Prophet Muhammed S, his only offspring, die and we do not perform her funeral prayers?! This is truly very serious!” He said, “Suffices you what you have committed against Allah, the Messenger of Allah S and his Progeny.

By Allah! I would not violate her will which she entrusted to me, that is, that none of you should perform her funeral prayers, and there is no blame on one who carries out someone’s will.” Those folks shook the dust off their clothes and said, “We have to perform the funeral prayers for the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S).” They immediately went to al-Baqi’ and found forty graves freshly dug up. They could not tell which one of them was hers. People exchanged blame and accusations and said, “You did not witness the demise of the daughter of your Prophet, nor did you perform the funeral prayers for her, and now you do not even know where her grave is so you may visit it!”

Abu Bakr said, “Let a number of trustworthy Muslims dig up these graves till you find her grave so that we may perform her funeral prayers and visit it.”

The Commander of the Faithful (as) heard about it, so he went out of his house angrily. His face was red with anger, his eyes burning, his cheeks puffed up, and he was carrying on his hand his yellow outer garment which he never put on except on an ill-fated day. He was using his sword, Thul-Fiqar, like a walking stick till he reached al-Baqi’. Prior to his arrival, report reached people that he was going there. A warner said to them, “Here is Ali (as) coming as you can see swearing by Allah that no brick of these graves will be moved from its place except that he will let his sword do its business against the unlucky ones from among this nation.” People fled away in hordes.[23](#)

15. Among the verses of poetry which were narrated by traditionists and historians and which were composed by al-Zahra’ (sa) eulogizing the greatest of all Prophets (as) are the following:

Why should one who sniffs the earth

Where Ahmed is buried that he shall not

As long as he lives sniff musk at all?

Calamities were poured over me had they

Been poured on the light of day,

They would have turned it into night.

So today I am submitting to humiliation

Shunning the oppression,

Defending myself against the oppressor

Even with my own outer garment.[24](#)

Had the calamities to which she refers in these lines been one relevant to the demise of her father, she would not have used the plural, nor has she resorted to submitting to humiliation or to defending herself with her outer garment. Another verse of poetry refers to her defending herself against her oppressor with her own mantle, referring to the oppression which was not confined to usurping her inheritance, and to Fadak, for these do not need to defend against the oppressor with her outer mantle, but she went out and demanded restitution, providing arguments.

Add to all the above the fact that one who used her outer mantle to defend against oppression is one who exerts a physical endeavor which she, peace with her, had to exert. She did not confine herself to delivering a speech and to provide arguments supporting her claims.

What Imam al-Hassan al-Mujtaba (as) Narrates

16. It is narrated from al-Sha'bi, Abu Mikhnaf, Yazid ibn Habib al-Misri the tradition of Imam al-Hassan al-Mujtaba (as) in which he argued with 'Amr ibn al-'As, al-Walid ibn 'Uqbah, 'Amr ibn 'Othman and 'Utbah ibn Abu Sufyan in the presence of Mu'awiyah, and it is quite a lengthy tradition. In it, the Imam (as) says to al-Mughirah ibn Shu'bah, "You are the one who hit Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S, causing her to bleed and she miscarried, thus humiliating the Messenger of Allah S, disobeying his order and violating his sanctity since the Messenger of Allah S had said to her, 'O Fatima! You are the Head of all the women of Paradise.'" [25](#)

The great 'allama and mentor Shaikh al-Tibrisi, in his Introduction to his book *Al-Ihtijaj*, has said, "Most of what we cite of any report we quote it according to its own *isnad* either because there is a consensus in its regard, or it agrees with what other thinkers have pointed out, or it is famous in biography books of those who disagree as well as those who agree with us except the speech of the father of Muhammed, namely (Imam) al-Hassan al-'Askari (as), which I have cited, for nothing is more famous than it, although it contains the same as we have already introduced. For this reason, I mentioned its *isnad* at the beginning of each report of the same..." [26](#)

The researching 'allama and mentor, al-Tehrani, has said the following in *Al-Thari'a* الذريعة, "This statement of his is quite clear in that everything he has cited in this regard is famous as agreed on by those who disagree as well as by those who agree with us. It is one of the highly regarded books on which scholars such as 'allama al-Majlisi and the traditionist al-Hurr al-'Amili and their peers depend." [27](#)

What is Narrated by al-Sajjad (as)

17. Muhammed ibn Jarir ibn Rustam al-Tabari has recorded the following: “We have been informed by Makhal ibn Ibrahim al-Nahdi who says that Matar ibn Arqam has said that Abu Hamzah al-Thumali has said that Ali ibn al-Husayn (as) has said the following:

When he (S) passed away, and when Abu Bakr received the oath of allegiance, Ali (as) lagged behind, so “Umar said to Abu Bakr, “Are you not going to send someone to this lagging man to come and swear the oath of allegiance to you?” He (Abu Bakr) said, “Qunfath! Go to Ali and tell him that the successor of the Messenger of Allah S tells you to come and swear the oath of allegiance.” Ali (as) raised his voice saying, “Praise to Allah! How quickly you have told lies about the Messenger of Allah S!” He returned and informed Abu Bakr of it. “Umar again said, “Are you not going to send someone to this lagging man to come and swear the oath of allegiance to you?” He (Abu Bakr) said to Qunfath, “Go to Ali and tell him that the commander of the faithful tells you to come and swear the oath of allegiance.” Qunfath went there and knocked at the door. He said, “Who is it?” He said, “It is I, Qunfath.” He said, “What brought you here?” He said, “The commander of the faithful tells you to go and swear fealty.” Ali (as) raised his voice as he said, “Glory to Allah! He claims what is not his!” Qunfath returned and told Abu Bakr everything. “Umar stood up and said, “Let us go to this man to bring him here.” A group of men went with him.

