Al-Islam.org
Ahlul Bayt Digital Islamic Library Project
Published on *Al-Islam.org* (https://www.al-islam.org)

The Twentieth Spurious Argument: Rejecting Analogy and Discretion

Some people erroneously criticize the Shias in that they reject analogy and discretion, and the expediencies transmitted in jurisprudence upon which the Companions and their successors depended. They also criticize the Shia of accusing those who adopt these methods as using analogy just as did Iblis (the Devil) who said to Allah,

I am better than he (Adam), Thou hast created me of fire, while him Thou didst create of clay. Qur'an 7: 12)

The Answer

Analogy means proving a verdict on a matter of Sharia simply based upon its similarity in some ways to another matter. It is obvious that the mere similarity between two things does not require them having the same verdict. There are many subjects in the Sharia that are similar in some way or other but have different verdicts.

Discretion means regarding an act as approvable or not approving a deed and then issuing the appropriate verdict according to personal discretion. This is clear innovation, for innovation is nothing but linking that which is one approves to the Sharia and issuing a verdict that considers personal discretion as a part of the Sharia!

This is definitely unacceptable when we know that no Sunni, except for the Mu'tazilites, has ever committed himself to subordinate the laws of the Sharia to the personal advantage of the individual and his personal disadvantage.

It is true that we who believe in reason are partisans of justice and are duty bound by it. However, how can any jurist comprehend the advanteges and rulings behind Allah's acts? Allah is aware of advantages and disadvantages to an infinite degree, but the deficient minds of human beings cannot realize them to

this degree. They therefore cannot find out Allah's rulings simply by taking into consideration some advantage or disadvantage in an action.

Indeed, if a transmitted text explains the general cause of a ruling, it proves that the cause is not limited to what is only in the text, but it will include others having the same cause.

They fell into innovation because they turned away from the path of knowing the Islamic Law which the Prophet (s) had determined for the Muslims. He said, I am leaving to you two weighty things; the Holy Qur'an and my family. You will not go astray if you keep to them." He made his family the guide for Muslims like the Holy Qur'an and told them that they (his family) were the depositories of the knowledge of the Sharia. He (s) said: I am the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate.

Imam Ali (a) said: The Messenger of Allah had taught me one thousand sections of knowledge from each one thousand sections are opened.

Imam Ali deposited this knowledge with the Infallible

Imams and each in turn inherited it.

Source URL:
https://www.al-islam.org/spurious-arguments-about-shia-abu-talib-tabrizi/twentieth-spurious-argument-rejecting-analogy-and#comment-0