

Published on Al-Islam.org (https://www.al-islam.org)

Home > A Victim Lost In Saqifah - Revised Edition with Comprehensive Additions > A Victim Lost in Saqifah Vol. 2 > Discourse 2: Criticism And Scrutiny Of Analyses Propagated About Consultation Of Caliphs With Ali > Differences between the Aims of Caliphs and Ali Regarding Consultations

# Discourse 2: Criticism And Scrutiny Of Analyses Propagated About Consultation Of Caliphs With Ali

## What Doubts Are Propagated In This Regard?

One of the wrong analyses propagated by some extremist unity-seekers is that in spite of differences between Ali and Caliphs, the Caliphs consulted Ali whenever necessary.

They thus say:

"He1 sought answers to his difficulties in Ali's company. Ali explained to him issues not clear to him. And he executed Ali's judicial decrees. Ali too like a kind lover used to guide his beloved. He did not keep anything short from him. We shall deal with Ali's practical conduct with Umar. This will show good relations between these two great historical persons."!2

### **Does Consultation Alone Suffices To Prove Good Relations?**

Now our aim is to answer this question: to offer consultation or to give opinion on various issues wherein ignorance of Caliphs pushed and enmeshed them which was about to leave bad effects on Islamic legislation and spoil fundamentals, is it enough to show existence of a lover and a beloved type of relations? In later chapters we shall dwell upon relations between Ali and Caliphs on the basis of historical evidences.

While it is that:

"It must be acknowledged that had not the Imam gone to help the Caliphs, Muslims would have been involved in a great chaos. It was likely that Muslims could have even apostised. Or when they did not

receive an answer, Islam itself would have fallen into suspicion and it was likely they would have denounced Islam as a false religion."3

Reply to this question needs a thorough research regarding consultation of Caliphs with Amirul Momineen ('a) and to derive conclusions from it. But first only by way of logical refutation we want to mention that by studying history we can also find cases in which Muawiyah sought Ali's opinion.

The table given below show instances of Muawiyah referring to Hazrat Ali ('a), taken from the valuable book of Ali and the Caliphs by contemporary research scholar, Shaykh Najmuddin Al-Askari.

		(Fifth type) Some instances of Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan referring to Amirul Momineen Ali Ibn Abi Talib ('a) 349
Topic	No	Instances of Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan referring to Amirul Momineen Ali Ibn Abi Talib ('a) narrated by Sunni scholars 351
Legal	1	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in the verdict of digging graves 352
Legal	2	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in the verdict of one who found a man and killed him 352
Legal	3	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in the verdict of two men having dispute about the cloth 354
Legal	4	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in the verdict of who marries a girl and later marries her to another 354
Scientific query – religious	5	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply to question of Ibnal Asfar 355
Scientific query – religious	6	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply to question of the Roman King 357
Scientific query – religious	7	Another referral to him in reply to question of the Roman King 358

On investigation it does not remain concealed that relationship of Muawiyah with Amirul Momineen ('a) was in no sense cordial and these referrals and consultations in no way prove good relations between them. Except that we want to be careful in passing off as good straining of relations of the Imam ('a) with Muawiyah and for the aspect of protecting Muslim unity suffice to say:

"But he took Muawiyah to task because his act had gone beyond the limits of difference in opinion..."!4

# Analysis Of Consultation Of Caliphs With Amirul Momineen ('a) On The Basis Of Statistical Scrutiny

On the basis of this only consultation does not describe the motives of the two sides and for obtaining correct analysis from consultation of Caliphs with Amirul Momineen ('a) it is necessary to examine each instance of these consultations case by case basis. We should classify each instance according to the subject of inquiry and mode of referral etc. and then analyse on the basis of statistics.

Therefore we have made a systematic table of all instances of referrals in the book, Min Noor-e-Ali, Part Two, Ali wa Khulafa, written by Shaykh Najmuddin Al-Askari, and classified by subject of inquiry and

# **Chart Of Consultations Of Three Caliphs With Amirul Momineen ('a)**

Mode of Referral	Topic	No	(Second Type) some instances of Abu Bakr consulting Amirul Momineen ('a)
Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	1	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of the Jew 75
Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	2	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of Jathileeq 76
First Companions' consulted then Imam ('a) mentioned his view	Laws of Shariah	3	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in the verdict one who marries like 77
First Companions' consulted then Imam ('a) view is asked	Administrative affairs	4	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) during battle of Rome 78
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Laws of Shariah	5	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in verdict of one who consumed liquor and claims he did so not knowing its illegality 78
Mode of referral not mentioned. Apparently Imam ('a) was present and he gave the reply	Laws of Shariah	6	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the man who marries 81
First Companions' consulted then Imam ('a) mentioned his view	Scientific inquiry – Religious	7	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) about building of Masjid at the sea shore 82
Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	8	Referring to Amirul Momineen ('a) in the reply questions of Christians 83
News reached Imam ('a) and he interfered	Scientific inquiry – Religious	9	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of messenger of Roman king 85
The questioner himself asked the Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	10	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of Raas al-Jaloot 86
News reached Imam ('a) and he replied	Scientific inquiry – Religious	11	Question of Abu Bakr regarding meaning of Quranic word: Abaa 88
News reached Imam ('a) and he replied	Religious	12	Question of Abu Bakr regarding meaning of Kalaala 93
The questioner addressed the Imam ('a) directly	Scientific inquiry – Religious	13	Question of Abu Bakr regarding place of Allah
Mode of referral not mentioned. Apparently Imam ('a) was present and he gave the reply	Laws of Shariah	14	Ref. Amirul Momineen ('a) in the verdict of one who says to a man 97
Mode of Referral	Topic	No	(Third Type) some instances of Umar bin Khattab consulting Amirul Momineen ('a)
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	1	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about a man who is shrouded in cloth spun with gold threads 101
In the beginning Imam ('a) mentioned the issue and then Umar who was present there posed the question to him	Laws of Shariah	2	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about marrying the mother of the young man 102