They knocked at the door. When Ali (as) heard their voices, he said nothing. A woman spoke and inquired who they were. They said, “Tell Ali to come out and swear fealty.” Fatima (sa) raised her voice as she said, “O Messenger of Allah S! What have we suffered at the hands of Abu Bakr and ‘Umar after you?!” When the men heard her voice and words, many of them wept.

Then they went away. ‘Umar remained, accompanied by a number of men. They took Ali (as) out and led him to Abu Bakr till they seated him in front of the latter. Abu Bakr said to him, “Swear fealty (to me).” Ali (as) said, “What if I don’t?” Abu Bakr said, “Then, by Allah, the One and only God, your neck shall be struck with the sword.” Ali (as) said, “You do that to me although I am a servant of Allah S and the Brother of His Messenger?!” Abu Bakr said, “Swear it.” Ali (as) said, “What if I don’t?!” Abu Bakr said, “Then, by Allah, the One and only God, your neck shall be struck with the sword.” Ali (as) turned to the grave (of the Messenger of Allah (S)) and said, “O Brother! The people deem me weak, and they almost killed me.” He swore fealty then left.[28](#)

What Either al-Baqir or al-Sadiq (as) has Narrated

18. ‘Allama al-‘Ayyashi, may Allah have mercy on him, has cited one of these Imams (as) narrating a lengthy tradition at the end of which he said,

Abu Bakr sent him a message to go there to swear the oath of allegiance to him. Ali (as) said, “I shall not come out till I finish compiling the Qur’an.” He sent for him again. He said, “I shall not come out till I

am through.” Abu Bakr sent for him a third time a cousin of his called Qunfath. Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S went out to act as a barrier between the men and Ali (as). Qunfath hit her, returning without Ali (as). It was feared that he would amass a group of opponents. Abu Bakr ordered firewood to be brought and placed around Ali’s house. Then “Umar set out with a torch in his hand and wanted to burn Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as). When Ali (as) saw all of that, he was forced to come out to swear fealty against his wish.[29](#)

19. Muhammed ibn Yahya quotes Muhammed ibn al-Husayn quoting Muhammed ibn Isma’il quoting Salih ibn ‘Uqbah quoting ‘Abdullah ibn Muhammed al-Ju’fi quoting Abu Ja’far and Abu ‘Abdullah (as) as saying, “When they did what they did, Fatima (sa) seized “Umar by the collar, pulled him and said, ‘O son of al-Khattab! Had I not feared that some innocent people would be hurt, I would have submitted a plea to Allah to which He will respond swiftly.’”[30](#)

The mentor of the Muslims, Shaikh al-Majlisi, has said the following while explaining the beginning of the quotation of the Imam cited above, “He means their forceful entry into Fatima’s house.”[31](#)

What is Narrated from Imam al-Baqir (as)

20. Ibrahim ibn Ahmed al-Tabari, relying on Ali ibn “Umar ibn Hassan ibn Ali al-Siyari who cites Muhammed ibn Zakariyya al-Ghulabi citing Ja’far ibn Muhammed ibn ‘Imarah citing his father citing Jabir al-Ju’fi citing Abu Ja’far Muhammed ibn Ali ibn al-Husayn (as) citing his father citing his grandfather citing Muhammed ibn ‘Ammar ibn Yasir ؓ in a tradition saying the following:

... She was pregnant with al-Hassan (as). Having given birth to him, she conceived forty days thereafter with al-Husayn (as), then she was blessed with Zainab and Umm Kulthum. Then she was big with al-Muhsin. When the Messenger of Allah S passed away, and when the folks did what they did on that day, forcefully entering her house and taking her cousin, the Commander of the Faithful (as), out by force. After the harm dealt to her by that man (“Umar), she miscarried her son. That was the original cause of her sickness then subsequently death, peace and blessings of Allah with her.[32](#)

21. Muhammed ibn Jarir ibn Rustam al-Tabari stated that Ali (as) lagged behind when Abu Bakr received the people’s oath of allegiance, so they went to his house and intended to set it to fire. They wanted to burn him and Fatima (sa), so al-Zubayr came out with his sword unsheathed, and they broke his sword. Muhammed ibn Harun has narrated from Aban ibn ‘Othman saying that Sa’d ibn Qudamah cites Za’ida saying that Abu Bakr invited Ali (as) to swear the oath of allegiance to him, but he refused. Then the narrator details how Ali (as) argued with them and goes on to say, “I asked Za’idah ibn Qudamah, ‘Who did you hear this from?’ He said, ‘I heard it from Abu Ja’far Muhammed ibn Ali ibn al-Husayn (as).’”[33](#)

22. Abu al-Jarud is cited quoting Abu Ja’far being asked about when al-Qa’im (as) will come out (of his occultation). He provided a lengthy answer wherein he referred to “the firewood which they collected in

order to burn Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as). And this is the firewood which we keep inheriting..."³⁴

