

[Home](#) > [Fabricated Traditions](#) > [The Holy Prophet \(S\) talks to Mount Hira](#) > [Evaluation of tradition](#) > 2.

Chain of transmitters of tradition

The Holy Prophet (S) talks to Mount Hira

The third fabricated tradition is narrated by Muslim in his *Sahih* in a chapter devoted to the excellences of Talha and Zubair. He narrates from Ubaidullah bin Muhammad bn Yazid bin Khanis and Ahmad bin Ysuf bin Azdi from Ismael bin Yunus bin Abu Uwais from Sulayman bin Bilal from Yahya bin Sa'eed from Sahl bin Abu Salih from his father who quotes Abu Huraira as saying:

Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) was on the mountain of Hira' that it stirred; thereupon Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) said: Hira! be calm, for there is none upon you but a Prophet, a Siddiq, a martyr, and there were upon it Allah's Prophet (may peace be upon him), Abu Bakr, 'Umar, Uthman, 'Ali, Talha, Zubair, Sa'd b. Abi Waqqas.^{[1](#)}

Evaluation of tradition

Though the tradition mentioned above does not arrange the names of caliphs on the basis of the order of their caliphate, we, however, look at it from two angles: First, the inventor of this tradition has dealt with the issue of the order of the names of caliphs elsewhere in this tradition, using the language of the Holy Prophet (S). Two, in addition, this tradition intends to attribute the adjective 'siddiq' to Abu Bakr and the adjective 'shahid' to all others who follow him. It has to be however mentioned that this tradition is fabricated on two grounds: its text and its chain of transmitters.

1. Text of Tradition

This tradition attributes the adjective 'shahid' to the people mentioned above, whereas none of them except Imam Ali (a.s) was martyred. Sa'ad bin Abi Waqqas died in his castle a natural death. That is why in a tradition preceding this tradition in *Sahih Muslim* no mention is made of the name of Sa'ad. This in itself is a thought provoking point! Others have however, complying with the implication of the tradition, said that Sa'ad bin Abi Waqqas died of plague. Whoever dies of plague is a martyr!^{[2](#)}

2. Chain of transmitters of tradition

In assessing the chain of transmitters of this tradition we suffice to looking at Ismael bin Uwais, omitting thus other reporters this chain includes. Scholars of traditions have given varied comments in regard with him.

Nisaei says he was weak in terms of transmitting traditions.³ Yahya bin Mu'aleen accuses Ismael and his father of stealing traditions. Dulabi, commenting on weak narrators, quotes Nadr bin Salama Maruzi as saying that Ismael bin Abu Uwais is a full liar. After quoting this quotation, Zahabi says: Ibn Udai narrated three traditions from Ismael and said: He narrated strange traditions from his maternal uncle which are not reliable at all.⁴ Ibrahim bin Junaid quotes Yahya as saying: Ismael bin Abu Uwais is a liar. He is not a credible narrator.⁵

In his *al-Muhalla*, Ibn Hazm quotes Abu al-Fath Azdi as saying: Saif bin Muhammad told me that Ibn Uwais was in fact fabricating traditions.⁶

Commenting on Ismael, 'Aini says that he himself confessed that he was fabricating traditions. Nisaei has also mentioned the same point, quoting Salma bin Shu'aib.⁷

¹ – Sahih Muslim, vol. 5, p. 33 and 34, tradition no. 2417. Another version of this tradition is also reported by Muslim. See: Abu Huraira reported: Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) was upon the mountain of Hira,' and there were along with him Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman. 'Ali, Talha, 'Zubair, that the mountain stirred; thereupon Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) said: Be calm, there is none upon you but a Prophet, a Fiddle (the testifier of truth) and a Martyr.(Book 31, Number 5942). Bukhari has also narrated traditions of this kind. See for example:

a) Allah's Apostle ascended the (mountain) of Uhud with Abu Bakr and 'Uthman and it shook. Allah's Apostle said, "Be calm, O Uhud!" I think he stroked it with his foot and added, "There is none on you but a Prophet, a Siddiq and two martyrs." (The two martyrs were Umar and Uthman) (Sahih Bukhari, Vol. 5, Book 57, Number 46).

b) The Prophet once climbed the mountain of Uhud with Abu Bakr, 'Umar and 'Uthman. The mountain shook with them. The Prophet said (to the mountain), "Be firm, O Uhud! For on you there are no more than a Prophet, a Siddiq and two martyrs. (Sahih Bukhari, Vol. 5, Book 57, Number 24)

c) The Prophet ascended the mountain of Uhud and he was accompanied by Abu Bakr, 'Umar and 'Uthman. The mountain shook beneath them. The Prophet hit it with his foot and said, "O Uhud ! Be firm, for on you there is none but a Prophet, a Siddiq and a martyr. (Vol. 5, Book 57, Number 35)

² – See, al-Shifa and its commentary Nasim al-Riyad, vol. 3, p. 192.

³ – Al-Du'afa wa al-Matrukun, p. 51.

⁴ – Mizan al-Itidal, vol. 1, pp. 379–380.

⁵ – Tahdib al-Tahdib, vol. 1, p. 280.

⁶ – Ibid, p. 281.

⁷ – Umda al-Qari, vol. 1, p. 8,