In the hearinging Imam ('a)			
In the beginning Imam ('a) mentioned the issue and then Umar who was present there posed the question to him	Laws of Shariah	3	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about wife of Uqbah's slave 102
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) was asked about his view	Monetary affairs	4	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about Baitul Maal 103
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) was asked about his view	Monetary affairs	5	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the amount that can be taken from Baitul Maal 106
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Monetary affairs	6	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about sale of Kaaba cloth 107
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) expressed his view	Laws of Shariah	7	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about punishment of drinking wine 109
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) expressed his view	Laws of Shariah	8	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about one who drinks wine under a pretext 110
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) was asked about his view	Laws of Shariah	9	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the group of people who imbibed wine in Syria 113
News reached Imam ('a) and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	10	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about Khamr 115
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) expressed his view	Laws of Shariah	11	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the Imam who sees a man and his wife on 119
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) expressed his view	Laws of Shariah	12	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about one who does not turn the people to ignorance 120
At the request of both sides the Imam was referred to	Laws of Shariah	13	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about two men 121
First the Companions were asked and then Imam ('a) was asked about his view	Laws of Shariah	14	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about marrying slaves 123
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Laws of Shariah	15	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about divorce
Referred both parties to the Imam directly	Laws of Shariah	16	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about two men disputing 127
Referred both parties to the Imam directly	Laws of Shariah	17	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the Bedouin who sold his camel 128
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	18	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about one who killed the camel of someone 129
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	19	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about necessity of Ghusl for 130
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Scientific inquiry – Religious	20	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about Hajar Aswad 133
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Laws of Shariah	21	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the in Ihram eating 139
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Laws of Shariah	22	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about killed in the Kaaba 141
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	23	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about fixing of the time of Mischief 146

By chance Imam ('a) was present and he interfered in the matter	Scientific inquiry – Religious	24	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about a man from the companions whi said that he liked mischief 147
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) expressed his view	Administrative affairs	25	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in victory of Baitul Maqdas 155
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) was asked about his view	Laws of Shariah	26	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in the incident of Maan Ibn Zaida 159
In the beginning Imam ('a) mentioned the issue and then Umar who was present there posed the question to him	Laws of Shariah	27	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the man whom Amirul Momineen ('a) told to abstain from his wife 161
Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	28	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) to fulfill the request of slave of a Jew 161
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	29	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of Caesar of Rome 168
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Scientific inquiry – Religious	30	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply to the questions of Roman King 175
News reached Imam ('a) and he gave the reply	Scientific inquiry – Religious	31	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply to Rabbis 179
Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	32	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of Kaab al-Ahbaar 189
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	33	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of Asqaf Najran 197
Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	34	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about in reply to Jews 201
Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	35	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of some Jew people 203
Chance presence of the Imam ('a) and reply of His Eminence ('a) in the matter	Scientific inquiry – Religious	36	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of Kaab al-Ashraaf and Malik bin Saifi 205
Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	37	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply of 40 women 206
News reached Imam ('a) and he gave the reply	Laws of Shariah	38	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the verdict of the woman who 211
From the narration it seems that the Imam was not referred to directly	Laws of Shariah	39	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the woman who delivers in six months 214
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) mentioned his view	Laws of Shariah	40	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the woman while she was forced 221
By chance Imam ('a) was present and he interfered in the matter	Laws of Shariah	41	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the womaninsane 224
By chance Imam ('a) was present and he interfered in the matter	Laws of Shariah	42	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the who is pregnant and confesses 230
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	43	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about not punishing Abu Bakra 235

First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	44	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the woman who gave birth to 240
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	45	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the free woman and a slave woman disputing about a male child 242
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	46	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the pregnant woman who had a miscarriage in fear of Umar 247
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	47	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the one and he was fasting 250
Referred both parties to the lmam directly	Laws of Shariah	48	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man who divorces his wife without uttering the word of 'divorce' 251
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	49	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about selling the daughters of kings 261
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	50	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about taking Jizyah 262
Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a)	Laws of Shariah	51	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about Meeqaat 264
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	52	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the meaning of Alhamdulillaah 265
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	53	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the incident of Qataf 265
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	54	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about distribution of Kufa lands 267
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) mentioned his view	Scientific inquiry – Religious	54	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about fixing the beginning of Hijra calendar 268
First the Companions were consulted and then Imam ('a) expressed his view	Administrative affairs	56	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about mounted attack 270
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	57	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about inheritance of grandfather 275
By chance Imam ('a) was present and he interfered in the matter	Laws of Shariah	58	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the woman who denied her son 277
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	59	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the woman who delivered a red-skinned child while she was herself black 282
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Scientific inquiry – Religious	60	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the woman accused by the Ansaari 283
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	61	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the thief whose one hand and leg has been cut off 286
In two narrations the referral was indirect	Laws of Shariah	62	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the man who hit the killer of his brother till he thought that he was dead; so he fled. But he came back to kill him again 287

By chance Imam ('a) was present and he interfered in the matter	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about 63 the woman who marries an old man and that man dies 289
Referred directly to the Imam	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about th woman who resembles the mother of man 291
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man 291
Referred directly to the Imam	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the orphan 292
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about two men disputing about eight dirhams 295
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the man in ladies clothes 299
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about two women disputing about a male child 307
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the youth 307
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	71 Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man who told his wife 312
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about five arrested for 313
First the Companions were questioned and then Imam ('a) was asked	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the newborn child 314
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the 74 amount of blood money of one who attacks another cutting off a part of his tongue 320
In two narrations the referral was indirect	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the man 75 who planned to kill the killer of his brother a second time 320
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the slave who killed his mistress and master 323
Directly asked Imam ('a)		
Directly deficed infam (a)	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man who divorced his wife when he was a non–Muslim and again when he became a Muslim 324
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man who divorced his wife when he was a non-Muslim and again when he became a
Imam ('a) was present there	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man who divorced his wife when he was a non-Muslim and again when he became a Muslim 324 Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a) By chance Imam ('a) was present and he interfered in the	Laws of Shariah  Scientific inquiry – Religious	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man who divorced his wife when he was a non-Muslim and again when he became a Muslim 324 Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man 325 Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply to
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered Referring the questioner directly to Imam ('a) By chance Imam ('a) was present and he interfered in the matter Imam ('a) was present there	Laws of Shariah  Scientific inquiry – Religious Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man who divorced his wife when he was a non-Muslim and again when he became a Muslim 324  Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man 325  Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) in reply to women 327  Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about