What Imam al-Sadiq (as) is Quoted Narrating

23. Muhammed ibn 'Abdullah ibn Ja'far al-Himyari quotes his father quoting Ali ibn Muhammed ibn Salim quoting Muhammed ibn Khalid quoting 'Abdullah ibn Hammad al-Basri quoting 'Abdullah ibn Ali ibn Abd al-Rahman al-Asam quoting Hammad ibn 'Othman quoting Abu 'Abdullah (as) saying,

When the Prophet S was taken for the night journey, it was said to him that Allah would test him in three instances. So the angel kept counting them till he said, "As for your daughter Fatima (sa), she will be oppressed and deprived and her right will be confiscated, the inheritance which you will leave her. And she will be hit while she is pregnant; insults and humiliation will affect her, then she will miscarry what is in her womb and be beaten, and she will die from such beating... The first to raise a complaint against his killer (on the Day of Judgment) will be Muhsin son of Ali (as), then Qunfath and his fellow (Abu Bakr) will be brought..."³⁵

24. Abul-Hassan ibn Shathan quotes his father quoting Muham-med ibn al-Hassan ibn al-Walid quoting Muhammed ibn al-Husayn ibn al-Saffar quoting Muhammed ibn Ziyad from Mufaddal ibn 'Umar from Yunus ibn Ya'qub from al-Sadiq (as) saying the following in a lengthy tradition: "O Yunus! My grandfather, the Messenger of Allah (S), said, 'Cursed is whoever oppresses my daughter Fatima (sa) and confiscates what belongs to her and kills her.'"³⁶

25. The author of *Al-Kafi* cites some of our folks citing Ahmed ibn Muhammed from al-Qasim from his grandfather from Abu Busayr from Abu 'Abdullah (as) quoting his forefathers saying, "The Commander of the Faithful (as) has said, 'When the ones you miscarry meet you on the Day of Judgment, they will ask their parents why they did not give them names. The Messenger of Allah (S) had named Muhsin before his birth.'"³⁷ This narrative is also included among the 400 *ahadith*. Refer also to al-Saduq's book titled *Al-Khisal*.

Regarding the *isnad* of this tradition, al-Majlisi has said that it is reliable.³⁸

26. Ibrahim ibn Sa'd al-Thaqafi has said, "Ahmed ibn 'Amr al-Bijli has told me that we have been told by Ahmed ibn Habib al-'Amiri who quotes Hamran ibn A'yan quoting Abu 'Abdullah Ja'far ibn Muhammed S as saying, 'By Allah! Ali (as) did not swear the oath of allegiance (to Abu Bakr) except after the smoke had entered his house.'"³⁹

27. Al-Husayn ibn Hamdan quotes Muhammed ibn Isma'il and Ali ibn 'Abdullah al-Husayni citing Abu Shu'ayb and Muhammed ibn Nasir quoting "Umar ibn al-Furat quoting Muhammed ibn al-Mufaddal ibn 'Umar as saying,

I asked my master, al-Sadiq (as), "Is there a particular time for the reappearance of the Awaited One,

al-Mahdi (as), which people know?" He (as) said, "Far, it is, from Allah to time his reappearance to one known by our Shi'as..." The narrative continues till it refers to how Salman al-Farisi was beaten, how the fire was set at the house door of the Commander of the Faithful and Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) in order to burn them, how the hand of the Truthful Lady, Fatima (sa), was whipped, how her stomach was kicked, and how she miscarried al-Muhsin..., the story of Abu Bakr and how he sent out Khalid ibn al-Walid, Qunfath (his slave) and "Umar ibn al-Khattab, how the latter gathered people to get the Commander of the Faithful (as) out of his house in order to swear fealty to Abu Bakr at the *saqifa* of Bani Sa'idah... "Umar said, "Come out, Ali, and join what the Muslims have all done; otherwise, we shall kill you." Fidda, maid of Fatima (sa), said to them, "The Commander of the Faithful (as) is busy, and it will be a good deed if you are true to your own selves and be fair to him" (and how "Umar taunted her in response). They gathered plenty of firewood at the door in order to burn the house of the Commander of the Faithful (as) as well as Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), as well as Zainab, Umm Kulthum and Fidda. They set the door to fire. Fatima (sa) went out to address them from behind the door. She said to them, 'Woe unto you, O "Umar! How dare you thus offend Allah and the Messenger of Allah S?! Do you want to put an end to his (Prophet's) offspring in this world, exile him and put out the *noor* of Allah? Yet Allah shall complete His *noor*.' "Umar rebuked Fatima (sa). He said to her, "Fatima! Enough of that! Neither Muhammed is present nor are the angels bringing orders from Allah to do or not to do! Ali is like any other Muslim. You have the option either to get him out to swear fealty to Abu Bakr, or I shall burn you all." Crying, Fatima (sa) supplicated thus: "Lord! I complain to You about how I miss Your Prophet, Messenger and chosen one, how Your nation has turned its back on us, and how they have confiscated what belongs to us and which You thus stated in the Book You revealed to the Prophet You sent!" "Umar said to her, "Abandon, O Fatima, the *foolishness* of women, for Allah will not let both Prophetic Mission and caliphate be yours." As he spoke these words, fire had already consumed the door's wood. Qunfath the accursed stretched his damned hand in order to open the door (from inside). "Umar hit Fatima's hand with his whip. The whip left a mark on her wrist like a black bracelet. He kicked the door with his foot, and the door hit Fatima's stomach. She was six months big with al-Muhsin whom she miscarried...

