

[Home](#) > [Spurious Arguments about the Shia](#) > [The Nineteenth Spurious Argument: The Criterion for Accepting and Rejecting Hadith](#) > The Answer

The Nineteenth Spurious Argument: The Criterion for Accepting and Rejecting Hadith

Some people launch spurious attacks against the Shia claiming that they don't accept traditions narrated by some of the Companions, they do not accept the Sunni books of traditions, such as the six main (Sahih) books.

They claim that the Shia do not depend upon the traditions mentioned in such books, and that they do not quote traditions from them except when they want to refute them. Instead, they depend only upon the traditions narrated by the Prophet's family (peace be upon them).

The Answer

Shia jurisprudence with respect to proving the veracity of one-way related information is based upon the chain of its narrators, whether or not they were trustworthy, no matter it had been mentioned in a Shia or Sunni book. Having a book called Sahih (i.e. Correct) is not sufficient, every one of the narrators of that tradition must be proven to have been trustworthy regardless of whether he was Shiite or Sunni, or whether or not it had been mentioned in Shiite or Sunni books. Allah says:

O you who believe! If an evildoer comes to you with a report, look carefully into it. (Qur'an 49:6)

And follow not that of which you have not the knowledge. (Qur'an 17:36)

In their jurisprudence, the Shia depend upon the traditions narrated by the Prophet's family because they were the authority for the nation after Prophet Muhammad (s). This is confirmed by the prophetic tradition of Thaqalayn, the two weighty matters upon which all Muslims agree.

We have mentioned this tradition in our book (Al-Jami' li Barahin Usul ul-I'tiqadat). At-Tirmidhi mentioned this tradition in his book (Sahih) vol. 13 p. 200, narrated by Zayd bin Arqam and in another chain by Abu Sa'id that Prophet Muhammad (s) had said: I have left to you two very weighty matters.

If you keep to them, you will never go astray after my death. One, the greater than the other is the Holy Qur'an, which is as a string extended between Heaven and Earth, and the other is my family. They will never separate until they come to me in Paradise. Be careful how to obey me through obeying them."

Some Sunni scholars have certified this tradition and its many sources. One of them was ibn Hajar in his book titled *As-Sawa'iq*. He said: The tradition of *ath-Thaqalayn* has been narrated by thirteen Companions. Many of its chains of narration are true and correct."

It was also mentioned by al-Hadhrami in his book titled *Al-Qawlul-Fasl* vol. 1 p. 49. He said: The tradition of *ath-Thaqalayn* was narrated by more than twenty Companions. Its chains of narration were true and acceptable. It was a *mutawatir* tradition meaning that the tradition had an uninterrupted sequence of trustworthy narrators. All scholars of hadith have said that this was a true tradition."

The profusion of narrations of this tradition has led to the conclusion that it was said by Prophet Muhammad (s) on four occasions. The first occasion was the Day of Arafah when he made a speech from above his she-camel, al-Quswa, the second was at the Kheif Mosque, the third was on the Day of al-Ghadir when he was returning from his last hajj, and the fourth, on the day of his death when he gave a sermon on the pulpit.

Here are some of the paths by which this tradition has been narrated from the books of the Sunnis;

1. Narrated by al-A'mash, from Atiyah, from Abu Sa'id- (mentioned by ibn Sa'd in his book *Tabaqat*) vol.2 p.114.
2. From another direction, al-A'mash, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id, (al-Maghazili's *Manaqib*) p. 235.
3. From a third direction, al-A'mash, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Maghazili's *Manaqib*) p. 235.
4. Ibn Numayr, Abdul-Malik bin Abu Sulayman, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (Ahmad's *Manaqib*).
5. Ali bin Musahir, Abdul-Malik bin Abu Sulayman, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Mu'jam ul-Kabir) p. 137.
6. Harun bin Sa'd, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Mu'jam us- Saghir) vol.1 p. 135.
7. Fuzeil bin Marzuq, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Ma'rifa wa at-Tarikh) p. 537.
8. Kutheir an-Nawaa', Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Mu'jam us Saghir) p. 73.
9. Abu Isra'il, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Ma'rifa wa at- Tarikh) p. 537.
10. Muhammad bin Muzaffar al-Baghdadi, Abu Sa'id (Miftah un-Naja) p. 51.
11. Salman ul-Farsi (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. 36.
12. Ja'far bin Aun, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (ad-Darimi's *Sunan*) vol. 2 p. 431.