Directly asked Imam ('a)	Scientific inquiry – Religious	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the three things Umar forgot to ask the Prophet (S) 329
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Scientific inquiry – Religious	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about fixing a place for Allah about which he was asked 333
Mode of Referral	Topic	No (Fourth Type) some instances of Uthman consulting Amirul Momineen ('a) 335
Imam ('a) received the news and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about 1 the woman who delivers a child in six months 337
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	2 Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the old man who married 338
Referred both parties to the Imam directly	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about the man who 339
Mode of referring is varied in narrations	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about 4 the woman of Ansaar whose husband died 340
Imam ('a) received the news and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the hunter 342
Imam ('a) was present there and he interfered	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) for verdict about the man 344
Directly asked Imam ('a)	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about correspondence 344
Both parties told to refer to the Imam ('a)	Laws of Shariah	Ref. to Amirul Momineen ('a) about a slave who 345

# What does Scrutiny of Statistics show?

### A) Items Of Abu Bakr's Consultation With Imam Ali ('a)

The following are the results of statistical analysis of First Caliph's consultations with Amirul Momineen ('a):

In all there were 14 instances when Abu Bakr referred to Ali. Its detailed order is: 9 items concern knowledge and religion, 4 items regarding justice, legislature, criminal sentences and jurisprudence. One item only on military side. In finance there is no item registered in history.

Point worth noting in this is that the mode of contacting the Imam: Four times Abu Bakr contacted directly without any formality. Three of them were for religious matters and learning and one for religious decrees.

Only in one instance, he consulted his companions and then finally sought Ali's view and opinion. The question was a military matter. In other words in nine remaining instances Imam's presence in the scene or in affairs is completely overlooked. And in fact the Caliph never referred to the Imam. Rather the Imam himself, in spite of this negligence in two instances after the Caliph's consultation with the companions expressed his view. There are two incidents when Imam himself interfered, since he was present there. There are other three instances when the Imam received the news he took steps; and lastly in two other cases the questioner referred to the Imam.

So we leave judgment to the reader. In spite of these open matters they still say:

"And in this way, Abu Bakr, the First Caliph, has benefited from Imam Ali ('a) in difficult issues."6

Or they say:

"During his Caliphate Abu Bakr consulted Imam Ali ('a) in most important matters."7

In order to invalidate the latter claim it is sufficient to say that Abu Bakr in the last moments of his life appointed Umar as his successor.

"Abu Bakr being conscious of oppositions that will pose later, first summoned Abdur Rahman bin Auf and informed him about his decision and after his initial disapproval secured his permission. Then the next person he acquainted with his decision was Uthman bin Affan.

It is worth mention that when Abu Bakr spoke he advised both of them to keep the matter secret.

Anyway, why at all Abu Bakr mentioned his determination to these two? Why he did not take into account senior companions of Prophet. It is interesting to note that Abdur Rahman bin Auf was from Bani Zahra tribe while Uthman bin Affan was from Bani Umayyah. Both were old friends of Abu Bakr and had become Muslims through him. They were in the group of Abu Bakr and Umar. Later too they were seen in the six-person committee of Umar.

Anyway, in case Abu Bakr really intended consultation why he did not consult Ali ('a)? Who according to the Egyptian writer, a Dr. Noori Gaffer, commanded more respect and was more competent than others. And this was an obvious tyranny and trespassing on eligibility and right of Ali."9

#### B) Items Of Consultation Of Umar With Imam Ali ('a)

The following are the results of statistical analysis of Second Caliph's consultations with Amirul Momineen ('a):

In all there were 85 instances when Umar consulted Imam Ali ('a). Among them 59 are religious problems such as jurisprudence, criminal sentences, judgments; 21 cases pertaining to religious knowledge; three instances of monetary affairs and two military problems.

It is interesting that out of these 85 cases only in 27 cases did Umar have direct contact with the Imam – 13 of them in field of religious verdicts and 13 in field of knowledge. One case was financial. On the other hand they claim that:

"Hazrat Umar was always consulting Hazrat Ali ('a) in his difficulties and problems." 10

A little attention and care will prove to us that Umar contacted Ali whenever he was convinced that no one else could help him to solve his problem. Because in 13 other instances also on legislative side

Umar did not consult Ali first. He first sought companions' opinion and then consulted Ali.

Similarly, he did the same in two other financial cases and a question of religious knowledge; after having had asked companions he finally approached Ali.

Statistics show that in 42 cases Imam Ali ('a) was never contacted for any consultation. Moreover, the presence of Imam Ali ('a) in the scene was ignored. Umar depended upon his own opinion and decision and thought himself needless of Ali's opinion. As he was wrong in his opinion, Imam feared it would establish a wrong precedent. So, he himself, without being invited, gave his opinion and corrected the wrong decision. The Imam did this in the interest of Islam as he saw himself responsible before God.

Although by wrong interpretation of these steps of Amirul Momineen ('a) it is claimed that:

"Ali ('a) had a prominent presence during the Caliphate of Umar, and had a position of presidentship among the companions."!11

Despite such a position can it be possible that in 42 cases the Caliph did not think of referring to Amirul Momineen ('a)? This negligence of the Second Caliph calls your attention to another narration in this connection:

#### Did The Second Caliph Always Consult Ali? Did He Always Accept His View?

In historical sources it is recorded that Umar was asked about marriage and divorce and Umar answered. Regarding this Amirul Momineen ('a) has said:

"He wrote down while I was present there. But he did not ask me nor did he refer to me as though his knowledge had enriched him beyond me. I wanted to correct him. But I preferred to be silent because he will be vilified by God. But no one censured him. On the contrary, they appreciated him. They made it a tradition. Even if a mad man would have passed judgment it would have been better. 12"13

Similarly, there are evidences that the Second Caliph was not always inclined to consult Amirul Momineen Ali ('a):

"In the fifteenth year of Hijra, Umar wanted to go to Jerusalem. He consulted Ali. Ali told him not to go there, but Umar went. It is said that he appointed Ali in his place in Medina and went to Syria and Palestine.