"Umar attacked, and so did Qunfath and Khalid ibn al-Walid. "Umar slapped Fatima (sa) on her cheek, breaking her ear-ring under her veil, and she was crying loudly as she said, "O father! O Messenger of Allah! Your daughter Fatima is treated as a liar, is hit, and her fetus is killed in her womb!" The Commander of the Faithful (as) came out of the house with red eyes, wearing nothing on his head. He put his outer mantle on Fatima (sa), hugged her and said, "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S)! You already know that your father was sent as a mercy to the whole world..." Then he turned to "Umar and said, "O son of al-Khattab! Woe unto you from this day of yours and from the day thereafter and the ones that follow! Get out (of my house) before I unsheathe my sword and annihilate the bygone of the nation!" "Umar went out and so did Khalid ibn al-Walid, Qunfath, and Abd al-Rahman ibn Abu Bakr. They were outside when the Commander of the Faithful (as) called on Fidda to tend to her mistress who was undergoing the pain of miscarriage... Fatima (sa) miscarried al-Muhsin, so Ali (as) said, "He is

joining his grandfather, the Messenger of Allah (S), to whom he will lodge a complaint. And al-Muhsin will come out (on the Judgment Day) carried by (his maternal grandmother) Khadija daughter of Khuwaylid and (his paternal grandmother) Fatima daughter of Assad, mother of the Commander of the Faithful (as), and they shall be wailing. His mother shall say, 'This is the Day about which you were warned.'"

Al-Mufaddal asked the Imam (as), "Master! What do you say about the verse that says, 'When the female infant buried alive is asked for what sin she was killed' (Qur'an, 81:8-9)?" The Imam (as) said, "O Mufaddal! The infant buried alive, by Allah, is Muhsin, because he is one of us. Anyone who says otherwise is a liar." Al-Mufaddal said, "Master! Then what?" Imam al-Sadiq (as) said, "Fatima (sa) daughter of the Messenger of Allah S will stand and say, 'Lord! Carry out Your promise to me and regarding myself against whoever oppressed me, confiscated what belonged to me, hit me and killed all my sons!'"[40](#)

28. In another tradition, Imam al-Sadiq (as) said to al-Mufaddal, "There is no tragedy like ours at Kerbala' despite what happened one day at the *saqifa* and how the fire was set at the door of the Commander of the Faithful (as), thus endangering him, al-Hassan, al-Husayn, Fatima, Zainab and Umm Kulthum (as) as well as Fidda. And the killing of Muhsin, when someone kicked his mother in the stomach, is greater, more tragic and more bitter because it is the origin of the Day of Torment."[41](#)

29. The head of the Shi'a, namely Shaikh al-Mufid, has said the following in his book titled *Al-Ikhtisas* where he cites Ahmed ibn Muhammed ibn 'Isa quoting his father, and also from al-'Abbas ibn Ma'ruf from 'Abdullah ibn al-Mughirah saying that 'Abdullah ibn 'Abd al-Rahman al-Asam cited 'Abdullah ibn Bakr al-Arjani as saying, "I accompanied Abu 'Abdullah (as) on his way from Mecca to Medina..." then he narrated a lengthy discourse wherein he quoted Abu 'Abdullah (as) as saying, "... killer of the Commander of the Faithful (as), killer of Fatima (sa), killer of al-Muhsin, killer of al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as)...., etc."

This is narrated in *Kamil al-Ziyarat* from another *isnad* from 'Abdullah ibn al-Asam from 'Abdullah ibn Bakr al-Arjani. In it, the Imam (as) is quoted as saying, "... and the killer of Fatima (sa) and Muhsin..., etc.," so you may refer to it.[42](#)

30. Ali ibn Ibrahim quotes his father quoting Sulayman al-Daylami quoting Abu Busayr quoting Abu 'Abdullah (as) as saying, "On the Day of Judgment, Prophet Muhammed S shall be called on, and he will be clad in a rosy outfit... Then it will be called from the depths of the 'Arsh by the Lord of Glory and the Sublime Horizon, 'How good your father, O Muhammed, is, who is Ibrahim, and how good your brother is, who is Ali ibn Abu Talib (as), and how good your grandsons are, and they are al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as), and how good your fetus is, and he is Muhsin, and how good the rightly guided Imams (as) are..., etc."[43](#)