13. Ya'la bin Ubayd, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (al-Bayhaqi's Sunan) vol. 10 p. 113.
14. Isma'il bin Ibrahim, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (Muslim's Sahih) vol. 7 p. 122.
15. Muhammad bin Fuzeil and Jarir, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (Muslim's Sahih) vol.7 p. 123.
16. Ali bin Musahhir, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (Ibnul-Maghazili's Manaqib) p. 236.
17. Hasaan bin Sa'id, ibn Masruq, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (Muslim's Sahih) vol. 7 p. 123.
18. Al-A'mash, Yazid bin Hayyan (Al-Mu'jam ul-Kabir) vol. 5 p. 190.
19. Abu Sa'id, Habib bin Abu Thabit, Zayd bin Arqam (At-Tirmidhi's Sahih) vol. 13 p. 200.
20. Al-A'mash, Habib bin Abu Thabit, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. 5 p. 190.
21. Al-A'mash, Abuz-Zuha, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. 5 p. 190.
22. From another direction to Abuz-Zuha, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. 5 p. 190.
23. From a third way to Abuz-Zuha, Zayd bin Arqam (Al- Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. 5 p. 190.
24. Al-Hasan bin Abdullah, Muslim bin Subayh, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mustadrak) vol.3 p. 148.
25. Kuheil, Abut-Tufayl, Zayd bin Arqam (Wasilat ul- Ma'al) p. 55.
26. Habib bin Abu Thabit, Abut-Tufayl, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mustadrak) vol.3 p. 109.
27. Hakam bin Jubayr, Abut-Tufayl, Zayd bin Arqam (Al- Mu'jam ul- Kabir) p. 137.
28. Ali bin Rabi'a, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Ma'rifa wa at- Tarikh) p. 536.
29. Al-Husayn bin Abdullah, Zayd bin Arqam (Fara'id us-Samtein) vol.2 p. 142.
30. Zayd bin Thabit (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. 5 p. 171.
31. From another direction to Zayd bin Thabit (Al- Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. 5 p. 171.
32. From a third direction to Zayd bin Thabit (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. 5 p. 171.
33. From a fourth direction to Zayd bin Thabit (Al- Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. 5 p. 171.
34. Al-Anmati, Ma'ruf bin Kharbuth, Abu Tufayl, Hudhayfa bin Usayd (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) p. 157.

35. Zayd bin al-Hasan, Ma'ruf bin Kharbuth, Abu Tufail, Hudhayfa bin Usayd (Fara'id us-Samtein) vol.2 p.574.
36. Ahmad bin Abdullah bin Salam, Hudhayfa bin al-Yaman (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p.35.
37. Urwa bin Kharija, Fatimat uz-Zahra' (peace be upon her) (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. 30.
38. Ja'far bin Muhammad, from his father, from Jabir bin Abdullah (At-Tirmidhi's Sahih) vol.13 p. 199.
39. Abdur-Rahman bin Khallad, Jabir bin Abdullah (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. 40.
40. Al-Husayn bin Ali (s) from Imam Ali (s) (Fara'id us-Samtein)
41. (Aabir) bin Wathila, Imam Ali (Ibnul-Maghazili's Manaqib) p. 117.
42. Muhammad bin Umar bin Ali from his father, Imam Ali (Kanz ul-Ummal) vol.1 p. 340.
43. Ubaydullah bin Musa, from his father, from his grandfather, from Imam Ali (Wasilat ul-Ma'al) p. 57.
44. Asbagh bin Nabata, Imam Ali (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. 39.
45. Sulaym bin Qays, Imam Ali (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. 114.
46. Asbagh bin Nabata, Abu Rafi' (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. 39.
47. Muhammad bin Abdur-Rahman bin Khallad (Arjah ul-Matalib) p. 341.
48. Hudhayfa bin al-Yaman (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. 36.
49. Talha (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. 35.
50. Abdur-Rahman bin Auf (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. 35.
51. Sa'd bin Abu Waqqas (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. 35.
52. Ibn A'atham al-Kufi, Ibn Abbas (As-Safina) .
53. Ata', Abu Yahya, Ibn Abbas (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. 35.
54. Abdullah bin al-Hasan, from his father, al-Hasan bin Ali (s) (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p.20.
55. Anas, (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. 191.
56. Abu Rafi'; the freed slave of Prophet Muhammad (s) (Arjah ul-Matalib) p. 337.
57. Jubayr bin Mut'im, (Yanabi'ul Mawaddah) p. 31.

- 58. Abdullah bin Huntub (Ihya'ul-Meyyit) p. 115.
- 59. Sakhra al-Aslami (Yanabi'ul Mawaddah) p. 38.
- 60. Abd bin Hamid (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. 38.
- 61. Abu Dharr (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. 5 p. 538.
- 62. Abu Hurayra (Majma'uz-Zawa'id) vol. 9 p. 163.
- 63. Um Hani (Wasilatul-Ma'al) p. 59.
- 64. Umm Salama (Arjah ul-Matalib) p. 338 and (Yanabi'ul Mawaddah) p. 36.

It should be mentioned that the tradition (I have left to you two very important things; the Holy Qur'an and my Sunna,) which the Sunnis put to be against the tradition of Thaqalayn was not mentioned in any of their six Sahih books and it could not be narrated by any Companion who was in opposition to the Prophet's family, because the motto of Prophet's family was the Prophet's Sunna, while the motto of the Companions who were in opposition was "The Holy Qur'an is enough for us.'

They prevented people to write down or narrate the Prophet's Sunna during the reigns of Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman. They collected all what had been written down and burnt them. They punished people for narrating the Prophet's traditions except what they themselves narrated.

Source URL:

<https://www.al-islam.org/spurious-arguments-about-shia-abu-talib-tabrizi/nineteenth-spurious-argument-criterion-accepting-and#comment-0>