Again, in the same year he consulted Ali what to do with the revenue of Iraq and other conquered countries. Amirul Momineen ('a) advised him to distribute them among warriors and campaigners of respective countries. Umar did not accept. He treasured the revenue. Later it was spent on salaries after the fashion of Iran of those days."14

#### C) Instances Of Uthman Consulting Amirul Momineen Ali ('a)

The following are the results of statistical analysis of Third Caliph's consultations with Amirul Momineen ('a):

In all there are 8 instances when the Third Caliph sought Ali's advice. All these are with regard to jurisprudence, religious decrees, dispensing punishments and judgments. In no instance is it recorded that the Caliph sought Imam's advice directly with due attention to the presence of Imam ('a) in the society and the possibility of his getting benefit from his guidance and advices.

Regretfully we see that in only three cases the Caliph referred to the Imam directly. In other cases, Ali's presence on the spot was the reason for his advice.

More interesting is the fact that in instance no. 5 Uthman addressed Imam ('a) in the following words:

"You oppose us very much." 15

Paying close attention to this statement will tell you about the truth behind claim of good relations between the Caliphs and Amirul Momineen ('a). Because: had judged this matter he would have said more than this.

"From Uthman's statement to Imam ('a): 'Indeed you oppose us very much' it can be nicely concluded that Imam ('a) had opposed Uthman in various issues.

Indeed it is a well–known that the opposition of Imam ('a) was not due to personal enmity and selfish motives; but when he saw that the Caliph was going against a divine command or creating an innovation in religion he used to oppose him and this matter becomes clearer on scrutiny of other arguments between him and Uthman. For example regarding the lawfulness of meat hunted by others, Uthman consumed it while in Hajj and when the Imam recited the verse of Quran: 'and the game of the land is forbidden to you so long as you are on pilgrimage', 16 instead of confessing his mistake he became angry and said:

You have made this food bitter for me!"17

While the unity-seekers claim:

"Circumstances during the Caliphate of Uthman bin Affan were also like the tenures of the previous Caliphs and he in numerous instances consulted His Eminence in problems connected to faith and jurisprudence as mentioned in books of traditions, jurisprudence and History."! 18

The authenticity of the above claim can be judged from the following historical document:

"Uthman consulted the Imam as regards the decision about Ibn Umar. His Eminence said that retaliation

must be taken from him and he must be executed because his hands were smeared with innocent Muslim blood.

Although Uthman did not accept Imam's opinion."19

In the same way in this matter 20:

"Uthman gave precedence to the statement of Amr bin Aas over that of

Imam Ali ('a) and the Muhajireen and Ansaar."21

### **Results Of Statistical Analysis**

**Result A)** Of the total of 107 cases only three concern finance and three cases are related to military matters. In these cases the Imam did not initiate his opinion unless he was requested.

Now the question arises that in duration of Caliphs which stretched to twenty-five years, statistics show that only on six occasions the Imam was asked to give his opinion. In other cases, Imam himself intruded because he saw that the Caliph's claim was incorrect. When such is the reality, how can they claim that:

"His Eminence was present in all political and martial matters in the form of highest authority of consultation and the trustworthy and truthful one of the Caliphs."!22

Can all political and martial instances of twenty-five years be condensed into only six cases?

History shows that in any rulership such instances are more.

With a little consideration: "It can be easily said that with the group of Abu Bakr and Umar coming to power, the period of political isolation of Hazrat Ali ('a) began and it continued for 25 years."23

**Result B**) From 107 cases 71 concern legislation and judiciary and thirty are regarding faith and knowledge. This makes a total of 101 cases.

We request extremist unity-seekers to reconsider their following claims:

"Umar also did not do anything without consulting Ali."!24

"The Second Caliph used to say...we are commanded by Prophet to consult Ali."!25

"Mostly the Second Caliph preferred Ali's opinion to that of others." !26

"Before him Abu Bakr and later Uthman also always consulted Ali."!27

"Throughout 25 years Ali acted as a guide and consultant in all affairs." !28

"Caliphs too had accepted him as a consultant in all matters." !29

In all these 101 cases, only 17 times they contacted Imam directly. In a period of 25 years this number shows how little they cared for him or his presence. They claim such because they want to cover this shortcoming. They themselves know facts are not as they claim. In this direct contact, 16 items were about knowledge and religion and 17 concerned religious knowledge. That is 33 out of 101; which is only one–third.

In other words there remain 68 items in which either there was no attention from the side of the Caliph to the presence of Imam ('a) – in 42 cases. And in 16 cases the Caliphs did not want to ask the Imam so first he asked others and only later the Imam.

In ten cases when the Caliph did not pay any attention to the presence of the Imam, Amirul Momineen ('a) as a person present in the society mentioned his opinion.

The reason is not obscure. It is that the Caliphs wanted to cut short possibilities of Imam's credit among the people and to hinder his knowledge taking root in society.

It could be summed up in a single sentence thus:

"They avoided every type of action and even statement that could strengthen the trust of society in him."30

# Final Analysis about Caliphs' Consultation with Amirul Momineen ('a)

"It was not that the Caliphs showed courtesy of inviting Ali to government meetings or take his advice as a minister or senior experienced dignitary. And that he accepted thus showing his cooperation with them. Rather the Caliphs did not even do the justice and well being of the Ummah by allowing them to benefit from the Imam's advice. Their behavior with him was such that it isolated him from social and political arenas and he resorted to farming, cultivation and peasantry.