31. Abu Muhammed, citing 'Abdullah ibn Sinan from Abu 'Abdullah (as) says the following:

When the Messenger of Allah (S) passed away, Abu Bakr took his seat on his pulpit. He sent for the [business] agent of Fatima (sa) and expelled him... Abu Bakr then wrote her a property title, returning Fadak to her possession. But "Umar met her and asked her, "O Daughter of Muhammed! What is this sheet in your hand?" She said, "A property title which Abu Bakr wrote me, returning Fadak to my possession." He said, "Give it to me." She refused, so he kicked her with his foot in the stomach, and she was pregnant with a son named al-Muhsin whom she instantly miscarried. "Umar then slapped her on her cheek, causing her ear-ring to break into bits and pieces. Then he took the property title and tore it to pieces. Fatima (sa) went away. For seventy-five days from the time "Umar kicked her, she remained sick, then she passed away. On her death-bed, she called Ali (as) to her presence and said to him, "You may either guarantee to carry out what I shall say to you or I shall ask al-Zubayr [to do so]." Ali (as) said, "I guarantee to carry out your will, O Daughter of Muhammed!" She said to him, "I ask you in the right of the Messenger of Allah S that if I die, both men ("Umar and Abu Bakr) should not be present near me, nor should they attend my funeral prayers." He said, "You will have what you desire." When she passed away, he buried her at night. In the morning, the people of Medina, including Abu Bakr and "Umar, wanted to attend her funeral. Ali (as) went out and was met by both men. They asked him, "What have you done to the daughter of Muhammed S regarding preparing her for her burial, O father of al-Hassan?" Ali (as) said, "By Allah, I have already buried her." They said, "What caused you to bury her without informing us that she had died?" He (as) said, "She had ordered me to do just that." "Umar said, "By Allah! I am about to dig up her grave and perform the funeral prayers for her." Ali (as) said, "By Allah! As long as my heart is still resting inside my rib cage, and as long as I can hold (my sword) Thul-Fiqar in my hand, you shall never be able to dig her body out, and you know best what I can do!" Abu Bakr said (to "Umar), "Go, for he is more worthy of her than we are." People then dispersed.[44](#)

32. Muhammed ibn Harran al-Tal'akbari cites his father as saying that "Abu Ali," Muhammed ibn Humam ibn Suhail, has said that Ahmed ibn Muhammed al-Barqi has cited Ahmed ibn Muhammed al-Ash'ari al-Qummi citing 'Abd al-Rahman ibn Abu Najran citing 'Abdullah ibn Sinan citing Ibn Maskan citing Abu Busayr quoting Abu 'Abdullah (as) saying the following:

Fatima (sa) was born on the 20th of Jumada al-ākhira, when the Prophet S was forty-five years old... The reason for her death is that Qunfath, slave of the man (Abu Bakr), poked her with the sword's scabbard as ordered by his master, so she miscarried Muhsin. She fell seriously sick because of the incident, and she did not allow any of those who harmed her enter her house. Two men (Abu Bakr and "Umar) from among the companions of the Prophet S requested the Commander of the Faithful (as) to intercede on their behalf with her. He requested her, and she agreed. When they entered, they asked her, "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah S! How do you feel?" She said, "Well, all Praise is due to Allah." Then she said to them, "Did you not hear the Prophet S say, 'Fatima (sa) is part of me; whoever harms her harms me, and whoever harms me harms Allah'?" They answered in the affirmative. She said, "By Allah! You both have harmed me." They went out while she was still angry with them.[45](#)

The *isnad* of this narrative is authentic.

33. Shaikh al-Tusi has said that Imam al-Sadiq (as) is quoted as saying that when the Commander of the Faithful (as) was taken forcefully out of his house, Fatima (sa) went out behind him. All women from Banu Hashim went out with her and they all were near the grave (of the Prophet (S) which was inside the room nearby). Fatima (sa) said to them, "Leave my cousin alone for, by Allah, if you do not leave him alone..., etc."⁴⁶

This narrative, too, proves that they entered his house by force and took him out by force although Fatima (sa) was there, demonstrating a total lack of respect for her and for her privacy.

34. Judge 'Abd al-Jabbar, who died in 415 A.H./1024 A.D. and who was contemporary to Shaikh al-Mufid (d. 413 A.H./1022 A.D.), may Allah have mercy on him, has said that the Shi'a put forth claims on a narrative by Imam Ja'far ibn Muhammed [al-Sadiq] (as) and others which says that "Umar (ibn al-Khattab) hit Fatima (sa) with his whip."⁴⁷

We do not know if he is referring to the narratives which we have been citing or to others, so we set his quoted statement aside for this reason.

What is Narrated from Imam al-Kazim (as)

'Allama al-Majlisi, may Allah Almighty have mercy on him, has transmitted from *Kitab al-Tara'f fi Ma'rifat Mathahib al-Tawa'if* الطوائف في معرفة مذاهب الطوائف by the great 'allama Sayyid Ibn Tawus⁴⁸, from *Kitab al-Wasiyya* by Shaikh 'Isa ibn al-Mustafad al-Darar from Musa ibn Ja'far from his father saying that when the Messenger of Allah S was about to leave this world for the next, he said, "O men of the Ansar! Parting is opportune... The door of Fatima (sa) is my door, her house is mine; so, whoever violates its sanctity violates the sanctity of Allah's barrier." 'Isa goes on to say that the father of al-Hassan (as) wept for a long time. He discontinued his narrative then said, "By Allah! Allah's barrier was violated! By Allah! Allah's barrier was violated! By Allah! Allah's barrier was violated, O nation blessed by Allah!"⁴⁹

36. Harun ibn Musa is quoted by Ahmed ibn Muhammed ibn 'Ammar al-'Ijli al-Kufi quoting 'Isa al-Darar quoting Imam al-Kazim (as) saying, "I asked my father, 'What happened after the departure of the angels from the Messenger of Allah S?' He said, 'He called to his presence Ali, Fatima, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and told all others to leave them alone... He then said to Ali (as), 'Be informed, O Ali, that I am pleased with whomsoever my daughter Fatima is pleased with, and so is my Lord and His angels. O Ali! Woe unto whoever oppresses her! Woe unto whoever confiscates what belongs to her! Woe unto whoever violates her sanctity! Woe unto whoever burns her door! Woe unto whoever harms her friend! Woe unto whoever exposes her to hardship or antagonizes her! Lord! I am clear of all of them, and they are clear of me.' Then the Messenger of Allah S named them, hugged Fatima, Ali, al-Hassan and al-Husayn (as) and said, 'Lord! I am peace with them and with whoever follows them, and I hope they will all enter Paradise. And I am a foe and war against anyone who antagonizes them, who

oppresses them, who goes ahead of them or lags behind them and behind their followers (Shi'as), and I hope all these will enter the Fire! O Fatima! I shall never be pleased except when you are pleased! No, by Allah! I shall never be pleased except when *you* are pleased! I shall never be pleased except when *you* are pleased!"⁵⁰

