Al-Islam.org
Ahlul Bayt Digital Islamic Library Project
Published on *Al-Islam.org* (https://www.al-islam.org)

Predestination

Predestination الجَبر

The Fallacy Of Predestination

بُطلانُ الجَبرِ

1- الإمامُ عليٌّ (عَلَيهِ السَّلامُ) - في بيانِ بُطْلانِ الجَبرِ - :لَو كانَ كذلكَ لَبَطلَ الثَّوابُ والعِقابُ، والأمرُ والنَّهْيُ والزَّجْرُ، ولَسقَطَ معنى الوَعْدِ والوَعيدِ، ولَم تَكُنْ على مُسيءٍ لائمَةٌ، ولا لمُحسنٍ مَحْمَدةٌ، ولكانَ المُحسنُ أوْلى باللآئمةِ مِن المُذنِبِ، والمُذنِبُ أولى بالإحسانِ مِن المُحسِنِ، تلكَ مَقالةُ عَبَدَةِ الأوثانِ وخُصَماءِ الرَّحمنِ.

1- Imam Ali (a.s.), exposing the fallacy of predestination, said, 'If it were like this, the concepts of reward, punishment, command, and prohibition would be erroneous. The meaning of promise [of Paradise] and threat [of the Hellfire] would be futile, and there would be no blame for a wrongdoer, nor praise for the good-doer. Furthermore, the good-doer would be more blameworthy than the wrongdoer, and the latter would deserve more praise than the former. This [i.e. predestination] is the claim of the idolators and the foes of the Merciful.'[Bihar al-Anwar, v. 5, p. 13, no. 19]

2- الإمامُ الصّادقُ (عَلَيهِ السَّلامُ): ما اسْتَطعتَ أنْ تَلومَ العبدَ علَيهِ فهُو مِنهُ، وما لَم تَسْتَطِعْ أنْ تَلومَ العَبدَ علَيهِ فهُو مِن فِعلِ اللّهِ، يقولُ اللّهُ تعالى للعبدِ: لِمَ عَصَيْتَ؟ لِمَ فَسَقْتَ ؟ لِمَ شَرِبْتَ الخَمرَ؟ لِمَ زَنَيْتَ؟فهذا فعلُ العبدِ، ولا يقولُ لَه: لِمَ مَرِضْتَ؟ لِمَ قَصُرْتَ ؟ لِمَ ابْيَضَضْتَ ؟ لِمَ اسْوَدَدْتَ؟ لأنَّهُ مِن فِعلِ اللّهِ تعالى.

2- Imam al-Sadiq (a.s.) said, 'Anything that you can blame a servant [of Allah] for is his own doing, and whatever you cannot blame him for is Allah's doing. Allah, the Exalted, will ask the servant, 'Why did you disobey [Me]? Why did you commit sins? Why did you drink wine? Why did you commit adultery?' All of this is the the servant's doing. But He will not ask him, 'Why were you sick? Why were you short? Why

were you white? Why were you black?' because all of this is Allah's doing.'[Ibid. p. 59, no. 109]

3ـ الإمامُ الكاظمُ (عَلَيهِ الّسَلامُ): إنّ السَّيّئاتِ لا تَخْلو مِن إحدى ثلاثٍ: إمّا أنْ تكونَ مِن اللّهِ ـ ولَيستْ مِنهُ ـ فلا يَنبغي للرَّبِّ أنْ يُعذّبَ العبدَ على ما لا يَرْتَكِبُ، وإمَّا أنْ تكونَ مِنهُ ومِن العبدِ ـ ولَيستْ كذلكَ ـ فلا يَنبغي للشَّريكِ القَوِيِّ أنْ يظلِمَ الشَّريكَ الضَّعيفَ، وإمّا أنْ تكونَ مِن العبدِ ـ وهِي مِنهُ ـ فإنْ عَفا فبِكَرَمِهِ وجُودِهِ، وإنْ عاقَبَ فبِذَنبِ العبدِ وجَريرَتِهِ.