Whenever they sought his advice, they did so because they had no alternative. And if their praise and appreciation of Amirul Momineen ('a) has been found in history it is because it was not possible to deny the excellences of His Eminence."31

Besides it was ignorance on their part about Islam32 and its laws, rules and legislative questions. They as successors of Prophet had no ground to put forth excuse of their ignorance or not knowing matters. Likewise, they had no excuse to justify their occupation of the office inspite of having no knowledge of the very decrees, commands and holy verses and text. There are 42 cases when Imam Ali ('a) clearly proved their inability to handle the office. History has recorded these instances. Ali has saved them from committing blunders. Else they would have gone astray; and others too would have followed them. The

wrong would have become common or a standard. They, in their station of leadership, if be so ignorant it reflects their unfitness to occupy Prophet's place as his successors. Further there are occasions in history when the Second Caliph admitted his inability and Ali's superiority. 33 Such views and opinions cannot be impregnated with a good will or good terms between two sides. Beyond this, Muawiyah too has acknowledged superiority of Ali. If such things are indication of good terms can we believe that Muawiyah too was on good terms with Ali?

As we said one of the reasons that impelled Ali to help Caliphs by his advice was to disclose to the Ummah their inability in handling affairs and leading the Ummah. This he did in the best way. But the Ummah had gone somnolent to the extent that it did not wake up. The obstinacy was so deep that the Ummah required a greater shock to move. There are historical evidences that show the extent of ignorance of the Second Caliph. In one of the divine decrees regarding inheritance, Umar changed the ruling altogether and replaced it by one created by his own ignorance. This ruling is called Ghowl and it still is in practice by his followers.34

Imam ('a) considered Umar's verdict in this matter as innovation which showed his ignorance of divine laws; His Eminence ('a) in this matter not only opposed the Caliph he also censured the Islamic Ummah and said:

"Reason for such innovations is they surrendered leadership of Islamic society to people who were not worthy of it. If ruling power had been in the hands of those whom Allah had selected, the matter of Ghowl would not have existed today. And there would not have been any difference in divine law; because the knowledge of all this is with Ali."35

In the same way, in crises, sentences like: "Had Ali not been there, Umar would have perished," would remind that:

"Umar has said this about one against whom he aligned with Quraish and usurped his rights." 36

An important point that can be recalled from analysis of confessions of Caliphs is that claims like these have another aim also, and that is to justify and cover their usurpation of the rightful rulership of Imam ('a).

Therefore claims of always consulting Amirul Momineen ('a) and that also in administrative and military affairs is in fact an exaggeration they voiced in reply to those who objected like Ibn Abbas.

Pay attention to the following historical document:

Umar, during his Caliphate, said to Ibn Abbas: "Ali was more suitable for rulership than me and Abu Bakr."

Ibn Abbas at once asked: In spite of saying this why did you sideline him?

Umar answered him immediately: "We do not take decisions without his permission and consultation."37

By this he avoided the censure for usurping Caliphate from Ali.

Such proceedings can be termed as political attitude. This went a great deal to satisfy companions of Prophet as they thought that they were in the scene and having a share in running affairs. This minimized their censure. This same attitude Abu Bakr adopted against Ansaar at Saqifah.

Umar wanted to utilize the presence of the Prophet's companions but he was afraid to give them government posts and considered it unwise. So he limited it to extent of advice and consultation.

"On one hand the Caliph wanted to profit by family of Abbas in matters of governance but on the other he did not want them to be in power all the time. So he refrained from it. When the Governor of Humis38 died Umar came to Abdullah Ibn Abbas and asked him if he would like to take governorship of Humis. But before everything he revealed his view to him...39

Ibn Abbas also replied to the Caliph: I don't want to be your governor... Umar at last said to Abdullah Ibn Abbas: Then at least give me advice."40

It seems Umar learned this from Ibn Abi Qahafa Abu Bakr in Saqifah Bani Saada; because as we said it was only through this that Abu Bakr was able to pacify the Ansaar:

"In the end Abu Bakr assured them that in case they accept rulership of Muhajireen they would be their counsels and nothing would be done without consulting them." 41

The same policy was used with Ali also so that they can tell others – even today – that:

"Imamate and scientific expertise of Ali ('a) was already known to Caliphs and they had acknowledged this."42

On the other hand the Caliphs were always anxious to obtain legitimacy for their rule and their becoming Caliphs. In this respect, they were willing to lay hand on any opportunity useful to them. So they wanted to draw Imam's attention to them. They at least wanted people to believe they were on good terms and good relations lasted between them and Imam. These oral confessions and praises came into being for this purpose. Through these tactics they wanted to deceive the people at the same also putting a lid on their own deficiencies.

Because whenever Amirul Momineen ('a) interfered and solved difficult problems or replied to complicated religious questions a question arose in the minds of the people that:

"Why should a man so learned not become the holder of an important post like Islamic Caliphate? Instead the responsibility had gone to one who is bereft of all this knowledge."

In reply to this Umar appeared side-by-side one of the most learned man of his time among the people.

So they say:

"According to narrations of both sects, the Second Caliph said: If Ali had not been there, Umar would have perished and he addressed His Eminence, Ali ('a) saying: You are my Master. Thus showing that good relations existed between him and Imam Ali ('a)."!43

As if the Imam was their minister and consultant?!!

As if the presence of Imam furnished credibility to Caliphs and a justification of their weaknesses and defects.!!