37. Muhammed ibn Yahya quotes al-'Amraki quoting Ali quoting Ali ibn Ja'far quoting his brother quoting the father of al-Hassan (as) as saying, "Fatima (sa) is a truthful lady and a martyr, and daughters of prophets do not menstruate."⁵¹

Both al-Majlisi I and II, who are among the greatest of our scholars, have commented about the above-quoted tradition saying that it is authentic.⁵²

38. The great 'allama and ascetic worshipper, Sayyid Ibn Tawus, through his *isnad* from Imam al-Kazim (as) who quotes his father (as) as saying, "The Messenger of Allah S said, 'O Ali! What are you going to do when certain people plot against you after me and push themselves over you, and (so-and-so) will call on you to swear fealty, then you will be covered with your garment and led like a fleeting camel, humiliated and despised, grieved and depressed, and thereafter humiliation will descend...?'"⁵³

What is Narrated From Imam al-Rida (as)

39. The great 'allama and ascetic worshipper, Sayyid Ibn Tawus, may Allah have mercy on him, has transmitted a supplication by our master, Imam al-Rida (as), to be recited during *sajdat al-shukr* (prostration of thanksgiving) which he narrates through *isnad* to Sa'd ibn 'Abdullah in a book detailing the rewards of supplication. He cites Abu Ja'far quoting Muhammed S ibn Isma'il ibn Bazee' quoting Imam al-Rida (as) and also Bakar ibn Salih from Sulayman ibn Ja'far from al-Rida (as). Both men say that they visited him once as he was performing the thanksgiving prostration. He prolonged his prostration then raised his head. They said to him, "You surely have prolonged your prostration!" He said, "Anyone who supplicates to Allah reciting this plea will be regarded as though he had shot arrows during the battle of Badr in the company of the Messenger of Allah S." They asked him if they should write it down. He said, "Write down that once you are prostrating during *sajdat al-shukr*, you should say..., etc." He cited the supplication which contains the following: "... and they both ridiculed Your Messenger and killed the son of Your Prophet S..., etc."⁵⁴

What is Narrated from Imam al-Jawad (as)

40. Citing his father, Muhammed ibn Harun ibn Musa transmits from Muhammed ibn al-Hassan ibn Ahmed ibn al-Walid, from Ahmed ibn Abu 'Abdullah al-Barqi from Zakariyya ibn Adam saying,

I was in the company of al-Rida (as) when Abu Ja'far, peace with him, was brought in. He was not yet forty years old. He hit the ground with his hand then raised his head to the sky and contemplated for a long time. Al-Rida (as) said to him, 'May I be your sacrifice! About what have you prolonged your

contemplation?!’ He said, ‘About what was done to my mother Fatima (sa)..., by Allah..., etc.’ Then he, peace with him, stated how those who did so would be punished.”⁵⁵

We say that this narrative, though not detailing what took place, also considers her, peace with her, as having been exposed to a great injustice.

What is Narrated from Imam al-’Askari (as)

41. Sayyid Ibn Tawus, in his work titled *Zawa’id al-Fawa’id*, citing *Kitab al-Mukhtasar* by Shaikh Hassan ibn Sulayman, a copy handwritten by Ali ibn Muzahir al-Wasiti, through a continuous chain of *isnad* that ends with Muhammed ibn al-’Ala’ al-Hamadani al-Wasiti. Then he cites it from *Kitab al-Mukhtasar* at the conclusion of which he says that he copied it from an edition handwritten by Muhammed ibn Ali ibn Tay. In it, it is stated that Ibn Abul-’Ala’ al-Hamadani and Yahya ibn Muhammed ibn Haweej disputed with each other regarding “Umar ibn al-Khattab, so they sought the arbitration of Ahmed ibn Ishaq al-Qummi, a friend of Imam al-Hassan al-’Askari (as). He narrated to them from what he had learned from Imam al-’Askari (as) who cites his father (as) saying that Huthayfah narrated a lengthy tradition about the Prophet S wherein he informed Huthayfan ibn al-Yaman a number of events that would take place after his demise. Huthayfah, seeing how what he had heard came true, said, “... And the Qur’an was distorted, and the house where revelation used to descend was burnt... and the face of the Lady of Virtue was slapped...”⁵⁶

1. Al-Tusi, Amali, Vol. 1, p. 122. Refer to p. 191 of this edition published by Al-Wafa’ Establishment of Beirut, Lebanon. Ibn Sa’d, Tabaqat, Vol. 8, p. 278. Ansab al-Ashraf, Vol. 1, p. 551. Ahmed, Musnad, Vol. 6, p. 339. Al-Khasa’is al-Kubra, Vol. 2, p. 135. Al-Mufid, Amali, p. 215. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 40.

2. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 38, p. 145, citing Al-Manaqib.

3. Cited from the book of Sulaym ibn Qays (al-Hilali) (edited by al-Ansari), Vol. 2, p. 907.

4. Fara’id al-Simtayn, Vol. 2, pp. 34–35. Al-Saduq, Amali, pp. 99–101. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 1, pp. 280–81. Irshad al-Qulub, p. 295. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 37, 39 and Vol. 43, pp. 172–73. Al-’Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 391–92 in the footnote of which a citation of p. 48 of Ghayat al-Maram, p. 48 and p. 109 of Al-Muhtadir. Al-Majlisi, Jala’ al-’Uyun, Vol. 2, pp. 186–88.

5. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 98, p. 44.

6. Ibn Salam al-Abazi, Bid’ al-Islam wa Shara’i’ ad-Din, p. 107. Al-Bukhari, Sihah, Vol. 1, pp. 67, 164, 212 (1309 A.H. edition). Ibn Majah, Sunan, Vol. 2, p. 1306. Al-Bayhaqi, Dala’il al-Nubuwwa, Vol. 6, p. 386.

7. Refer to the references listed in the previous footnote.

8. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, pp. 302–03 and the book of Sulaym ibn Qays, Vol. 2, pp. 674–75. Al-’Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 413.

9. Refer to the references listed in the previous footnote.

10. Refer to the book of Sulaym ibn Qays as edited by al-Ansari, Vol. 2, p. 915. Ibn Shathan, Al-Fada’il, p. 141. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 73.

11. Al-Kulayni, Al-Kafi, Vol. 1, p. 459. Mir’at al-’Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 329. Nahjul-Balagha (Sermon No. 202).

12. Al-Kaf’ami, Misbah, p. 4.

13. The word “million” does not exist in classical Arabic. Instead, Arabs say “a thousand thousands.” ___ Tr.

14. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 82, p. 261. Al-Kaf’ami, Misbah, p. 553. Al-Balad al-Amin, pp. 551–52. ’Ilm al-Yaqin, p. 701.

15. Refer to the footnotes of p. 553 of Al-Misbah by al-Kaf’ami, to pp. 551–52 of Al-Balad al-Amin and to p. 701 of ’Ilm al-

Yaqin.

- [16.](#) Refer to p. 555 of the previous reference and to p. 261, Vol. 82, of Bihar al-Anwar.
- [17.](#) Shaikh al-Saduq, Amali, p. 118. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 51; also refer to Vol. 44, p. 149. Ithbat al-Hudat, Vol. 1, p. 281. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 397. Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, p. 189. `Abd ar-Razzaq al-Muqarram, Wafat al-Siddiq al-Zahra' (sa), p. 60. Ibn Shahr Ashub, Al-Manaqib, Vol. 2, p. 209 (published by Intisharat `Alamah, Qum).
- [18.](#) Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, p. 189.
- [19.](#) Al-Hidaya al-Kubra, p. 163.
- [20.](#) Ibn A`tham, Al-Futuh, Vol. 3, p. 474.
- [21.](#) Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 15, p. 186. Al-Tasatturi, Ihqaq al-Haqq, Vol. 2, pp. 368-69.
- [22.](#) Ibn Abul-Hadid, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 28. Refer also to Nahj al-Sa`da and p. 369, Vol. 2, of Ihqaq al-Haqq.
- [23.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, pp. 348-50, citing Irshad al-Qulub by al-Daylami.
- [24.](#) References of this poetry are numerous among the Muslims' books, so we find it sufficient to point out to p. 299, Vol. 1, of Al-Manaqib by Ibn Shahr Ashub.
- [25.](#) Al-Tibrisi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, p. 414. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, p. 197. Mir'at al-`Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 321. Diya' al-`Alamin (manuscript), Vol. 2, p. 64.
- [26.](#) Al-Tibrisi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, p. 4.
- [27.](#) Al-Thari`a, Vol. 1, p. 282.
- [28.](#) Al-Mustarshid fi Imamate Ali ibn Abu Talib, pp. 65-66.
- [29.](#) Al-`Ayyashi, Tafsir, Vol. 2, pp. 307-08. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 231. Al-Burhan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Vol. 2, p. 434.
- [30.](#) Al-`Ayyashi, Tafsir, Vol. 2, pp. 307-08. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, p. 231. Al-Burhan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Vol. 2, p. 434.
- [31.](#) Al-Kulayni, Al-Kafi, Vol. 1, p. 460.
- [32.](#) Dala'il al-Imama, pp. 26-27. Refer to Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, p. 504.
- [33.](#) Al-Mustarshid fi Imamat Ali ibn Abu Talib (as), pp. 64-65.
- [34.](#) Dala'il al-Imama, p. 242.
- [35.](#) Kamil al-Ziyarat, pp. 232-35. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 62-64. Refer also to Vol. 53, p. 23 of the same. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 398. Al-Majlisi, Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, pp. 184-86.
- [36.](#) Kanz al-Fawa'id, Vol. 1, pp. 149-50. Rawdat al-Jannat, Vol. 6, p. 182.
- [37.](#) Al-Kafi, Vol. 6, p. 18. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 411. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, p. 195 and Vol. 101, p. 128 and Vol. 10, p. 112. Al-Khisal, Vol. 2, p. 434. `Ilal al-Shara'i, Vol. 2, p. 464. Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, p. 222.
- [38.](#) Jala' al-`Uyun, Vol. 1, p. 222.
- [39.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 28, pp. 269, 390, 411. On its footnote, it is stated that it cites al-Thaqafi's book Al-Gharat.
- [40.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 53, pp. 14, 18, 19, 23. Al-`Awalim, Vol. 11, pp. 441-43. Al-Khasibi, Al-Hidaya al-Kubra, pp. 392, 407-08, 417. Hilyat al-Abrar, Vol. 2, p. 652. Refer also to Fatima al-Zahra' Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa, Vol. 2, p. 532 from Nawa'ib al-Duhur by Sayyid al-Meerjahani, p. 192.
- [41.](#) Fatima al-Zahra' Bahjat Qalb al-Mustafa, Vol. 2, p. 532, quoting Nawa'ib al-Duhur by Sayyid al-Meerjahani, p. 194. Al-Khasibi, Al-Hidaya al-Kubra, p. 417 (Beirut edition).
- [42.](#) Shaikh al-Mufid, Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 343-44. Kamil al-Ziyarat, pp. 326-27. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 8, p. 213. Refer also to Basa'ir al-Darajat.
- [43.](#) Al-Qummi, Tafsir, Vol. 1, p. 128. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 7, pp. 328-29 and Vol. 23, pp. 130-31 and Vol. 12, pp. 6-7. Nar al-Thaqalayn, Vol. 1, p. 348. Al-Burhan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Vol. 1, pp. 328-29.
- [44.](#) Al-Mufid, Al-Ikhtisas, pp. 184-85. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 29, p. 192. Abd al-Razzaq al-Muqarram, Wafat al-Siddiq al-Zahra', p. 78.
- [45.](#) Dala'il al-Imama, p. 45. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 43, p. 170. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, pp. 411, 504.
- [46.](#) Al-Tibrisi, Al-Ihtijaj, Vol. 1, p. 222. Al-Mustarshid fi Imamat Ali ibn Abu Talib (a), p. 67.
- [47.](#) Judge `Abd al-Jabbar, Al-Mughni, Vol. 20, p. 335. Sayyid al-Murtada, Al-Shafi, Vol. 4, pp. 110-19. Ibn Abul-Hadid,