3– Imam al–Kazim (a.s.) said, 'Sins cannot be other than one of three cases: either they originate from Allah – which they do not – and in this case it would not be proper for the Lord to punish His servant for what he has not committed; or that they originate from Him and the servant together – which they do not – and in this case it would not be proper for the strong partner to wrong the weak partner; or that they originate from the servant – which they do – and in this case, if Allah forgives, it is due to His kindness and liberality, or if He punishes, it is as a result of the sin and crime of the servant.'[Ibid. v. 78, p. 323, no. 23]

Neither Free Will Nor Predestination

لا جَبرَ ولا تَفويضَ

4ـ التوحيد عن الإمامِ الباقرِ والإمامِ الصّادقِ(: إنّ اللّهَ عزّ وجلّ أرحَمُ بخَلقِهِ مِن أنْ يُجْبِرَ خَلقَهُ على الذُّنوبِ ثُمّ يُعذِّبَهُم علَيها، واللّهُ أعزُّ مِن أنْ يُريدَ أمراً فلا يكونَ . قالَ: فسُئلا(: هلْ بينَ الجَبرِ والقدَرِ مَنزلةٌ ثالثةٌ؟ قالا: نَعَمْ، أوسَعُ مِمّا بينَ السّماءِ والأرضِ.

4– Imam al–Baqir and Imam al–Sadiq (a.s.) said, 'Allah, the Exalted, is too merciful to coerce His servants to sin and then punish them for it. He is also too mighty to want something and it not be accomplished.' Then they were asked whether there is a stance between free will and predestination, to which they replied, 'Yes, [a stance] wider than the space between the earth and the sky.'[al–Tawhid, p. 360, no. 3]

5ـ بحار الأنوار عن المُفَضَّلِ عن الإمامِالصّادقِ (عَلَيهِ الّسَلامُ): لا جَبرَ ولا تَفويضَ، ولكنْ أمرٌ بينَ أمرَينِ . قالَ: قلتُ: ما أمرٌ بينَ أمرَينِ ؟ قالَ: مَثَلُ ذلك مَثَلُ رجُلٍ رأيتَهُ على معصيةٍ فنَهَيْتَهُ فلَم يَنْتَهِ، فتَرَكتَهُ ففعلَ تلكَ المعصيةَ، فليسَ حَيثُ لَم يَقْبلْ مِنكَ فَتَركْتَهُ كُنتَ أنتَ الّذي أمَرتَهُ بالمعصيةِ.

5– Imam al–Sadiq (a.s.) said, according to what Mufadhal b. 'Umar narrated on his authority, 'There is neither predestination nor free will, but a stance in between them.' [Mufadhal] asked, 'What is the stance in between?' He replied, 'It is like when you observe a man in sin and you advise him against it but he

does not desist from it, so you leave him to his sin. Leaving him to sin after he has rejected your advice does not mean that you commanded him to sin.'[Bihar al-Anwar, v. 5, p. 17, no. 27]

Allah Deserves All Credit For Good Deeds

اللّهُ أولى بِالحَسَناتِ

6- الإمامُ الرِّضا (عَلَيهِ السّلامُ): قالَ اللّهُ تعالى: يابنَ آدمَ، بِمَشِيَّتي كُنتَ أنتَ الّذي تَشاءُ، وبِنِعْمَتي أدَّيْتَ إلَيَّ فَرائضي،6
وبِقُدرَتي قَوِيتَ على مَعْصيَتي، خَلَقتُكَ سَميعاً بَصيراً، أنا أوْلى بحَسَناتِكَ مِنكَ، وأنتَ أوْلى بسَيّئاتِكَ مِنّي.

6- Imam Ar-Ridha' (a.s.) said, 'Allah, most High, said, 'O son of Adam! By My will you attained free will, and with the help of My favor, you perform your obligations towards Me, and with My power you feel empowered to disobey Me. I created you with sight and hearing, so I deserve more credit for your good deeds than you, while you are to blame for your own misdeeds.'[Ibid. p. 4, no. 3]

Proponents Of Predestination And Proponents Of Free Will

الجَبرِيَّةِ وَالقَدَرِيّةِ

7- الإمامُ الصّادقُ (عَلَيهِ السّلامُ): مَن زعَمَ أنّ اللّهَ يَجبُرُ عِبادَه على المعاصي أو يُكلِّفُهُم ما لا يُطيقونَ فلا تأكُلوا7
ذَبيحَتَهُ، ولا تَقْبَلوا شَهادَتَهُ، ولا تُصَلُّوا وَراءهُ، ولا تُعطُوهُ مِن الزّكاةِ شيئا.

7- Imam al-Sadiq (a.s.) said, 'He who claims that Allah coerces His servants to disobey Him or burdens them with that which they cannot endure [i.e. acts of obedience], you must not eat from an animal that he has slaughtered, nor should you believe his testimony, nor pray behind him, nor give him any part of your alms.'[Ibid. p. 11, no. 17]

Source URL: https://www.al-islam.org/mizan-al-hikmah-scale-wisdom/predestination#comment-0