It is thus claimed:

"The Caliphs in numerous matters asked the Imam for his opinion and consulted him and the Imam supervised the acts of the rulers and guided and advised them."!44

During his Caliphate time and again Umar sought Ali's advice or without his asking Ali ('a) mentioned his opinion and Umar accepted it."!45

"Umar asked for co-operation of His Eminence, Ali ('a) in the most difficult situations and through the guidance of Imam solved his problems."!46

It was that the revolution of Islam was a religious and cultural revolution. More than armed confrontation it required scientific and cultural weapons. After the passing away of the Holy Prophet (S) Ali ('a) took up these important functions."!47

"In this way the Imam acted like a minister and guide of the rulers and was like a reliable point of reference for the Muslims and believers in behavior and practice of Islam as the Holy Prophet (S) was."!48

"Imam Ali ('a) in that same condition did not refrain from dispensing consultation to the Righteous Caliphs."!49

"Imam Ali ('a) after the passing away of the Holy Prophet (S) during the period of all the three Caliphs with his divinely bestowed ministership and foresight was the pivot and axis of Islamic revolution and he bore the responsibility of cultural revolution. He maintained Muslim unity and guided the people and the Caliphs."!50

The notable point in the explanation and analysis of scientific, religious and jurisprudential activities of Amirul Momineen Ali ('a) is that the steps that the

Imam took regarding his judgments on various topics, it became apparent how much the Caliphs would have distorted Islam had the Imam not been present.

For example during the period of the Second Caliph:

"The number of judgments from Ali ('a) that in this period remained in force are astonishing. All these were after the time when the Caliph had issued contrary orders and Ali ('a) had corrected them."51

It was in this manner that all the attitudes of His Eminence, Ali ('a) were aimed at removing the dust of deviation and ruin from the face of teachings of real Islam and prevention of innovations and illegalities to enter jurisprudential issues and to finally propagate and explain sources of Islamic faith; it had nothing to do with friendly relations, co-operation and cultural support of the rulers who had usurped his Caliphate!

Yet they go on making claims like:

"Attitude of Hazrat Ali ('a) during 25 years of rule of the three Caliphs is that of co-operation and support, guidance and advice, restraining from deviations and removal of the doubts of the Caliphs and prohibition of anything that could destabilize their position. Is all this enmity?"!52

"Among the other instances of co-operation! And unity-seeking of Ali ('a) in the matter of support! And unity of thought! And consultation and counseling the Caliphs was before it, whether in complicated political and military matters or in complex and difficult social and jurisprudential issues, even in personal affairs."!53

"During Umar's reign also His Eminence remained as the most active and greatest force of social awakening in Islamic society leaving his footprints of helpfulness on the sands of time. He provided consultation and guidance to the Caliph of the time and Umar during his Caliphate referred to him many times or even without his request His Eminence gave his opinion54 and he (Umar) agreed,"!55

"From this angle can be remembered instances of co-operation between our lord, Ali and our lord, Umar and can be described as a relation of sincere friendship and amity beyond description!

They continued to work for achieving the aims of Caliphate together in a co-operative manner! And for its well being."!56

"Ali Murtadha was the best advisor and sincere well wisher of our lord Umar..."!57

"His Eminence, Ali ('a)...always throughout the Caliphate of Abu Bakr was his sincere friend and intimate advisor."!58

# **Theological Reminder**

Among the important points derived from the confession of the Caliphs (in proof of truthfulness of Shiite beliefs in discussion of Imamate) is refutation of claim of superiority of the Caliphs and as a result puts a question mark on the legality of Caliphate of Abu Bakr and Umar.

We should know that Ahlul Sunnat have different opinions as regard the qualifications of Caliph. Some like Fadl bin Ruzbahan do not consider superiority to be a requirement of Caliphate; but others like Ibn Taimmiyah accepts this condition and then goes out of his way to prove the superiority of the Caliphs and negates all the claims of Imamiyah on the absolute superiority of Amirul Momineen ('a).59

# Differences between the Aims of Caliphs and Ali Regarding Consultations

In one bird's eye view, we can separate the line of Caliphs with that of Ali:

"During periods of Caliphates of Abu Bakr and Umar, Imam Ali ('a) did not do anything against them. He did not interfere in political and social affairs as if they had reached an understanding that Ali and his family will be left alone untroubled and he in return would have no say in politics. Except when the Caliph should see it as his own good to take advice and help from him."60

"In important matters whenever Umar could not take a decision by himself he sought Ali's advice."61

Because: "The main intellectual specialty of the Second Caliph is that being a ruler of the society he considered himself to be having extensive powers. He not only considered himself restricted to political and judicial affairs he also thought that he had the special right to make laws and frame rules of the Shariah. He during his Caliphate, relying on these powers went on to make changes in religion and introduced innovations. And he did not feel that he was bound by any limits except those of his comprehensive understanding of Quran and Shariah. In instances when he found himself helpless he resorted to consultation with Companions (including Ali)."62

"...it is not possible to find any Caliph than Umar and Uthman who considered that they had the discretion to make any changes in religion even to the extent of worship acts...

Such freedom of opinion in the matter of worship acts is only part of discretion that was exercised in other matters. The Caliph did not refrain from creating innovations. Expansion of Islamic territories brought them face to face with many new legal problems and therefore mostly they endeavored to solve them even through consultation with Companions. All these solutions were on the basis of Prophet's teachings and on the other hand consultation with Companions or thirdly from the side of inventive faculty of the Caliph himself. This went on to increase the spread of creations of the regime. 65

#### On the other hand:

"It will seen clearly that co-operation and guidance of His Eminence in removing numerous doubts of the Caliph was to protect Muslim society from the danger of decline and that the foundations of Islam may not be destroyed...if His Eminence ('a) had not interfered and co-operated, especially in religious and political issues it would have led to deviation of Islam from its true path and created great problems

which the Imam could not bear to see."66

Therefore that which the Imam ('a) had in his aim was protection of Islam from deviation and destruction and on this way he did not give any importance to the regime or Caliphate. Even then they wish to distort the facts claiming that:

"Did not the co-operation of Hazrat Ali ('a) to the three Caliphs continue for 25 years till the last moments of the life of the Third Caliph? Can all these co-operations, support and help in social and political matters throughout this period be without sincerity?"!67