Sharh Nahjul-Balagha, Vol. 16, p. 271.

[48.](#) Following is a list of some of the works of Ibn Tawus:

1- الإقبال Al-Iqbal التحصين 2- Al-Tahseen الأسفار Al-Aman min Akhtar al-Asfar 4- فلاح السائل Falah al-Sa'il الدعاء المجتبي Al-Mujtana min Du'a Jamal al-Usboo جمال الأسبوع 6- Al-Duroo' al-Waqiya 5- الدروع الواقية 8- فتح الأبواب 9- Fath al-Abwab 10- الطرائف في معرفة مذاهب الطوائف 11- اللهوف في قتلى الطفوف 12- الملاحم والفتن 13- بناء المقالة 14- سعد السعود 15- فرج المهموم 16- فرحة الغري 17- Qabas min Ghiyath Sultan al-Wara 18- كشف المحجة لثمره المهجة . -Tr.

[49.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, pp. 476-77. In its footnote, it cites pp. 18-21 of Al-Tara'if by Ibn Tawus.

[50.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 22, pp. 484-85. In its footnote, p. 72 of Khasa'is al-A'imma is cited and so is p. 400, Vol. 11, of `Awalim al-`Ulum as well as pp. 92-34 of Al-Tara'if and also Musbah al-Anwar.

[51.](#) Al-Kulayni, Al-Kafi, Vol. 1, p. 458. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 260. Al-Khawajoo'i, Al-Rasa'il al-`Itiqadiyya, pp. 301-02.

[52.](#) Mir'at al-`Uqul, Vol. 5, p. 315. Rawdat al-Muttaqin, Vol. 5, p. 342.

[53.](#) Al-Kulayni, Al-Kafi, Vol. 1, p. 458. `Awalim al-`Ulum, Vol. 11, p. 260. Al-Khawajoo'i, Al-Rasa'il al-`Itiqadiyya, pp. 301-02.

[54.](#) Muhaj al-Da`awat, pp. 257-58. Shaikh al-Kaf'ami, Al-Misbah, pp. 553-54. Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 30, p. 393 and Vol. 83, p. 223. Al-`Ataridi, Musnad al-Imam al-Rida ؑ, Vol. 2, p. 65.

[55.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 50, p. 59, citing Dala'il al-Imama by al-Tabari.

[56.](#) Al-Majlisi, Bihar al-Anwar, Vol. 95, pp. 351, 353-54 and Vol. 31, p. 126. Shaikh Hassan ibn Sulayman, Al-Muhtadir, pp. 44-55 (as referred to in a footnote in Bihar al-Anwar). Also in the same footnote, it is stated that al-Tabari had narrated it in Dala'il al-Imama in the Part relevant to the Commander of the Faithful ؑ and is narrated by Shaikh Hashim ibn Muhammed (one of the sixth century A.H. scholars) in Misbah al-Anwar and by al-Jaza'iri in Al-Anwar al-Nu`maniyya through a different chain of isnad; so, you may refer to it.

Source URL:

<https://www.al-islam.org/tragedy-al-zahra-doubts-and-responses-jafar-murtadha-al-amili/texts-and-legacies-fourteen-infallible#comment-0>