"Indeed we must not forget that he [His Eminence, Ali ('a)] even in the field of action and interfering in some matters was only to the extent of consultation; so that the machinery of Caliphate may not benefit by his co-operation and support to strengthen itself and gain a sort of legitimacy. Because he knew that the Islamic Ummah would see contradiction between acceptance and political value of the Caliphs and his (Ali's) own religious legality. And all the efforts of Caliphate was also to gain legitimacy for themselves by pretending to take advice and co-operation of the Imam. And thus they may get some political and public acceptance. But they were not able to do so. And in the end Ali ('a) made clear to the people that the Caliphs were not having any legitimacy; and he did so to defend an important pillar of faith. 68 This was a great defeat for Caliphate. Till the very end they could not succeed in reconciling the two."69

"Whenever Ali ('a) saw that some mistakes of the Caliphs were going to play havoc with the future of Muslims he used to at once interfere and do what was possible. He even risked his life and property to prevent such eventualities. He never refrained to step forward whenever he sensed danger."70 Therefore, "It is not seen in any source that the Caliph asked for his view and he desisted from giving it. Because it is not possible for one who spent his whole life in spread of Islam to see any harm coming to Muslims and that which was happening in the society. And we see that whenever the Caliph asked for his consultation he did not refuse it even though he saw that his rights are usurped."71

- 1. Umar.
- 2. Muhammad Barfi: Seemai Ali Az Manzar Ahlul Sunnat (Portrait of Ali from the Sunni point of view), 1st Edition 1380, Pg. 95.
- 3. Ali Muhammad Meer Jalili: Imam Ali ('a) wa Zamaamdaaraan (Imam Ali and the Rulers), Pgs. 175.
- 4. Abdul Kareem Bi-Aazaar Shirazi: Mashal-e-Ittehaad (Torch of Unity), Pg. 30.
- 5. Dar az-Zahra, Beirut, 1st Edition, 1414.
- 6. Abdul Kareem Bi-Aazaar Shirazi: Seemai Imam-e-Muttageen, (Portrait of the Imam of the Pious), Vol. 6, Pg. 14.
- 7. Ibid. Seemai Imam-e-Muttageen, (Portrait of the Imam of the Pious), Vol. 7, Pg. 8.
- 8. Refer: Ali wa Manawao, Matbuaat an-Najah, Cairo, 1396 A.H. 1976 A.D..
- 9. Jalal Darikhsha: Mawaaze Siyasi Hazrat Ali Dar Qibal Mukhalifeen (Political stands of Ali against opponents), Pg. 53.
- 10. Muhammad Barfi: Seemai Ali Az Manzar Ahlul Sunnat (Portrait of Ali from the Sunni point of view), 1st Edition 1380, Pg. 104.
- 11. Ibrahim Baizoon (Translated by Ali Asghar Muhammadi Seejaani): Rafataar Shinashi Imam Ali ('a) Dar Aaina-e-Tareekh (Understanding the stand of Imam Ali in the Mirror of History) (1st Edition), 1379, Pg. 42.
- 12. In another version it is mentioned: While it was such a judgment that if a mad man.

- 13. Refer: Muhammad Ismail Ansari Zanjani: Translation of Asraar Aale Muhammad, Pg. 340
- 14. Muhammad Baqir Bahboodi: Seerah Alawi (1st Edition), Pg. 41; quoting from: Tarikh Tabari, Vol. 3, Pg. 608.
- 15. Ali Muhammad Meer Jalili: Imam Ali ('a) wa Zamaamdaaraan (Imam Ali and the Rulers), Pg. 289; quoting from Musnad Ahmad, Vol. 1, Pg. 100.
- 16. Surah Maidah 5:96.
- 17. Ibid. Pg. 290; quoting from: Wasaelush Shia, Vol. 5, Pg. 44-46.
- 18. Muhammad Ali Taskhiri: Article quoted in Kayhan Farhangi, Issue No. 184, Bahman 80, Pg. 32.
- 19. Ali Muhammad Meer Jalili: Imam Ali ('a) wa Zamaamdaaraan (Imam Ali ('a) and the Rulers), Pg. 174; quoting from Ansaab al-Ashraaf, Vol. 5, Pg. 24.
- 20. Ibid. Pgs. 264-269.
- 21. Ibid. Pg. 269.
- 22. Muhammad Jawad Hujjati Kermani: Ittelaat Daily, Issue No. 26, Khordad 1379.
- 23. Jalal Darikhsha: Mawaaze Siyasi Hazrat Ali Dar Qibal Mukhalifeen (Political stands of Ali against opponents), Pg. 51.
- 24. Abdul Kareem Bi-Aazaar Shirazi: Seemai Imam-e-Muttageen, (Portrait of the Imam of the Pious), Vol. 7, Pg. 8.
- 25. Ibid. Seemai Imam-e-Muttageen, (Portrait of the Imam of the Pious), Vol. 6, Pg. 6.
- 26. Ibid. Interview in Kayhan Farhangi, Issue No. 184, Bahman 80, Pg. 16.
- 27. Ibid. Seemai Imam-e-Muttaqeen, (Portrait of the Imam of the Pious), Vol. 2, Pg. 7.
- 28. Muhammad Jawad Hujjati Kermani: Interview in Nida-e-Islam Magazine, Issue No. 4, Summer 79, Pg. 62.
- 29. Abdur Raheem Mahmoodi: Maqaam-e-Sahaaba wa Zindagi-e-Khulafa-e-Raashideen Dar yek Nigaah (Status of Companions and life of Rightly Guided Caliphs in a Glance), Pgs. 36–37.
- 30. Jalal Darikhsha: Mawaaze Siyasi Hazrat Ali Dar Qibal Mukhalifeen (Political stands of Ali against opponents), Pg. 51.
- <u>31.</u> Dr. Sayyid Muhammad Taqi Nabawi: Pamphlet on Astaana-e-Ghadeer (Lecture on the topic of Ghadeer and Imamate, article on the subject of Amirul Momineen in the period of Caliphs Araaf Noor Cultural Organization Summer 81), Pg. 19.

This pamphlet was republished in 1382 and in a book form also in 1382.

- 32. "The Second Caliph was not fond of much discussion and religious arguments due to his weakness in knowledge." (Abdullah Khanaqli Hamadani: Siyasat Imam Ali-o-Hasnain Dar Raabita Ba Hukoomat-o-Futuhaat Kholafa, Pg. 97).
- 33. Refer: Ibid. Pgs. 191–220.
- 34. Ali Muhammad Meer Jalili: Imam Ali ('a) wa Zamaamdaaraan (Imam Ali and the Rulers), Pgs. 273-276.
- 35. Ibid. Pg. 276; quoting from: Wasaelush Shia, Vol. 17, Pg. 426.
- 36. Jalal Darikhsha: Mawaaze Siyasi Hazrat Ali Dar Qibal Mukhalifeen (Political stands of Ali against opponents), Pg. 55.
- 37. Refer: Ali Muhammad Meer Jalili: Imam Ali ('a) wa Zamaamdaaraan (Imam Ali and the Rulers), Pg. 167; quoting from Mahaazaraat al-Udaba, Pg. 4, Pg. 478.
- 38. A Syrian city.
- <u>39.</u> "He suggested to Abdullah to take the rulership of Humis on the condition that he will not use his position in favor of Caliphate of Ali ('a) after the Caliph." (Yusuf Gholami: Pas az Ghuroob, Pg. 281).
- <u>40.</u> Asghar Qaidan: Tahleeli Bar Mawaze Siyasi Ali Ibn Abi Talib ('a) Research on political stands of Ali Ibn Abi Talib ('a), Pg. 120.
- 41. Yusuf Gholami: Bohraan-e-Jansheeni-e-Payambar (Crisis of Succession to the Prophet), Pg. 27; quoting from: Al-Kamil, Vol. 2, Pg. 329; Tarikh al-Umam wal Mulook, Vol. 2, Pg. 243; Ansaab al-Ashraaf, Vol. 1, Pg. 582.
- 42. Abdul Kareem Bi-Aazaar Shirazi: Interview in Kayhan Farhangi, Issue No. 184, Bahman 80, Pg. 156.
- 43. Muhammad Jawad Hujjati Kermani: Aftaab-e-Yazd Daily, Issue No. 9, Tir 1381.
- 44. Abdul Kareem Bi-Aazaar Shirazi: Mashal-e-Ittehaad (Torch of Unity), Pg. 25.
- <u>45.</u> Sayyid Jawad Mustafawi: Article quoted in Kitab-e-Wahdat, Pg. 139; article quoted in Mashkoot Magazine, Issue No. 2, Spring 62, Pg. 52.
- 46. Farooq Safizaada: Article quoted in Kayhan Farhangi, Issue 170, Azar 79, Pg. 81.
- 47. Abdul Kareem Bi-Aazaar Shirazi: Interview in Kayhan Farhangi, Issue No. 184, Bahman 80, Pg. 16.
- 48. Markaz-e-Pazuhashhai Sada wa Seema: Article quoted in Kayhan Farhangi, Issue No. 182, Azar 80, Pg. 37.

- 49. Muhammad Ali Taskhiri: Article quoted in Kayhan Farhangi, Issue No. 184, Bahman 80, Pg. 34.
- 50. Abdul Kareem Bi-Aazaar Shirazi: Seemai Imam-e-Muttaqeen, (Portrait of the Imam of the Pious), Vol. 7, Pg. 18.
- <u>51.</u> There are only 8 instances out of 85 when the Imam ('a) expressed his view before the opinion of the Second Caliph can be acted upon as can be seen the tables.
- 52. Muhammad Jawad Hujjati Kermani: Aftaab-e-Yazd Daily, Issue No. 9, Tir 1381.
- 53. Sayyid Ahmad Mawassaqi: Istiratazi-e-Wahdat (Strategy of Unity), Vol. 1, Pg. 125.
- <u>54.</u> There are only 8 instances out of 85 when the Imam ('a) expressed his view before the opinion of the Second Caliph can be acted upon as can be seen the tables.
- 55. Ibid. Istiratazi-e-Wahdat (Strategy of Unity), Vol. 1, Pgs. 125-126.
- 56. Abdul Qadir Dahqaan Siraawaani: Article quoted in Nida-e-Islam Magazine, Issue No. 11, Autumn 81, Pg. 7.
- 57. Ibid. Article quoted in Nida-e-Islam Magazine, Issue No. 11, Autumn 81, Pg. 7.
- 58. Ibid. Article quoted in Nida-e-Islam Magazine, Issue No. 15, Autumn 82, Pg. 11.
- 59. Refer: Sayyid Ali Husayni Milani: Imamat-e-Bila Fasl (Edit. Muhammad Reza Kareemi), Pg. 160.
- 60. Muhammad Baqir Bahboodi: Seerah Alawi (1st Edition), Pg. 41.
- 61. Jalal Darikhsha: Mawaaze Siyasi Hazrat Ali Dar Qibal Mukhalifeen (Political stands of Ali against opponents), Pg. 55.
- 62. Abdullah Khanaqli Hamadani: Siyasat Imam Ali ('a)-o-Hasnain Dar Raabita Ba Hukoomat-o-Futuhaat Kholafa, Pg. 97.
- 63. Although if he could not think of anything he would refer to the Sunnah of Prophet (S). (Ibid. Pg. 99).
- 64. These were personal derivations of the Caliph variously based on exigencies. (Ibid. Pg. 99).
- 65. Ibid. Pgs. 98-99.
- 66. Ibid. Pg. 56.
- 67. Muhammad Jawad Hujjati Kermani: Aftaab-e-Yazd Daily, Issue No. 9, Teer 1381.
- 68. This statement requires correction. The phrase "Absence of armed uprising" is more appropriate.
- 69. Asghar Qaidan: Tahleeli Bar Mawaze Siyasi Ali Ibn Abi Talib ('a) Research on political stands of Ali Ibn Abi Talib ('a), Pgs. 97–98.
- 70. Ibid. Pgs. 103-104.
- 71. Ibid. Pg. 109.

#### Source URL:

https://www.al-islam.org/victim-lost-saqifah-revised-edition-comprehensive-additions-ali-labbaf/discourse-2-criticism-and